

## Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare

### Minutes of the 106<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting

**Held on 28-29-30 June 2017, Parma, (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 11 July 2017)**

#### **Participants**

##### ■ Panel Members

Anette Bøtner, Dominique Bicot, Andy Butterworth, Paolo Calistri, Sandra Edwards (day 2 only), Bruno Garin-Bastuji, Margaret Good, Christian Gortazar Schmidt, Hans Hermann Thulke, Virginie Michel, Miguel Angel Miranda, Simon More, Mohan Raj, Søren Saxmose Nielsen, Liisa Sihvonen, Hans Spoolder, Jan Arend Stegeman, Antonio Velarde Calvo and Preben Willeberg

##### ■ EFSA

ALPHA UNIT: Beatriz Beltran-Beck, Alessandro Broglia, Denise Candiani, Sofie Dhollander, Chiara Fabris, Andrey Gogin, Lisa Kohnle, Nikolaus Kriz, Joana Morgado, Frank Verdonck, Gabriele Zancanaro (ALPHA), Ana Garcia (AMU), Francesca Avanzini and Bray Edward (EXREL)

##### ■ EUROPEAN COMMISSION (via teleconference)

DG SANTE: Francisco Reviriego Gordejo, Maria Pittman, Stanislav Ralchev

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The chair welcomed the meeting participants. Apologies were received from Klaus Depner and Christoph Winckler.

#### **2. Adoption of the agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel Members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests (DoI), EFSA screened the Annual (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) provided by the Panel Members for the present meeting. The Panel members were asked to confirm that no further interests had to be declared in the context of the agenda of the meeting. No conflict of interest has been identified.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 105<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting held on 10-11 May**

## 2017, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the previous plenary meeting have been adopted by written procedure.

### 5. New Mandates

Not applicable

### 6. Scientific outputs submitted for possible adoption

- **Scientific opinion on the listing and categorisation of animal diseases in the framework of the Animal Health Law on Paratuberculosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00588), Enzootic Bovine Leukosis (EBL) (EFSA-Q-2016-00156), Avian Mycoplasmosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00600), Salmonella (EFSA-Q-2016-00601), Anthrax (EFSA-Q-2016-00590), Bovine Viral Diarrhoea (BVD) (EFSA-Q-2016-00585), Equine Encephalomyelitis (Eastern And Western) (EFSA-Q-2016-00595), Infectious Bovine Rhinotracheitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00586), Porcine Reproductive and Respiratory Syndrome (EFSA-Q-2016-00587), West Nile Fever (EFSA-Q-2016-00592), Japanese Encephalitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00594), Venezuelan Equine Encephalomyelitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00596), Borna Disease (EFSA-Q-2016-00597), Bovine Tuberculosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00598)**

The following scientific opinions on the listing and categorisation of animal diseases in the framework of the Animal Health Law were adopted by written procedure: on 9 June- Aujeszky's disease (EFSA-Q-2015-00713), Infection with *Brucella abortus*, *B. melitensis* and *B. suis* (EFSA-Q-2016-00591), Ebola virus disease (EFSA-Q-2016-00602), Low Pathogenic Avian Influenza (EFSA-Q-2016-00599), *Trypanosoma evansi* infections (including Surra) (EFSA-Q-2016-00593); on 18 June- Koi herpes virus disease (EFSA-Q-2016-00589).

On 30 June, the following Scientific opinion on the listing and categorisation of animal diseases in the framework of the Animal Health Law were adopted:

1. Enzootic Bovine Leukosis (EBL) (EFSA-Q-2016-00156),
2. Avian Mycoplasmosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00600),
3. *Salmonella* (EFSA-Q-2016-00601),
4. Bovine Viral Diarrhoea (BVD) (EFSA-Q-2016-00585),
5. Equine Encephalomyelitis (Eastern And Western) (EFSA-Q-2016-00595),
6. Infectious Bovine Rhinotracheitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00586),
7. Porcine Reproductive and Respiratory Syndrome (EFSA-Q-2016-00587),
8. West Nile Fever (EFSA-Q-2016-00592),
9. Japanese Encephalitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00594),
10. Venezuelan Equine Encephalomyelitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00596),
11. Borna Disease (EFSA-Q-2016-00597),
12. Paratuberculosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00588),
13. Anthrax (EFSA-Q-2016-00590),
14. Bovine Tuberculosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00598).

