

Brussels, 10 March 2015
EFSA/SHP/LdL/2015

Minutes

TWENTY-SEVENTH MEETING OF THE EFSA STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIVE PLATFORM BRUSSELS (BELGIUM) 10-11 MARCH 2015

MEMBERS OF THE EFSA STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIVE PLATFORM

Chair: *Andreas Varlamos*

AESGP – Association of the European Self-Medication Industry	<i>Kinga Adamaszwili</i>	Eurocoop – European Community of Consumer Cooperatives	<i>Emma Nolan</i>
BEUC – The European Consumer Organisation	<i>Ilaria Passaran, Camille Perrin</i>	EUROPABIO – European Association for Bioindustries	<i>Violeta Georgieva, Delphine Carron</i>
CEFIC – Food & Feed Cluster	<i>Marc Vermeulen,</i>	FEFAC – European Feed Manufacturers Federation	<i>Alexander Döring</i>
COPA-COGECA - European Farmers European Agri-Cooperatives	<i>Javier Valle</i>	FEFANA – European Association of Speciality Feed Ingredients and their mixtures	<i>Didier Jans,</i>
ECPA – European Crop Protection Association	<i>Euros Jones, Lukasz Wozniacki</i>	FoEE – Friends of the Earth Europe	<i>Mute Schimpf</i>
EEB – European Environmental Bureau	<i>Martin Dermine</i>	FoodDrinkEurope	<i>Beate Kettlitz</i>
ELC – Federation of European Specialty Ingredients	<i>Petr Minsk, Maryse Hervé</i>	Greenpeace	<i>Franziska Achterberg</i>
EFAD – European Federation of the Associations of Dietitans	<i>Michael Gore</i>	IFAH – Europe International Federation for Animal Health-Europe	<i>Peter Oostenbach</i>
ESA – European Seed Association	<i>Garlich von Essen</i>	PFP – Primary Food Processors Association	<i>Kalila Hajjar</i>
Euro-Commerce	<i>Els Bedert</i>	UEAPME – Union européenne de l'artisanat et des petites et moyennes entreprises	<i>Birte Day</i>

APOLOGIES

Copa-Cogeca – European Farmers European Agri-Cooperatives (Annette Toft)

ABSENT

AMPEF – Association of Manufacturer and Formulators of Enzyme Products (Henk Aalten)

CELCAA – European Liaison Committee for Agricultural Cooperation in the European Union (Pascale Rouhier)

OBSERVERS

Association of Poultry Processors & Poultry Trade in the EU	<i>Laura Mazzei</i>	EU Food Law	<i>Sara Lewis</i>
Advisory Forum	<i>Giancarlo Belluzzi</i>	EU Food Policy	<i>Kate Trollope</i>
DG SANTE'	<i>Giulia Bertezolo</i>	Eurogroup for Animals	<i>Kirsty Reid</i>
ECHA	<i>Lindsay Jackson</i>	Federation of Associations for Hunting & Conservation in the EU	<i>Yves Lecocq</i>

REPRESENTATIVES OF THE EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Stakeholder Consultative Platform Secretariat: *Lucia de Luca*

<i>Raquel Garcia Mates</i>	<i>James Ramsay</i>
<i>Karine Lheureux</i>	<i>Alberto Spagnolli</i>
<i>Ernesto Liebana Criado</i>	<i>Marta Hugas</i>
	<i>Claudia Timanti</i>

DAY 1 – TUESDAY 10 MARCH 2015

1 WELCOME AND OPENING OF THE MEETING

The Chair, Andreas Varlamos, welcomed members and observers to the 27th meeting of the Platform and noted that apologies were received from Annette Toft at Copa-Cogeca.

2 ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Doc SHP 10 03 15 – 1

With no further points raised for discussion, the Chair adopted the agenda.

