

Parma, 19 July 2016
EFSA/CONTAM/2796

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 79th plenary meeting
Held on 12-14 July 2016, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 28-07-2016)

Participants

• **Panel Members:**

Jan Alexander¹, Lars Barregard², Margherita Bignami, Beat Brüscheiler, Sandra Ceccatelli, Bruce Cottrill, Mike Dinovi³, Lutz Edler, Bettina Grassl-Kraupp, Christer Hogstrand, Ron Hoogenboom, Helle Knutsen, Carlo Nebbia, Isabelle Oswald, Annette Petersen, Martin Rose⁴, Alain-Claude Roudot, Tanja Schwerdtle, Christiane Vleminckx, Günter Vollmer and Heather Wallace.

• **Hearing Experts⁵:**

Konrad Grob (for item 7.3)⁶

• **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2),

• **EFSA:**

• **BIOCONTAM Unit:**

Katleen Baert, Marco Binaglia, Mari Eskola, Marta Hugas, Karen Mackay, Ruth Roldán Torres, and Hans Steinkellner.

• **DATA Unit:**

José Ángel Gómez Ruiz (for item 9)

• **SCER Unit:**

Ana Afonso, Andrea Germini and Angelo Maggiore (for item 8)

• **Observers:**

Not applicable

¹ Attendance by audio-web conference for agenda item 11.2.5 (14 July only)

² Present on 12-13 July only

³ Attendance by audio-web conference

⁴ Present on 12 July only

⁵ As defined in Article 11 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ Present on 13 July only

- **Others:**
Not Applicable

1. Welcome

The CONTAM Panel Chair welcomed the participants and in particular the new CONTAM Panel Member Beat Brüscheiler. The meeting participants briefly introduced themselves.

2. Apologies for absence

Luisa Ramos Bordajandi and Mathijs Van Manen (BIOCONTAM Unit), Frank Swartenbroux (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2) and Marina Marini (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit D1).

3. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

4. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁸, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Agreement of the minutes of the 78th Plenary meeting held on 10-12 May 2016, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 78th Plenary meeting held on 10 – 12 May 2016 were agreed on 27 May 2016.

6. Report on the written procedures since 78th Plenary meeting

The draft opinion on malachite green in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00815) was adopted by written procedure by the CONTAM Panel on 24 June 2016.

7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

7.1 Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks to human and animal health related to the presence of deoxynivalenol and its acetylated and modified forms in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2013-00721)⁹

The Chair of the WG on Fusarium toxins presented the revised sections on hazard identification and characterization of the opinion for discussion and possible endorsement. The revisions for the sections endorsed earlier at the 76th CONTAM Panel

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00721>

plenary meeting were discussed and agreed. The sections 7.2 Mode of Action, 7.3 Toxicity in Experimental animals and 7.4. Adverse effects in farm and companion animals to the sections 7.5 Combined effects of DON and its acetylated and modified forms and 7.6 Human data were discussed by the Panel and endorsed subject to minor revisions with the exception of the first three sub-chapters in 7.3 on acute, sub-acute and sub-chronic toxicity. An updated strategy for the derivation of acute and chronic health based reference values was presented and the Panel agreed to it noting that the proposed uncertainty factor for the derivation of the dose for acute risk requires a more detailed explanation. An extension of the deadline will be asked to European Commission and the opinion will be presented again for discussion and possible endorsement of selected sections at the 81st CONTAM plenary meeting.

7.2. Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks to human and animal health related to the presence of erucic acid in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2015-00027)¹⁰

The Chair of the WG on erucic acid in food and feed presented the draft opinion on the presence of erucic acid in food and feed for discussion. The Panel discussed the opinion and, subject to some minor revisions, endorsed the following sections: 3.3.1. toxicokinetics, 3.3.2. toxicity in experimental animals, 3.3.3. observations in humans, 3.3.4. mode of action and 3.3.5. adverse effects in livestock. The opinion will be presented for discussion and adoption at the 80th CONTAM Panel meeting.

7.3 Draft opinion on the evaluation of substances as acceptable previous cargoes for edible fats and oils (EFSA-Q-2015-00196)¹¹

The Chair of the WG on Previous cargoes presented the approach proposed for the evaluation of the four substances requested in the mandate. Selected sections were presented for possible endorsement. The Panel discussed in detail the possible presence of impurities of potential concern related to technical grades of calcium lignosulphonate and ammonium sulphate. The following sections were endorsed: 1. Introduction, 2. Data and methodologies; Calcium Lignosulphonate: 3.1.3.2 Reactivity and reaction products, 3.1.3.4 Allergenicity; Methyl acetate: 3.2.1. Chemical properties and use, 3.2.3.1 Expected impurities, 3.2.3.2 Reactivity and reaction products; Ethyl tert-butyl ether (ETBE): 3.3.1. Chemical properties and use, 3.3.2. Previous evaluations, 3.3.3.1 Expected impurities, 3.3.3.2 Reactivity and reaction products, 3.3.3.4 Allergenicity; Ammonium sulphate: 3.4.1. Chemical properties and use, 3.4.3.2 Reactivity and reaction products, 3.4.3.4 Allergenicity.

