

## Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare

### Minutes of the 102<sup>nd</sup> Plenary meeting

**Held on 17-18 January 2017, Parma, (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 30 January 2017)**

#### **Participants**

■ Panel Members

Anette Bøtner, Dominique Bicot, Andy Butterworth, Paolo Calistri, Sandra Edwards, Bruno Garin-Bastuji, Margaret Good, Christian Gortazar Schmidt, Virginie Michel, Miguel Angel Miranda, Simon More, Mohan Raj, Søren Saxmose Nielsen, Liisa Sihvonon, Hans Spooler, Jan Arend Stegeman, Hans-Hermann Thulke, Antonio Velarde Calvo, Preben Willeberg, Christoph Winckler

■ EFSA

ALPHA UNIT: Francesca Baldinelli, Beatriz Beltran-Beck, Alessandro Broglia, Denise Candiani, Ewelina Czwieczek, Sofie Dhollander, Chiara Fabris, Andrea Gervelmeyer, Andrey Gogin, Lisa Kohnle, Nikolas Kriz, Joana Morgado, Frank Verdonck, Gabriele Zancanaro

■ EUROPEAN COMMISSION

Vasco Antunes, Pierangelo Bernorio, Andrea Gavinelli, Alessandro Gianini, Milos Juras, Laszlo Kuster, Marguerite Kuzma, Barbara Logar, Marina Marini, Laura Perez Alvarez, Maria Pittman, Stanislav Ralchev, Denis Simonin (DG SANTE)

## **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The chair welcomed the meeting participants. Apologies were received by Klaus Depner. Paolo Calistri and Jan Arend Stegeman attended only the discussions on the bluetongue and the vector borne disease mandates, respectively, through a web link, due to weather conditions having impeded their physical attendance of the meeting.

## **2. Adoption of the agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel Members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests (DoI), EFSA screened the Annual (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) provided by the Panel Members for the present meeting. The Panel members were asked to confirm that no further interests had to be declared in the context of the agenda of the meeting. No conflict of interest has been identified.

## **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 101<sup>st</sup> Plenary meeting held on 29 and 30 November 2016, Parma (Italy)**

The minutes of the previous plenary meeting have been adopted by written procedure.

## **5. New Mandates**

- **Request on listing and categorising diseases under the new Animal Health Law (AHL)**

A new request on listing and categorising the following diseases for the new Animal Health Law was presented. The request has the same ToRs as the other mandates submitted in 2016 to EFSA in the context of the new AHL, and encompasses the diseases Bovine genital campylobacteriosis, Trichomonosis, Border disease, Ovine epididymitis (*Brucella ovis*), Contagious bovine pleuropneumonia, Contagious caprine pleuropneumonia and Infestation with *Varroa spp.* (Varroosis). The deadline proposed by the EC is September 2017. EFSA will assess the resources needed to reply to this mandate and consequently suggest a feasible deadline to the EC.

## **6. Scientific outputs submitted for possible adoption**

- **Scientific opinion on Bluetongue (EFSA-Q-2016-00160)**

The opinion covering the first 3 ToRs has been discussed and adopted. Major changes compared to previous version were referred to the section on surveillance.

## **7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion**

- **Scientific opinion on entry routes into the EU of vector borne diseases (EFSA-Q-2014-00187)**

The preliminary output of the risk assessment of 36 vector-borne diseases was presented to the Panel. The Panel was updated on the progress made on the characterisation of these 36 diseases through the map journals. The links to 36 draft

map journals were shared with the Panel, and one example was presented during the plenary meeting. The reviewers of the Panel for each of the 36 diseases were agreed upon. A short presentation was given on the visualisation of the systematic review outputs using micro strategy. The Panel agreed on the presentation of the characterisation of the diseases and the risk assessment in the map journals, and the presentation of the ranking in the scientific opinion.

## 8. Feedback from the ad-hoc Working Groups of the AHAW Panel

### • **Scientific opinion on avian influenza (EFSA-Q-2015-00214)**

The Statement of the AHAW Panel on avian influenza that had been adopted by written procedure on 14 December 2016 has been presented by EFSA to the PAFF committee. The Panel was informed that the Member States appreciated the work that has been done within a short time frame and the usefulness of the output had been underlined. The EC representative also thanked everybody involved in generating the Statement. Member States and EC agreed with the suggestion of EFSA to continue the data collection on the current outbreaks to underpin the scientific opinion that will be delivered in autumn. In addition, a brief overview on the approach to assess biosecurity used in the Statement was provided.

### • **Scientific Opinion on the listing and categorisation of animal diseases in the framework of the new Animal Health Law (EFSA-Q-2015-00713; EFSA-Q-2016-00156)**

The Panel has been updated on the AHL mandate with regard to the state of the completion of the fact-sheets and the planning of the expert judgement (EJ). The timeline of the EJ sessions was presented. They are foreseen for 18-19 January, 8-9 March, 4-5 April, 28 June and 14 September. During the expert judgement session on 18 January the interpretation of the criteria on impact assessment was discussed with the EC, in particular concerning the diseases that are present/endemic in EU and under control. The following interpretation has been agreed with the EC:

- For the questions in art 5: B(i), B(iii) - "The disease causes or could cause ..." and B(v)- The disease has or could have...":
  - In the EJ, the disease impact or negative effects have to be assessed without considering any effect of interventions or control measures that are (if the disease is already present in the EU) or can be put in place (if the disease is exotic and assuming it is introduced into the EU).
- For questions in art. 9 - 4AB, 4C, 5A, 5B, 5C, 5D starting with "the disease has a significant impact on.....":
  - Case 1: for diseases not present (exotic) or present only in exceptional cases, or only in a very limited part of EU:
    - The potential impact should be assessed: using the fact-sheet and collective opinion to assess the impact of the disease, assuming it is introduced into the EU and without considering the effects of any interventions or control measures.
  - Case 2: for diseases that are endemic / present in the whole or part of the Union
    - The current impact should be assessed: using the fact-sheet (which provides information of the current status) and collective opinion to assess the impact of the disease by taking into account the effects of the interventions or control measures that are in place (if any);

- The potential impact should be assessed: when relevant, assess the impact of the disease considering the potential situation in EU if the interventions or control measures in place (if any) would be removed.

