

29 07 2013
EFSA/FIP/113

**Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings
and Processing Aids (CEF)**

Minutes of the 38th plenary meeting

Held on 02-05 07 2013

(Agreed by written procedure on 12 August 2013)

Participants

- **Panel Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Claudia Bolognesi¹, Laurence Castle, Alessandro Di Domenico², Karl-Heinz Engel³, Roland Franz, Nathalie Gontard, Trine Husøy, Martine Kolf-Clauw, Klaus-Dieter Jany, Catherine Leclercq, Maria Rosaria Milana³, Fátima Poças, Iona Pratt (Chair), Kettil Svensson, Fidel Toldrá² and Detlef Wölflé

- **Hearing Experts:**

Alfonso Siani⁴, Tony Hardy⁵, Diane Benford⁵, Jan Alexander⁵, Riccardo Crebelli⁶

- **European Commission:**

Annette Schäfer

- **EFSA:**

Food Ingredients and Packaging (FIP) Unit: Anna F. Castoldi, Cristina Croera, Claudia Heppner, Anne Theobald, Rachele Tamburino, Alina Lupu, Annamaria Rossi, Marina Goumenou, Rositsa Serafimova, Eric Barthelemy, Kim Rygaard Nielsen.

- **Observers:**

None

- **Others:**

None

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the members to the 38th CEF plenary meeting. Apologies for absence were received from: Mona-Lise Binderup, Leon Brimer, Rainer Gürtler and Wim Mennes for the full plenary meeting. The chair informed the panel that this would be the last plenary

¹ Participated only on 2 and 3 July (morning)

² Participated on 5 July 2013 by teleconference

³ Participated on only 2 to 4 July 2013

⁴ Participated only on 3 July 2013 by teleconference

⁵ Participated only on 3 July 2013

⁶ Participated only on 4 July 2013

meeting for Catherine Leclercq who decided to resign from the CEF Panel and all her EFSA activities due to her new position at FAO in Rome. The chair and the members of the CEF Panel thanked Catherine for all her work over the last years and wished her every future success.

2. Adoption of agenda

The draft agenda was adopted without any changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the SDoI, please refer to Annex I.

4. Agreement of the minutes

4.1 Agreement of the 37th plenary meeting held on 21 June 2013

The minutes of the 37th plenary meeting were agreed by the members of the CEF Panel during the 38th plenary meeting on 2 July 2013.

5. Report on written procedure since 37th plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

The Chair of the CEF Panel expressed her appreciation for the work on the scientific outputs discussed at this meeting, to the WGs on Food Contact Materials, Recycling, Flavourings, and to the EFSA staff members involved in each WG.

6.1 Draft opinion on Bisphenol A (BPA) ([EFSA-Q-2012-00423](#))

The members of the CEF Panel discussed the part of the BPA opinion dealing with exposure assessment, focussing on the uncertainty chapter, the summary and conclusions on BPA exposure and endorsed the BPA exposure part for public consultation, pending some minor changes suggested during the plenary meeting. The chair of the WG expressed her thanks to the members of the WG BPA exposure as well as EFSA staff members.

The Panel members discussed also the relevance for human health of some endpoints where effects in animal tests have been observed. For the discussions some members of the Scientific Committee (SC) who participated in the SC Working Group (WG) on endocrine disrupter and an expert on metabolic changes were also present. It was agreed that a more in depth discussion should take place within the WG BPA toxicology.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

6.2 1,3,5-tris(2,2-dimethylpropanamido)benzene, CAS No. 745070-61-5, (EFSA-Q-2012-00695)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage⁴.

6.3 Interseroh Step 2 (RECYC070) (EFSA-Q-2010-00951)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage⁵.

6.4 Visy (EFSA-Q-2013-00298) + SIA EkoPET (EFSA-Q-2013-00324) (Starlinger IV+ technology)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage⁶.

6.5 Microbiological time temperature indicators (EFSA-Q-2011-00120)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage⁷.

6.6 Flavouring Group Evaluation 217 (A) (EFSA-Q-2013-00114 to EFSA-Q-2013-00122)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage⁸.

6.7 Flavouring Group Evaluation 220 (A) (EFSA-Q-2013-00201 to EFSA-Q-2013-00204)

Due to lack of time, the discussion of the substance was postponed to the next Plenary meeting in September.

6.8 Flavouring Group Evaluation 216 (A) (EFSA-Q-2013-00170 to EFSA-Q-2013-00174)

The CEF Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion is available on the Authority's webpage⁹.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3306.htm>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3308.htm>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3309.htm>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3307.htm>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3304.htm>

7. New Mandates

Two new mandates on Enzymes (EFSA-Q-2013-00586 and EFSA-Q-2013-00587), nine on FCMs, two on recycling processes, two new evaluations of flavouring substances, six re-evaluations of flavourings and one mandate on a processing aid (EFSA-Q-2013-), were received from EFSA. For the mandate on processing aids the BIOHAZ Panel will be the leading Panel and one expert from CEF Panel and one expert of the previous CEF WG on processing aids will be proposed to join the BIOHAZ WG, and if the ADOI is cleared, asked to prepare the draft chapters on human safety and environmental risk assessment.

8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/the Scientific Panel, Working Groups, EFSA, the European Commission

8.1 Scientific Committee

No meetings of the Scientific Committee were held since the previous CEF Plenary meeting.

