

ED DIRECTORATE

Note to the Management Board

Discussion on the update of the Management Board Decision on the establishment and operations of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and their Working Groups

At the Management Board meeting held on 15 March 2012, the Board adopted a *Decision concerning the establishment and operations of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and of their Working groups.* With the forthcoming renewal of the 10 Scientific Panels and the Scientific Committee approaching (process need to start in early 2017) it is proposed to update that decision to take into account input given on various occasions by the Management Board regarding the selection and operations of the Scientific Committee and Panel members.

At this stage, it is not envisaged to conduct a fundamental rewrite of the existing MB rules.

The proposed update only concentrates on some major issues, such as the number of terms of a Scientific Panel member in the same Panel and the number of members in a Scientific Panel. In addition, the proposal covers the deletion of the reference to some procedural/technical details, e.g. data on mission expenses and indemnities, which are comprehensively covered in EFSA's internal rules.

Concerning the need to attract young exerts and the possibility to reserve for them some posts within Panels, the proposed update only includes a generic recommendation whereby implementation details would be provided by EFSA's internal rules.

The Management Board is invited to provide comments on the attached proposal as well as providing input for further improvements to the document.



Revision of the

DECISION OF THE MANAGEMENT BOARD OF THE EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Concerning the establishment and operations of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and of their Working Groups

Version adopted on 15.03.2012

MB Decision – 15.03.2012	Revised version proposal	
RECIT	ALS	
THE MANAGEMENT BOARD OF THE EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY,		
Having regard to Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 (hereinafter referred to as 'the Regulation') of the European Parliament and the Council of 28 January 2002 laying down the general principles of food law, establishing the European Food Safety Authority and laying down procedures in relation to food safety, and in particular to Chapter III thereof ¹ , Having regard to Commission Regulation (EC) No 1304/2003 of 23 July 2003 on the procedure applied by the		
European Food Safety Authority to requests for scientific opi Whereas:	mons referred to it ,	
(1) The rules governing the establishment and operations of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels should be in line with the requirements of the Regulation (EC) No 178/2002, and in particular Article 28(9) thereof, which requires that the procedures for the operation and co-operation of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels	No changes	
(2) shall be laid down in the internal rules of the		

particular:

European Food Safety Authority, specifying in

¹ OJ L 31, 1.2.2002, p. 1.

² OJ L 185, 24.7.2003, p. 6.



 the number of times that a member can 	
serve consecutively on a Scientific Committee or Scientific Panel;	
 the number of members in each Scientific Panel; 	
 the procedure for reimbursing the expenses of members of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels; 	
 the manner in which tasks and requests for scientific opinions are assigned to the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels, including tasks and requests addressing multisectoral issues; 	
 the creation and organisation of the Working Groups of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels, and the possibility of external experts being included in those Working Groups; 	
 the possibility of observers being invited to meetings of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels; 	
 the possibility of organising public hearings. 	
(3) This document should also be in line with Article 29(7) of the Regulation, requiring that the Authority's internal rules shall specify implementing rules in regard to format, explanatory background and publication of a scientific opinion.	Deleted
(4) The Authority has adopted implementing provisions regarding the Selection of Members of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and External Experts to assist EFSA with its Scientific Work ³ .	Deleted

³ Decision of the Executive Director of EFSA concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work, available at www.efsa.europa.eu



(5) The Authority has adopted implementing provisions regarding the publication of a scientific opinion⁴.	Deleted
(6) The Authority has drafted common templates for scientific opinions and a guide for their coherent use ⁵ .	Deleted
(7) The Authority adopted implementing provisions for the independence of its scientific outputs and for the submission and screening of Declarations of Interest of its experts ⁶	Deleted
	(2) The Authority should aim at ensuring an appropriate age balance among the members of its Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and Working Groups, to facilitate the inclusion of diverse profiles and to foster the assessment expertise talent pool while complying with the principles of non-discrimination and equal treatment. (3) The Authority shall monitor expert members' participation and contribution in Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and their Working Groups meetings

 $^{^4}$ Decision of the Management Board of 10 March 2005 concerning implementing measures of transparency and confidentiality requirements, MB 10.03.2005 – 10.

⁵ Cf. 'Internal EFSA Guidance for Scientific Outputs & Supporting Publications. Templates', Version 0.5.2, as endorsed by the EFSA Joint Science Meeting of 22 November 2011.

⁶ EFSA Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes, adopted by the Management Board of 15 December 2011, and Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, both available at www.efsa.europa.eu



