



Scientific Panel on Plant Health (PLH)

Minutes of the 80th Plenary meeting

Held on 22 May 2019 08.30 – 18.30h

EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 19 June 2019)

Participants

■ **Panel Members**

Claude Bragard, Francesco Di Serio, Paolo Gonthier, Josep Jaques Miret, Annemarie Fejer Justesen, Sven Christer Magnusson, Juan A. Navas-Cortés, Roel Potting, Philippe Lucien Reignault, Antonio Vicent, Jonathan Yuen, Marie-Agnès Jacques, Lucia Zappalà

■ **Hearing Experts:**

ANSES: Christine Tayeh

EPPO: Camille Picard

■ **European Commission DG SANTE:**

Panagiota Mylona

■ **EFSA:**

Animal and plant health Unit: Melanie Camillieri, Ewelina Czwierczek, Eduardo De La Peña, Alice Delbianco, Makrina Diakaki, Ciro Gardi, Michela Guzzo, Tomasz Kaluski, Virag Kertesz, Mart Kinkar, Svetla Kozelska, Andrea Maiorano, Maria Rosaria Mannino, Elisabeth Meyer-Landrut, Marco Pautasso, Stefano Preti, Maria Chiara Rosace, Giuseppe Stancanelli, Emanuela Tacci, Sara Tramontini and Sybren Vos

Assessment and methodological support Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

Legal & Assurance Services Unit: Simone Gabbi

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risk Unit: Bernard Bottex

Communication Unit: Maria Tejero and Fabrizio Mosca

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Alan MacLeod; Panagiotis Milonas, Stephen Parnell & Katharina Dehnens-Schmutz



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Committee/Scientific Panel/ Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration(s) of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Info session for Panel plenaries on independence progress in 2018

Simone Gabbi from the EFSA Legal & assurance services Unit presented to the panel a report on independence related activities, with particular focus on separation of risk assessment and risk management activities and ownership of financial investment; clarifications were also provided regarding private-public co-funding in research funding.

5. Report on written procedures since 79th Plenary meeting held on 27 & 28 March 2019 Parma Italy

5.1 79th Plenary minutes were adopted

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 23 April 2019 and then published on EFSA website 24th April 2019 <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/190327>

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

6.1 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Pest categorisation of non-EU viruses of *Prunus* L, EFSA-Q-2018-00785

Following a request from the EU Commission, the Panel on Plant Health addressed the pest categorisation of the viruses and viroids of *Prunus* L. determined as being either non-EU or of undetermined standing in a



previous EFSA opinion. These infectious agents belong to different genera and are heterogeneous in their biology. With the exclusion of Ilarvirus S1 and Ilarvirus S2, for which very limited information exists, the pest categorisation was completed for 26 viruses and 1 viroid having acknowledged identities and available detection methods. All these viruses are efficiently transmitted by vegetative plant propagation techniques, with plants for planting representing the major pathway for long-distance dispersal and thus considered as the major pathway for entry. Depending on the virus, additional pathway(s) can also be represented by *Prunus* seeds, pollen and/or vector(s). Most of the viruses categorised here are known to infect only one or few plant genera, but some of them have a wide host range, thus extending the possible entry pathways. Apple scar skin viroid, American plum line pattern virus, cherry mottle leaf virus, cherry rasp leaf virus, cherry rosette virus, cherry rusty mottle-associated virus, cherry twisted leaf virus, peach enation virus, peach mosaic virus, peach rosette mosaic virus, tobacco ringspot virus and tomato ringspot virus meet all the criteria evaluated by EFSA to qualify as potential Union quarantine pests (QPs). With the exception of impact in the EU territory, on which the Panel was unable to conclude, apricot vein clearing virus, Asian prunus virus 1, Asian prunus virus 2, Asian prunus virus 3, Caucasus prunus virus, cherry virus B, Mume virus A, nectarine stem pitting-associated virus, nectarine virus M, peach chlorotic mottle virus, peach leaf pitting-associated virus, peach virus D, prunus virus F and prunus virus T satisfy all the other criteria to be considered as potential Union QPs. *Prunus geminivirus A* does not meet the criterion of having negative impact in the EU. For several viruses, especially those recently discovered, the categorisation is associated with high uncertainties mainly because of the absence of data on their biology, distribution and impact. Since the opinion addresses only the non-EU viruses, they do not meet the criteria assessed by EFSA to qualify as a potential Union regulated non-quarantine pests.

