Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 61st Plenary meeting

Held on 12-13 April 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 21 June 16)

Participants

a) Panel Members

Claudia Bolognesi, Laurence Castle, Jean-Pierre Cravedi, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Roland Franz, Konrad Grob, Rainer Gürtler,[1] Wim Mennes,[1] Sirpa Orvokki Kärenlampi, Maria Rosaria Milana, André Penninks, Maria De Fátima Tavares Poças, Vittorio Silano, Andrew Gilbert Smith, Christina Tlustos,[2] Detlef Wölfle, Holger Zorn, Corina-Aurelia Zugravu

b) Hearing Experts:[3]

–

c) European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

- Bastiaan Schupp (DG SANTE)[1]
- Rafael Luis Perez Berbejal (DG SANTE)[2]

d) EFSA:

- Food Ingredients and Packaging (FIP) Unit: Margarita Aguilera-Gomez, Maria Anastassiadou, Magdalena Andryszkiewicz, Eric Barthélémy, Mary Carfi, Anna Federica Castoldi, Cristina Croera, Diveki Zoltan, Marina Goumenou, Alexandros Lioupis, Yi Liu, Claudia Roncancio Peña, Annamaria Rossi, Kim Rygaard Nielsen, Anne Theobald, Ellen Van Haver, Katharina Volk

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Trine Husøy.

[1] Participated via teleconference on 12 and 13 April 2016
[2] Participated via teleconference on 13 April 2016
[3] As defined in Article 11 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Committee/Scientific Panel/ Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[4] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,[5] EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI or the SDoI, please refer to Annex. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 60th Plenary meeting held on 9-11 February 2016, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 60th Plenary meeting held on 9-11 February 2016 were agreed.[6]

5. Report on the written procedures since 60th Plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

6.1 Evaluation of Poly((R)-3-hydroxybutyrate-co-(R)-3-hydroxyhexanoate (EFSA-Q-2015-00414)

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of Poly((R)-3-hydroxybutyrate-co-(R)-3-hydroxyhexanoate for use in food contact materials was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The opinion is available on the Authority's webpage.

6.2 Evaluation of Sodium polyacrylate, cross linked (EFSA-Q-2014-00449)

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of polyacrylic acid, sodium salt, crosslinked, for use in active food contact materials was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The opinion is available on the Authority's webpage.

[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[5] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf
[6] www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/160209

6.3 Evaluation of the active substance potassium metabisulfite, for use in active food contact materials (EFSA-Q-2015-00104)

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of the active substance potassium metabisulfite, for use in active food contact materials was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The opinion is available on the Authority's webpage.

6.4 Evaluation of Polisan Hellas S.A. recycling process (Polymetrix, formerly Buhler, technology) (EFSA-Q-2015-00404)

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of Polisan Hellas S.A. recycling process (Polymetrix, formerly Buhler, technology) was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and endorsed the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.
The formal adoption of the opinion will be proposed under written procedure, once an additional document will be sent by the applicant.

6.5 Evaluation of ß-Amylase from barley (EFSA-Q-2014-00731)

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of evaluation of β-amylase was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and asked the WG Enzymes for some additional clarifications. A revised draft opinion will be presented at a future plenary for discussion and possible adoption.

7. New Mandates

The Head of the FIP unit informed the members of the CEF Panel that four new mandates for the safety assessment of flavourings, twenty-four new mandates for the safety assessment of enzymes and two new mandates for the safety assessment of food contact materials had been received since the last Plenary meeting.

7.1 New applications since the previous meeting

Food Sector	EFSA-Q-Number	Subject	Reception date
FCM	2016-00128	Demande d'évaluation du groupe de substance suivant "1,4-Benzene dicarboxylic acid(with LN=La,Eu,Gd,Tb)" afin de l'inclure dans l'annexe I du règlement (UE) n° 10/2011 en tant qu' additif de matières plastiques	09/02/16
FCM	2016-00139	Request for safety evaluation of Märkische Faser recycling process (NGR technology)	11/02/16
FLAV	2016-00146	FL 09.302 Myrtenyl acetate	17/02/16
ENZ	2016-00132	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Phospholipase A2 from a genetically modified strain of *Streptomyces violoceoruber* (strain AS-10)	18/02/16
ENZ	2016-00133	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from *Bacillus subtilis*	18/02/16