TITLE I

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND SCIENTIFIC PANELS

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND SCIENTIFIC PANELS	
Art.1 Appointment of members of the Scientific Committee and Panels and their Terms of Office	Art.1 Appointment of members of the Scientific Committee and Panels and their Terms of Office
1. Members of the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels shall be appointed by the Management Board, acting upon a proposal from the Executive Director, following publication in the Official Journal, in relevant leading scientific publications and on the Authority's website of a call for expressions of interest. Candidates found suitable for the position but not appointed shall be invited to be included on a reserve list. The Executive Director draws up implementing rules for the selection of members of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels.	 Members of the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels shall be appointed by the Management Board, acting upon a proposal from the Executive Director, following publication in the Official Journal, in relevant leading scientific publications and on the Authority's website of a call for expressions of interest. The Management Board oversees the correct application of the selection procedure. Shortlisted candidates not being proposed for appointment shall be included on a reserve list. The Executive Director draws up implementing rules for the selection of members of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels.
2. When appointing members, the Authority shall ensure a high level of collective scientific competence and expertise to fulfil the mandate of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels, and, consistent with this, a geographical distribution that reflects the diversity of scientific problems and approaches in the European Union.	No changes
3. Members of the Scientific Committee and of the Scientific Panels shall be appointed for a three year term of office that may be renewed twice.	No changes
4. Members who have just completed three or less consecutive terms of office in the Scientific Committee shall be eligible for membership of a Scientific Panel. Likewise, members who have just completed three or less consecutive terms of office in a Scientific Panel shall be	4. Members who have just completed three or less consecutive terms of office in the Scientific Committee shall be eligible for membership of a Scientific Panel. Likewise, members who have just completed three or less terms of office in a Scientific Panel shall be eligible for membership of the Scientific Committee or of a

⁷ Article 28(5) of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002.

eligible for membership of the Scientific Committee or a

for membership of the Scientific Committee or of a

different Scientific Panel. Candidates who have already



different Scientific Panel.	served three terms of office at any time in the Scientific Committee or in a Scientific Panel shall not be eligible for membership of the same scientific entity.
Art.2	Art.2
Delegation of responsibilities	Delegation of responsibilities
1. The members of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels are appointed in a personal capacity. They shall therefore not delegate their responsibilities to another member or to a third person	No changes
2. If the Chair is not in a position to fulfil his/her function,	
he/she may be replaced by one of the vice-Chairs or, failing that, by another member in common accord of the	No changes
members.	
Art.3	Art.3
Number of members in the Scientific Panel	Number of members in the Scientific Panel
1. The number of members of a Scientific Panel should be sufficient to fulfil its mandate but shall not exceed 21. The Authority may however decide to defer nomination of some of the members of a Scientific Panel to allow for the need to add expertise in the light of practical experience.	1. The number of members of a Scientific Panel should be sufficient to fulfil its mandate, ranging from 15 (minimum) to 25 members (maximum) depending on the workload planned for the relevant term of office and the expertise needed. The Authority may decide to defer nomination of some of the members of a Scientific Panel to allow for the need to add expertise in the light of practical experience, emerging risks or urgent requests for scientific advice.
2. The term of office of members nominated at a later date shall terminate at the same time as other members.	2. The term of office of members nominated at a later date shall terminate at the same time as other members. A term of office shorter than 18 months shall not be counted to the purpose of establishing whether the three terms of office set out in Article 1(3) applies.
Art.4	Art.4
Election of the Chairs and vice-Chairs of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels	Election of the Chairs and vice-Chairs of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels
1. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall elect from among their members a Chair and two Vice-Chairs.	1. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall elect from among their members a Chair and two Vice-



The terms of office of the Chair and Vice-Chairs shall be three years, renewable.

Chairs. The terms of office of the Chair and Vice-Chairs shall be three years. In case members having served already a term of office as a Chair or Vice Chair are reappointed to the Scientific Committee or to the same Panel, they may be elected as Chair or Vice Chair for a second term of office. No such possibility shall be granted should they be appointed for a third term.

- 2. The Chair shall be elected by secret ballot. Subject to a unanimous decision by the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel, the secrecy requirement for the ballot may be waived. The Executive Director or his/her designated representative shall chair the election procedures. The procedure shall be as follows:
- (a) The names of those wishing to stand as candidates shall be notified to the Secretariat before the meeting or be announced at the meeting. Members may present themselves as candidates in their own name or be proposed by another member in compliance with the principles referred to in Article 33 of the present Decision.
- (b) Where there is a single candidate or where the other candidates withdraw, leaving a single candidate, that candidate shall be elected provided that he or she receives the majority of votes cast.
- (c) Where there are several candidates, election shall take place in accordance with the following procedure:
 - The candidate who receives at least a twothirds majority of the votes of all members is elected. Where none of the candidates receives a two-thirds majority of the votes of all members, at each round the candidate(s) with the lowest number of votes shall withdraw.
 - When only two candidates are left and after three rounds none of them obtains a twothirds majority, the candidate receiving the majority will be elected.

No changes, except for reference to Art.30 instead of Art.33

- (c) Where there are several candidates, election shall take place in accordance with the following procedure:
 - The candidate who receives at least a two-thirds majority of the votes of all members is elected. Where none of the candidates receives a two-thirds majority of the votes of all members, at each round the candidate(s) with the lowest number of votes shall withdraw.
 - When only two candidates are left and after three-rounds none of them obtains a two thirds majority, the candidate receiving the majority will be elected.



