

Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 71th Plenary meeting

Held on 19 to 21 September 2017, Lisbon (Portugal)

(Agreed on 09/10/2017)¹

Participants

a) Panel Members

Claudia Bolognesi, Kevin Chipman, Jean-Pierre Cravedi, Roland Franz, Paul Fowler, Konrad Grob, Rainer Gürtler², Maria Rosaria Milana, Wim Mennes, Sirpa Orvokki Kärenlampi, Gilles Rivière, Vittorio Silano, Jannavi Srinivasan, Christina Tlustos³, Karla Pfaff, Maria De Fátima Tavares Poças, Detlef Wölfle and Holger Zorn

b) European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

- DG SANTE: Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell³

c) EFSA:

- Food Ingredients and Packaging (FIP) Unit: Margarita Aguilera-Gomez, Maria Anastassiadou, Mary Carfi, Anna F. Castoldi⁴, Claudia Roncancio Peña, Ellen Van Haver.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants and expressed his gratitude to Dra Maria Antonia Calhau for hosting the meeting at the premises of the Instituto Nacional Dr. Ricardo Jorge (Lisbon). Apologies were received from Laurence Castle, Karl-Heinz Engel and Trine Husøy.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Committee/Scientific Panel/ Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI or the SDoI, please refer to the

¹ Adopted by written procedure

² Participated on 20 and 21 September 2017

³ Attended on 19 September via teleconference

⁴ Participated via teleconference for agenda item 8.2.1

Annex. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 70th Plenary meeting held on 5-6 July 2017, Parma

The minutes of the 70th Plenary meeting held on 5-6 July were agreed on 20 July 2017 by written procedure⁵.

5. Report on the written procedures since 70th Plenary meeting

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of the flavouring substances evaluated in FGE.502: GRILLIN' 5078 (EFSA-Q-2016-00002) was adopted by written procedure on 25 July 2017.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

6.1 Xylanase from a genetically modified *Bacillus subtilis* (LMGS-28356) ([EFSA-Q-2014-00733](#))

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of the food enzyme Xylanase from a genetically modified *Bacillus subtilis* strain TD160(229) was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

6.2 Pullulanase from *Pullulanibacillus naganoensis* (AE-PL) ([EFSA-Q-2015-00451](#))

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of the food enzyme Pullulanase from *Pullulanibacillus naganoensis* strain AE-PL was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

6.3 FGE.73Rev4 ([EFSA-Q-2017-00250](#), [EFSA-Q-2017-00251](#), [EFSA-Q-2017-00252](#), [EFSA-Q-2017-00253](#))

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of the flavouring substances evaluated in FGE.73Rev4 was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

6.4 FGE.410: [FL-no: 16.132] 4',5,7- trihydroxyflavanone ([EFSA-Q-2015-00567](#))

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of the flavouring substances evaluated in FGE.410 was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

6.5 Ethyl acrylate ([EFSA-Q-2016-00426](#))

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/170503>

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of the flavouring substance ethyl acrylate was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

6.6 Benzophenone ([EFSA-Q-2016-00425](#))

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of the flavouring substance benzophenone was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

6.7 Evaluation of [3-(2,3-Epoxypropoxy)propyl]trimethoxy silane ([EFSA-Q-2016-00001](#))

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of [3-(2,3-Epoxypropoxy)propyl]trimethoxy silane, for use in food contact materials was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

6.8 Evaluation of Kronos recycling process ([EFSA-Q-2016-00704](#))

The draft opinion on the safety evaluation of Kronos recycling process was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

7. New Mandates

7.1 New questions since the previous meeting

The following new mandates have been received since the last Plenary meeting: six for food contact materials and two for processing aids.

Food Sector	EFSA-Q-Number	Subject	Reception date
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00590	Update of the risk assessment for Bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (DEHP, FCM No 283)	14/07/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00589	Update of the risk assessment for butyl-benzyl-phthalate (BBP, FCM No 159)	14/07/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00588	Update of the risk assessment for di-butylphthalate (DBP, FCM No 157)	14/07/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00608	Request for safety re-evaluation of alcohols, C16-C18, ethoxylated, for use in plastics	27/07/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00616	Request for safety evaluation of EstPak Plastik recycling process (Starlinger viscotec deCON technology)	10/08/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00645	Request for the evaluation of a substance: tris(2-ethylhexyl) benzene-1,2,4-tricarboxylate	01/09/2017
Food hygiene	EFSA-Q-2017-00666	Organic acids lactic and acetic acid to reduce microbiological surface contamination on pork carcasses and pork cuts	13/09/2017
Food hygiene	EFSA-Q-2017-00667	Lactic acid to reduce microbiological surface contamination on carcasses from wild game and small stock	13/09/2017

7.2 Valid questions since the previous meeting

The following questions have been considered valid for the start of the assessment since the last Plenary meeting: eight for the safety assessment of enzymes and four for the safety assessment of food contact materials.

