

27 11 2013  
EFSA/FIP/173 rev.2

**Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings  
and Processing Aids (CEF)**

**Minutes of the 40<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting**

**Held on 22-25 10 2013**

**(Agreed on 27 11 2013)**

**Participants**

**• Panel Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh<sup>1</sup>, Claudia Bolognesi, Leon Brimer, Laurence Castle, Alessandro Di Domenico<sup>4</sup>, Karl-Heinz Engel<sup>2</sup>, Roland Franz, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy, Martine Kolf-Clauw, Klaus-Dieter Jany, Wim Mennes (Vice-Chair), Maria Rosaria Milana<sup>3</sup>, Iona Pratt (Chair), Kettil Svensson, Fidel Toldrá<sup>4</sup> and Detlef Wölflé (Vice-Chair)

**• Hearing Experts:**

Riccardo Crebelli<sup>5</sup>

**• European Commission:**

Annette Schäfer (DG Sanco E6)

**• EFSA:**

Food Ingredients and Packaging (FIP) Unit: Eric Barthelemy, Maria Carfi, Anna F. Castoldi, Cristina Croera, Marina Goumenou, Claudia Heppner, Maria Luisa Escudero Hernandez, Alina Lupu, Silvia Moretti, Annamaria Rossi, Kim Rygaard Nielsen, Rositsa Serafimova, Rachele Tamburino, Anne Theobald, Elisavet Thessalonikeos.

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the members to the 40<sup>th</sup> CEF plenary meeting. Apologies for absence were received from: Mona-Lise Binderup, Nathalie Gontard and Fátima Poças for the full plenary meeting. The members of the CEF Panel took note of a TV crew from France 2 which filmed the CEF panel meeting until item 4 and then left the CEF plenary meeting.

<sup>1</sup> Participated only on 22 and 23 October 2013 physically and on 25 October by teleconference

<sup>2</sup> Participated only on 22, 23 and 24 October 2013

<sup>3</sup> Participated only on 22 October 2013

<sup>4</sup> Participated only on 22, 23 and 24 October 2013 physically and on 25 October by teleconference

<sup>5</sup> Participated only on 23 and 24 October 2013

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The draft agenda was adopted without any changes.

## 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>6</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>7</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADol) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDol) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the SDol, as well as the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to Annexes I and II.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes

### 4.1 Agreement minutes 39<sup>th</sup> CEF Panel meeting (24-27 September 2013)

The minutes of the 39<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting were agreed on the 22 October 2013 and are published on the Authority's webpage<sup>8</sup>.

## 5. Report on written procedure since 39<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

## 6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

The Chair of the CEF Panel expressed her appreciation for the work on the scientific outputs discussed at this meeting, to the WGs on bisphenol A toxicology and exposure, Food Contact Materials, Recycling plastics, Flavourings, and to the EFSA staff members involved in each WG.

### 6.1 Draft opinion on Sky-Light (Erema MPR) ([EFSA-Q-2009-00707](#))

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage<sup>9</sup>.

### 6.2 Draft opinion on Octal ([EFSA-Q-2009-00965](#)), Pregis ([EFSA-Q-2009-00963](#)), Sabert ([EFSA-Q-2010-00050](#)), Linpac ([EFSA-Q-2010-00067](#)), Hofheld ([EFSA-Q-2010-00146](#)), Huhtamaki ([EFSA-Q-2010-00214](#)), Snelcore ([EFSA-Q-2010-00089](#)) ExtruPET ([EFSA-Q-2010-00051](#)), Selenis ([EFSA-Q-2010-00103](#)), Re-PET ([EFSA-Q-2012-00236](#)) (Erema Basic)

The CEF Panel discussed the draft opinion but suggested minor modifications, therefore it was agreed to adopt the opinion by written procedure.

### 6.3 Draft opinion on Kruschitz ([EFSA-Q-2009-00849](#)), Vogtland ([EFSA-Q-2009-00850](#)), Veolia ([EFSA-Q-2009-00865](#)), ITW Polyrecycling ([EFSA-Q-2009-00918](#)),

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

<sup>8</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/130924-m.pdf>

<sup>9</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3450.htm>

**Texplast** ([EFSA-Q-2009-00958](#)), **Alimpet** ([EFSA-Q-2010-00026](#)), **Esox Prodimpex** ([EFSA-Q-2010-00066](#)) (Erema Advanced)

The CEF Panel discussed the draft opinion but suggested minor modifications, therefore it was agreed to adopt the opinion by written procedure.