(d) Candidates may withdraw their candidature at any time during the procedure.	No changes
3. Two Vice-Chairs shall be elected following a procedure identical to that of the Chair. The vice-Chairs shall be elected separately. The names of the Chair and Vice-Chairs shall be recorded in the minutes of the meeting and shall be made public. If the office of Chair falls vacant, the Scientific Committee/the relevant Scientific Panel will decide which of the Vice-Chairs shall replace him or her until later elections. If the Chair is unable to attend a meeting or part of a meeting, the Chair indicates which of the Vice-Chairs shall chair the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel. If both the Chair and the Vice-Chairs are unable to attend a meeting, the meeting shall be chaired by the member of the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel chosen by the other members.	3. Two Vice-Chairs shall be elected following a procedure identical to that of the Chair. The vice-Chairs shall be elected separately. The names of the Chair and Vice-Chairs shall be recorded in the minutes of the meeting and shall be made public. If the office of Chair falls vacant, the Scientific Committee/the relevant Scientific Panel will decide which of the Vice-Chairs shall replace him or her until later elections. Remaining text deleted as already covered under 2.2
Art.5 Dismissal and replacement of members	Art.5 Dismissal and replacement of members
A member of the Scientific Committee and/or a Scientific Panel may be dismissed by the Management Board, on a proposal of the Executive Director, for not contributing	
effectively to the work of the Scientific Committee and/or Scientific Panels or for actions which are conflicting with EFSA's internal rules. In those cases, or if a member wishes to resign, the Management Board, acting on a proposal of the Executive Director, may appoint a replacement from the reserve list referred to in Article 1(1).	No changes except for reference to Art. 1(2)instead of 1(1)
Scientific Panels or for actions which are conflicting with EFSA's internal rules. In those cases, or if a member wishes to resign, the Management Board, acting on a proposal of the Executive Director, may appoint a replacement from	

⁸ The Mandate Review Committee (MRC) is entrusted with the task of advising the Executive Director on the allocation of requests of scientific opinion or of scientific or technical assistance received by the European Food Safety Authority or issued by EFSA on its own initiative. The MRC is composed of the Chair of the Scientific Committee, senior management representing the scientific, communications and administrative Directorates and the Head of the Legal and Regulatory Affairs Unit. The MRC is chaired by the Executive Director.



scientific opinion to

either the Scientific Panels in accordance with their mandate as set out below⁹:

- for the **Panel on food additives and nutrient sources**added to food: safety in the use of food additives,
 nutrient sources and other substances deliberately
 added to food, excluding flavourings and enzymes;
- for the Panel on food contact materials, enzymes,
 flavourings and processing aids: safety of use of
 materials in contact with food, enzymes,
 flavourings and processing aids, safety of
 processes;
- for the Panel on additives and products or substances used in animal feed: safety for the animal, the user/worker, the consumer of products of animal origin, the environment and to the efficacy of biological and chemical products/substances intended for deliberate addition/use in animal feed;
- for the Panel on plant protection products and their residues: safety of plant protection products for the user/worker, the consumer of treated products and the environment;

for the Panel on plant health: plant health;

- for the **Panel on genetically modified organisms**:

 genetically modified organisms, such as microorganisms, plants and animals, relating to
 deliberate release into the environment and
 genetically modified food and feed, including
 products deriving from GMOs;
- for the **Panel on dietetic products, nutrition and allergies**: dietetic products, human nutrition and food allergy, and other associated subjects such as novel foods;
- for the **Panel on biological hazards**: biological hazards relating to food safety and food-borne disease, including food-borne zoonoses and transmissible spongiform encephalopathies, microbiology, food hygiene and associated waste management;
- for the **Panel on contaminants in the food chain**: contaminants in food and feed, associated areas

accordance with their mandate⁹ or the Scientific Committee for tasks on multi-sectoral issues and on issues which do not fall within the competence of any of the Scientific Panels.

Deleted

⁹ The mandates of the Scientific Panels are set out in Article 28(4) of the Regulation.



and undesirable substances such as natural toxicants, mycotoxins and residues of non-authorised substances not covered by another Scientific Panel; for the Panel on animal health and welfare: all aspects of animal health and animal welfare, primarily relating to food producing animals including fish; or the Scientific Committee for tasks on multi-sectoral issues and on issues which do not fall within the competence of any of the Scientific Panels.	
2. The Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel may ask the Secretariats to clarify a question or a task assigned to it and/or to supply additional information.	Deleted
3. Requests for a scientific opinion shall be presented by the Secretariat. They will consist of the question, the scientific background and the Community interest. Where necessary a deadline will be specified.	Deleted
Art.7	Art.7
Risk-related issues raised by the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels	Risk-related issues raised by the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels
	•



Art.8 Secretariats of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels	Section covered under new Art.26 with text amendments
The Secretariat shall be responsible for providing the support needed to facilitate the efficient functioning of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels. Specific duties of the Secretariats include but are not limited to:	
 Ensuring best use of the resources allocated to the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels and planning to meet priorities and time-limits; Ensuring compliance with internal rules of the Authority such as those regulating the Declarations of interests, transparency et cetera; Exercising vigilance in order to identify at an early stage any potential source of divergence between the scientific opinion of the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panel and those issued by other bodies carrying out similar tasks; Providing information on the legal or public policy 	
aspects of questions;Preparing the work of the Scientific Committee and	Section covered under new Art.26
Scientific Panels, in consultation with their chairs;	with text amendments
 Drafting agendas and minutes of meetings; Providing support to the work carried out within and between the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels; 	
 Ensuring that relevant background information is made available to the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels; 	
 Assisting the Chairs of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels in the preparation of draft opinions before adoption; 	
 Dealing with requests by the Commission to provide scientific or technical assistance in accordance with Article 31 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002; Ensuring the consistency and quality of editorial 	
aspects of the scientific opinions adopted by the Scientific Panel.	