ENZ	2016-00134	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glucose oxidase from *Aspergillus niger* (strain NZYM-KA)	18/02/16
ENZ	2016-00135	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: 4-alpha-D-{(1-4)a-D-glucano} *trehalose trehalohydrolase from Arthrobacter ramosus*	18/02/16
ENZ	2016-00136	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme:(1-4)-alpha-D-glucan 1-alpha-D-glucosylmutase from *Arthrobacter ramosus*	18/02/16
FLAV	2016-00151	FL 05.106 Myrtenal	23/02/16
ENZ	2016-00141	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Beta-galactosidase from a genetically modified strain of *Aspergillus oryzae* (DP-Bzg59)	25/02/16
ENZ	2016-00142	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha, alpha trehalase from a genetically modified strain of *Trichoderma reesei* (DP-Nzs51)	25/02/16
ENZ	2016-00143	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzymes: Alpha-amylase from a genetically modified strain of *Bacillus licheniformis* (DP-Dzb45)	25/02/16
ENZ	2016-00144	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glucose oxidase from a genetically modified strain of *Aspergillus niger* (DP-Aze23)	25/02/16
ENZ	2016-00145	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from *Geobacillus stearothermophilus* (DP-Gzb47)	25/02/16
FLAV	2016-00159	FL 14.042 6-Methylquinoline	26/02/16
ENZ	2016-00173	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glucan 1,4-alpha-glucosidase from a genetically modified strain of *Trichoderma reesei* (DP-Nzh63)	3/03/16
ENZ	2016-00174	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Subtilisin from a genetically modified strain of *Bacillus subtilis* (DP-Ezx62)	3/03/16
ENZ	2016-00175	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzymes: Subtilisin from a genetically modified strain of *Bacillus subtilis* (DP-Ezx42)	3/03/16
ENZ	2016-00176	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from *Aspergillus oryzae* (DP-Bzb41)	3/03/16
ENZ	2016-00177	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glucan, 1,4-alpha-glucosidase from a genetically modifed strain of *Trichoderma reesei* (DP-Nzh38)	3/03/16
ENZ	2016-00205	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from *Aspergillus oryzae* (strain L729-48)	9/03/16
ENZ	2016-00206	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Phospholipase D from a genetically modified strain of *Streptomyces violaceoruber* (pPDN)	9/03/16

ENZ	2016-00207	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Pectate lyase from *Bacillus subtilis* (strain 11096)	9/03/16
ENZ	2016-00208	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Membrane alanyl aminopeptidase from *Lactococcus lactis* (strain DGCC5920)	9/03/16
ENZ	2016-00200	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from a genetically modified strain of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* (BD15754)	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00201	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Phospholipase C from a genetically modified strain of *Pichia pastoris* (PRF)	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00202	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from a genetically modified strain of *Bacillus licheniformis* (DP-Dzb25)	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00203	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Xylose isomerase from a genetically modified strain of *Streptomyces rubiginosus* (DP-Pzn37)	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00204	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from a genetically modified strain of *Bacillus amyloliquefaciens* (DP-Czb53)	10/03/16
FLAV	2016-00228	FL 09.278 P-mentha-1,8-dien-7-yl acetate	18/03/16

7.2 Valid applications since the previous meeting

Thirty-six mandates for the safety assessment of enzymes, six mandates for the safety assessment of flavourings and five mandates for the safety assessment of food contact materials had been considered valid for the start of the assessment since the last Plenary meeting.

Food Sector	EFSA-Q-Number	Subject	Valid on
FCM	2015-00832	Request for safety evaluation of dimethyl carbonate for use as monomer in plastics	9/02/16
FCM	2016-00006	Request for re-evaluation of Phosphorous acid, mixed 2,4-bis(1,1-dimethylpropyl)phenyl and 4-(1,1-dimethylpropyl) phenyl triesters (Ref. No. 74050; Trade name: Weston 705) with regards to revising the existing specific migration limit	15/02/16
ENZ	2015-00840	Request to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Beta-Fructofuranosidase from *Aspergillus fijiensis* (strain ATCC® 20611™)	15/02/16
ENZ	2015-00845	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Aspergillus nuclease S1 from *Penicillium citrinum* (strain NP-11-15)	15/02/16
ENZ	2015-00847	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzymes: AMP deaminase from *Aspergillus oryzae* (strain DEA 262)	15/02/16

FLAV	2016-00002	Request for an evaluation of a new other flavouring; GRILLIN' 5078	16/02/16
FLAV	2016-00003	Request for an evaluation of a new other flavouring: GRILLIN' CB-200SF	16/02/16
ENZ	2014-00801	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase from *T. emersonii*	22/02/16
ENZ	2014-00802	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase from *T. emersonii*	22/02/16
ENZ	2014-00803	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Cellulase from *T. emersonii*	22/02/16
ENZ	2015-00038	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Pectinase from *A. niger*	22/02/16
ENZ	2015-00039	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Poly-galacturonase from *A. niger*	22/02/16
ENZ	2015-00040	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Pectin esterase from *A. niger*	22/02/16
ENZ	2015-00041	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Pectin lyase *A. niger*	22/02/16
ENZ	2015-00042	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Arabanase from *A. niger*	22/02/16
FLAV	2016-00146	FL 09.302 Myrtenyl acetate	22/02/16
ENZ	2016-00030	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Mucorpepsin from *Rhizomucor miehei*	23/02/16
ENZ	2016-00031	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Acetolactate decarboxylase from a genetically modified strain of *Bacillus licheniformis* (strain NZYM-JB)	23/02/16
ENZ	2016-00032	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glucose isomerase from *Streptomyces murinus* (strain NZYM-GA)	23/02/16
ENZ	2016-00033	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: 4- alpha-glucanotransferase from *Geobacillus pallidus* (strain AE-SAS)	23/02/16
ENZ	2016-00034	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Tannase from *Aspergillus niger* (strain AE-TAN)	23/02/16
FCM	2015-00612	Request for safety evaluation of Superabsorbent Polymer "FAVOR® P500" used as liquid absorber intended to be used in food contact materials	1/03/16

