

Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

Minutes of the 2nd Plenary meeting

Held on 11-13 September 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 02 October 2018)

Participants

■ Panel Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Laurence Castle, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Maria José Frutos Fernandez, Peter Fürst¹, Ursula Gundert-Remy, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy², Wim Mennes, Peter Moldeus, Sandra Rainieri, Romina Shah, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Detlef Wölflé and Maged Younes

■ Hearing Experts:

Dominique Parent-Massin for agenda item 6.2

Matthew Wright for agenda item 9.1

■ European Commission representatives:

DG SANTE (Health and Food Safety), E2 Food processing technologies and novel foods: Jiri Sochor

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Claudia Roncancio Peña, Eleonora Alquati, Maria Carfi, Anna Christodoulidou, Dimitrios Chrysafidis, Alessandra Giarola, Federica Lodi, Carla Martino, Fabiola Pizzo, Ana Maria Rincon, Camilla Smeraldi, Alexandra Tard and Giorgia Vianello

PRAS Unit: Maria Anastassiadou

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants in the meeting.

Apologies were received from Agneta Oskarsson.

¹ Participated by web-conference only on the 13th September

² Participated by web-conference only on the 12th September

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Plenary meeting held on 4-5 July 2018, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 1st Plenary meeting held on 4-5 July 2018 were agreed by written procedure on 24 July 2018⁵.

5. Report on written procedures since 1st Plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

Food Additives

6.1. Re-evaluation of thermally oxidized soya bean oil interacted with mono and diglycerides of fatty acids (E479b) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00567](#))

The FAF Panel was presented for the first time with a draft scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of the already permitted food additive thermally oxidized soya bean oil interacted with mono and diglycerides of fatty acids (E479b) together with the main points for discussion.

The FAF Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/event/180704-1-m.pdf>

6.2. Re-evaluation of phosphoric acid, phosphates, di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-341; E 343; E 450-452) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00618](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00619](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00620](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00621](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00622](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00623](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00624](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00625](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00626](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00628](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00629](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00630](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00532](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00533](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00534](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00535](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00536](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00537](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00538](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00539](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00540](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00541](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00542](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00543](#))

The draft opinion on the re-evaluation of the safety of phosphoric acid, phosphates, di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-341; E 343; E 450-452) as food additives was presented to the members of the FAF Panel together with the main points for discussion.

The Panel reviewed the technical part and toxicological part of the opinion which is still to be finalised by the Working Group and identified the need for additional information to be requested from the interested parties.

The draft opinion will be further elaborated by the WG following the recommendations from the Panel and taking into account the additional information requested.

The revised draft opinion will be scheduled for discussion and possible adoption at a forthcoming plenary meeting.

In the meantime, the Panel also agreed that the FIP Unit should keep the NUTRI Unit informed about the progress made on the opinion, given that the topic may be also of their relevance.

Flavourings

6.3. Scientific Opinion of Flavouring Group Evaluation 411 (FGE.411): 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-1H-pyrazol-3-yl-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl)acetamide ([EFSA-Q-2015-00820](#))

The FAF Panel was presented for the first time with a draft scientific opinion on the Flavouring Group Evaluation 411 (FGE.411): 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-1H-pyrazol-3-yl-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl)acetamide together with the main points for discussion. The FAF Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

6.4. Scientific Opinion on Flavouring Group Evaluation 200, Revision 1 (FGE.200 Rev.1): 74 α,β -unsaturated aliphatic aldehydes and precursors from chemical subgroup 1.1.1 of FGE.19 ([EFSA-Q-2018-00148](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00149](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00150](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00151](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00152](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00153](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00154](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00155](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00156](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00157](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00158](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00159](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00160](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00161](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00162](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00163](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00164](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00165](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-](#)