Art.9 Co-ordination of the work of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels	Art.8 Co-ordination of the work of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels
 The Secretariats of the Scientific Committee and of the Scientific Panels shall assist in ensuring: that the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels work in close co-operation with each other; the avoidance of overlapping or inconsistent opinions, or of diverging opinions issued by bodies carrying out similar tasks. 	Covered under Art.26
 The Chairs of the Scientific Panels shall keep the Scientific Committee informed of their activities through regular reports at meetings of the Scientific Committee. The Scientific Committee shall assist in ensuring consistency in the approach to risk assessment and proper assessment of multi-sectoral issues. 	No changes 2. The Scientific Committee shall be responsible in ensuring consistency in the approach to risk assessment from the development of guidance on methods to its consistent implementation across all Scientific Panels.
Art.10 Planning of meetings ¹⁰ , invitations, agenda, documentation, time limits	Art. 9 Planning of meetings ¹⁰ documentation and time limits
1. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall establish a schedule of their meetings for the forthcoming calendar year.	No changes
2. As a general rule, the Secretariats will endeavour to confirm a meeting of the Scientific Committee and of a Scientific Panel not less than 10 working days before the date of the meeting and shall give notification of cancellation not less than two working days before the date of the meeting.	Deleted
3. Meetings of the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels	Deleted

¹⁰ The definition of meetings includes physical meetings and meetings held by video/audio/web conference, hereinafter referred to as 'tele-meeting'. By way of exception, Article 4(1), (2) and (3) first sentence shall be considered as referring only to meetings.



may be called at short notice according to the urgency of the matter.

- 4. The draft agendas of the meetings of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall be drawn up by the Secretariats in consultation with the Chair. The draft agenda shall be circulated to members, generally within two weeks of the meeting. They shall be published on the Authority's website before the meeting. The agenda shall be adopted at the beginning of the meeting taking account of any agreed amendments.
- 5. Wherever possible, documents including reports and draft opinions prepared by a Rapporteur or a Working Group shall be available to the members one week before that meeting. As regards time-limits for the delivery of scientific opinions, the Authority applies the provisions laid down in Article 7 of Commission Regulation (EC) No 1304/2003. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall prioritise their work to ensure that time-limits are respected.

into account the limited time allocated for the

2. The draft agendas of the meetings of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall be drawn up by the Secretariats in consultation with the Chair. The draft agenda shall be circulated to its members, generally within two weeks of the meeting. and shall be published on the Authority's website before the meeting. The agenda shall be adopted at the beginning of the meeting taking account of any agreed amendments.

3. Wherever possible, documents including reports and draft opinions prepared by a Rapporteur or a Working Group shall be available to the members five working days before that meeting. As regards time-limits for the delivery of scientific opinions, the Authority shall apply the provisions laid down in Article 7 of Commission Regulation (EC) No 1304/2003. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall prioritise their work to ensure that time-limits are respected.

Art.11	Art.10
Accelerated Procedures	Accelerated Procedures
 Without prejudice to Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 and Commission Regulation (EC) No 1304/2003, and when not otherwise established, the procedure to be followed in order to address an urgent matter shall depend inter alia on the degree of urgency and the nature of the question and may be either: (a) A response that may take the form of a statement or opinion adopted either by the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel and issued by the Authority. The development and adoption of a statement or an opinion shall be undertaken by the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel as far as possible in accordance with standard operating procedures, under the Executive Director's direction and taking 	No changes
8	



response to the question (fast track); (b) A statement by the Authority prepared by the Authority's members of staff. The Chair of the Scientific Committee or of the relevant Scientific Panel shall be informed of the question and the process. Experts from the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel and/or a Working Group may be consulted during the process.	
2. Where necessary, implementing rules for the procedures described in (a) and (b) of paragraph 1 will be adopted by the Executive Director.	No changes
	Art.11 Public/targeted consultation
	 In line with its commitment to advance public and stakeholder engagement in the context of its scientific assessment process, the Authority, in consultation with its Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels, may decide to launch a public or targeted consultation on a given mandate or on a draft scientific output. The responsible Scientific Committee, Scientific
	Panel or Working Group shall take account of the comments received during the consultation.
	3. All comments received during the public consultation shall be published together with a report outlining EFSA's response to the points raised.
Art.12 Written Procedures	Art.12 Written Procedures
In the event that the nature, urgency or circumstances do not necessitate or allow discussion at a meeting, a draft opinion, a statement or guidance may be adopted by written procedure. In this case, the Secretariats shall send the draft opinion to the members of the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel with a request	No changes



