

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH
Minutes of the 47th plenary meeting of the Scientific Panel on Plant Health
Held on 29-30 January 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 12 March 2014)

Participants

• **Panel Members:**

Richard Baker, Claude Bragard, Thierry Candresse, Gianni Gilioli, Jean-Claude Gregoire, Imre Holb, Michael John Jeger, Olia Evtimova Karadjova, Christer Sven Magnusson, David Makowski, Charles Manceau, Maria Navajas, Trond Rafoss, Vittorio Rossi, Jan Schans, Gritta Schrader, Gregor Urek, Johan Coert Van Lenteren, Irene Vloutoglou, Stephan Winter, Wopke Van Der Werf

• **Hearing Experts**

Andrea Battisti (University of Padova)

– **EFSA:**

- **Animal and Plant Health Unit:** Franck Berthe, Ewelina Czwieczek, Gabor Hollo, Virag Kertesz, Svetla Kozelska, Tomasz Oszako, Giuseppe Stancanelli, Sara Tramontini, Sybren Vos
- **Other EFSA Units/Departments:** Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (Assessment and Methodological Support Unit, Risk Assessment and Scientific Assistance Department); Simon Terry (Editorial and Media Relations Unit, Communication Department)

– **Observers:**

Guillermo Cardon (DG SANCO, attended via videoconference only items 6, 7, 9.1 and 9.3); Françoise Petter (European and Mediterranean Plant Protection Organisation (EPPO)).

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Panel Chair welcomed the participants to 47th plenary meeting of the EFSA Plant Health Panel. Apologies were received for the second day from Charles Manceau and for the first half day, due to an overlapping EFSA meeting on expert elicitation, from Wopke van der Werf, Jean Claude Gregoire, Vittorio Rossi and Gianni Gilioli.

Two new colleagues from EFSA Animal and Plant Health unit Ewelina Czwieczek (trainee) and Tomasz Oszako (seconded national expert) were introduced and welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interests (Dols)¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed at this meeting have been identified during the screening process or in the Oral Declarations of Interest (ODOI) at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 46th Plenary meeting held on 20-21 November 2013, Parma

The minutes were agreed.

5. Scientific topics for information and/or discussion

5.1. Presentation by Andrea Battisti (University of Padova) of the outsourced EFSA Article 36 Project PERSEUS – A review of data quality on pest occurrence and distribution in the EU and its influence on uncertainties for pest risk assessment for the EU territory - (CFP/EFSA/PLH/2010/01)

PERSEUS: Plant health pest surveys for the EU territory: an analysis of data quality and methodologies and the resulting uncertainties for pest risk assessment.

The major outcomes of the project were presented. The three main tasks performed were:

- The systematic review performed on the methodologies of specific surveys for the 298 pests listed in the annexes of Directive 2000/29;
- The identification of the strengths and limitations of the different survey methodologies;
- The analyses of the uncertainties linked to the pest surveys for pest risk assessment and for evaluation of management options.

The conclusions of the work are as follows:

- Survey methods for the majority of species are poorly documented (in particular sampling methods);
- Typically (though not always) positives are reported without number of plants or area examined;
- Diagnostic tests are well described;
- Research disproportionate for some species;
- No common reporting procedure;
- Key information for quantitative assessment of uncertainty not reported/available.

The PERSEUS project recommends that a structure for the reporting of survey results should be developed, that more consideration should be given to emerging pests and that a central repository of methods used and data collected should be considered.

The Panel discussed and agreed on the need of communicating these important results to the risk managers.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

6. Update on public consultations for discussions and possible endorsement of public consultation reports:

6.1. Reply to the comments from the public consultation on the draft scientific opinion *Phyllosticta citricarpa* (Citrus black spot) EFSA-Q-2012-00334

The draft Technical report on “Outcome of the public consultation on the draft scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of *Phyllosticta citricarpa* for the EU territory” was presented to the Panel members. The Panel members recommended to emphasize more the contribution of the comments received to the improvement of the opinion in the report conclusions. The Panel endorsed the technical report.

