

Parma, 21 November 2018
EFSA/CONTAM/3541

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain

Minutes of the 95th Plenary meeting

Held on 14-15 November 2018, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 7 December 2018)

Participants

- **Panel Members:**

Margherita Bignami, Laurent Bodin, Kevin Chipman, Jesus Del Mazo, Bettina Grasl-Kraupp, Christer Hogstrand¹, Ron Hoogenboom, Jean-Charles Leblanc, Carlo Nebbia, Elsa Nielsen, Evangelia Ntzani², Annette Petersen, Salomon Sand, Dieter Schrenk, Tanja Schwerdtle, Christiane Vleminckx and Heather Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts³:**

Diane Benford (for Item 9.1); Jan Alexander and Jean-Pierre Cravedi (for item 10)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete⁴

- **EFSA:**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:**

Katleen Baert, Marco Binaglia, Ernesto Liebana Criado, Karen Mackay, Luisa Ramos Bordajandi and Hans Steinkellner.

- **DATA Unit:**

¹ Attendance on 14 November only.

² Attendance by audioweb-conference.

³ As defined in Article 11 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Attendance by audioweb-conference on 15 November only.

Davide Arcella (for items 9.1. and 11.3.3.)

- **Observers:**

See Annex I

- **Others:**

Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the CONTAM Panel welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Veerle Vanheusden (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2) and Marina Marini (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit D1).

2. Brief introduction of Panel members and Observers

The CONTAM Panel welcomed the Observers and the meeting participants introduced themselves.

3. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

4. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting had been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Presentation of Guidelines for observers

The CONTAM Team Leader presented the EFSA Guidelines for Observers attending the open plenary meeting.

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

⁶ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

6. Agreement of the minutes of the 94th Plenary meeting held on 25-27 September 2018

The minutes of the 94th Plenary meeting held on 25-27 September 2018 were agreed on 19 October 2018.

7. Report on written procedures since 94th Plenary meeting

Not applicable.

8. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

8.1. Scientific Opinion on the human health risks related to the presence of cyanogenic glycosides in foods other than raw apricot kernels (EFSA-Q-2016-00802)⁷

The Chair of the WG on HCN in food reported that the opinion had been updated following the comments from the Panel at the last Plenary meeting. The Panel discussed the draft opinion, and pending insertion of minor changes endorsed it for public consultation that will indicatively take place between the end of November 2018 and January 2019.

8.2. Scientific opinion on the risk to human health related to the presence of chlorinated paraffins in feed and food (EFSA-Q-2016-00801)⁸

The Chair of the WG on Chlorinated Paraffins in food and feed presented, for discussion, the sections of the draft opinion on physicochemical properties, production and industrial use, environmental levels and fate, methods of analysis, previous assessments, legislation, toxicokinetics and toxicity in experimental animals. The Panel made suggestions to those sections and the draft opinion will be presented again at the next Plenary meeting.

8.3. Draft EFSA Scientific Report on available toxicity information on calystegines (EFSA-Q-2018-01006)⁹

The CONTAM Team Leader presented the draft EFSA Scientific Report on available toxicity data on calystegines for discussion. The Panel suggested amendments and agreed with the content of the report.

9. Presentation of the EFSA external scientific report: "Bioaccumulation and toxicity of mineral oil hydrocarbons in

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00802>

⁸ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00801>

⁹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-01006>

rats - specificity of different subclasses of a broad mixture relevant for human dietary exposures”

The scope and outcomes of the study were presented by the study coordinators present in the meeting as hearing experts. The Panel discussed the results of the study and concluded that additional analysis is needed to evaluate the implications for the risk assessment of mineral oil hydrocarbons.

10. Update on the outcome of the Information Session of EFSA on the CONTAM Scientific Opinion on dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in food and feed

The Chair of the WG Dioxins in food and feed informed the Panel that on Tuesday 13 November an Information Session on the Opinion was held at EFSA premises. Representatives from 22 EU Member States, Norway and Iceland participated. The objective of the Session was to explain and promote the understanding of the Opinion on dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs, adopted by the CONTAM Panel in its 2015-2018 mandate, considering the comments previously submitted by the countries. Presentations were prepared to cover aspects of the Opinion raised by the comments, and after each block of presentations the floor was opened for discussion. The discussion mainly related to the critical effect and critical epidemiological studies and the toxicokinetic modelling. The opinion is planned to be published 20 November, together with the presentations and comments submitted by the countries. A report of the Information Session will also be prepared and published at the EFSA website.

11. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

11.1. European Commission

The European Commission representative gave feedback on the activities of the European Commission in relation to the scientific opinions of the CONTAM Panel. Several amendments of current legislation are under discussion with the Member States as an outcome of the CONTAM Panel scientific opinions.

