

Parma, 23 September 2016
EFSA/CONTAM/2854

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 80th plenary meeting
Held on 20-22 September 2016, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 06-10-2016)

Participants

• **Panel Members:**

Jan Alexander, Lars Barregard¹, Beat Brüscheweiler, Sandra Ceccatelli, Bruce Cottrill, Mike Dinovi², Lutz Edler, Bettina Grassl-Kraupp, Christer Hogstrand, Ron Hoogenboom, Helle Knutsen, Carlo Nebbia¹, Isabelle Oswald³, Annette Petersen, Martin Rose, Alain-Claude Roudot, Tanja Schwerdtle, Christiane Vleminckx, Günter Vollmer and Heather Wallace.

• **Hearing Experts⁴:**

Konrad Grob (for item 7.1)⁵

• **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2),

• **EFSA:**

• **BIOCONTAM Unit:**

Katleen Baert, Marco Binaglia, Mari Eskola, Marta Hugas, Karen Mackay, Ruth Roldán Torres, Luisa Ramos Bordajandi, Hans Steinkellner and Mathijs Van Manen.

• **DATA Unit:**

Andrea Altieri (for item 7.2) and José Ángel Gómez Ruiz (for item 7.3)

• **Observers:**

Not applicable

• **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ Present on 20-21 September only

² Attendance by audio-web conference

³ Attendance by audio-web conference for item 7.2 only (20 September).

⁴ As defined in Article 11 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ Attendance by audio-web conference for item 7.1 only (20 September).

1. Welcome

The CONTAM Panel Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Apologies for absence

Margherita Bignami (CONTAM Panel), Marta Hugas (BIOCONTAM Unit), Frank Swartenbroux (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2) and Marina Marini (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit D1).

3. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

4. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁷, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Agreement of the minutes of the 79th Plenary meeting held on 12-14 July 2016, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 79th Plenary meeting held on 12 – 14 July 2016 were agreed on 27 July 2016.

6. Report on the written procedures since 79th Plenary meeting

Not applicable.

7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

7.1. Draft opinion on the evaluation of substances as acceptable previous cargoes for edible fats and oils (EFSA-Q-2015-00196)⁸

The Chair of the WG on Previous cargoes presented the draft opinion on the evaluation of substances as acceptable previous cargoes for edible fats and oils. The Panel endorsed the following sections: Calcium Lignosulphonate : 3.1.1 Chemical properties and use, 3.1.2 Previous evaluations; Methyl acetate: 3.2.2 Previous evaluations, 3.2.3.3 Toxicological profile, 3.2.3.4 Allergenicity, 3.2.4 Summary and conclusion; Ethyl tertbutyl-ether: 3.3.3.1 Expected impurities, 3.3.3.3 Toxicological profile, 3.3.4 Summary and conclusion; Ammonium sulphate: 3.4.2 Previous evaluations, 3.4.3.3 Toxicological profile.

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁸ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00196>

7.2. Draft opinion on the appropriateness to set a group health based guidance value for T-2 and HT-2 toxin and their modified forms (EFSA-Q-2015-00229)⁹

The Chair of the WG on HBGV for mycotoxins and their modified forms presented the draft opinion on the appropriateness to set a group health-based guidance value for T2 and HT2 toxins and their modified forms. The Panel endorsed the following sections: 1.3. Introduction of modified mycotoxins, 1.4. Legislation, 1.5. Interpretation of Terms of Reference, 2. Data and methodologies, 3. Previous assessments (pending minor updates), 4. Chemistry, 5. Analytical methods, 7. Toxicokinetics of modified forms of T2 and HT2, 8. Toxicity (pending several updates and clarifications) and 9. Mode of action for toxicity of T2 and HT2 and their metabolites.

The Panel discussed the data used for derivation of acute and chronic HBGVs and agreed to the proposed critical endpoints. Further refinements in the BMD calculations used for derivation of HBGVs for T2 and HT2 were requested. The approach to derive relative potency factors for modified forms of T2 and HT2 wherever this is possible for their inclusion in group HBGVs was also discussed.

7.3. Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks to human and animal health related to the presence of erucic acid in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2015-00027)¹⁰

The Chair of the WG on erucic acid in food and feed presented the draft opinion on the presence of erucic acid in food and feed for possible adoption. The Panel discussed the opinion and, subject to some minor revisions, adopted it. The chair of the CONTAM Panel expressed her appreciation to the members of the WG and the EFSA staff.