8. Presentation of Emerging Risks Team and Network

A representative of the SCER Unit presented the activities of the Team on Emerging Risks and the related Emerging Risks Exchange Network (EREN) and the possible cooperation with the CONTAM Panel. In particular the process for the early identification of emerging risks was described and an overview of issues identified by EREN possibly falling in the area of responsibility of the CONTAM Panel. It was noted that the expertise present in the CONTAM Panel could be used to identify early signals of emerging risks and indicate priorities. It was concluded that a closer interaction between the Emerging Risks Team and the CONTAM Panel is desirable and that updates of the Emerging Risks Team will be given two times per year at the plenary meetings of the CONTAM Panel.

¹⁰ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00027>

¹¹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00196>

9. Draft report on exposure assessment to pyrrolizidine alkaloids in food

The draft report on dietary exposure assessment to pyrrolizidine alkaloids in food was presented to the CONTAM Panel. A discussion was held on the list of pyrrolizidine alkaloids to be recommended for food monitoring. Based on the occurrence data present in the draft report, the Panel noted that the list of pyrrolizidine alkaloids of particular importance for food and feed contamination indicated in the 2011 opinion on pyrrolizidine alkaloids is not applicable anymore and a revision of this list is warranted. The Panel endorsed the draft report with minor comments.

10. New mandates

10.1. Request for a scientific opinion on the evaluation of the toxicity of Tetrodotoxins (TTX) and TTX-analogues in bivalve molluscs and marine gastropods (EFSA-Q-2016-00399)¹²

The CONTAM Panel discussed the new mandate received and agreed with the approach proposed by the Secretariat to set up a new ad hoc WG and to propose an extended deadline to end of May 2017. The Panel Chair appointed Annette Petersen as WG Chair.

11. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

11.1. European Commission

The European Commission representative gave feedback on the activities of the European Commission in relation to the issued scientific opinions of the CONTAM Panel. Several amendments for current legislation are under discussion with the Member States as an outcome of the CONTAM Panel scientific opinions. In addition, several recommendations to the Member States are under preparation by the European Commission based on CONTAM opinions.

11.2. CONTAM Panel Working Groups

11.2.1. Working Group on Fusarium toxins

See item 9.3. The Chair of the WG on Fusarium toxins informed that the work on moniliformin in food and feed has started (EFSA-Q-2010-01004)¹³.

11.2.2. Standing Working Group on Non-allowed pharmacologically active substances in food and feed and their reference points for action

The SWG is dormant.

11.2.3. Working Group on dioxins in food and feed

The Chair of the WG on Dioxins in food and feed informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the draft opinion on dioxins and DL-PCBs in food and feed is progressing well. In order to get further insight into epidemiological studies relevant to the study subject the authors of such studies will be contacted. In addition, a general update of the current activities will be given at an EFSA Special Session to be held within the programme of the DIOXIN2016 conference.

¹² <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00399>

¹³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2010-01004>

11.2.4. Working Group on Erucic acid in food and feed

See item 7.2

11.2.5. Update from WG on Group HBGV for mycotoxins

The Chair of the WG presented the approach for the assessment. The previous EFSA assessment on T2 and HT2 toxins (2011) and on modified fusarium toxins (2014) are the starting points for the present opinion. The group TDI for T2 and HT2 set in 2011 is being reviewed in the light of new data becoming available since then. In addition the possible establishment of a group acute reference dose for T2 and HT2 is considered on the basis of the available data. A series of T2/HT2 metabolites have been identified and the WG will evaluate if these can be included in any group HBGVs, possibly applying relative potency factors.

11.2.6 Update from WG on Zearalenone in feed

The Chair of the WG on zearalenone in feed informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the draft opinion on zearalenone and its modified forms in feed is progressing well. A presentation with the preliminary outcomes and the proposed approach to follow in this opinion was given. The members of the CONTAM Panel discussed the approach and provided their suggestions.

The opinion will be presented for discussion and possible endorsement of selected sections at the 80th CONTAM Panel meeting.

11.2.7. Update from WG on Previous cargoes

See item 7.3

11.2.8. Update from WG on Perfluoroalkylated substances (PFASs) in food

The Chair of the WG on PFAS in food informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the draft opinion on PFAS in food is progressing well but is still at an early stage of development. The WG plans to bring for preliminary discussion at the 80th CONTAM Panel meeting the use of human continuous data to derive a health based guidance value (HBGV).

11.2.9. Update from WG on Furan in food

The Chair of the WG on furan in food informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that a second meeting was held in June. The opinion will address furan, 2-methylfuran, 3-methylfuran and 2,5-dimethylfuran, collectively known as methylfurans. The WG started the discussion of the toxicity of furan and methylfurans, as well as the supporting information for the assessment.

11.3. EFSA

11.3.1. Advisory Forum

No items relevant to the CONTAM Panel were discussed at the 60th Advisory Forum meeting (8-9 June 2016). Additional information on the 60th Advisory Forum meeting is available on the EFSA website¹⁴.