**6.4 Draft opinion on Copolymer wax ethylene vinyl acetate** ([EFSA-Q-2013-00282](#))

The draft opinion was discussed and revisions in the area of toxicity were proposed to the CEF WG Food Contact Materials. The opinion was not adopted and will be scheduled for possible adoption at one of the upcoming plenary meetings.

**6.5 Draft opinion on BPA** ([EFSA-Q-2012-00423](#))

The members of the CEF Panel were informed in depth on the comments received during the public consultation process of the draft exposure assessment and how the members of the WG BPA exposure proposed to take these comments into account. In addition, the draft parts on toxicokinetics, dose-response modelling and the endpoints relevant for the risk characterisation were discussed. The members of the CEF Panel provided further steering to the WG BPA exposure and WG toxicology.

**6.6 Draft opinion on FCM Guidelines** ([EFSA-Q-2011-00107](#))

The members of the CEF panel discussed all chapters related to the draft new guidance for the presentation of an application for safety assessment of a substance to be used in food contact materials prior to its authorisation and the panel endorsed the document for public consultation. The HoU of FIP outlined that EFSA will propose the date for public consultation and will inform the CEF Panel on the outcome.

**6.7 Draft opinion on FGE.213 Rev1** ([EFSA-Q-2013-00102](#) to [-00113](#) and [EFSA-Q-2013-00560](#) and [-00561](#))

The draft opinion was discussed and revisions in the area of genotoxicity were proposed to the CEF WG genotoxicity. The opinion was not adopted and will be scheduled for possible adoption at one of the upcoming plenary meetings.

**6.8 Draft opinion on FGE.76 Rev1** ([EFSA-Q-2013-00222](#) and [-00223](#))

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage<sup>10</sup>.

**6.9 Draft opinion on FGE.21 Rev4** ([EFSA-Q-2013-00224](#) to [-00228](#) and [EFSA-Q-2013-00181](#))

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage<sup>11</sup>.

**6.10 Draft opinion on FGE.93 Rev1** ([EFSA-Q-2013-00182](#) to [-00184](#) and [00180](#))

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage<sup>12</sup>.

---

<sup>10</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3455.htm>

<sup>11</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3451.htm>

## 6.11 Draft opinion on FGE.210 Rev1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00268](#) to [-00276](#) and [EFSA-Q-2013-00554](#) to [-00559](#))

Due to lack of time this opinion was not discussed and will be scheduled for possible adoption to one of the upcoming CEF plenary meetings.

## 6.12 Draft opinion on FGE.24 Rev2 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00357](#))

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage<sup>13</sup>.

## 7. New Mandates

Overall, ten new requests falling within the remit of the CEF Panel were received by EFSA since the last plenary meeting. Two requests related to Enzymes ([EFSA-Q-2013-00789](#) and [EFSA-Q-2013-00790](#)), seven requests falling within the area of FCMs (one application related to substances [EFSA-Q-2013-00641](#); four applications related to recycling processes [EFSA-Q-2013-00754](#), [EFSA-Q-2013-00753](#), [EFSA-Q-2013-00724](#), and [EFSA-Q-2013-00613](#), three applications related to active and intelligent packaging [EFSA-Q-2013-00639](#), [EFSA-Q-2013-00725](#) and [EFSA-Q-2013-00726](#) and one request related to the re-evaluations of flavourings [EFSA-Q-2013-00816](#). For most of these applications the APDESK unit is currently carrying out the completeness check and the registration is not yet completed. The Panel received also a mandate to review the information provided by Joint Reinforced Plastics Working Group and to advise on whether the suggested approach provided in the industry guidance document is suitable to demonstrate that when glass fibre sizing in glass fibre reinforced plastics for food contact satisfies the requirements of Art. 3 of Regulation (EC) No 1935/2004 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00838](#)). The Panel expressed concerns that under the currently high workload it is not possible to deliver this opinion at the requested time (July 2014) and indicated that an extension of the deadline should be asked to the EC.

## 8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/the Scientific Panel, Working Groups, EFSA, the European Commission

### Scientific Committee

#### 8.1 Scientific Committee

No meeting of the SC was held since last meeting of the CEF panel.

### 8.2 Working Groups

#### 8.2.1 WG BPA Exposure

No additional information was provided as this item was already discussed under agenda item 6.5.

#### 8.2.2 WG BPA Tox

No additional information was provided as this item was already discussed under agenda item 6.5.

---

<sup>12</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3452.htm>

<sup>13</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3453.htm>

### **8.2.3            WG FCM Recycling**

No additional information was provided as this item was already discussed under agenda item 6.1-6.3.