The Panel endorsed the text related to 'Parameter 8 - Risk of introduction by possible entry routes' to be added to the Scientific opinion on the listing and categorisation of animal diseases in the framework of the Animal Health Law on Ebola virus disease (EFSA-Q-2016-00602) before its publication.

- **Art. 29: Scientific opinion on Bluetongue (TOR 4-5) (EFSA-Q-2016-00624)**

BT opinion on ToR 4 and 5 of the mandate was tabled for adoption. The main discussion was about the output of the judgement about morbidity and transmissibility of BTV-1-24 for category A and B was discussed. The interpretation of both criteria used by the Panel has been elaborated in the document. The underlying information supports that morbidity in cattle may be limited but in sheep there have been scenarios with high morbidity. In line with that, it was decided to add an explanatory footnote clarifying that the judgement has been made by considering all species together and looking at the highest values (worst case), thus ending up in scoring BTV-1-24 as with high morbidity, but actually the situation can be different in the different host species.

For the transmissibility the judgement was reconsidered, and non-consensus output was reached, with minority of judges assigning BTV-1-24 to high transmissibility.

Other inputs and comments provided before the meeting were discussed and endorsed when considered relevant by the Panel.

The BT opinion was finally unanimously adopted.

## **7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion**

### 7.1 Scientific opinion on avian influenza (EFSA-Q-2015-00214)

The following draft chapters and the corresponding appendices were discussed: LPAI introduction via wild birds, HPAI and LPAI introduction via non-wild bird pathways, biosecurity and zoning. The terminology will be clarified for instance for 'entering birds'. The legal requirements regarding live birds and pet birds will be unravelled and the methodology of the qualitative assessment of the non-wild bird pathways will be elaborated. The figures in the biosecurity chapter will be moved to the corresponding appendix whereas a summary text will be included in the body of the opinion. The necessity to maintain biosecurity throughout the year will be mentioned. Experts will be contacted to elaborate on biosecurity measures regarding insemination teams, introduction of males in breeding flocks and early removal of birds from a production unit. It will be clarified in the text that it is not possible to establish an algorithm to determine an exit strategy to lift housing orders. A first discussion of the conclusions took place and the main views of the WG regarding AI surveillance were presented and discussed.

### 7.2 Scientific opinion concerning the use of low atmosphere pressure system (LAPS) for stunning poultry (EFSA-Q-2016-00327)

An update on the progress of the LAPS opinion was provided including a detailed explanation and discussion on the methodology that is developed by the WG. An extensive literature review regarding currently available stunning methods for chickens is ongoing and an Expert Knowledge Elicitation will be performed to rank welfare hazards relevant for poultry stunning methods.

## **8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission**

### **8.1 EFSA including its Working Groups /Task Forces**

#### **8.1.1 Scientific Network on Risk Assessment in Animal Health and Welfare**

The Panel was informed about the recent meeting held within the frame of the AHAW Network on RA in Animal Health and Welfare. The meeting was held in Parma on 11-12 May 2017. Two main sessions were held at the meeting: 1) presentation of INRA multidisciplinary report on "Animal consciousness" and 2) exercise aimed at the identification and prioritisation of animal welfare topics across Member States. From the INRA report, key findings from the main chapters of the report and conclusions relating to the need for further enhancements to the welfare of livestock animals were presented; the session was moderated by Professor Howard Browman.

For the exercise aimed at the identification and prioritisation of animal welfare topics across Member States, the aim was to identify some AW topics that are of major interest for MSs and where international collaboration amongst risk assessors is desirable. The session was moderated by Professor Linda Keeling. MSs can follow up by initiating collaborations amongst themselves and/or requesting support from EFSA. After summer EFSA will ask the participants about any feedback on the meeting; in the meantime Panel members can request feedback about the meeting and the proposed topics to their national contact points from the AHAW Network.