8.2 Working Groups

8.2.1 WG BPA Exp

The outcome of the WG discussions was discussed under 6.1.

8.2.2 WG BPA Tox

The outcome of the WG discussions was discussed under 6.1.

8.2.3 WG Enzymes

Due to lack of time this item was deferred to the next meeting.

8.2.4 WG FCM Recycling

Due to lack of time this item was deferred to the next meeting.

8.2.5 WG FCM Substances

Due to lack of time this item was deferred to the next meeting.

8.3 EFSA

- BPA

The members of the CEF Panel were informed that EFSA welcomed the proposal of the CEF Panel to carry out a two step approach in relation with the BPA opinion for public consultation: 1) endorsement of the exposure part on BPA in July 2013 and public consultation from 24 July to 15 September 2013, and 2) endorsement of toxicological part and health aspects in December 2013, and public consultation from the beginning of January until March 2014. A meeting with stakeholders with participants who contributed during public consultation is also foreseen. The adoption of the BPA opinion is foreseen in May 2014.

- *EFSA's Stakeholder Consultative Platform (SHP):*

- An "open" meeting of EFSA's Stakeholder Consultative Platform (SHP) took place on 12 June 2013 in Brussels with the participation of observers. The set up of discussion groups under SHP was welcomed and ways to inform the SHP were proposed. The discussion group on chemical data collection will have its first meeting in autumn 2013. FoodDrinkEurope had organised a training course on

⁹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3305.htm>

data collection for food additives (FA) with participation of EFSA colleagues from the DCM Unit on 30 May 2013. The Head of EFSA's APDESK Unit presented an update of the activities carried out by the Unit, including the presentation on a feasibility study for the electronic submission of dossiers for applications of regulated products. A final decision is expected by September 2013.

- EFSA presented an overview of the administrative practices followed by EFSA in the scientific risk assessment of regulated products applications, establishing a reasonable extension of the time limit for evaluations.
- CEFIC presented its view on Food Contact Materials and put forward some suggestions in view of EFSA's upcoming consultation on the revised Guidance Document on the submission of dossiers related to substances to be used in FCM to be evaluated by EFSA. A member of the CEF Panel presented work of the Panel, particularly in the area of FCM.
- *48th meeting of the Advisory Forum (19-20 June, London):*
 - The Chairs of the ANS and CEF Panel were invited to present the Panels' work, including an overview on the draft safety evaluation of aspartame and an update on BPA. The presentations were very much appreciated. The Head of the FIP unit presented a proposal for the establishment of a FIP network dealing with different topics within its remit. The members of the Advisory Forum (AF) found that clarifications in the proposed Terms of References (ToR) are needed, hence it was agreed to submit a slightly revised version for final approval.
- *57th Management Board meeting, 27 June, Parma:*
 - EFSA presented an update on EFSA's Multiannual Plan and Multiannual Staff Policy Plan (see <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/mb130627/docs/mb130627-p5.pdf>) which cannot be finalised yet due to the ongoing negotiations on the EU's Multiannual Financial Framework (MFF) (2014-2020). Both documents are likely to be tabled again at the October Management Board meeting. Raymond O'Rourke was appointed as a new member of the Board and the Board agreed that Bernhard Url will become deputising officer of EFSA's Executive Director as of 16 July 2013.
- FIP unit
 - New FIP Unit staff member Dr. Marina Goumenou, analytical chemist and toxicologist, introduced herself to the Panel members.
 - Hanne Pedersen and Anna Campanini will move to CORSER unit, a unit which deals with central meeting organisation, as of 16 September 2013.

8.4 European Commission

Mr. Miguel Granero will be the new Commission official responsible for legislation on flavouring substances as of 1 July 2013.

9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussions

10. Any other business

The members of the CEF Panel agreed on one additional plenary meeting 10-12 December 2013. In addition, the following meetings dates for 2014 were agreed: 11-13 February, 25-26 March (in Brussels), 8-10 April, 20-23 May; 1-3 July, 3 - 4 July (inauguration), 23-25

September , 4-6 November, 16-18 December. From 3 July onwards meeting dates are to be considered tentative and have to be confirmed with the newly appointed CEF/ANS members (mandate 2014 to 2017).

NIAS meeting: Laurence Castle reported back from the first [Swiss Food Science Meeting 2013](#) on Non-Intentionally Added Substances which was held from 27 to 28 June 2013 in Switzerland, at which Claudia Heppner also gave a presentation on the work of EFSA.

Annex I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Specific Declaration of Interests (SDoI)¹⁰

- a) **CONFLICT OF INTEREST:** In his SDoI filled for the present meeting, Roland Franz declared the following interests: his laboratory has prepared the dossiers for Starlinger iV+Technology to produce recycled plastic for food contact uses by Visy R&D PTY Ltd, Australia and for poly (ethylene terephthalate) for direct food contact application by Fraunhofer Institute for process engineering and packaging (IVV) on behalf of SIA EkoPET (Starlinger iV+). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interests above were deemed to represent a conflict of Interest. These results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when the item Visy (EFSA-Q-2013-00298) + SIA EkoPET (EFSA-Q-2013-324) (Starlinger IV+ technology (agenda item 6.4) was discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

¹⁰ The Annual Declarations of Interests have been screened and approved before inviting the experts to the meeting, in accordance with the Decision of the Executive Director implementing the Policy on Independence regarding Declarations of Interests.