

# Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

## Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting

Held on 06-08 November 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 28 November 2018)

### Participants

#### ■ Panel Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Laurence Castle, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Maria José Frutos Fernandez, Fürst Peter<sup>1</sup>, Ursula Gundert-Remy, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy, Wim Mennes, Peter Moldeus<sup>2</sup>, Agneta Oskarsson<sup>3</sup>, Sandra Rainieri<sup>4</sup>, Romina Shah, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Detlef Wölflé and Maged Younes

#### ■ European Commission representatives:

DG SANTE (Health and Food Safety), E2 Food processing technologies and novel foods: Guillermo Cardon

#### ■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Claudia Roncancio Peña, Eleonora Alquati, Anna Christodoulidou, Dimitrios Chrysafidis, Alessandra Giarola, Ana Maria Rincon, Camilla Smeraldi and Alexandra Tard.

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants in the meeting.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>5</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>6</sup>, EFSA

<sup>1</sup> Participated by web-conference on 06 and 08 November 2018

<sup>2</sup> Participated whole meeting by web-conference

<sup>3</sup> Apologies on 08 November 2018

<sup>4</sup> Apologies on 06 November 2018

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Plenary meeting held on 11-13 September 2018, Parma (Italy)**

The minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Plenary meeting held on 11-13 September 2018 were agreed by written procedure on 02 October 2018<sup>7</sup>.

#### **5. Report on written procedures since 2<sup>nd</sup> Plenary meeting**

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

#### **6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption**

##### **Food Additives**

##### **6.1. Re-evaluation of propane-1,2-diol esters of fatty acids (E477) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00566](#))**

The FAF Panel was presented for the first time with a draft scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of the already permitted food additive propane-1,2-diol esters of fatty acids (E477) together with the main points for discussion.

The FAF Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

The FAF Panel noted that this re-evaluation of propane-1,2-diol esters of fatty acids (E477) is closely related to the two other scientific opinions issued by the former ANS Panel on the re-evaluation of the food additives propane-1,2-diol (E 1520)<sup>8</sup> and propane-1,2-diol alginate (E 405)<sup>9</sup>. Although the three food additives are currently regulated independently one from another in terms of their maximum permitted levels in food, the Panel acknowledged that all three food additives (E 1520, E 405 and E 477) contribute to the overall exposure to propane-1,2-diol.

The Panel therefore agreed to initiate a self-tasking activity aimed at exploring the feasibility of establishing a group ADI for those food additives that result in an exposure to propane-1,2-diol. The Panel will also consider performing a combined exposure assessment to propane-1,2-diol resulting from the use of these three food additives.

##### **6.2. Re-evaluation of hydrochloric acid and chlorides (E 507-509; E 511) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00657](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00658](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00659](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00660](#))**

This item was not discussed due to lack of time. Panel members were invited to distribute their comments in writing, for further elaboration by the Working Group on the re-evaluation of miscellaneous food additives.

---

<sup>6</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>7</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/event/180911-m.pdf>

<sup>8</sup> <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.5235>

<sup>9</sup> <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.5371>

**6.3. Re-evaluation of phosphoric acid, phosphates, di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-341; E 343; E 450-452) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00618](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00619](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00620](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00621](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00622](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00623](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00624](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00625](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00626](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00628](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00629](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00630](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00532](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00533](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00534](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00535](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00536](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00537](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00538](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00539](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00540](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00541](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00542](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00543](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00597](#))**

As agreed at the previous FAF plenary meeting, preliminary conclusions reached by the Working Group on Phosphates had been presented to the NDA Panel at its October 2018 plenary meeting. Feedback received from NDA Panel was overall supportive of the approach followed by the Working Group and preliminary conclusions reached.

At the current FAF Panel Plenary meeting, a revised draft opinion on the re-evaluation of the safety of phosphoric acid, phosphates, di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-341; E 343; E 450-452) as food additives was presented to the members of the FAF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The Panel discussed the draft opinion and made suggestions for improvement, to be considered by the WG. The draft opinion will be tabled for a future Plenary.

The Panel noted that the scientific opinion currently being prepared also encompasses the assessment of a proposal for extension of phosphoric acid, phosphates and polyphosphates phosphoric acid, phosphates, di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-341; E 343; E 450-452) in confectionery (EFSA-Q-2018-00597). The Panel was also informed that the other application for an extension of use of disodium diphosphate (E 450(i)) in tortilla (EFSA-2018-00598) received under the same mandate M-2018-0125 was still under consideration by APDESK, and therefore unlikely to be considered jointly with the current assessment.

## **7. New Mandates**

No new mandates were received since the last FAF Plenary meeting.