2.1 Follow-up actions from the previous meeting

Doc SHP 10 03 15 – 2

Doc SHP 10 03 15 – 3

The Chair pointed out that only Action point 2 is still open. According to this action, members were invited to suggest topics to be discussed by the Platform in 2015 and in a possible annual stakeholder conference. The Chair stressed the role of members shaping the discussions at the Platform and invited members to reflect and send EFSA their suggestions by the end of April 2015. Regarding the annual stakeholder meeting, Lucia de Luca clarified that such meeting will not take place in 2015 since the EFSA Expo conference will offer the opportunity to discuss stakeholder-related matters but that ideas gathered will help shaping the 2016's annual conference with stakeholders.

Action 1: Members to send to EFSA suggestions regarding topics to be discussed in 2015 and topics to be discussed in a possible annual conference by 30 April 2015.

3 STANDING ITEMS

3.1 Report back from EFSA on topics relevant to stakeholders

Power point presentation – 1

Andreas gave the floor to Alberto Spagnolli, acting Head of Communications, who, on behalf of Bernhard Url - who could not attend this meeting due to engagements in Parma - shared with participants an update on EFSA's achievements and future challenges. Alberto updated members on some of the scientific work and meeting with risk managers and with stakeholders which took place since November 2014, the current committee. Alberto invited members to inform their delegates and other interested parties about the Young Researcher

Initiative EFSA launched in the context of the activities organised for the EFSA's 2nd scientific conference scheduled from 14 until 16 October 2015 at the Milan EXPO. The conference and the Initiative will constitute an important opportunity to talk about challenges and opportunities in assessment science with very interesting plenary and break-out sessions. Members are invited to register at their earliest convenience and circulate the information to all interested parties.

Alberto also presented the strategic objectives and multi-annual projects characterising the EFSA Multi-annual plan 2015-2017 which was recently approved by the Board and on which members will be invited to contribute at their 28th Platform meeting in June 2015. Alberto reminded members that discussions on the EFSA Multi-annual plan need to be inspired by the EFSA strategy 2015-2020 which highlights EFSA's strategic priorities for the next five years, for which Alberto presented a timeline. Members will be also invited to discuss the strategy at their 28th meeting.

The Chair gave then the floor to James Ramsay, Acting Head of the External Relations Unit at EFSA who provided participants with a brief overview of some of the multimedia and publication projects realised by EFSA. James focussed on the upcoming communication projects such as the integrated communications campaign outlined for the EFSA event at EXPO and the releases planned to accompany some of the EFSA's scientific outputs on ebola, food contact materials guidance, acrylamide in food and caffeine. James also spoke about the positive evolution in the area of social media, in particular twitter.

The Chair gave the floor to Alberto who briefly updated members on progress on the Open EFSA initiative. Alberto said that the Open EFSA will be the central theme for the strategy the Agency is developing for the next five years and that EFSA relies on the strong and strategic role stakeholders will play in this evolution.

Discussions followed on the role of EFSA at international and global level, in which EFSA is primarily supporting risk managers in

clarifying the Agency's work in fora such as Codex Alimentarius or chairing international group in the area of animal health, microbial and chemical food safety or transboundary threats such as Ebola. Regarding communications, members discussed how could EFSA best address different targets groups in its communication, e.g. the use of specific communications materials such as laymen summary, videos, and of course the important role stakeholders have in acting as multiplier of EFSA's communications as highlighted by the Chair.

The Chair gave the floor to Marta Hugas, acting Head of RASA, who illustrated some of the highlights of the EFSA scientific data warehouse project, a central repository (database) integrating data from several sources which EFSA plans to carry out in 2015 and 2016. The data warehouse will include, for example, information on zoonoses, antimicrobial resistance, foodborne outbreaks, pesticide residues, chemical contaminants, food consumption and chemical hazards.

Marta explained the access rules applied to the project published by EFSA at the end of February 2014 and pointed out that this project will constitute a single access point and a user-friendly feature allowing member states, EFSA and other interested parties to electronically access, retrieve, validate, extract, report and easily visualise data submitted to EFSA, in a variety of different formats. Members investigated about the process EFSA will apply for the validation of the quality of such data and the involvement of stakeholders, as well as the contextualisation of such data. Marta also clarified that a key role in the validation process will be played by the European Commission which sends such data to EFSA but that the role of stakeholders in such process cannot be excluded.