for approval by a specified date. The draft shall be adopted if the majority of the members of the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panel have expressed their approval before the deadline. If a majority is not reached, the draft opinion must be placed on the agenda for the next meeting of the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel or, if the urgency requires this, an ad-hoc meeting shall be convened at the earliest date at which the quorum can be assured. The conclusion of the written procedure needs to be included in the minutes of the meeting.	
Art.13 Quorum and majority	Art.13 Adoption of a scientific Committee/Panel Output
Reference to Art. 15	1. The Scientific Committee and individual Scientific Panels shall adopt their scientific opinions at their plenary meetings or by one of the procedures set out in Article 10 or 12.
1. A quorum of at least two thirds of the members of the Scientific Committee or of a Scientific Panel shall have to be present in order to be able to adopt opinions validly.	No changes
2. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall adopt opinions by a majority of their members.	3. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall adopt opinions by majority of their members. Individual members of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels may express a minority opinion at the conditions set out in Article 15. Abstention shall not be allowed.
Reference to Art. 15	4. A scientific opinion shall comprise the question posed by the Commission, the Parliament, a Member State or the Authority itself, the terms of reference, the background to the request, the information considered the scientific reasoning and the opinion of the Scientific Committee or the Scientific Panel.
Reference to Art. 15 except highlighted part	5. With the exception of the elements of the opinion considered confidential pursuant to Article 39 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 or relevant sectoral legislation, the full scientific opinion shall be published



	without delay on the Authority's website.
Art.14 Access to meetings and confidentiality of individual views of participants	Art.14 Access to meetings and confidentiality of individual views of participants
1. The representatives of the Commission's departments shall be entitled to be present in the meetings. If invited to do so, they may assist for the purposes of clarification or information but shall not seek to influence discussions.	1. The representatives of the Commission's departments shall be entitled to be present in the meetings. If invited to do so, they may assist for the purposes of clarification or information but shall not seek to influence discussions. In case EFSA receives a mandate from a Member State or the European Parliament, representatives of the requestor may be invited by EFSA to attend as observers to the meetings for the purposes of clarification or information but shall not seek to influence discussions.
2. The Executive Director may invite observers to attend the meetings of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels. Observers shall not in any way participate or intervene in the discussions, drafting, voting or in other activities carried out in the meetings they attend.	No changes
3. With the exception of minority opinions referred to in Article 16, individual views, whether expressed orally or in writing by members during deliberations within the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels shall be confidential.	No changes
Art.15 Adoption of scientific opinions	Covered under Art.13 of the revised version
1. Upon suggestion of the Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel the Authority may decide to publish a draft opinion on the Authority's website with an invitation to provide scientific comments by a specified deadline. The Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel will take account of the comments received when adopting its final opinion ¹¹ .	Public consultation covered under Art.11 of the revised version

¹¹ Public consultations shall be organized by EFSA on a regular basis in order to ensure the possibility for the public to comment draft scientific opinion of the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels even if it is not explicitly foreseen in the



2. The Scientific Committee and individual Scientific Panels shall adopt their scientific opinions at their plenary meetings or, exceptionally, by one of the procedures set out in Article 11 or 12.	Covered under Art.13 of the revised version
3. A scientific opinion shall comprise the question posed by the Commission, the Parliament, a Member State or the Authority itself, the terms of reference, the background to the request, the information considered the scientific reasoning and the opinion of the Scientific Committee or the Scientific Panel.	Covered under Art.13 of the revised version
4. The full scientific opinion shall be published without delay on the Authority's website. Detailed rules relating to public access to scientific opinions are established in the Decision of the Management Board of the European Food Safety Authority concerning implementing measures of transparency and confidentiality requirements, according to Article 41 of the Regulation ¹² .	Covered under Art.13 of the revised version Deleted text and reference to 2005 MB rules
Art.16 Minority opinions	Art.15 Minority opinions

applicable legal framework. Public consultations on draft opinions shall be carried out in accordance with EFSA's paper on public consultations, endorsed by the Management Board and available at www.efsa.europa.eu.

¹² MB 10.03.2005 – 10.



	of the opinion including comments by the Panel or Committee on the minority opinion shall be recorded in the minutes of the relevant meeting.
Art.17 Technical hearings	Covered under Art.27 of the revised version
1. Upon suggestion of the Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel, technical hearings with individuals, petitioners or other stakeholder representatives may be organized by the Secretariats if it considers it necessary for the development of a scientific opinion.	Covered under Art.27 of the revised version
2. Hearings shall be indicated clearly in the draft agenda of the meeting during which it is to take place.	Covered under Art.27 of the revised version
3. The Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel shall not take any decisions during hearings.	Covered under Art.27 of the revised version
Art.18	Art.16
Art.18 Minutes	Art.16 Minutes

¹³ EFSA Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes, adopted by the Management Board of 15 December 2011, and Implementing Decision concerning EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interests, both available at www.efsa.europa.eu.