## **8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission**

### **8.1. Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups**

#### **8.1.1. FAF WG Food Additives Applications**

Feedback from the second meeting held on 6 November 2018 was provided by the Chair. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### **8.1.2. FAF WG on the re-evaluation of miscellaneous food additives**

Feedback from the second meeting held on 22-24<sup>th</sup> October 2018 was provided by the Chair. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

### **8.1.3.FAF WG on Phosphates**

Feedback from the second meeting held on 15-17<sup>th</sup> October 2018 was already provided under the agenda item 6.3. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

### **8.1.4.FAF WG on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age**

The Chair provided feedback from the second meeting held on 17-18 October 2018. The Panel was informed about an upcoming workshop that will be held at the EFSA's premises on 30<sup>th</sup> November 2018. Several calls for data have been prepared by the WG and published on the EFSA's website<sup>10</sup>. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

### **8.1.5.FAF WG on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners**

Feedback from the first two meetings held on 26-28 September and 22-24<sup>h</sup> October 2018 was provided by the Chair. The Panel was informed that the view of the EFSA Scientific Committee WG on Genotoxicity will be sought with respect to the preliminary conclusions of the WG on the assessment of Quillaia extract (E 999) as a food additive. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

### **8.1.6.FAF WG on Sweeteners**

Feedback from the first meeting held on 6-8 October 2018 was provided by the Chair. During its initial meeting the Working Group identified the need for enlarging the area of expertise, to cover dietary exposure assessment and chemistry, in the first instance and later on, toxicology. Additional members would be identified to cover these areas. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

### **8.1.7.FAF WG on Flavourings**

Feedback from the first meeting held on 15-17 October 2018 was provided by the Chair. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

### **8.1.8.FAF WG on the follow-up of the re-evaluation of sorbic acid and potassium sorbate as food additives**

Feedback from the first meeting held on 16 October 2018 was provided by the Chair. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

### **8.1.9.FAF WG on the re-evaluation of Annatto extracts (E 160b)**

The WG will meet for the first time on 8 November 2018. Feedback will be provided at the next FAF Panel plenary meeting.

<sup>10</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/calls/data>

## 8.2. EFSA including its Working Groups/Task Forces

The FAF Panel was made aware of an upcoming scientific opinion of the CONTAM Panel on the health risk related to hydrocyanic acid in foods other than raw apricot kernels forms. The FAF Panel was informed that the opinion would be tabled for endorsement for public consultation at the 95th Plenary meeting of the CONTAM Panel on 14-15 November 2018.

The FAF Panel noted that since the scope of the opinion of the CONTAM Panel was different and the database available was more extensive, the conclusions drawn by the CONTAM Panel in its current opinion might deviate in some aspects from the 2004 scientific opinion of the former Scientific Panel on Food Additives, Flavourings, Processing Aids and Materials in Contact with Food (AFC) on hydrocyanic acid in flavourings and other food ingredients with flavouring properties.<sup>11</sup>

## 8.3. European Commission

The Panel was informed by the EC representative attending the current plenary meeting about the following calls for data, recently published on the Commission website as part of the follow-up of the re-evaluation programme for food additives:

- Call for scientific and technical data on the permitted food additive processed Eucheuma seaweed (E 407a)<sup>12</sup>:
  - Deadline for step 1 (Registration of the contact details of business operators interested in submitting data): 30 November 2018
  - Deadline for step 2 (Confirmation of data submission, deadlines and milestones): 31 January 2019
- Call for scientific and technical data on the permitted food additives calcium silicate (E 552), magnesium silicate (E 553a(i)), magnesium trisilicate (E 553a(ii)) and talc (E 553b)<sup>13</sup>:
  - Deadline for step 1 (Registration of the contact details of business operators interested in submitting data): 6 December 2018
  - Deadline for step 2 (Confirmation of data submission, deadlines and milestones): 15 April 2019

## 9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

No other scientific topics were presented for information and/or discussion.

## 10. Any Other Business

As a follow-up of the scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of glutamic acid and glutamates as food additives (E 620-625) adopted by the former ANS Panel in June 2017<sup>14</sup>, the FAF Panel received feedback from the Dietary Glutamate Workshop organised by the International Glutamate Technical Committee (IGTC) at the beginning of October 2018 and attended by one member of the EFSA staff as an observer.

<sup>11</sup> <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/j.efsa.2004.105>

<sup>12</sup> [https://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/fs\\_improv-additive\\_call\\_20181012\\_data-e407a.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/fs_improv-additive_call_20181012_data-e407a.pdf)

<sup>13</sup> [https://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/fs\\_improv-additive\\_call\\_2018102\\_data-e552-e553ai-e553aii-e553b.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/food/sites/food/files/safety/docs/fs_improv-additive_call_2018102_data-e552-e553ai-e553aii-e553b.pdf)

<sup>14</sup> <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/j.efsa.2017.4910>