6.2. Reply to the comments from the public consultation on the draft scientific opinion on *Xanthomonas campestris* (Citrus canker) EFSA-Q-2012-00333

The draft Technical report on “Outcome of the public consultation on the draft scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of *Xanthomonas citri* *pv.* *citri* and *Xanthomonas citri* *pv.* *aurantifolii* for the EU territory” was presented to the Panel members. The Panel members recommended to summarize shortly the comments received also in the report itself and to emphasize the contribution of the commentators for the improvement of the opinion in the conclusions. The Panel endorsed the technical report.

7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

7.1. Draft scientific opinion on *Xanthomonas campestris* (Citrus canker) EFSA-Q-2012-00928

The draft opinion was presented to the Panel members by the WG chair. The Panel discussed in detail mainly the following issues:

- host range, natural and artificial infection and its implication for the entry part,
- limitations for the transfer of the bacteria to the host plant,
- specification of the genera falling in the category “Rutaceous ornamental plants”,
- “infection” being part of the Entry and/or the Establishment part.

The WG addressed the PLH Panel comments and presented the changes in the opinion to the Panel on the second day of the meeting. After the changes were discussed and agreed the opinion was adopted by the Panel.

7.2. Draft scientific opinion *Phyllosticta citricarpa* (Citrus black spot) EFSA-Q-2012-00992

The draft opinion was presented to the Panel members by the WG chair. The Panel discussed in detail mainly the following issues:

- *Phyllosticta* species;
- Host range, with particular focus on Tahiti lime;
- Entry pathways and risk reduction options;
- Publication of a data annex with quantitative models results;

To address the PLH Panel comments, changes in the opinion were proposed and discussed. The opinion was adopted by the Panel.

8. Update on public written adoption and publications

8.1. Written adoption on the scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of *Phytophthora fragariae* var. *fragariae* in the EU territory, with the identification and evaluation of risk reduction options (EFSA-Q-2012-00810)

A short report was presented to the Panel on the results of written adoption of the *Phytophthora fragariae* var. *fragariae* opinion. Following the EFSA procedure the opinion was published on the website on the 23rd of January 2014.

The Panel was informed that also the report concerning the technical hearing with experts operating within the commercial cultivation and trade in strawberry and raspberry in the EU to assist evaluation of the risk of certain organism listed in Annex II, Part A, Section II of Council Directive 2000/29/EC was published on EFSA website the 22nd of January 2014

8.2. Update on the publications of the EFSA statement on the urgent request on *Xylella fastidiosa* (host plants, pathways and risk reduction options) (EFSA-Q-2013-00890) and the Scientific Opinion on assessment of the potential establishment of the apple snail (EFSA-Q-2012-00991)

The EFSA Statement has been published in November 2013. It included a preliminary assessment of host range, vectors, pathways and risk reduction options. The key entry pathway is plants for planting and spread is by natural means via vectors and by human assistance via trade of plants for planting. In addition to the EFSA statement on *Xylella fastidiosa*, the Panel was requested to provide a scientific opinion in the form of a pest risk assessment. The Scientific Opinion on assessment of the potential establishment of the apple snail (EFSA-Q-2012-00991) was published in December 2013.

9. New mandates/progress report

9.1. ERA Pomacea (EFSA-Q-2012-00739)

The progress of the environmental risk assessment of the apple snail was presented by the Chair and rapporteur of the working group indicating the importance of external experts consultation for the assessment of the change in service provision level and biodiversity of the ecosystem.

The Panel discussed the possibility to also address specifically the expected potential impact of a snail invasion in European areas of specific interest such as natural reserve, protected areas and other Natura 2000 areas.

9.2. Soil and growing media (EFSA-Q-2013-00405)

The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2013-00405.