 a summary of discussions, including agreed actions; a record of decisions taken and opinions adopted. 	 actions; if applicable, a summary of the discussion on any minority opinion expressed by members of the Panel if applicable, diverging views expressed by members of the working group (pursuant to Article 25); a record of decisions taken and opinions adopted.
2. The draft minutes shall be circulated to members for comments and agreed either at the next meeting or in writing	2. The draft minutes shall be circulated to members for comments and agreement in line with EFSA's Standard Operating procedures.
3. The minutes shall be placed on the Authority's website after they have been agreed.	No changes
TITLI	II
WORKING GROUPS	
Art.19	Art.17
Working Groups	Working Groups
1. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels may establish Working Groups whenever they deem it necessary for reasons related to the need for external expertise or their capacity to fulfil their mandates or in order to enhance the multidisciplinary nature of their expertise. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall entrust the Working Groups with tasks that are clearly defined. In particular, the Working Group may be asked to undertake all necessary preparatory tasks in relation to a draft contribution. The Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel can require that these tasks be completed within a set period.	No changes
establish Working Groups whenever they deem it necessary for reasons related to the need for external expertise or their capacity to fulfil their mandates or in order to enhance the multidisciplinary nature of their expertise. The Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall entrust the Working Groups with tasks that are clearly defined. In particular, the Working Group may be asked to undertake all necessary preparatory tasks in relation to a draft contribution. The Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel can require that these tasks be	No changes No changes



Working Groups shall be made public.	
Art.20 Delegation of responsibilities	Art.18 Delegation of responsibilities
The members of the Working Groups are appointed in a personal capacity. They shall therefore not delegate their responsibilities to another member or to a third person.	No changes
Art.21 Number and composition of members of the Working Groups	Art. 19 Number and composition of members of the Working Groups
The number and the scientific expertise of members of a Working Group should be sufficient to fulfil its mandate.	The number and composition of a Working Group shall be decided ensuring that all the competences needed to fulfil its mandate are sufficiently represented.
Art.22 Nomination of the Chairs and vice-Chairs of the Working Groups	Art.20 Nomination of the Chairs and vice-Chairs of the Working Groups
1. The Chair of the Working Group is nominated by the Chair of the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel, following consultation with the Secretariat in compliance with the principles referred to in Article 33.	No changes except reference to Article 30 instead of Article 33
compliance with the principles referred to in Article 33.	
2. When appropriate, vice-Chairs of the Working Groups may be nominated by the Chair of the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel, following consultation with the Secretariat.	No changes
2. When appropriate, vice-Chairs of the Working Groups may be nominated by the Chair of the Scientific Committee or the relevant Scientific Panel, following consultation with	No changes Art.21 External experts



scientific knowledge may be invited to contribute to the work of the Working Groups. The Executive Director draws up implementing rules for their selection procedure and their designation ¹⁴ .	
2. An external expert may be excluded from further activity within the Authority by the Executive Director in consultation with the Chair of the Working Group for not contributing effectively to the work of the Working Group or for actions which are conflicting with the Authority's internal rules.	No changes
Art.24	Art.22
Rapporteurs	Rapporteurs
1. At the first meeting after the acceptance of a request for	After the acceptance of a request for a draft opinion,
a draft opinion, the Chair of the Working Group in consultation with the Secretariat supporting that Working Group shall designate one or more Rapporteurs, if possible. Rapporteur(s) shall ensure that the draft opinion is prepared, if necessary within a set time period. If that is not possible, the Chair endeavours to designate one or more Rapporteurs at a later stage. The Rapporteur(s) shall work in close co-operation with the relevant Secretariat and may present the draft opinion of the Working Group to the relevant Scientific Panel.	the Chair of the Working Group in consultation with the Secretariat supporting that Working Group may designate one or more Rapporteurs. Rapporteur(s) shall ensure that the draft opinion is prepared, if necessary within a set time period. The Rapporteur(s) shall work in close co-operation with the relevant Secretariat and may present the draft opinion of the Working Group to the relevant Scientific Panel.
2. The work of a Rapporteur ends when the Authority issues the opinion.	No changes
Art.25	
Support to Working Groups	Covered under Art. 26 of the revised version
The Secretariats of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels shall be responsible for providing the support	

¹⁴ Decision of the Executive Director of EFSA concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work, available at www.efsa.europa.eu.



needed to facilitate the efficient functioning of Working Groups. Specific duties of the Secretariats include but are not limited to:	
 Ensuring best use of the resources allocated to Working Groups and planning to meet priorities and time-limits; 	
 Ensuring compliance with internal rules of the Authority such as those regulating the Declarations of interests, transparency et cetera; 	
 Exercising vigilance in order to identify at an early stage any potential source of divergence between draft contributions of Working Groups and those 	
 issued by other bodies carrying out similar tasks; Providing information on the legal or public policy aspects of questions; 	
 Preparing the work of Working Groups, in consultation with their chairs; Drafting agendas and minutes of meetings; 	
 Providing support to the work carried out within Working Groups; 	
 Ensuring that relevant background information is made available to Working Groups; 	
 Assisting the Chairs of Working Groups in the preparation of draft contributions; 	
 Ensuring the consistency and quality of editorial aspects of the draft contributions. 	
Art.26	
Quorum	Deleted
No quorum shall be required for meetings of the Working Groups to be valid.	Deleted
Art.27	Art.23
Access to meetings and confidentiality of individual views	Access to meetings and confidentiality of individual
of participants	views of participants
1. The representatives of the Commission's departments	1. The representatives of the Commission's
shall be entitled to be present in the meetings. If invited to do so, they may assist for the purposes of clarification or	departments shall be entitled to be present in the meetings. If invited to do so, they may assist for the