The opinion was adopted on 22 May 2019.

The Panel agreed to uniform the previous scientific opinions on the non-EU viruses of *Cydonia*, *Malus* and *Pyrus* and the non-EU viruses of *Vitis* with this adopted opinion on the non-EU viruses of *Prunus*, with respect to the reasoning for the assessment of the criteria evaluated by EFSA for qualification as regulated non-quarantine pests (RNQP).

6.2 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on the List of non-EU Scolytinae spp EFSA-Q-2017-00567 (for endorsement by the Panel)

The scientific opinion was presented to the Panel by the rapporteur. The work was built on data collected by an outsourced procurement project. The contractor first generated the list of worldwide Scolytinae species,



then established the list of those species that feed on conifers. After this, the selection of non-EU species was made based on agreed criteria. The working group prepared the draft opinion on the list of non-EU Scolytinae species that has been endorsed by the panel. The data and information on such list will be circulated to the Chief Plant Health Officers of the EU Member States for consultation and provision, when available, of additional evidence. Parallel with this, the contractor is working on data collection about life history, detection and identification, entry pathways, dispersal capacity and impacts of the non-EU species. Based on these data, the working group will prepare the pest categorisation of the non-EU Scolytinae species for the EU territory.

6.3 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Pest categorisation of non-EU Cicadomorpha vectors of *Xylella* spp. EFSA-Q-2018-00792

The Panel on Plant Health performed a group pest categorisation of non-EU Cicadomorpha vectors of *Xylella* spp. known to be associated with plant diseases. Although all the insects considered in this categorisation are proven vectors of *Xylella* spp., additional vectors within the order Hemiptera most probably exist but have not been associated with any *Xylella* spp.- disease yet. Currently, the group consists of 50 taxa (49 at species level and one at genus level) from the families Aphrophoridae, Cicadellidae, and Membracidae (Arthropoda: Hemiptera: Cicadomorpha) for which reliable identification methods exist. Members of the group can be found in the Americas, Asia, Africa, and Oceania. Only one of them, *Homalodisca vitripennis* is considered invasive. Species in the group are mostly polyphagous; many are known to feed on several plant families. Hosts can include broadleaf trees, herbaceous plants and grasses. Breeding takes place on herbaceous hosts and eggs are inserted into plant tissues. Nymphs emerge to feed on sap of the natal host. Adults move from breeding hosts to food hosts and can spread *Xylella* spp. causing a variety of diseases. Three of the species are listed in Annex IAI of Council Directive 2000/29/EC as examples of Cicadellidae (non-EU) known to be vector of Pierce's disease (caused by *Xylella fastidiosa*). Plants for planting, cut branches, flowers and fruit are potential pathways for entry into the EU. However, there are no records of EU interceptions of any members of the group. EU biotic and abiotic conditions are conducive for establishment and spread of these insects. Were members of the group to establish and spread, impact on several cultivated species (e.g., grapevine, citrus, *Prunus* spp.) and ornamentals (e.g., *Polygala myrtifolia*) could be expected as these insect species are efficient vectors of *Xylella* spp. Considering the criteria within the remit of EFSA to assess their regulatory plant health status, the group of non-EU Cicadomorpha vectors of *Xylella* spp. meets all the criteria assessed by EFSA for consideration as potential Union quarantine pests. The group does not meet all the criteria assessed by EFSA for consideration as regulated non-quarantine pests, as members of the group are not present in the EU.

The opinion was adopted on 22 May 2019.