[00166](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00167](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00168](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00169](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00170](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00171](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00172](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00173](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00174](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00175](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00176](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00177](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00178](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00179](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00180](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00181](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00182](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00183](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00184](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00185](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00186](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00187](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00188](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00189](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00190](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00191](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00192](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00193](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00194](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00195](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00196](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00197](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00198](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00199](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00200](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00201](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00202](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00203](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00204](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00205](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00206](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00207](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00208](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00209](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00210](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00211](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00212](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00213](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00214](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00215](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00216](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00217](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00218](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00219](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00220](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00626](#))

The FAF Panel was presented for the first time with the draft first revision of the scientific opinion on the Flavouring Group Evaluation 200 (FGE.200). The FAF Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

6.5. Scientific Opinion on Flavouring Group Evaluation 201 Revision 2 (FGE.201Rev2): 2-Alkylated, aliphatic, acyclic alpha,beta-unsaturated aldehydes and precursors, with or without additional double-bonds, from chemical subgroup 1.1.2 of FGE.19 ([EFSA-Q-2017-00117](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00118](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00119](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00120](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00121](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00122](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00123](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00124](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00412](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00413](#))

The FAF Panel was presented for the first time with the draft second revision of the scientific opinion on the Flavouring Group Evaluation 201 (FGE.201). The FAF Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

7. New Mandates

Food Additives

7.1. Request for a scientific opinion of EFSA on the extension of use of phosphoric acid - phosphates - di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-452) in confectionary and sodium diphosphate (E 450) in tortilla (M-2018-0125)

This mandate covers two different applications for proposed extension of use, one concerning phosphoric acid - phosphates - di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-452) in confectionery (EFSA-Q-2018-00597) and a second one related to disodium

diphosphate (E 450(i)) in tortilla (EFSA-Q-2018-00598), the latter still under consideration by EFSA.

Pending confirmation of validity of these applications, the scientific assessments will be carried out by the Panel together with the re-evaluation of the food additives (see agenda item 6.2).

7.2. Scientific opinion on the safety of Annatto E and on the exposure to the Annatto colouring principles bixin and norbixin (E160b) when used as food additives (M-2018-0139)

This mandate from the European Commission (EC) covers a request for assessment (EFSA-Q-2018-00620) of new data generated by interested parties as a follow-up from the re-evaluation of annatto extracts (E 160b) as a food additive completed by the former ANS Panel in 2016⁶. The data to be assessed under the mandate mainly relate to the results from new genotoxicity studies and new proposed uses and use levels of the food additive.

The Panel agreed that the preparatory work should be carried out by a new WG, tasked with the scientific evaluation of the new data provided in response to the follow-up call launched by the European Commission. The Panel noted that the deadline set by the EC for completing this assessment is 31 March 2019.

Following consultation with the Head of FIP Unit, the Chair of the FAF Panel nominated Gabriele Aquilina as Chair of this new Working Group.

7.3. Scientific opinion on a new reproductive toxicity study for the permitted food additives sorbic acid (E200) and potassium sorbate (E202) (M-2018-0140)

This mandate from the EC covers a request for assessment (EFSA-Q-2018-00137) of new data generated by interested parties as a follow-up from the re-evaluation of sorbic acid (E 200) and potassium sorbates (E 202) as a food additives completed by the former ANS Panel in 2015⁷. The data to be assessed under the mandate mainly relate to the results from a new reproductive toxicity study.

Upon acceptance of this mandate, the Panel agreed with the setting up of a new WG, tasked with the preparatory work for the scientific assessment of the new data provided in response to the follow-up call launched by the European Commission. The Panel noted that the deadline set by the EC for completing this assessment is 31 January 2019.

Following consultation with the Head of FIP Unit, the Chair of the FAF Panel nominated Ine Waalkens-Berendsen as Chair of this new Working Group.

7.4. Scientific opinion on the proposed amendment of the specification of the food additive titanium dioxide (E171) (M-2018-0144)

This mandate from the EC covers a request for assessment (EFSA-Q-2018-00625) of new data generated by interested parties as a follow-up from the re-evaluation of titanium dioxide (E 171) completed by the former ANS Panel in 2016⁸. The data to be assessed under the mandate relate to information on the specifications of the food

⁶ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.2903/j.efsa.2016.4544>

⁷ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.2903/j.efsa.2015.4144>

⁸ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.2903/j.efsa.2016.4545>

additive, in particular data on particle size and particle size distribution and how this information could support the proposed amendment of the existing EU specifications.