7.4. Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks for animal health related to the presence of zearalenone and its modified forms in feed (EFSA-Q-2015-00247)¹¹

The Chair of the WG on Zearalenone in feed presented some sections of the draft opinion on the risks for animal health related to the presence of zearalenone and its modified forms in feed. The Panel discussed the draft sections on background information, feed occurrence and exposure and a preliminary outline of the toxicity in animals and provided suggestions to the WG.

7.5. Draft opinion on the risks for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food (EFSA-Q-2015-00028)¹²

The Chair of the WG on dioxins in food and feed presented the status of the draft opinion on dioxins and DL-PCBs in food and feed. Progress has been made in sections providing supporting information for the assessment, related to the hazard identification and characterisation and the exposure assessment of both the human and the livestock/companion animal risk assessments. The WG aims to present at the upcoming CONTAM Panel meeting sections for discussion and possible endorsement.

⁹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00229>

¹⁰ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00247>

¹¹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00027>

¹² <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00028>

8. Draft update of the guidance of the Scientific Committee on the use of the benchmark dose approach in risk assessment

The draft guidance was discussed by the Panel and several comments were identified. The Panel agreed to provide suggestions and ask for clarifications to the Scientific Committee's WG on BMD.

9. Research proposals for Horizon 2020

The CONTAM Panel discussed possible proposals for thematic research projects to be proposed in the context of the Horizon 2020 Framework Programme. The agreed thematic project will be used for the preparation of the EFSA Technical Report 'H2020: EFSA's Priority Research Topics'.

10. Correction of the CONTAM Opinion on nickel in food and drinking water

The corrections implemented in the CONTAM Scientific opinion on nickel in food and drinking water were presented to the CONTAM Panel for endorsement. The CONTAM Panel discussed the request of the Nickel Institute and Nipera to include more information on the uncertainties of the assessment in the conclusions and summary of the opinion. The Panel concluded the uncertainties of the assessment are reported with an adequate level of detail and transparency in the opinion and that no additional change is deemed necessary.

11. Draft report on exposure assessment to pyrrolizidine alkaloids in food

Due to the lack of time the agenda item was deferred to a future meeting of the CONTAM Panel.

12. Letter from Tea and Herbal Infusions Europe on Inorganic mercury in tea

The CONTAM Panel discussed the letter received from Tea & Herbal Infusions Europe regarding the Scientific Opinion on the risk for public health related to the presence of mercury and methylmercury in food published in 2012. The CONTAM Panel acknowledged that new data regarding the occurrence of mercury in tea have become available. Considering that tea and herbal infusions are not a major source of exposure for the population groups and countries presenting the highest levels of exposure to inorganic mercury, the CONTAM Panel concluded that the impact of these new data on the conclusion is limited and no update of the exposure assessment is required.

13. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

13.1. European Commission

The European Commission representative gave feedback on the activities of the European Commission in relation to the issued scientific opinions of the CONTAM Panel. Several amendments for current legislation are under discussion with the Member States as an outcome of the CONTAM Panel scientific opinions. In addition, several recommendations to the Member States are under preparation by the European Commission based on CONTAM opinions.

13.2. CONTAM Panel Working Groups

13.2.1. Update from WG on Fusarium toxins

The Chair of the WG on Fusarium toxins presented the updated approach for the human and animal exposure assessment of the sum of DON, 3-Ac-DON, 15-Ac-DON and DON-3-glucoside, and the use of biomarker data to support the hazard quantification in humans. The CONTAM Panel agreed to the presented proposals.

13.2.2. Update from WG on dioxins in food and feed

See item 7.5

13.2.3. Update from WG on Erucic acid in food and feed

See item 7.3

13.2.4. Update from WG on Group HBGV for mycotoxins

See item 7.2

13.2.5 Update from WG on Zearalenone in feed

See item 7.4

13.2.6. Update from WG on Previous cargoes

See item 7.1

13.2.7. Update from WG on Perfluoroalkylated substances (PFASs) in food

The Chair of the WG on PFAS in food presented the preliminary approach proposed by the WG for hazard identification and characterisation, considering data from both animal toxicity studies and human studies.

13.2.8. Update from WG on Furan in food

The Chair of the WG on furan in food informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the draft opinion on furan is progressing well. The WG is discussing the identified toxicity studies and the third WG meeting takes place back to back with the 80th CONTAM Panel meeting. The opinion will address furan and the methylfurans 2-methylfuran, 3-methylfuran and 2,5-dimethylfuran. The approach for the risk assessment will be presented to the CONTAM Panel in the first quarter of 2017.

13.3. EFSA

13.3.1. Advisory Forum

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the CONTAM Panel that the 61st meeting of EFSA's Advisory Forum meeting will be held on 28-29 September 2016. Additional information is available on the EFSA website¹³.

