

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 7TH PLENARY MEETING

Held on 4-6 June 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 26 June 2019)

Participants

■ Panel Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Laurence Castle, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler¹, Peter Fürst², Ursula Gundert-Remy, Trine Husøy, Wim Mennes, Peter Moldeus, Agneta Oskarsson, Romina Shah, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Detlef Wölfle and Maged Younes

■ Hearing Experts:

Riccardo Crebelli has participated via web-conference on 4th June 2019, in agenda point 8.2

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

DG SANTE (Health and Food Safety), E2 Food processing technologies and novel foods:
Guillermo Cardon and Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Claudia Roncancio Peña, Stefania Barmaz, Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Brian Flynn, Alessandra Giarola, Federica Lodi, Carla Martino, Ana Maria Rincon, Camilla Smeraldi, Alexandra Tard and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants in the meeting. Apologies were received from Maria José Frutos Fernandez and Rainer Gürtler.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Apologies on 4 June 2019 AM

² Apologies on 6 June 2019



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Plenary meeting Open for Observers held on 26-28 March, Parma

The minutes of the 6th Plenary meeting Open for Observers held on 26-28 March 2019 were agreed by written procedure on 19 April 2019⁵.

5. Report on written procedures since 6th Plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

6. Debrief on feedback received from Observers to the 6th Plenary meeting

The Panel was presented with feedback from the previous plenary meeting open to observers. Although limited in number, overall positive feedback on the content of the meeting was received from the observers physically attending the plenary meeting. It was acknowledged that observers attending remotely were only requested to provide feedback on the technical organisation of the meeting. The Panel would welcome extending the survey on the content of the plenary also to the observers attending remotely.

7. Presentation on New Food Law 178

A presentation was given on the EFSA ART Programme, which will support EFSA on its transformation journey and, most importantly, get us ready for the implementation of the revised General Food Law, better known as Regulation (EC) No 178/2002.

8. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

FOOD ADDITIVES

- 8.1. Re-evaluation of phosphoric acid, phosphates, di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-341; E 343; E 450-452) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00532](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00533](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00534](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00535](#); [EFSA-Q-](#)**

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/event/190326-m.pdf>



[2011-00536](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00537](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00538](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00539](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00540](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00541](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00542](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00543](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00618](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00619](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00620](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00621](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00622](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00623](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00624](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00625](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00626](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00628](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00629](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00630](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00597](#))

At its previous plenary meeting held in March 2019, the FAF Panel had adopted the scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of the safety of phosphates as food additives. During the preparation of the scientific output for publication EFSA became aware of an incorrect numerical value for the use levels of phosphates from one data provider that was included in the dataset used for exposure assessment. In accordance with the applicable EFSA SOP 12, the publication of the adopted scientific opinion was put on hold, and the opinion was included in the agenda of the current plenary meeting.

At the current meeting, the Panel has withdrawn the scientific opinion previously adopted on 27 March 2019 and discussed the new text related to the exposure assessment, uncertainties, conclusions and recommendations. The Panel agreed with the revised dataset and updated the relevant tables and text of the scientific opinion, also including an explanation for the changes made.

The revised scientific opinion was discussed at the current plenary meeting and was unanimously adopted by the FAF Panel on 4 June 2019.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage⁶.

8.2. Re-evaluation of sweeteners: Sorbitols (E 420 i,ii); Mannitol (E 421 i, ii); Acesulfame K (E 950); Isomalt (E 953); Sucralose (E 955); Thaumatin (E 957); Neohesperidine DC (E 959); Aspartame acesulfame salt (E 962); Lactitol (E 966); Xylitol (E 967); Erythritol (E 968); Cyclamates (E 952 i, ii, iii); Saccharin Na, Ca, K (E 954 i, ii, iii, iv); Neotame (E 961); Maltitol (E 965 i, ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00644](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00645](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00646](#); [EFSA-Q-011-00647](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00721](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00723](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00724](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00725](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00726](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00727](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00728](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00729](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00730](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00733](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00734](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00735](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00736](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00737](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00738](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00739](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00740](#)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00755](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00490](#))

Further to the discussion at the previous plenary meeting, the Panel discussed the proposed draft protocol to be applied to the re-evaluation of sweeteners in the context of Regulation (EC) No 257/2010. The protocol presented is aimed at describing in detail the methodology that will be applied to the collection, screening for relevance and appraisal of the data that will be used for hazard identification and characterisation steps of the risk assessment.

At the current meeting, the Panel discussed the different sections of the draft protocol and unanimously endorsed the document, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

⁶ www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5674



The draft protocol will be released for public consultation on the Authority's webpage for a period of at least 6-8 weeks.

