28 05 2014
EFSA/FIP/348 rev 1

Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 46th plenary meeting

Held on 8-10 4 2014

(Agreed on 20 05 2014)

Participants

- **Panel Members**:

  Leon Brimer, Laurence Castle (vice-chair), Alessandro Di Domenico, Karl-Heinz Engel, Roland Franz, Nathalie Gontard, Rainer Gürtler[1], Trine Husøy, Klaus-Dieter Jany[2], Martine Kolf-Clauw, Wim Mennes (chair), Maria Rosaria Milana[3], Fátima Poças[4], Kettil Svensson, Fidel Toldrá, and Detlef Wölfle (vice-chair).

- **Hearing experts:**

  Eugenia Lampi[5], Ralph Pirow[6], Nathalie von Goetz[7]

- **European Commission:**

  Ylva Johannesson, Annette Schaefer, and Bastiaan Schupp, (DG Sanco, E6), Rebeca Fernandez Fernandez and Rafael Perez-Berbejal (DG Sanco E3)

- **EFSA:**

  Food Ingredients and Packaging (FIP) Unit: Margarita Aguilera-Gomez[4], Cristina Croera. Marina Goumenou[4], Claudia Heppner, Annamaria Rossi, Rositsa Serafimova, Anne Theobald.

  Legal and Regulatory Affairs Unit: Simone Gabbi[8]

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Vice-chair welcomed the members to the 46th CEF plenary meeting. Apologies for absence were received from following CEF Panel members: Ulla Beckman Sundh, Mona-Lise Binderup, and Claudia Bolognesi for the full plenary meeting. The CEF Panel was informed that two members of the CEF WG BPA exposure Natalie von Goetz and Ralph

[1] Present only from 9 to 10 April 2014
[2] Present only from 8 to 9 April 2014
[3] Present by phone only on 8 April 2014
[4] Present by phone
[5] Present by phone only on 9 April 2014
[6] Present only on 9 April 2014
[7] Present only on 8 April 2014
[8] Present by phone on 8 April 2014

European Food Safety Authority – Via Carlo Magno 1/a, 43126 Parma, ITALY
Tel: (+39) 0521 036 111 • Fax: (+39) 0521 036 110 • www.efsa.europa.eu

Pirow were invited to participate as hearing experts to the discussions related to the draft part on the exposure assessment of bisphenol A (BPA).

2. Adoption of agenda

The draft agenda was adopted without any changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[9] and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests[10], EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the SDoI, please refer to Annexes I. Oral Declarations of interest (ODoI) were asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Election of CEF Chair/Vice-Chair

In the presence of Simone Gabbi (Legal and Regulatory Affairs Unit) by phone, who explained the procedure of the election, Dr Wim Mennes was unanimously elected as chair of the CEF Panel. In addition, Dr. Laurence Castle was unanimously elected as second vice-chair of the CEF Panel.

5. Agreement minutes 45th CEF plenary meeting (25-27 March 2013)

The minutes of the 45th plenary meeting were agreed on 08 April 2014. The minutes will be available on the Authority's webpage[11].

6. Report on written procedures since 45th CEF plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

The Chair of the CEF Panel expressed his appreciation for the work on the scientific outputs discussed at this meeting, to the Working Groups (WG) on bisphenol A exposure, Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings, Recycling Plastics, and to the EFSA staff members involved in each WG.

7.1 BPA exposure assessment (EFSA-Q-2012-00423)

The chair of the WG BPA exposure outlined the revisions which were carried out by the members of the WG in the respective chapters of the draft exposure assessment on BPA in the light of the comments received during the public consultation phase (part 1). The Panel

[9] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[10] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf
[11] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/140325.htm

had a thorough discussion and reading on the respective chapters of the exposure assessment. In addition, the CEF Panel discussed the current timelines for the overall opinion and noted that it is not possible due to the high number of approximately 250 comments received during the public consultation (part 2) related to the health aspect to adopt the opinion by May 2014. The Panel agreed that a prolongation of the deadline to December 2014 is needed. It was also clarified and agreed that no additional literature, besides the papers which were submitted during the public consultation process, can be taken into account in order to meet the deadline.