Food Sector	EFSA-Q-Number	Subject	Valid on
ENZ	EFSA-Q-2017-00546	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Maltogenic amylase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> (strain BABSC)	14/08/2017
ENZ	EFSA-Q-2017-00544	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Phospholipase D from <i>Kitasatospora paracochleata</i>	11/08/2017
ENZ	EFSA-Q-2017-00543	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Bacillolysin from <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> (strain HPN 131)	11/08/2017
ENZ	EFSA-Q-2016-00867	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Bromelain from <i>Ananas comosus</i>	31/08/2017
ENZ	EFSA-Q-2016-00866	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Ficin from <i>Ficus glabrata</i>	31/08/2017
ENZ	EFSA-Q-2016-00273	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from <i>Aspergillus niger</i> (DP-Azb60)	22/08/2017
ENZ	EFSA-Q-2016-00141	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Beta-galactosidase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Aspergillus oryzae</i> (DP-Bzg59)	22/08/2017
ENZ	EFSA-Q-2015-00562	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> (CBS 613.94)	02/08/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00590	Update of the risk assessment for Bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (DEHP, FCM No 283)	21/07/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00589	Update of the risk assessment for butyl-benzyl-phthalate (BBP, FCM No 159)	21/07/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00588	Update of the risk assessment for di-butylphthalate (DBP, FCM No 157)	20/07/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2016-00128	Demande d'évaluation du groupe de substance suivant Ln 1,4-Benzene dicarboxylic acid(with Ln=La,Eu,Gd,Tb)" afin de l'inclure dans l'annexe I du règlement (UE) n° 10/2011 en tant qu' additif de matières plastiques	08/09/2017

These questions were assigned to the respective working groups.

7.3 Withdrawn questions since the previous meeting

Two applications for the safety assessment of food contact materials have been withdrawn since the last CEF Plenary meeting.

Food Sector	EFSA-Q-Number	Subject	withdrawn on
FCM	EFSA-Q-2017-00438	Request for the evaluation of a substance: Amines, bis(hydrogenated palm-oil alkyl)hydroxy	24/07/2017
FCM	EFSA-Q-2016-00016	Request for safety evaluation of Cyclooctene Monomer for use as a monomer in plastics	10/08/2017

8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

8.1 Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel including their Working Groups

8.1.1 Scientific Committee and its Working Groups

The Scientific Committee Plenary was held on 13-14 September 2017. The Chair provided feedback on the main issues discussed.

The Chair presented the cross-cutting guidelines, including those that have been recently adopted by the Scientific Committee. The Chair discussed possible options for implementing these new or revised risk assessment methodologies by the working groups of the CEF Panel.

8.1.2 CEF SWG Food Enzymes

No updates were provided

8.1.3 CEF SWG Genotoxicity

No updates were provided

8.1.4 CEF SWG Recycling Plastics

No updates were provided

8.1.5 CEF SWG Food Contact Materials

No updates were provided

8.1.6 CEF SWG Flavourings

No updates were provided

The Panel was informed about the need for establishing two new *ad hoc* Working Groups: a WG on phthalates and a WG on the evaluation of chemical substances to remove microbial surface contamination from products of animal origin. The set-up of the WG on phthalates follows a request from the European Commission to update the risk assessment of three phthalates for use in food contact materials based on an opinion of the Risk Assessment Committee of ECHA proposing an amendment of Annex XVII to REACH. The WG on the evaluation of chemical substances to remove microbial surface contamination from products of animal origin will need to perform the risk assessment of two new mandates as referred to in section 7.1 (food sector: 'food hygiene').

The head of the FIP Unit informed the Panel about new challenges in the future, regarding a decrease in budget that will be available in 2018 for the organisation of meetings. The EFSA Units are therefore requested to optimise the use of available resources.

8.2 EFSA including its Working Groups/Task Forces

8.2.1 BPA assessment protocol

Anna F. Castoldi presented to the Panel an overview of comments that were received during the public consultation on the draft BPA hazard assessment protocol. The Panel was also informed about the outcome of the Stakeholder meeting that took place 14th of September. The presentations that were given at that meeting are published on the EFSA website: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/170914>.

8.3 European Commission

No updates were provided.

9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

This item was deferred to the next plenary meeting.

10. Any Other Business

The Panel was informed about the addition of an amendment note to a food enzyme opinion that was published in May 2017. This note was triggered by a letter from the European Dairy Association (EDA) concerning the word “whey” appearing in that opinion. EDA reminded EFSA that “whey” is protected by Regulation (EU) No 1308/2013, and can be used only for milk products with animal origin (EDA recently won a case law at the European Court of Justice about such term protection). Following advice of the legal service, EFSA republished the opinion (<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/j.efsa.2017.4757/full>) by replacing the term “whey” by “aqueous extract” throughout to comply with EU legislation and case law.

The guidelines for observers were presented to the CEF Panel members in view of the CEF plenary meeting of 28-30 November 2017 that will be partially open to observers.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI) or Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST: In his SDoI, Dr Roland Franz declared the following interest for agenda item 6.7 (Evaluation of [3-(2,3-Epoxypropoxy)propyl]trimethoxy silane) and agenda item 6.8. (Evaluation of Kronos recycling process). Concerning agenda item 6.7, his lab has done some experimental work for the petitioner of the dossier and the results are included in the technical annex of the dossier. Concerning agenda item 6.8: in general, his lab has prepared dossiers in the area of recycled plastics for food contact for industry for submission to US-FDA and evaluation by EFSA. For the recycling process under evaluation (item 6.8.) his lab has contributed with technical-experimental work in support of this dossier and prepared this dossier for the petitioner. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁷, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest. This results in exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other processing of items 6.7 and 6.8 by the concerned scientific group.

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>