The Panel received an update also on the other protocol that is currently being elaborated by the Working Group, to cover the exposure assessment methodology. This second protocol is planned to be presented to the plenary meeting in September 2019 and will also be subject to a public consultation phase prior to its finalisation and implementation.

8.3. Re-evaluation of hydrochloric acid and chlorides (E 507-509; E 511) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00657](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00658](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00659](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00660](#))

The Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

8.4. Re-evaluation of sulphuric acid and sulphates (E 513-517) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00662](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00663](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00664](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00665](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00666](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00667](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00668](#))

This item was not discussed due to lack of time and it will be placed on the agenda of a future plenary meeting.

8.5. Re-evaluation of starch sodium octenyl succinate (E 1450) as a food additive in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age ([EFSA-Q-2018-00102](#))

The Chair of the Working Group on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age introduced the approach followed and the preliminary conclusions reached on the assessment of the data provided by interested parties in response to the follow-up calls launched by EFSA after the re-evaluation of the food additive starch sodium octenyl succinate (E 1450) with respect to its use in the general population and as a food additive in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age.

On the basis of the comments received during the current plenary meeting the draft opinion will be further elaborated by the Working Group and will be tabled for possible adoption at a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

8.6. Re-evaluation of benzyl alcohol (E 1519) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00590](#))

This item was not discussed due to lack of time and it will be placed on the agenda of a future plenary meeting.

FLAVOURINGS

8.7. FGE.204 Rev1 (FGE.19 subgroup 1.2.1) ([EFSA-Q-2015-00297](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00298](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00299](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00300](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00301](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00302](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00303](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00304](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00305](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00306](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00307](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00308](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00309](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00310](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00311](#); [EFSA-Q-2015-00312](#))

The Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

8.8. FGE.70 Rev1 ([EFSA-Q-2018-00648](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00652](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00653](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00654](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00655](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-](#)



[00656](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00657](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00658](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00659](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00660](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00661](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00662](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00663](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00664](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00665](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00666](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00844](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00845](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00846](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00847](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00848](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00849](#))

The Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

9. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

9.1. Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

9.1.1. FAF WG Food Additives Applications

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

9.1.2. FAF WG on the re-evaluation of miscellaneous food additives

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

9.1.3. FAF WG on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

9.1.4. FAF WG on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

9.1.5. FAF WG on Sweeteners

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

9.1.6. FAF WG on Flavourings

The Panel briefly discussed an evaluation approach for naringenin ([EFSA-Q-2017-00001](#)) and provided guidance to the WG for a follow-up. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

9.1.7. FAF WG on Specifications of Food Additives

In addition to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#), the Panel received an update on the assessment of the proposed update to existing specifications of titanium dioxide (E 171) currently ongoing. The draft opinion is in the process of being



finalised by the Working Group, for discussion and possible adoption at the next Panel plenary meeting.

9.2. EFSA including its Working Groups/Task Forces

No feedback provided.

9.3. European Commission

No feedback provided.

10. New and withdrawn mandates

10.1. Food Additives

10.1.1. Request for urgent scientific and technical assistance as regards the review on the risks related to the exposure to the food additive titanium dioxide (E 171) performed by ANSES (M-2019-00315)

The Panel was informed about a mandate from the European Commission to EFSA requesting technical assistance on the food additive titanium dioxide (E 171), that was received since the last FAF Plenary meeting (EFSA-Q-2019-00315). An EFSA statement has been prepared by the FIP Unit in response to this new request for technical assistance and was published on the EFSA website on 13 May 2019⁷.

At the current meeting, the Panel was provided with background information to this request from the European Commission, which followed the publication of an opinion by the French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety (ANSES) on 15 April 2019.

In preparation for the discussion which should take place at the coming plenary meeting on 26-27 June 2019, the Panel held a preliminary reflection on the possible implications of the ongoing assessment of titanium dioxide (E 171) with respect to proposed update of the specifications to include parameters related to its particle size distribution (see agenda item 9.1.7) on the opinions previously issued on the safety of this food additive by the former ANS Panel in 2016 and 2018.

10.1.2. Request for EFSA's scientific opinion as regards a proposed amendment of the specifications of the food additive Steviol glycosides (E 960) (M-2016-0214)

The Panel was informed about the withdrawal of this mandate from the European Commission for the assessment of an application for a proposed amendment of the specifications of the food additive steviol glycosides (E 960) to include a new production process covering fermentative rebaudioside A produced by a strain of *Yarrowia lipolytica*, genetically engineered to express the steviol glycoside metabolic pathway of the plant *Stevia Rebaudiana* (EFSA-Q-2016-00689).

11. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

No other scientific topics were presented for information and/or discussion.

⁷ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5714>

12. Any Other Business

None.