¹⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/160608a>

11.3.2. Management Board

The Team Leader reported on the approval of the Management Board to the new member of the CONTAM Panel at its 69th meeting (15 June 2016). Additional information on the 69th Management Board meeting is available on the EFSA website¹⁵

11.3.3. Other

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the Panel on two mandates to deliver technical assistance to the European Commission. In one mandate EFSA has been requested to apply the guidance on Reference Points for Actions developed by the CONTAM Panel in 2013 to a list of substances used as dyes in aquaculture. The second mandate is related to the assessment of the Maximum Residue Limits developed for zilpaterol by the FAO/WHO Joint Expert Committee on Food Additives and on the possible effects on zilpaterol on animal health and welfare.

11.4 Scientific Committee and its Working Groups of interest to the CONTAM Panel

The CONTAM Panel vice Chair highlighted the main items discussed in the 79th plenary meeting of the Scientific Committee (SC) held on 6-7 July 2016. The draft update of the guidance on the use of benchmark dose approach in risk assessment was endorsed for public consultation. The outcomes of two procurements of possible relevance to the CONTAM Panel, one on the presence of cyanobacteria in food and another on a procedure for the identification of emerging chemical risks in the food chain, were presented to the SC. More information is available on the EFSA website¹⁶.

The respective CONTAM Panel members who are members of the SC WGs of interest to the CONTAM Panel informed about current status of the WG on Weight of evidence, WG on Biological relevance, WG on Benchmark Dose (BMD) approach, WG on Chemical mixtures and SWG on Genotoxicity. An update was also provided on the Assessment and Methodology Unit WG on Prometheus.

12. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

12.1. Present status of current outsourcing activities of the CONTAM Team (BIOCONTAM Unit)

For the Article 36 grant on the combined bioaccumulation/toxicity study on a broad mixture of mineral oil saturated hydrocarbons relevant to the human dietary exposure (signed with Institut national de la recherche agronomique (INRA, France) and Norwegian Institute of Public Health (NIPH, Norway) in September 2013), the project deadline has been extended to the end of January 2016. The final meeting took place in the first half of February 2016 and the final report is under preparation.

For the Article 36 grant on occurrence of tropane alkaloids in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiary (Stichting Dienst Landbouwkundig Onderzoek (RIKILT, The Netherlands)), Institut de Recerca i Tecnologia Agroalimentàries (IRTA, Spain), Fera Science Ltd. (UK) and Vysoka Skola Chemicko-Technologicka V Praze (VSCHT, Czech Republic). The draft final report will be submitted at the beginning of September 2016 and the final meeting will take place later that same month.

¹⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/mb/mbmeetings>

¹⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/panels/scientific-committee>

For the Article 36 grant on occurrence data on citrinin in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiaries (RIKILT, The Netherlands), Netherlands Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority (NVWA, The Netherlands), Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore (UCSC, Italy), IRTA (Spain) and National Institute of Public Health – National Institute of Hygiene (NIPH-NIH, Poland) in August 2015. The first interim report was submitted to EFSA in April 2016 and the first interim meeting was held on 4 May 2016. The final report should be available by the end of 2016.

For the Article 36 grant on *in vivo* toxicity and genotoxicity of beauvericin and enniatins, the kick-off meeting with the appointed beneficiaries (Consortium of Istituto Superiore di Sanità (ISS), Italian National Agency for New Technologies, Energy and Sustainable Economic Development (ENEA) and French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety (ANSES) was held on 1 April. The next meeting will be held on 7 October (discussion of the 1st interim report). Total duration of the project is 18 months, the final report should be available by October 2017.

For the reopening competition under the multiple framework contract for an extensive literature search on furan and its methyl analogues, 2-methylfuran and 3-methylfuran, a contract has been signed with the Technical University of Denmark (DTU). The activities started in April and the final report was submitted to EFSA in June 2016.

For the reopening competition under the multiple framework contract for an extensive literature search on fumonisins and their modified forms, a contract has been signed with the Technical University of Denmark (DTU). Activities have started, the kick-off meeting was held Monday 11 July and the activities will finish in October 2016.

For the two negotiated procedures on extensive literature searches, selection for relevance and data extraction of studies related to the toxicity of polychlorinated dibenzodioxins (PCDD), polychlorinated dibenzofurans (PCDFs) and dioxin like-polychlorinated biphenyls (DL-PCBs) in humans and in experimental animals, two contracts have been signed with RPA Ltd/IEH Consulting Ltd and WCA Environment Ltd, respectively. The activities for both contracts started in June and the final reports are due in September 2016.

14. Any other business

The Panel meeting dates for 2017 were communicated:

82nd meeting: 24-26 January 2017;

83rd meeting: 14-16 March 2017;

84th meeting: 16-18 May 2017;

85th meeting: 4-6 July 2017;

86th meeting: 19-21 Sep 2017;

87th meeting: 21-23 November 2017.