13.3.2. Management Board

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the CONTAM Panel that the 70th meeting of the EFSA's Management Board will be held on 5 October 2016. Additional information is available on the EFSA website¹⁴.

¹³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/160928>

¹⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/161005>

13.3.3. Other

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the Panel on four mandates received from the European Commission for the production of scientific reports on exposure assessment to ergot alkaloids in food and feed, T2 and HT2 toxins in food and feed, perchlorate in food and tropane alkaloids in food. The mandates have been allocated to the DATA Unit and will be finalised in the course of 2017. The draft reports will be presented for endorsement to the CONTAM Panel in due time.

The CONTAM Team leader informed the Panel that scientific awards and prizes received by the Panel and WG members are to be declared in the annual declarations of interest submitted to EFSA.

The Panel was also informed of the new rules for authorship of the EFSA outputs¹⁵.

13.4 Scientific Committee and its Working Groups of interest to the CONTAM Panel

The Chair of the CONTAM Panel highlighted the main items discussed in the 80th plenary meeting of the Scientific Committee (SC) held on 14-15 September 2016. In particular the draft opinions on biological relevance and on criteria for updating and reopening an EFSA scientific assessment were presented and discussed by the Scientific Committee.

The respective CONTAM Panel members who are members of the SC WGs of interest to the CONTAM Panel informed about current status of these WGs, namely the WG on Weight of evidence, WG on Mixtures, WG on Biological relevance, WG on Benchmark Dose (BMD) approach and SWG on Genotoxicity.

14. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

14.1. Present status of current outsourcing activities of the CONTAM Team (BIOCONTAM Unit)

For the Article 36 grant on the combined bioaccumulation/toxicity study on a broad mixture of mineral oil saturated hydrocarbons relevant to the human dietary exposure (signed with Institut national de la recherche agronomique (INRA, France) and Norwegian Institute of Public Health (NIPH, Norway) in September 2013), the final report was approved in September 2016.

For the Article 36 grant on occurrence of tropane alkaloids in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiary (Stichting Dienst Landbouwkundig Onderzoek (RIKILT, The Netherlands)), Institut de Recerca i Tecnologia Agroalimentàries (IRTA, Spain), Fera Science Ltd. (UK) and Vysoka Skola Chemicko-Technologicka V Praze (VSCHT, Czech Republic). The draft final report was submitted at the beginning of September 2016 and the final meeting will take place during the 3rd week of September.

For the Article 36 grant on occurrence data on citrinin in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiaries (RIKILT, The Netherlands), Netherlands Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority (NVWA, The Netherlands), Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore (UCSC, Italy), IRTA (Spain) and National Institute of Public Health – National Institute of Hygiene (NIPH-NIH, Poland) in August 2015. The first interim report was submitted to EFSA in April 2016 and the first interim meeting was held on 4 May 2016. The final report should be available by the end of 2016.

¹⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/efsajournal/pub/e14091>

For the Article 36 grant on *in vivo* toxicity and genotoxicity of beauvericin and enniatins, the kick-off meeting with the appointed beneficiaries (Consortium of Istituto Superiore di Sanità (ISS), Italian National Agency for New Technologies, Energy and Sustainable Economic Development (ENEA) and French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety (ANSES) was held on 1 April. The next meeting will be held on 7 October (discussion of the 1st interim report). Total duration of the project is 18 months, the final report should be available by October 2017. The first interim report will be delivered by 30 September 2016 and will be discussed at the first interim meeting 7 October 2016.

For the reopening competition under the multiple framework contract for an extensive literature search on furan and its methyl analogues, 2-methylfuran and 3-methylfuran, a contract has been signed with the Technical University of Denmark (DTU). The activities started in April and the final report was approved by EFSA in July 2016.

For the reopening competition under the multiple framework contract for an extensive literature search on fumonisins and their modified forms, a contract was signed with the Technical University of Denmark (DTU). An interim meeting was held on 5 August. An extension has been requested which, if granted, will delay finalisation of the project by 6 weeks (i.e. to mid November 2016).

For the two negotiated procedures on extensive literature searches, selection for relevance and data extraction of studies related to the toxicity of polychlorinated dibenzodioxins (PCDD), polychlorinated dibenzofurans (PCDFs) and dioxin like-polychlorinated biphenyls (DL-PCBs) in humans and in experimental animals, two contracts have been signed with RPA Ltd/IEH Consulting Ltd and WCA Environment Ltd, respectively. The activities for both contracts started in June, interim deliverables have been submitted since then, and the final reports are due in mid-October 2016.

15. Any other business

Not applicable.