11.2. CONTAM Panel Working Groups

11.2.1. Update from WG on Dioxins in food and feed

See item 10.

11.2.2. Update from WG on Perfluoroalkylated substances in food

The Chair of the WG informed the Panel that the work on the 2nd Opinion is progressing and further sections will be presented for discussion at the 96th CONTAM Plenary in January 2019.

For the first opinion on PFOS and PFOA in food, (adopted in March 2018), the CONTAM Team Leader informed the Panel that the aim was to publish the opinion by the end of 2018, following the conclusion of the divergence procedure.

11.2.3. Update from Standing WG on feed detoxification

No activity currently on-going.

11.2.4. Update from WG on Hydrocyanic acid in food

See item 9.1.

11.2.5. Update from WG on Chlorinated paraffins in food and feed

See item 8.2.

11.2.6. Update from the WG on Glycoalkaloids in food and feed

The WG Chair informed the Panel that the work is progressing well and that sections of the draft opinion will be presented for first reading at the 96th CONTAM Panel meeting.

11.2.7. Update from WG on Quinolizidine alkaloids in food and feed

The Chair of the WG informed the Panel that the work is progressing well and that sections of the draft opinion will be presented for first reading at the 96th CONTAM Panel meeting.

11.2.8. Update from WG on aflatoxins in food

The WG Chair informed the Panel that a first WG meeting (teleconference) took place in October and that 2 additional meetings are planned in 2018.

11.2.9. Update from WG on Ochratoxin A in food

The Chair of the WG informed that a first WG meeting (teleconference) was held in October and that the first physical meeting will take place at the end of November.

11.3. EFSA

11.3.1. Advisory Forum

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the Panel that the 70th meeting of the EFSA advisory forum will be held on 28-29 November 2018. Additional information on this meeting is available in the EFSA website¹⁰.

11.3.2. Management Board

The CONTAM Team Leader informed that the 78th meeting of the EFSA Management Board took place on 10 October 2018. The Management Board re-elected the Chair and elected two vice-chairs. Additional information on this meeting is available in the EFSA website¹¹.

11.3.3. Other

- The Exposure Team Leader (DATA Unit) presented to the Panel an issue related to the CONTAM opinion on the Risks for public health related to the presence of chlorate in food (EFSA, 2015). A statistical analysis of chlorate occurrence data in food has been carried out by EFSA in August 2018 based on a request of the European Commission (Question number: EFSA-Q-2018-00605). Within this activity, a limited number of duplicate analytical samples (277 out of a total of 8 028) have been identified in addition to those already excluded based on the quality assessment described in section “2.1.1 Occurrence data” of the aforementioned opinion. EFSA carried out an impact analysis on the results of the occurrence levels presented in Appendix D of the 2015 EFSA Opinion and of the estimates for the “chronic dietary exposure using the available occurrence data” (see section 2.2.2. Exposure assessment and 3.2.3.1. Chronic dietary exposure to chlorate of the 2015 EFSA Opinion). The Panel noted that the differences in the exposure estimates, after the exclusion of the newly identified duplicates, are not sufficient to change the risk characterization and decided not to re-open the aforementioned opinion. The opinion will be republished with an explanatory note.
- The Panel confirmed the proposal to have a specific training on the Scientific Committee Guidance on uncertainty analysis in scientific assessment (EFSA, 2018) in July 2019. The CONTAM Team Leader proposed the previous CONTAM opinion on acrylamide in food (EFSA, 2015) and one of the opinions on feed

¹⁰ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/181128>

¹¹ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/181010>

detoxification adopted between 2017 and 2018 as possible study cases for the training.

11.4. Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

The CONTAM Panel Chair informed that the 91st meeting of the EFSA Scientific Committee will be held on 21-22 November 2018. Updates on the WG on mixtures, SWG on genotoxicity and WG on TTC were provided.

12. Answers to questions from Observers

One written question was submitted in advance to the meeting and was addressed by the CONTAM Team Leader.

Q.1 (Gianfranco Brambilla): What is the status of the opinion on PFOS and PFOA in food presented in the EFSA session at the DIOXIN 2018 Conference in Krakow?

Answer to Q.1: Divergences between the mentioned opinion and previous risk assessments of ECHA, Danish EPA and RIVM were identified. In addition potential contentious issues were raised also by BfR. A joint report is being prepared in which the identified divergences are discussed and clarified. The opinion will be published together with this report once it will be finalized. Publication is expected by the end of the year.

Questions and clarifications asked during the meeting were addressed by the meeting participants. Details are available in Annex II.

13. Any other business

Not applicable.