### **8.2.4            WG FCM Substances**

No additional information was provided as this item was already discussed under agenda item 6.4.

### **8.2.5            WG Genotox**

The chair of the WG reported from the last WG meeting and on challenges to identify dates for meetings as well as to have sufficient resources to make progress on the draft opinions. It was proposed that a meeting with the chairs of the WG flavourings and WG genotoxicity and EFSA staff, and EC should be organised in the near future to identify options for streamlining the workflow related to data submissions in the area of flavourings.

## **8.3            EFSA**

### **8.3.1            General matters**

The Head of the FIP Unit shortly informed the members of the CEF Panel on the following topics:

- Outcome of the 58<sup>th</sup> Management Board meeting held on 24.10.13
- The Board appointed Bernhard Url as Acting Executive Director of EFSA and the Commission representative described the procedures and timescale for the selection and appointment of a permanent Executive Director.
- EFSA's presented a progress report on activities covering the period since the last Board meeting in June. The Members congratulated EFSA for the delivery of a significant work programme in that period;
- The Board discussed EFSA's strategic orientations over the coming three-year period in light of the need to finalise the Multiannual Plan 2014-2016 for the December 2013 Board meeting and in view of the establishment of a corporate EFSA Strategy in 2014. The Board welcomed EFSA's approach to streamlining strategic and planning documents;
- The Board adopted EFSA's 2014 Work Programme for Grants and Procurement in Science and approved amendments to the Article 36 list of organisations;
- EFSA presented an update on the renewal of EFSA's ANS and CEF Panels which included information on the breakdown of applicants by gender and nationality, communication activities, and timetable;
- EFSA presented an update on the EU Menu project, noting the changes in funding since the project was first proposed and highlighting the effective European cooperation in taking the project this far despite the economic restrictions;
- Outcome of the 49<sup>th</sup> Advisory Form meeting held on 25 to 26. 09.13
- The FIP network was approved, the mandate is published ([EFSA-Q-2013-00591](#)), and the nomination of candidates can now take place. FIP unit plans to hold its first Network meeting in 2014 in the area of FCMs. The CEF Panel will be involved and informed in due time related to the agenda of the first network meeting.

- Next open CEF panel meeting:

The next open CEF panel meeting is scheduled to take place on 4-6 Nov 2014.

- FIP unit

Rachele Tamburino has finalised her 12 month traineeship at the FIP unit. The members of the CEF Panel wished Rachele all the very best for her future career. Silvia Moretti who started a 12 month traineeship at the FIP unit was introduced to the members of the Panel.

#### **8.4 European Commission**

No feedback was provided.

#### **9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussions**

No other scientific topics were provided.

#### **10. Any other business**

No any other business was raised.

## Annex I

### Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Specific Declaration of Interests (SDOI)<sup>14</sup>

**a) CONFLICT OF INTEREST:** In his SDOI Dr. Roland Franz declared the following interests: his laboratory has prepared the dossiers or was involved in experimental work used in the dossier for the following items in the agenda: Sky-Light (Erema MPR), Octal, Pregis, Sabert, Linpac, Holfeld, Huhtamaki, Snelcore, ExtruPET, Selenis, Re-PET (Erema Basic), Kruschitz, Vogtland, Veolia, ITW Polyrecycling, Texplast, Alimpet, Greenfiber. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interests above were deemed to represent a conflict of interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when these items (agenda items 6.1, 6.2 and 6.3) are discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

**b) CONFLICT OF INTEREST:** In his SDOI Dr. Detlef Wölflé declared the following interest: He has carried out preparatory work on ethylene vinylacetate, copolymer wax under a contract between EFSA and his employer BfR. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interests above were deemed to represent a conflict of interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (item 6.4) is discussed, voted on or in any way processed by that concerned scientific group.

---

<sup>14</sup> The Annual Declarations of Interests have been screened and approved before inviting the experts to the meeting, in accordance with the Decision of the Executive Director implementing the Policy on Independence regarding Declarations of Interests.

## Annex II

### Interests and actions resulting from the oral declarations of interests done at the beginning of the meeting

**NO CONFLICT:** With regard to this meeting Dr. Iona Pratt declared the following interest: Her employer, FSAI, and the designated national competent authority for receiving applications for authorisations for recycling processes to produce recycled plastics, submitted the request of safety evaluation of the a recycling process for poly ethylene terephthalate (PET) submitted by Holfeld Plastics (agenda item 6.2.) In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a conflict of interest for the expert concerned.