

**Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues**

**Minutes of the 64<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting**

**Held on 19-20 June 2013, Parma**

**(Agreed on 06 September 2013)**

**Participants**

• **Panel Members:**

Theodorus Brock, Ettore Capri, Sabine Duquesne, Antonio F. Hernandez-Jerez, Karen Ildico Hirsch-Ernst, Susanne Hougaard Bennekou, Michael Klein, Thomas Kuhl, Metka Filipič, Ryszard Laskowski, Matthias Liess, Alberto Mantovani, Bernadette Ossendorp, Daniel Pickford, Robert Smith, Paulo Sousa, Aldrik Tiktak and Ton van der Linden.

• **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Luc Mohimont, Maria Arena, Charlotte Bergkvist, Alessandra Caffi, Federica Crivellente, Stephanie Bopp, Mark Egsmose, Hans Steinkellner, Franz Streissl and Andrea Terron.
- Editorial & Media Relations Unit: Rory Harrington.
- Head of IT Unit: Paul Devalier.

• **Others:**

Celine Boutin, Rapporteur of the Working Group on the risk assessment for non-target terrestrial plants.

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Michael Walsh (DG SANCO), Alf Aagaard, Colin Ockleford and Ingvar Sundh.

Michael Klein and Aldrik Tiktak did not participate in the discussion relating to agenda item 6.6.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the SDoI as well as the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to Annex I.

### 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> PPR Plenary meeting held on 17-18 April 2013.

The minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting, held on 17-18 April 2013, were agreed by written procedure on 5 June 2013.

### 5. Report on written procedures since the 63<sup>rd</sup> PPR Plenary meeting.

No written procedure has taken place since the 63<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting.

### 6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption.

#### 6.1 Scientific Opinion addressing the state of science on risk-assessment for non-target terrestrial plants ([EFSA-Q-2011-00982](#))

The progress on this mandate and the planning for finalising the Scientific Opinion addressing the state of science on risk assessment for non-target terrestrial plants was presented by the Rapporteur of the Working Group. The Working Group intends to complete a first draft of the Scientific Opinion in November 2013 and to propose a final draft of the Scientific Opinion for adoption at the Plenary meeting in May 2014.

#### 6.2 Scientific Opinion on the identification of pesticides to be included in cumulative assessment groups on the basis of their toxicological profile ([EFSA-Q-2009-00860](#))

The Chair of the Working Group reported to the Panel the outcome of the consultation with the Scientific Committee, which took place after the last Plenary meeting. The written comments received from the Scientific Committee were taken into consideration in an updated version of the draft of the Scientific Opinion, which was later sent to the Panel on 5 June 2013. The Chair presented all changes made upon comments by the Scientific Committee and the Panel members. After a discussion and an agreement on the amendments made, the Scientific Opinion was adopted by the Panel.

#### 6.3 Guidance on aquatic Ecotoxicology ([EFSA-Q-2009-00001](#))

The Guidance on aquatic ecotoxicology was finalised by the Working Group and circulated to the Panel on 6 June 2013 after taking into account the comments received from the public consultation that was held between December 2012 and February 2013. The Rapporteur presented the main changes made to the draft Guidance which was

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

published for the public consultation. All comments from members of the Panel were addressed at the Plenary meeting. The Guidance was adopted by the Panel.

#### **6.4 Scientific opinion on the effect assessment of pesticides for sediment organisms in edge-of-field surface water ([EFSA-Q-2012-00959](#))**

The Chair of the Panel nominated Michael Klein as the Chair of the Working Group on sediment effect assessment on 20 June 2013. In consultation with the Chair of the Working Group, the Pesticides Unit will start identifying external experts for the areas of expertise agreed upon at the Plenary meeting that was held on 13 and 14 February 2013.

#### **6.5 Scientific Opinion addressing the state of science on risk assessment for non-target arthropods ([EFSA-Q-2011-00975](#)), Scientific Opinion addressing the state of science on in-soil risk assessment ([EFSA-Q-2011-00978](#)), Scientific Opinion on good modelling practice in the context of mechanistic effect models for risk assessment of plant protection products ([EFSA-Q-2011-00989](#))**

The Chair of the Working Group on non-target arthropod and in-soil risk assessment informed about the progress made at the first meeting, in particular on the concepts related to spatial boundaries and specific protection goals. After a consultation between the Chair of the Panel and the Secretariat, a new Chair of the Working Group on good modelling practice will be appointed following the rules of independence policy of EFSA.

#### **6.6 Scientific Opinion on the 2009 report of the FOCUS Groundwater working group (Higher tier assessment). ([EFSA-Q-2011-00754](#))**

The Rapporteur of the Working Group presented the second Scientific Opinion on the report of the FOCUS groundwater working group (FOCUS, 2009): assessment of higher tiers. The Scientific Opinion was adopted by the Panel after some amendments.

#### **6.7 Scientific opinion on the relevance of dissimilar mode of action and its appropriate application for cumulative risk-assessment of pesticide residues ([EFSA-Q-2011-01020](#))**

The Chair of the Working Group presented the composition of the Working Group and gave an outline of the work-plan. The Panel appreciated that the Terms of Reference for this mandate, at the time they were approved, did not anticipate the content of the Scientific Opinion on cumulative assessment groups of pesticides.

Therefore, taking into account the adopted Scientific Opinion on cumulative assessment groups of pesticides, the Panel agreed, as a matter of interpretation of the Terms of Reference, that the present Scientific Opinion should address the following question: When information is available and indicates that several active substances are causing the same phenomenological effect through different modes/mechanisms of action, what would be the reason for deviating from the already established methodological approach (i.e. dose addition) in order to estimate their combined effects without underestimating them? Which alternative methodology would be appropriate to estimate the combined risks in such a case?

## **7. New Mandates**

No new mandate has been adopted by the Mandate Review Committee since the 63<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting.

## **8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/the Scientific Panel, Working Groups, EFSA, the European Commission**

No meeting of the Scientific Committee took place since the 63<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting.

## **9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion**

No further scientific topic were added to the agenda for information and/or discussion

## **10. Any Other Business**

EFSA presented the new outsourced projects launched in 2013 in support of the activities of the Panel and of the Pesticides Unit.

The Secretariat announced that the 66<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting of the Panel will be open to Observers.

## Annex I

### INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADOI OR SDOI

In the ADol or in the SDol filled for the present meeting, Dr. Michael Klein and Dr. Aaldrik Tiktak declared the following interest: membership of the FOCUS Groundwater Working Group of DG SANCO that prepared the 2009 report. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest regarding item 6.7 and 6.8 (Scientific Opinions on the 2009 report of the FOCUS Groundwater working group).

This resulted in the impossibility for the experts to be present when the item was discussed by the Panel.