3.2 Update from the EFSA's Application Desk

Power point presentation – 2

The Chair invited Karine Lheureux, Head of Applications Desk Unit at EFSA, to update on the results of the stakeholders' satisfaction survey carried out with more than 411 respondents. Karine illustrated how the results seem to indicate that while the quality of the information was deemed very high by the interviewed parties, issues remain with their accessibility. Karine illustrated the three areas for improvement identified that is: i) more predictable application processes (calling for more dialogue and interactivity); ii) improve the speed of communication; and iii) increase the clarity and usability of content on the EFSA website.

Karine also updated members on the results of the survey on the Matrix project, carried out to evaluate the benefits that stakeholders could potentially gain from the implementation of an electronic management tool for applications of regulated products at EFSA. In a nutshell, 70% of the respondents perceived the level of benefits of such a system as high and very high, while 91% is willing to use such an e-system. Karine concluded her presentation with an overview of the catalogue of harmonised support initiatives EFSA has put in place. The new catalogue, which will be updated regularly, is scheduled for publication mid-March 2015.

3.3 Report on the meeting between industry associations and EFSA

Didier Jans, representative of the association FEFANA, was invited to inform members about the meeting 16 industry associations held with EFSA on 2 October 2014. Didier said the meeting was suggested by the associations to raise the attention to the need to improve the fluidity of the dialogues with applicants at the various stages of the risk assessment process for regulatory products in an efficient and transparent way. Although the associations work in areas which are very differently regulated, each one covered by different legislations, they do face common challenges. Didier pointed out that from the discussions, which took place at the presence of representatives of the DG SANTE', it was clear that talk on specific mandates and

guidance documents is a three-party process which includes EFSA, industry associations and the European Commission when. The associations also requested EFSA to organise annual meetings with applicants' similar to those EFSA has been holding for the past years with non-governmental organisations.

3.4 Update on the work of the SHP Discussion Groups

Doc SHP 10 03 15 – 4

The Chair gave to the floor to Lucia de Luca who referred to the written update on the work of the groups discussion of the Platform shared ahead of the meeting. Regarding the discussion group on food chemical occurrence data, Lucia listed some of the latest achievements and showed the members one of the results of the last group's meeting that is that the current priorities in the area of EFSA contaminants data collection are now available in a dedicated page of the EFSA website. Lucia mentioned that the third meeting of the group will take place in September/October 2015 in Brussels and shared with the participants some topics which could possibly be discussed. Regarding the group on emerging risk, the Chair invited Raquel Garcia Matas, officer responsible for the secretariat of the group to update members. Raquel stressed the key contribution the group made to the detection of possible emerging risks and how the issues discussed in past years by the Group was captured in detail in the groups' 2014 annual report on emerging risks available on the EFSA website. Raquel announced that the group will meet twice in 2015; on 5 May 2015 in Brussels and in October–November 2015.

4. STRATEGIC TOPICS FOR DISCUSSION

4.1 The contribution of the EFSA Advisory Forum

Power point presentation – 3

The Chair referred to the discussions he had at the meeting of the EFSA Management Board in December 2014 when, it was agreed that a representative of the EFSA Advisory Forum should be invited to one of the meetings of the Platform. As a result from that decision, the

Chair gave the floor to Giancarlo Belluzzi, Italian member of the Forum who illustrated the cooperation activities among member states at the Advisory Forum. Giancarlo clarified how one of the key tasks of the Forum is to avoid duplication of work among member states for example by sharing national work programmes, ensure cooperation and networking on scientific topics, share and exchange information and cooperate on scientific divergences. Giancarlo also spoke about how the activities of the Forum are shared at national level. Giancarlo informed participants that the Forum is currently reviewing its functioning to ensure it meets the objectives as set at the beginning of its operations. The review will touch upon the meeting organisation, the structure of the agenda and the roles of members. The review was initiated in 2014 and is taking place through members' surveys and dedicated discussion in break-out sessions. It is scheduled to finish in 2015 with changes to be implemented in 2016.

