

Discussion Group 2

Case study:

Gene drive modified agricultural pests







Trusted science for safe food

Problem formulation concepts



- Formally devising plausible pathways to harm that describe how a proposed activity could be harmful (i.e., impact a protected value adversely)
- Formulating risk hypotheses (i.e., hypotheses of no harm or of no unacceptable risk) about the likelihood and severity of such events
- Identifying the information that will be useful to test the risk hypotheses
- Developing a plan to acquire new data for hypothesis testing should tests with existing information be insufficient for decisionmaking

Gene drives to control an agricultural pest



- Insect pests cause important losses in agricultural productivity
- Drosophila suzukii (Spotted wing Drosophila) damages fruit industry
- Recently invaded North America and Europe
- Infestations treated with broad-spectrum insecticides
 - Not always effective and intensive use associated with shortcomings
- Gene drive technology could be applied for population suppression
 - Targeting genes essential for development or viability

Protection goals and potential risks



- Biodiversity and ecosystems
 - Toxicity to non-target organisms
 - Alteration of food networks
 - Impact on ecosystem services
 - Niche replacement pest
 - Impact on pest fitness
- Plant health
 - Niche replacement plant pathogens
 - Increased vectorial capacity
 - Increased pathology

- Human/animal health
 - Accidental exposure leading to toxicity or allergenicity
- Water, soil and air quality, agriculture or natural resources
 - Impact by gene drive modified pest
- Management practices
 - Impact on other control strategies
 - Failure of control strategy altering pest incidence

Problem formulation template



Plausible pathway to harm		Testable risk hypotheses (compared with GM insects)	Relevant information to test risk hypotheses	Means to gather relevant information (and feasibility)
Protection goal:				
Step1		***		***
Step2	•••	***	•••	***
Step3		***		***
Step4	•••	•••		
Step5		•••		•••
Step6		***	•••	***
Step7				***
Step8	•••	***	•••	***
Step9		***		***
Harm:				