Upon acceptance of this mandate, the Panel agreed with the setting up of a new WG, tasked with the preparatory work for the scientific assessment of the new data provided in response to the follow-up call launched by the European Commission. The Panel noted that the deadline set by the EC for completing this assessment is nine months from the receipt of the mandate, i.e. 23 May 2019, provided that no additional information is sought from interested parties.

Following consultation with the Head of FIP Unit, the Chair of the FAF Panel nominated Peter Furst as Chair of this new Working Group.

The Panel further noted that this mandate is likely to be the first one of a group of similar mandates that are expected to be received from the EC and related to the follow-up activities of other food additives for which additional data on the characterisation of the material used as a food additive has been requested as a follow-up to their re-evaluation.

7.5. Request for a scientific opinion from the European Food Safety Authority on the extension of use for shellac (E 904) as a carrier in food colours intended for printing of edible collagen casings (M-2018-0146)

This mandate covers a request for assessment of an application for a proposed extension of use of the food additive shellac (E 904) (EFSA-Q-2018-00628). Pending confirmation of validity of this new application, the preparatory work for the scientific assessment will be carried out by the existing WG Miscellaneous, jointly with the re-evaluation of the food additive.

Flavourings

7.6. Urgent Request for re-evaluation of Flavouring substances from FGE.208 (FGE.19 subgroup 2.2) (M-2018-0137)

This mandate covers a request for assessment of additional genotoxicity studies on the flavouring substance myrtenal (EFSA-Q-2018-00618), still under consideration by EFSA.

Pending confirmation of validity of this new request, the preparatory work for the scientific assessment will be carried out by the existing WG Flavourings.

8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

8.1. Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

8.1.1. FAF WG Food Additives Applications

The Chair provided feedback from the first meeting held on 11 September 2018. The minutes from the first meeting will be available on the Authority's webpage

8.1.2.FAF WG on the Re-evaluation of miscellaneous food additives

The WG will meet for the first time on 24-25 September 2018. Feedback will be provided at the next Panel plenary meeting.

8.1.3.FAF WG on Phosphates

Feedback from the first meeting held on 28-29 August 2018 was already provided under the agenda item 6.2. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the Panel further to what is already recorded in the minutes of the WG.

8.1.4.FAF WG on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age

The Chair provided feedback from the first meeting held on 10-11 September 2018. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the Panel further to what is already recorded in the minutes of the WG.

8.1.5.FAF WG on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners

The WG will meet for the first time on 26-28 September 2018. Feedback will be provided at the next Panel plenary meeting.

8.1.6.FAF WG on Sweeteners

The WG will meet for the first time in October 2018. Feedback will be provided at the next Panel plenary meeting.

8.1.7.FAF WG on Flavourings

The WG will meet for the first time in October 2018. Feedback will be provided at the next Panel plenary meeting.

8.2. EFSA including its Working Groups/Task Forces

Panel members were informed about the outcome of the election of the Chair of the EFSA Scientific Committee.

8.3. European Commission

No feedback provided.

9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

9.1. Re-evaluation of Quillaia extract (E 999) as a food additive combined with evaluation of an application for its extension of use as a food additive in 'flavourings' ([EFSA-Q-2011-00731](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00095](#))

The view of the Panel was sought with respect to the additional information submitted in response to a request from EFSA during the assessment of a proposed extension of use of the food additive Quillaia extract (E 999) jointly with its re-evaluation.

The advice from the Panel will be further considered by the WG on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners at a forthcoming meeting.

9.2. Evaluation of Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) - FGE. 501 – additional information ([EFSA-Q-2015-00821](#))

The view of the Panel was sought with respect to the additional information submitted in response to a request from EFSA during the evaluation of the grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) - FGE. 501.

The Panel reviewed the data submitted and identified the need for additional information to be requested to the applicant.

10. Any Other Business