4.2 EFSA Management Board discusses the Stakeholder Consultative Platform

The Chair thanked the Vice-Chairs and the members for the support provided for the preparation of the power point presentation in view of his participation at the December 2014's meeting of the EFSA Management Board. The Chair said that some of the questions received from Board's members related to the representativeness of national stakeholder interests within the Platform, the importance to establish relationships with the Advisory Forum and Scientific Committee, the sometimes low attendance rate at meetings and the interests of the members, the possible limited representativeness of stakeholders' interest due to the finite number of the Platform's membership, and also the role the Platform could have in acting as communication multiplier. The Board acknowledged the progress made by the Platform and was willing to extend the duration of the current mandate by one year to explore potential developments. The Chair pointed out that the Platform is now ten years old and future developments may focus on more active participations of members in

terms of presentations or contribution through discussion groups and that they will have to fit with the Open EFSA initiative. In the exchange which followed members agree to discuss ideas together and organise break-out discussion groups in the next two meetings planned in 2015. To prepare such encounters, members will share ideas before the next meeting. The Secretariat will consolidate such ideas which will be used to identify the objectives of the break-out groups to be organised at the June meeting.

Action 2: Members to send suggestions related to potential improvements of the current Platform format to be discussed in the break-out sessions of the June meeting by 30 April 2015.

Action 3: The Secretariat to consolidate the suggestions for the Chair and Vice-Chair to identify objectives of the June break-out groups by 30 May 2015.

DAY 2 – WEDNESDAY 11 MARCH 2015

4.3 How ECHA works with stakeholders. Sharing experiences

Power point presentation – 4

The Chair invited Lindsay Jackson, Head of Communications at the European Chemicals Agency (ECHA) to illustrate members the Agency's approach to stakeholder relations. Lindsay said that for ECHA stakeholders are considered as partners to either involve, consult or involve in their work. Lindsay stressed that ECHAs' flexible and agile approach, relies on an accredited stakeholder system and ensures the Agency gets the needed input, crucial networking, sharing of experiences and tangible stakeholders' feedback on critical issues, while ensuring a balanced treatment and high independence. The system is based on proactive involvement. In particular, the

annual strategic workshops leads to clear and shared stakeholders' recommendations on which ECHA commits to work on instead of long list of recommendations which are not addressed. Lindsay presented some initiatives developed with stakeholders such as in the area of communications and concluded by saying that thanks to the honest and intense dialogue with stakeholders possible conflicts are born of disagreement on a matter of substance and not on misunderstandings. ECHA's level of stakeholder satisfaction is quite high, that is equal to 86%.

Questions followed on whether EU agencies were trying to align their stakeholder engagement approach. Lindsay answered that each agencies is different and has to find its own path to stakeholder relations.

4.4 Interactions between EFSA and stakeholders, future developments

Doc SHP 10 03 15 – 5

The Chair gave the floor to Lucia who said that EFSA is currently reflecting on how to further engage with its stakeholders in line with one of the key aims of the Open EFSA initiative which is to explore how EFSA can best meet the needs and expectations of its stakeholders. The focus of the initiative is to develop a stronger and sounder engagement with stakeholders in the years to come and the aim of the break-out sessions is to gather the members' feedback on what steps EFSA might take in the future to adapt and improve the way it engages with stakeholders. Lucia invited members to join one of the groups which will both aim to respond to four questions, namely: i) Critical success factors for EFSA's engagement with stakeholders, ii) Purpose of the engagement (what should EFSA and its stakeholders achieve?); iii) Ideas on modalities of engagement per category of stakeholders; and iv) How to reduce barriers to stakeholders' participation.