#### **8.1.1 Scientific Network on National Contact Points from Reg. 1099/2009**

Article 20 of Reg 1099/2009 on the protection of animals at the time of killing foresees that MSs should provide scientific support to assist their national competent authorities for the implementation of the regulation. It also foresees that such scientific support is provided via a network of National Contact Points (NCP). The Panel was informed that EFSA was appointed to have a role in arranging this NCP network, which has been organised within the frame of the AHAW Network. The main task of it is to share: i) scientific and technical expertise relating to the approval of slaughterhouses, ii) scientific opinions on the instructions provided by manufacturers on the use and maintenance of restraining and stunning equipment, iii) scientific opinions on guides to good practice and iv) recommendations in relation to inspections and audits. The 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of National Contact Points was held on 26-27 May 2016 and the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting will be held on 17-18 October 2017.

#### **8.1.2 Discussion of potential emerging risks to AHAW**

The Panel was updated on ASF notification in the Czech Republic and the development of the situation on ASF in Eastern Europe and in the EU has been presented. Models on ASF spread demonstrate that human factor most likely play a crucial role in ASF spread. Available information on the primary ASF cases in wild boar in the Czech Republic was provided. It was mentioned that the wild boar density and specific wild boar and game management (especially supplementary feeding) in the Czech Republic may have serious negative consequences in terms of ASF spread. Analyses of all available data and information on the situation in Ukraine, Moldova and in the Czech Republic will be included in the second report on ASF.

### 8.1.3 Scientific Committee and Scientific Committee Working Groups

The Panel was updated on the outcome of the workshop on uncertainty. The main points of feedback and the proposals for revision were presented and discussed. The Panel will evaluate for each TOR of new mandates if and how uncertainty analysis could be performed taking into account the available time and resources. Uncertainty analysis is not considered relevant for some AHAW outputs (e.g. urgent request to provide descriptive statistics on animal disease outbreaks) and TORs (e.g. reasons for slaughter of pregnant animals, listing of prevention and control measures applied during disease outbreaks). TORs of some mandates will be screened to provide a brief list of examples to the uncertainty WG where implementation of uncertainty analysis is considered not relevant by the Panel.

## 9. Any other business

- An update was provided on procedure and support available to experts regarding interaction with the media on EFSA scientific outputs.
- Feedback was provided from the workshop 'Food Related Issues' in the context of the RONAFAs activities
- The results of the Prometheus impact assessment regarding the scientific opinion on bluetongue were presented.
- The Panel renewal process is open to experts. Deadline for applications is 8 Sep 2017.
- The Panel was informed on recent changes in WG compositions and authors/reviewers of AHL fact sheets.

### Extra Panel session on AHL opinions

28 June 2017, Parma

#### Participants:

#### Panel members:

Dominique BICOUT, Anette BØTNER, Andrew BUTTERWORTH, Paolo CALISTRI, Bruno GARIN-BASTUJI, Margaret GOOD, Christian GORTAZAR SCHMIDT, Virginie MICHEL, Miguel Angel MIRANDA, Søren Saxmose NIELSEN, Liisa SIHVONEN, Simon MORE, Jan Arend STEGEMAN, Hans-Hermann THULKE, Preben WILLEBERG.

#### EFSA:

Alessandro BROGLIA, Lisa KOHNLE, Francesca BALDINELLI, Sofie DHOLLANDER, Frank VERDONCK (ALPHA);

The comments provided beforehand by the AHAW Panel and by the EC on the opinions on

1. Enzootic Bovine Leukosis (EBL) (EFSA-Q-2016-00156),
2. Avian Mycoplasmosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00600),
3. *Salmonella* (EFSA-Q-2016-00601),
4. Bovine Viral Diarrhoea (BVD) (EFSA-Q-2016-00585),
5. Equine Encephalomyelitis (Eastern And Western) (EFSA-Q-2016-00595),
6. Infectious Bovine Rhinotracheitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00586),
7. Porcine Reproductive and Respiratory Syndrome (EFSA-Q-2016-00587),
8. West Nile Fever (EFSA-Q-2016-00592),
9. Japanese Encephalitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00594),

10. Venezuelan Equine Encephalomyelitis (EFSA-Q-2016-00596),
11. Borna Disease (EFSA-Q-2016-00597),
12. Paratuberculosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00588),
13. Anthrax (EFSA-Q-2016-00590),
14. Bovine Tuberculosis (EFSA-Q-2016-00598).

were discussed among the Panel members and endorsed in the text, and in relation to that, where needed, the judgement was revised.