Thus, for diseases that are endemic / present in the whole or part of the Union (case 2), two judgements need to be carried out, that will be captured in two separate columns of the judgement document. This option will also be included in the next online judgement round.

Further, it was agreed that for questions 1A, 1B, 1C, 1CAq; 2A, 2B, 2C, 2CAq only one "yes" can be provided across the 4 options.

Regarding the judgements for Salmonella and for Mycoplasma, it was agreed that these need to be split into the different bacterial species only for certain questions. Further clarification on this will be sought from the EC and shared with the Panel.

Depending on the progress achieved in the judgement session in March, the duration of the EJ session on 28th June (full or half day) will be decided.

- **Scientific opinion on animal welfare aspects in respect of the slaughter or killing of pregnant livestock animals (cattle, pigs, sheep, goats, horses) (EFSA-Q-2015-00477)**

A short update on the state of art of this scientific opinion was presented, particularly on the development of ToR4 (methods for stunning and killing of fetuses) and ToR5 (methods for establishing gestational age at slaughter). For ToR4, different scenarios were established for the detection of pregnancy by slaughterhouse operators (at lairage, during evisceration leaving an unopened uterus, during evisceration after accidental opening of the uterus). Further, two separate sets of scenarios are developed for the current circumstances (corresponding to the probability that fetuses do not feel pain) and for the circumstances applying under the precautionary principle (corresponding to the probability that fetuses feel pain).

The next WG meeting will be held on 13-14 February. Considering the progress achieved on the remaining tasks for this opinion, it is considered feasible to discuss the draft opinion for potential adoption during the plenary meeting in April 2017.

- **Scientific opinion concerning the use of low atmosphere pressure system (LAPS) for stunning poultry (EFSA-Q-2016-00327)**

Following the letter sent to the applicants with the request to provide EFSA with the additional data needed by the WG experts, EFSA got a positive answer from the company. Arrangements are ongoing to set up a web-conference between EFSA and the company, to provide the applicants with the opportunity to get clarifications on the statistical analyses to be run, and the additional information requested. In their reply letter the company anticipates that they should be able to provide the information, data and analyses to EFSA by the 31 March 2017. The Panel experts and the EC acknowledge that the time elapsed between the request by EFSA and the provision of the data may have an impact on the completion of the assessment.

## 9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

- **Request for scientific and technical assistance on Lumpy Skin Disease**

An update was given about major milestones in 2016-2017 regarding LSD:

- Dec 2016: GF TADs, Istanbul
- EURL capripox created
- Dec 2016: EFSA WG Meeting with focal points

- Jan 2017: meeting at EMA about vaccine authorisation (EC, EURL)
- March 2017: FAO project on cost benefit analysis : kick-off meeting
- Next GF TADs: Paris, May 2017 (OIE Plenary); Montenegro, Sept 2017

The workshop held at EFSA on 20 Dec 2016 was attended by Greece, Bulgaria, FYROM, Albania, Serbia, Montenegro, Turkey, Kosovo, Croatia, Bosnia Herzegovina and Romania. Data models have been discussed and agreed, and mutual collaboration has been established at the workshop. The EC has been encouraged to send a support letter to CVOs encouraging cooperation with EFSA. The possibility for publishing a special issue in Preventive Veterinary Medicine is being explored, to capitalise on the knowledge being accumulated in affected countries. In addition, drafting a guidance document for conducting field experiments on suspected LSDV vectors is being explored together with the EU Ref Lab.

The first intermediate report is expected to be delivered by the end of February. Dominique Bicout and Anette Bøtner volunteered to peer review the report.

- **Request for a scientific and technical assistance on *Batrachochytrium salamandrivorans* (Bsal)**

The Panel was updated on the progress made on the draft scientific report on Bsal. The sections "Interpretations of the ToRs" and "Data and methodologies" relevant to address the 4 ToRs, the results from the literature review and the ongoing activities to address the mandate were presented. It was highlighted that, in agreement with the EC services, the scientific report should be peer-reviewed by the 15th of February 2017, followed by approval by HoD RASA and publication by the end of February 2017.

- **Request for a scientific and technical assistance on ASF**

The Panel was updated on the remaining tasks and the deadlines for finalising the scientific report.

## **10. Feedback from the European Commission**

The Panel was updated by Andrea Gavinelli, Alessandro Gianini and Denis Simonin about the new Official Controls Regulation (OCR). Key principles of the OCR were explained. The responsibilities of the EU Reference Centres for animal welfare, which will be established in the context of this Regulation, as well as those of the EU Reference Laboratories in the area of animal health, were outlined. In addition, a brief outlook on the future EU Animal Welfare Platform was given.

### **Any other business**

- Open Plenary meeting 2017

The Panel was informed about EFSA's decision to hold the annual open plenary meetings of its Panels in Parma at EFSA premises and to provide live web streaming of the meetings in addition to hosting observers physically. Details about the arrangements and updated observer guidelines will be disseminated in February.