information but shall not seek to influence discussions.	purposes of clarification or information but shall not seek to influence discussions. In case EFSA receives a mandate from a Member State or the European Parliament, representatives of the respective organisation may be invited by the Authority to attend as observers to the meetings for the purposes of clarification or information but shall not seek to influence discussions.
 The Executive Director may invite observers to attend the meetings of Working Groups. Observers shall not in any way participate or intervene in the discussions, in the drafting or in other activities carried out in the meetings they attend. Individual views, whether expressed orally or in writing by members during discussion within Working Groups shall be confidential. 	No changes No changes
Art.28	Art.24
Finalisation of a draft contribution	Finalisation of a draft contribution
1. The Working Group shall finalise their draft contribution to the work of the Scientific Committee or the Scientific Panels at their meetings or in writing. The Chair of the	
Working Group shall decide when the Terms of Reference of the relevant mandate or question have been addressed in the draft contribution.	No changes



Art.29 Technical hearings	Covered under Art. 27 of the new version
1. Upon suggestion of Working Groups, technical hearings with individuals, petitioners or other stakeholder representatives may be organized by the Secretariat if it considers it necessary for the development of a draft contribution.	Covered under Art.27 of the new version
2. Hearings shall be indicated clearly in the draft agenda of the meeting during which it is to take place	Covered under Art.27 of the new version
Art.30 Minutes	Art.25 Minutes
 According to its tasks, as laid down in the present Decision, the Secretariat providing support to the Working Group shall prepare draft minutes of Working Groups' meetings. These shall contain, inter alia: the list of participants; conflicts of interests identified by the Secretariat screening Declarations of Interests filled in by participants and the action taken, in accordance with the EFSA Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes and the Implementing Decision concerning EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interests¹⁵ a summary of discussions. 	 According to its tasks, as laid down in the present Decision, the Secretariat providing support to the Working Group shall prepare draft minutes of Working Groups' meetings. These shall contain, inter alia: the list of participants; conflicts of interests identified by the Secretariat screening Declarations of Interests filled in by participants and the action taken to prevent the occurrence of conflicts of interest a summary of discussion including agreed actions if applicable, diverging views expressed by members of the working group
2. The draft minutes shall be circulated to members for comments and agreed not later than the next meeting or in writing.	2. The draft minutes shall be circulated to members for comments and agreement in line with EFSA's Standard Operating procedures. not later than the next meeting or in writing.
3. The minutes shall be placed on the Authority's website after they have been agreed.	No changes

¹⁵ Both available at <u>www.efsa.europa.eu</u>.



TITLE III	
COMMON PROVISIONS	
	Art.26 EFSA Secretariats of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels and its Working groups
	The Head of the Unit supporting the Scientific Committee, a Scientific Panel or a Working Group shall be responsible for providing the scientific, technical and administrative support needed to facilitate the efficient functioning of the relevant scientific entity. Specific duties of the EFSA secretariats shall include, but are not limited to:
	 Support the scientific work within and between the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and their working groups
	- Ensure that the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels work in close co-operation with each other
Reference to Art. 8 and 9	 Draft scientific outputs and assessment of applications as a basis for discussion in working groups and Scientific Committee/Panel meetings
	 Prepare scientific advice in specific circumstances (e.g. request for urgent advice, self-tasking)
	 Provide scientific or technical assistance in accordance with Article 31 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002;) Ensure consistency of EFSA's risk assessment approaches Safeguard adherence to sector specific and horizontal EFSA guidance documents and relevant EU legislation and EFSA internal rules Exercise vigilance in order to identify at an early stage any potential source of divergence between the scientific opinion of the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panel and those issued



	 Administrative/technical support Draft agendas and minutes of meetings in line with EFSA's Standard Operating procedures; Ensure that relevant background information is made available to the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels and working groups; Monitor scientific and regulatory developments Providing information on the legal or public policy aspects of questions.
	Art.27 Technical hearing and Hearing Experts
Reference to Art. 17 and Art. 29	1. Upon suggestion of the Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel, technical hearings may be organized by the Secretariats if it considers it necessary for the development of a scientific output. The Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel shall not take any decisions during hearings.
Reference to Art. 29	2. Technical hearings shall be announced on the EFSA website.
	3. Upon suggestion of the Scientific Committee/Panels or their working groups, EFSA may invite hearing experts on an ad hoc basis to present and share information, data, or knowledge in their possession with the members of the responsible Scientific Committee/Panel/Working Group and answer questions related to their input. Hearing experts shall be indicated in the minutes of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panel or Working Groups and shall not carry out tasks that are under the responsibility of the members of the Scientific Committee/Panels or their working groups.
Art.31 Mission expenses of members, external experts and indemnities	Art.28 Mission expenses of members, external experts and indemnities
1. Travel and subsistence expenses incurred by members in connection with meetings relating to the Scientific	No changes