Annex I

List of registered Observers at the 95th CONTAM Panel meeting

Registered for physical attendance to the meeting		
Observer	Affiliation	Country
Steve Risotto ¹²	Private sector	United States
Sultan Çobanoğlu ^{Error!} Bookmark not defined. ¹²	University/public research institute	Turkey
Mohammed Ismail ^{Error!} Bookmark not defined. ¹²	University/public research institute	Turkey
Maristella Coppola ^{Error!} Bookmark not defined. ¹²	Private sector	Italy
Dirk Daneels	Private sector	Belgium
Jan Woldhuis	International organisation	The Netherlands

¹² Registered Observer not attending the meeting

Registered for attendance by web-streaming

Observer	Affiliation	Country
Gianfranco Brambilla	University/public research	Italy
Kate Trollope	Press/media	United Kingdom
Gustaaf Bos	Industry association	Belgium
Christophe Leprêtre	Consultancy	Belgium
Line Hovdenak Lyng	Industry	Norway
Henrique Anselmo	Industry	The Netherlands
Nina Flem	Industry	Norway
Eliana Silva de Moraes	NGO	France
Susana Viegas	University/public research	Portugal
Ellinor Helland	Industry	Norway
Arnaud Bouxin	Industry association	Belgium
Carla Sofia Sousa	Other	Portugal
Dave Robb	Industry	United Kingdom
Solenn Le Bruchec	Consultancy	France
Tatiana Vallaey	University/public research	France
Julie Roiz	Industry association	Belgium
Stefanie Geiser	Consultancy	Belgium
Marta Biolatti	Industry	Italy
Lise Bergan	Industry	Norway
Abdul Afghan	National authority	Canada
Janice Taylor	University/public research	United Kingdom
Evangelia Mavromichali	Industry association	Belgium
Serap Hanci	National authority	Turkey
Lone Flyvholm	Industry association	Norway
Silvia Ranieri	Industry	Italy
Monica Olsen	National authority	Sweden
Bulent Kabak	University/public research	Turkey
Eliana Silva de Moraes	NGO	France
Francesco Meschini	Consultancy	Italy
Hans van den Heuvel	Other	The Netherlands
Scott Blechinger	National authority	Canada
Abderrauof Sadallah	University/public research	Italy
Adanela Musaraj	International organization	Italy
Kalila Hajjar	Industry association	Belgium
Neil Buck	Industry association	Switzerland
Anders Snellingen	Industry association	Norway
Murat Ozmen	University/public research	Turkey

Annex II

Answers to questions from Observers

Item 8.1.

- **Q2. Tatiana Vallaey**

In the discussion of the occurrence data submitted to EFSA, the Observer noted that higher levels of HCN than those reported were measured in sorghum, bamboo shoots and lima beans, as reported in a previous assessment from JECFA.

- **A2. Tanja Schwerdtle (Chair of WG on HCN in food)**

The table under discussion referred to data submitted to EFSA. An overview of other published occurrence data, including those cited in the JECFA assessment is available in the draft opinion.

Item 8.2.

- **Q3. Gianfranco Brambilla:**

In the discussion of the sources of contamination and environmental fate of chlorinated paraffins, the Observer noted that the occurrence in biosolids should be merged with any data about their uptake in vegetables - i.e. root vegetables.

- **A3. Elsa Nielsen (Chair of WG on Chlorinated paraffins in food)**

The suggestion will be considered, provided the availability of relevant data.

- **Q4. Tatiana Vallaey**

Under the discussion of analytical methods, the Observer suggested to mention a report on results of proficiency test SCCP & MCCP in polymers.

- **A4. Luisa Ramos Bordajandi (CONTAM Team)**

The indicated report is not relevant for the opinion as the discussion of analytical methods is limited to those for analysis of chlorinated paraffins in food and feed.

Item 9.

- **Q5. Dirk Daneels:**

In respect to the presentation of the results of the bioaccumulation experiments of the project, the Observer asked to comment on the relevance of the preferential accumulation of n-alkanes observed in the liver of Fischer 344/N rats compared to the accumulation of saturated hydrocarbons observed in human tissues.

- **A5. Jean-Pierre Cravedi (Hearing expert)**

Although there is a specific accumulation of n-alkanes in the Fischer 344/N rat liver, iso-alkanes were also observed to accumulate in liver and in the adipose tissue.

- **Q6. Dirk Daneels:**

In respect to the presentation of the results of the toxicity study, the Observer asked to comment the relevance of the findings of liver toxicity in view of the different accumulation of n-alkanes between Fischer 344/N rats and humans.

- **A6. Jan Alexander (Hearing expert)**

It was noted that the effects on liver and spleen weight observed in the Fischer F344/N rats were not correlated with the accumulation of n-alkanes, but rather with the exposure to iso-alkanes and naphthenes. These fractions are similar to those observed to accumulate in human tissues.