The progress on the assessment of the risk posed by the import into the EU of soil and growing media was presented by the Chair of the working group. The presenter informed that the working group will not perform a quantitative pathway analysis for different combinations of risk reducing options due to the difficulties to apply the method to the different soil and growing media as many different pests and soil types are involved leading to very important assumptions and this would result in a generic model that is not practical to assist the decision maker. The working group is currently exploring the possibility to develop a relational database in order to link the inventories of soil and growing media, the potentially associated pests, and the available risk reducing options.

9.3. *Daktulosphaira vitifoliae* (EFSA-Q-2012-00804)

The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2012-00804.

An update on the progress to date was given by the Chair of the working group. The conclusions on the risk of entry, establishment, spread and impact were presented to the

Panel. The possibility for this pest to develop aggressive strains inside and outside the risk assessment area has been identified as a crucial aspect to be considered in the context of the evaluation of risk reduction options. The full opinion is planned to be presented for discussion during the plenary meeting of March 2014.

9.4. *Strawberry crinkle virus* and *Strawberry mild yellow edge virus* (EFSA-Q-2012-00803 and EFSA-Q-2012-00802)

The requests are registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2012-00803 and EFSA-Q-2012-00802.

The working group chair gave an update on the progress of the draft opinion on *Strawberry mild yellow edge virus*, and introduced the conclusions of the pest categorisation, as well as the conclusions of the pest risk assessment stages. The working group is elaborating the section on risk reduction options and will shortly commence the development of the draft opinion on *Strawberry crinkle virus*. In light of the recent outbreak of *Strawberry mild yellow edge virus* in the USA, the importance of certification was highlighted.

9.5. *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *vesicatoria* (Dodge) Dye and *Clavibacter michiganensis* spp. *michiganensis* (Smith) Davis et al. (EFSA-Q-2012-00808) and (EFSA-Q-2012-00807)

The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA Q-2012-00807 and Q-2012-00807

The PLH Panel was informed that the work of the Tomato bacteria has just started. The EFSA staff responsible for supporting the WG were indicated. The workplan and the WG expertise and composition have to be discussed and decided with WG Chair. The approach to this WG is to produce distinct opinions for each question/species, to be used as case study for the new batch of risk assessments to support the update of the annexes of plant health legislation; the aim is a fit for purpose risk assessment with a 2 steps approach and an interactive approach with the new EC Annexes Working group (section II) of the Standing Committee. Within this plan, the pest categorisation could be delivered by the original deadline of May 2014 and, depending on feedback from risk managers, the work could be continued afterwards with full risk assessment and evaluation of risk reduction.

9.6. *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment and evaluation of risk reduction options (EFSA-Q-2013-00891)

The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA Q-2013-00891

The PLH Panel was informed about the progress of the WG on *Xylella fastidiosa* which had its first meeting with the WG Chair in December 2013 to identify expertise needed and to discuss the Working Group composition. The EFSA staff responsible for supporting the WG were indicated.

10. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/the Scientific Panel, Working Groups, EFSA, the European Commission

An update was given on the activities of the Scientific Committee Working Groups.

A presentation was given to the Panel by Wopke van der Werf on the advancements of the EFSA Scientific Committee WG on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment (ERA), where the approaches of GMO, PPR and PLH Panels are now under evaluation, highlighting the main differences and similarities.

An update was given on EFSA outsourcing activities, particularly on a project on development and testing of the media monitoring tool MediSys for the monitoring, early identification and reporting of existing and emerging plant health threats. This project is run

together with the Joint Research Centre of the European Commission and the University of Lleida and Institut de Recerca i Tecnologia Agroalimentàries (IRTA) from Spain.

11. Any Other Business

The Panel was reminded to register to the Joint EFSA EPPO Workshop on “Data collection and information sharing in plant health”.

- **Next meeting confirmation**

The next plenary meeting will take place on 12-13 March 2014, in Parma.