7.2 RECYC099-Recycling process RPC Cobelplast Montonate (EFSA-Q-2012-00907)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage[12].

7.3 RECYC035-Recycling process Phoenix ESPS (EFSA-Q-2010-00063)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage[13].

7.4 ATCO-OSDE (EFSA-Q-2011-00241)

The CEF Panel discussed the current terms of reference for food contact materials and agreed to apply a more general wording from now onwards.

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage[14].

7.5 FavorPac (EFSA-Q-2011-00066)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage[15].

7.6 Xylanase from genetically modified *Aspergillus oryzae* (strain NZYM-FB) (EFSA-Q-2012-00897)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage[16].

[12] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/efsajournal/pub/3404.htm
[13] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/efsajournal/pub/3404.htm
[14] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/efsajournal/pub/3404.htm
[15] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/efsajournal/pub/3404.htm

7.7 Alpha-amylase from genetically modified *Bacillus licheniformis* (strain NZYM-KE) (EFSA-Q-2012-00898)

The Panel shortly discussed the results of the 90-day toxicity study and the respective Margin of Exposure, however due to lack of time it was not possible to finalise the discussions and it was proposed to continue the discussions at the next plenary meeting.

7.8 FGE.213 Rev1 (EFSA-Q-2013-00102 to -00113; EFSA-Q-2013-00554; EFSA-Q-2013-00560 and -00561)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage[17].

7.9 FGE.91 Rev2 (EFSA-Q-2013-00412 to -00418)

Due to lack of time this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.10 FGE.74 Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00410 to -00411 and EFSA-Q-2013-00866 to -00873)

Due to lack of time this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.11 FGE.47 Rev2 (EFSA-Q-2014-00141 to -00142)

Due to lack of time this item was deferred to the next meeting.

7.12 FGE.304 Rev1 (EFSA-Q-2013-00860)

Due to lack of time this item was deferred to the next meeting.

8. New Mandates

Due to lack of time no detailed outline was given but panel members were invited to look at the respective document which is available on the workspace.

9. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/the Scientific Panel, Working Groups, EFSA, the European Commission

9.1 Scientific Committee

No report back was provided as there was no SC meeting held since the previous CEF panel meeting.

9.2 Working Groups

[16] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/efsajournal/pub/3404.htm
[17] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/efsajournal/pub/3404.htm

No report back was provided as there was no WG meeting held since the previous CEF panel meeting.

9.3 EFSA

9.3.1 General matters

The Head of the FIP unit informed the members of the CEF Panel that the next upcoming plenary meeting in May will be the last meeting of the current panel although the mandate of this Panel will run until 30 June 2014. The CEF Panel mandate 2014-2017 will start from 1 July 2014 onwards.

9.4 European Commission

Annette Schaefer informed the members that as of 1 May 2014 she will no longer work in DG Sanco on food contact materials. The Panel members wished Annette all the best for her new assignment.

10. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussions

No information was provided.

11. Any other business

No other business was raised.

Annex I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Specific Declaration of Interests (SDoI)[18]

a) CONFLICT OF INTEREST:

In his SDOI Dr. Roland Franz declared the following interests: in two recycling processes RPC Cobelplast Montonate (EFSA-Q-2010-00063) and Phoenix ESPS (EFSA-Q-2012-00907) where his laboratory has prepared the dossiers for the respective petitioners. In addition, he declared also an interest in FAVOR Pack (EFSA Q No. 2011-00066). Although his laboratory was not involved with migration testing for this application, his laboratory has done testing and preparation of dossiers for competing products. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interests above were deemed to represent a conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when these items (agenda items 7.2, 7.3. 7.5) are discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

[18] The Annual Declarations of Interests have been screened and approved before inviting the experts to the meeting, in accordance with the Decision of the Executive Director implementing the Policy on Independence regarding Declarations of Interests.