4. Each Rapporteur shall be entitled to an indemnity of up to EUR 600 ¹⁸ to defray costs linked to the co-ordination of preparatory work for draft scientific opinions.	Deleted
3. Members and external experts shall be entitled to an indemnity of EUR 100 per hour of attendance of telemeeting to defray costs derived from their contribution to and participation in the work of the Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel or one of their Working Groups. The ceiling per meeting per day shall be EUR 385. As a compensation for costs incurred by the preparatory work for meetings, the Chairs of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and Working Groups shall be entitled to an additional indemnity of EUR 50 per any hour of chairing a tele-meeting. The ceiling per meeting per day for chairs shall be EUR 770.	Deleted
2. Members and external experts shall be entitled to an indemnity of EUR 300 ¹⁶ for each full day of meeting attendance to defray other costs derived from their contribution to and participation in the work of the Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel or one of their Working Groups. As a compensation for costs incurred by the preparatory work for meetings, the Chairs of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and Working Groups shall be entitled to one additional daily indemnity per meeting.	2. Members and external experts shall be entitled to an indemnity in accordance with the scales laid down in the Authority experts compensation guide ¹⁷ , to defray other costs derived from their contribution to and participation in the work of the Scientific Committee or a Scientific Panel or one of their Working Groups. As a compensation for costs incurred by the preparatory work for meetings, rapporteurs, the Chairs of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and Working Groups shall be entitled to an additional indemnity in accordance with the scales laid down in the Authority experts compensation guide.
Committee or Scientific Panels or incurred by members or external experts in connection with meetings relating to one of their Working Groups shall be reimbursed by the Authority in accordance with the scales laid down in the Authority experts compensation guide, in line with the Commission Decision related to the experts compensation.	

¹⁶ As of 1 July 2010 the indemnity shall amount to EUR 385.

¹⁷ Decision of the Executive Director laying down the rules on the reimbursement of expenses incurred by third parties from outside EFSA invited to attend meetings in an expert capacity, available at www.efsa.europa.eu

¹⁸ As of 1 July 2010 the indemnity shall amount to EUR 770.



Director in order to establish in which cases the Authority may reimburse travel and subsistence expenses incurred by hearing experts and grant them the indemnities referred to in paragraphs 1 and 2.	
Art.32 Confidentiality	Art.29 Confidentiality
1. Members of Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels as well as external experts and hearing experts participating in their Working Groups, or acting as observers, shall not divulge to third parties information specifically identified by the Authority as 'restricted' or 'confidential'.	No changes
2. Members of the Scientific Committee or Panels as well as external experts and hearing experts participating in their Working Groups, or acting as observers, shall sign a written declaration that they will comply with the rules of confidentiality set out in paragraph 1 ¹⁹ .	2. Members of the Scientific Committee or Panels as well as external experts and hearing experts participating in their Working Groups, or acting as observers, shall declare that they will comply with the rules of confidentiality set out in EFSA's policies and rules on independence and declaration of interest.
3. Members of the Scientific Committee or Scientific Panels and external experts participating in their Working Groups, or acting as observers, shall be required, even after their duties have ceased, not to disclose information of the kind covered by the obligation of professional secrecy.	No changes
Art.33 Independence	Art.30 Independence
1. Members of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels, Working Groups as well as external experts shall undertake to act independently of any external influence. For this purpose, they shall make a Declaration of Commitment ²⁰ and an Annual Declaration of Interests ²¹ in accordance with the Implementing Decision concerning	Members of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and Working Groups, as well as external experts shall comply with EFSA's policies and rules on independence and declarations of interest ²³ .

¹⁹ Annex II of the Implementing Decision of EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interest, available at www.efsa.europa.eu.

 $^{^{20}}$ Annex II of the Implementing Decision of EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interest, available on EFSA's website.

²¹ Annex I of the Implementing Decision of EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interest, available on EFSA's website.



EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interest ²²	
2. These declarations shall be made annually in writing and shall be published on the Authority's website.	Deleted
3. The members of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels, Working Groups as well as external experts, at each meeting shall declare any interests which might be considered prejudicial to their independence in relation to the items on the agenda (Specific Declaration of Interests ²⁴ and Oral Declaration of Interests), in accordance with the Implementing Decision concerning EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interests.	Deleted
Art.34 Entry into force	Art.31 Entry into force
1. The present Decision shall enter into force on the day following the date of its adoption.	No changes
2. The present Decision shall replace the Decision of the EFSA Management Board of 17 December 2009 concerning the establishment and operations of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and of their Working Groups, which shall herewith be repealed as of the entry-into-force of the present Decision.	2. The present Decision becomes applicable and repeals the Decision of the EFSA Management Board of 17 March 2012 concerning the establishment and operations of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and of their Working Groups with effect as from 1 July 2017.

²³ EFSA Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes, adopted by the Management Board of 15 December 2011 and Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, both available at www.efsa.europa.eu

²² See Annex III of the Implementing Decision concerning EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interest, available at www.efsa.europa.eu.

²⁴ Annex III of the Implementing Decision concerning EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interest, available at www.efsa.europa.eu.