7. Feedback from Scientific Panel including their Working Groups

7.1 Update from the Working Group on plant bacteria categorisation on the work on non-EU phytoplasma of *Malus*, *Pyrus*, *Cydonia*, *Prunus*, *Rubus*, *Vitis*, *Ribes* and *Fragaria* [M-2017-0055](#)

The chair of the WG updated the Panel about the progress on the pest categorisation of non-EU phytoplasmas of fruit trees. The main information about 'Ca. Phytoplasma australiense' (reference strain) and 'Ca. Phytoplasma hispanicum' (reference strain) were presented. The plan for further work of the WG was summarized.

7.2 Update from the Working Group on plant viruses categorisation [M-2017-0055](#)

The Panel was informed about the activities of the WG on plant viruses. The deadline for the Tasking Grant for categorisation of non-EU viruses and viroids of *Malus*, *Pyrus*, *Cydonia*, *Prunus*, *Rubus*, *Vitis*, *Ribes* and *Fragaria* was extended to 30th November 2019. The WG is now finalising the categorisation of non-EU viruses and viroids of *Fragaria*. This group of non-EU viruses is composed by 13 viruses, one of them considered with undetermined standing. Pest categorisation will not be pursued for Strawberry latent virus (StLV) and Strawberry latent C virus (SLCV) because their identity was considered questionable. Working group started working with the pest categorisation of non-EU viruses and viroids of *Rubus* and *Ribes*. There are 7 non-EU viruses identified for *Ribes* and 20 for *Rubus*. These opinions are planned to be ready for possible adoptions in September (*Ribes*) and November (*Rubus*).

7.3 Update from the Working Group on Potato viruses categorisation [M-2017-0055](#), including presentation and endorsement of the draft opinion on the list of the non-EU potato viruses and viroids

The Panel was updated on the outcome of the consultation of the Chief Plant Health Officers of the EU Member States on the draft list of non-EU viruses and viroids of potato. The comments and evidence received from



Belgium, Cyprus, Poland and Slovenia will be reviewed by the working group on 3 and 4 June to update the draft list. The plan is that the final list of non-EU viruses and viroids of potato, as well as their draft pest categorisation will be circulated to the Panel on 17 June for review, and then proposed for endorsement at the next Plenary meeting (26-27 June 2019).

7.4 Update from the Pest Categorisation Working Groups M-2017-0055: Agricultural Insects

An update was given about the recent activity of the group including the meeting with non-EU Tephritidae (fruit flies) Tasking grant holder in April and the finalisation of the data collection within it. The Panel was informed on the plan for *Spodoptera litura* pest categorisation opinion circulation for comments by the Panel.

7.5 Update from the Pest Categorisation Working Groups M-2017-0055: Forest Insects

The WG is currently working on the categorisation of two large groups: non-EU Scolytinae spp. and non-EU *Acleris* spp. Before the plenary meeting, the WG members met the contractor who gave an update on the progress of the data collection on the non-EU Scolytinae species. So far, data have been collected for 60% of the species, thus the work is progressing in a timely manner. The WG members are also working on establishing the list of non-EU *Acleris* species and upon concluding this task, the categorisation of the group will soon commence.

7.6 Update on High Risk Plants commodity risk assessment mandate, including a short update on dossiers submitted by National Plant Protection Organisations of Third Countries

The chair of the WG on High Risk Plants – Section 1 presented an update on the activities and the work plan that was agreed during the first meeting of the WG. Few questions were raised on the timeline for third countries for submitting dossiers and on the time commitment that will be requested to the WGs members. The chair clarified that there is not deadline for dossier submission, but that at the end of the year the trade of the High Risk Plants will be temporarily closed. Concerning the expert time needed for the WGs activity, it is not possible to provide a precise forecast at the moment, as only two dossiers have been received so far.



7.7 Update from the Working Group on *Pantoea stewartii* USA corn seed derogation (EFSA-Q-2018-00902)

The Chair of the WG updated the Panel about the progress of the WG. Advances have been made on the conceptual model and parameter elicitation, as well as on retrieving additional information relevant for this mandate.