4.5 Feedback from break-out sessions and discussion

The Chair gave the floor to the rapporteurs of the two groups who listed some of the suggestions mentioned in response to the four questions:

- A. Critical success factors: Establish a real dialogue on science; equal access and treatment for all stakeholders but differentiated engagement based on the type of stakeholders. The engagement process should be transparent, reliable, predictable, uniform across EFSA and efficient to deliver information on time.
- B. Purpose of the engagement: EFSA's legal responsibility and crucial for EFSA's credibility. Increase mutual understanding and trust of the society in EFSA and create knowledge of EFSA's work for end consumers. Improved trust in EFSA will improve the quality of EFSA's work. Stakeholders to act as sounding board for communications initiatives.
- C. Modalities of the engagement: Increase dialogue with stakeholders on scientific work with transparent engagement rules, seek shared engagement, work on clarifying feedback sent by stakeholders to public consultations and better promote such consultations, clarify rules for stakeholder accreditation, increase stakeholder contribution to guidance documents, put in place more cooperation between risk assessors and risk managers, create fora for deeper stakeholders discussions, need for continuous stakeholder engagement when defining the guidance documents and engagement during the risk assessment process (e.g. literature review, data validation, face-to-face dialogue, embargo procedures). Clarify role and responsibilities of observers at meetings.
- D. How to reduce barriers to stakeholders' participation: Make EFSA more accessible, strike a balance between engagement and fear of being accused of conflicts of interest, timely sharing of information to stakeholders, increase EFSA's willingness to engage. EFSA to put in place a grant system for the involvement of civil society in its work.

In the discussion which followed members stressed the need for stakeholders to be consulted more and on a regular basis while taking into account the specific needs of the different groups of stakeholders. Discussion on the EFSA broader stakeholder engagement also touched upon the current Platform, members praised its existence and functioning and called on EFSA to ensure that free discussions can be held at Platform meetings and to define responsibilities of observers attending the meetings. Since the Platform was set up ten years ago, it is time to reflect on the achievements and look at possible improvements to increase the interactivity for example with break-out sessions dedicated to horizontal topics. The issue of the Platform having a finite membership was also mentioned as an area to reflect on. Members praised the break-out group modality as being a good one to allow a free and challenging exchange of information.

4.6 Development of resistant bacteria, an update of the first joint ECDC/EFSA/EMA Report

The Chair gave the floor to Ernesto Liebana, Acting Head of Unit of the Biological Hazards and Contaminants (BIOCONTAM) at EFSA to present the work of the Panel in the area of Antimicrobial Resistance. Ernesto outlined the result of EFSA's work on Carbapenemases in food animal ecosystems, an emerging and highly sensitive public health issue, as pointed out in the last report on antimicrobials. He said that although transmission through the food chain has not yet been reported, it is considered likely to emerge, to this end specific targeted surveys at EU level are needed.

Regarding the Joint Interagency Antimicrobial Consumption and Resistance Analysis, Ernesto explained the possible relationships investigated between the antimicrobial consumption in humans, animals and their possible and correlate antimicrobial resistance deriving in both humans and animals. The Panel carried out a comparison of consumption for humans and food-producing animals

and correlated it to resistance in human bacteria indicating some positive associations for E. coli (BSIs) and some classes such as 3-4th gen Cephs and Fluoroquinolones. Ernesto also explained in detail the comparison carried out in the report of antimicrobial consumption and resistance in animals and how indicators of resistance were derived as well as other possible relationships between antibiotics consumption in animals and resistance in humans were investigated. Regarding the annual European Union summary reports prepared by EFSA and ECDC, and effort resulting in more comparable data and similar criteria used by ECDC and EFSA to interpret antimicrobial resistance (AMR) in humans. Ernesto ended up his presentation with an explanation on key findings on Salmonella and Campylobacter.

5. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Doc SHP 10 03 15 – 6

The Chair gave the floor to Lucia to present the Rolling Plan on EFSA's activities with its stakeholders. Regarding the next meeting of the Platform scheduled for June 2015, Lucia informed members that they would be receiving a request to register and book their flights quite soon since the logistic aspects of the meeting needs to be initiated quite soon in view of the high affluence to Milan for the EXPO.

The Chair asked members if they had any questions regarding the rolling plan of EFSA's activities.

With no further points added to the agenda, the Chair closed the meeting.

ENDS---