ENZ	2015-00454	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Cellulase from a GM strain of *T. reesei* (DP-Nzc36)	3/03/16
FLAV	2016-00159	FL 14.042 6-Methylquinoline	8/03/16
ENZ	2015-00232	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Subtilisin from *B. licheniformis*	10/03/16
ENZ	2015-00409	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme Beta-galactosidase from *Klyuveromyces lactis*	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00081	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Cyclomaltodextrin glucanotransferase from *Geobacillus stearothermophilus* (strain AE-KCGT)	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00082	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzymes: Cyclomaltodextrin glucanotransferase from *Paenibacillus macerans* (strain AE-CGT)	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00083	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Thermolysin from *Geobacillus stearothermophilus* (strain AE-TP)	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00084	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Phospholipase A2 from *porcine pancreas*	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00085	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Beta amylase from soybean (Glycine max)	10/03/16
ENZ	2016-00099	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Tricylglycerol lipase from a genetically modified strain of *Aspergillus niger agg.* (strain FL108SC)	17/03/16
ENZ	2016-00100	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: 1,4-alpha-glucan branching enzyme from *Geobacillus stearothermophilus* (TRBE14)	17/03/16
ENZ	2014-00911	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from *B. licheniformis*	18/03/16
ENZ	2016-00102	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Urease from *Lactobacillus fermentum* (strain 48/72)	18/03/16
FLAV	2016-00151	FL 05.106 Myrtenal	21/03/16
ENZ	2015-00340	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme Cellulase, Glucanase and Hemicellulase covering Xylanase and Mannanase from *Aspergillus niger*	21/03/16
ENZ	2015-00665	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: 4-Phytase from a genetically modified strain of *Trichoderma reesei* (DP-Nzt55)	21/03/16

ENZ	2015-00666	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from a genetically modified strain of *Bacillus licheniformis* (DP-Dzb54)	21/03/16
ENZ	2015-00667	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Pullulanase from a genetically modified strain of *Bacillus licheniformis* (DP-Dzp39)	21/03/16
ENZ	2015-00681	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from a genetically modified strain of *Trichoderma reesei* (DP-Nzb48)	21/03/16
ENZ	2015-00682	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Thermolysin from *Geobacillus caldoproteolyticus* (DP-Fzj32)	21/03/16
FLAV	2016-00228	FL 09.278 p-Mentha-1,8-dien-7-yl acetate	23/03/2016
ENZ	2015-00448	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glucan 1,4-alpha-maltotetraohydrolase from a GM strain of *B. licheniformis* (DP-Dzf24)	29/03/2016
ENZ	2014-00667	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on a food enzyme: Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase from a genetically modified strain of *T. reesei* (DP-Nzd22)	29/03/2016
FCM	2015-00848	Request for safety evaluation of CO2 emitter for poultry meat	29/03/2016
FCM	2016-00007	Request for the safety evaluation of Freshness indicator for poultry meat	29/03/2016

These applications were assigned to the respective working groups.

8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

8.1 Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel including their Working Groups

8.1.1. Scientific Committee and its Working Groups

The Scientific Committee Plenary was held 17-18 February 2016. The Chair provided feedback on the main issues discussed.

8.1.2. CEF SWG Genotoxicity

8.1.3. CEF SWG Recycling Plastics

8.1.4 CEF SWG Food Contact Materials

8.1.5. CEF SWG Flavourings

8.1.6. CEF SWG Food Enzymes

The agenda items 8.1.2-8.1.6 were not discussed because of lack of time.

8.2 EFSA including its Working Groups /Task Forces

8.2.1. Discussion on the Implications of the Court of Justice in case C-615/13P

Legal and Regulatory Affairs representatives made a presentation regarding the Appeal triggered by an access to documents request submitted under Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001.

8.3 European Commission

9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

9.1 Implications of deletion of Article 11(2) of Regulation (EU) No 10/2011

In the light of the minutes of the PAFF Standing committee (http://ec.europa.eu/food/safety/docs/reg-com_toxic_20160419_sum.pdf) where a proposal for deletion of Article 11(2) of Regulation (EU) No 10/2011 was discussed, the Panel undertook a preliminary discussion of its possible implications on the future workload.

10.Any Other Business

No other business was raised.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI) or Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST:

- In the SDoI submitted for this meeting, Dr Roland Franz declared the following interest: his institute has done some migration tests and data were used in a technical annex of the petitioner's dossier on sodium polyacrylate, cross linked (EFSA-Q-2014-00449) items 6.2 on the Agenda. Additionally, his laboratory has contributed with technical-experimental work and with the preparation of the dossier on Polisan Hellas S.A. recycling process (Polymetrix, formerly Buhler, technology) (EFSA-Q-2015-00404) items 6.4 on the Agenda. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest. This results in exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other processing of these items by the concerned scientific group.