7.8 Update from the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata*

The Scientific Officer in charge of the project updated the Panel about the progress of the WG. The WG met twice and first meetings were focused on clarifying the Terms of Reference, starting to draft the pest categorization, and searching relevant information regarding *S. tridentata*.

8 Feedback from EFSA including its Working Groups:

8.1 Update on the EFSA plant health horizon scanning mandate

EFSA presented an overview of the project focusing on the ongoing collaborations and activities on the scientific literature monitoring. The aim of the pest ranking activity requested in the mandate was also clarified. The methodology, developed by ANSES for EFSA within a Tasking Grant agreement, will be applied for unlisted pests found through the media and literature monitoring in order to identify those that may represent a risk for the EU territory. The ranked list will help risk managers to take decisions on further actions (e.g. pest categorisation requests to EFSA).

8.2 Introduction to the methodology to rank plant pest identified by horizon scanning: presentation by ANSES

ANSES presented the main conclusions of the review carried out on the pest ranking systems in use in some countries. Outcomes from the review were considered in developing the proposal of a ranking methodology for the EU territory. It was presented to the Panel as well as the results of a first ranking exercise carried out on 10 pilot pests to test the methodology.

9 Update from Scientific Committee and its Working Groups



Scientific Committee panel is working in the discussion on nanotechnologies, strategy for chemical risk assessment 2020-2027, risk assessment for honey bees. SC panel also commented on the 2020 Internal Year of Plant Health.

10 Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

10.1 Feedback from the presentation at PAFF committee of the two Scientific Opinions on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

The Panel was updated about the presentation at PAFF Committee of the two Scientific Opinion on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment. In general, good feedback was received on the quality of the two opinions. Many questions and comments were received related to:

- the need of having a case-by-case approach based on *X. fastidiosa* subspecies, STs, locations, climate, hosts, etc...
- impact estimation on grapevine, for which the EKE process and the scenario assumptions were explained
- model on short/long range spread assumptions, parameters, and results
- asymptomatic phase

10.2 Overview of media coverage on the publication of the two PLH scientific opinions on *Xylella fastidiosa*

The Panel was updated on the media coverage on *Xylella* by EFSA Communication Unit.

10.3 Update on the organisation of the second European research conference on *Xylella fastidiosa*, Ajaccio (FR) 29-31 October 2019

The Panel was updated on the organization of the second European conference on *Xylella fastidiosa* that will be held in Ajaccio (Corse), next October, and that is organized by EFSA together with many research institutions and EU-funded projects. The overall results of registrations, abstracts' submissions and screening, and the draft program were presented.

10.4 International Plant Health Year

The chair informed the panel about the International Year of Plant Health in 2020, see links below for further information:



UN proclaims 2020 the International Year of Plant Health
Watch the International Year of Plant Health [Video](#),
Factsheet: ["Championing an International Year of Plant Health"](#)

11 Feedback from the European Commission

A presentation was provided by the EC SANTE representative on the new EU plant health law and the processing for decision making of the PLH Panel scientific opinions.

12 AOB

12.1 2019-2020 PLH Plenary dates

Panel members agreed on 2020 PLH plenary dates, table with dates and outlook invitations to be sent out by PLH secretariat.



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, Dr. Francesco Di Serio declared the following interest: with regard to the draft Scientific opinions on the categorisation of non-EU phytoplasma of *Cydonia* Mill., *Fragaria* L., *Malus* Mill., *Prunus* L., *Pyrus* L., *Ribes* L., *Rubus* L. and *Vitis* L., he informed the Panel that he participates to the work on this opinion as coordinator of an EFSA Art. 36 Tasking Grant Specific Contract. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest (CoI).

This results in the exclusion of the expert from discussion or voting as PLH Panel Member of item 6.7, however he can participate to this agenda meeting to present the work he conducted under the EFSA Art 36 Tasking Grant Specific Contract.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
²

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf