

PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

Minutes of the 39th plenary meeting of the Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Held on 19-20 September 2012, Parma

(Agreed on 21 November 2012¹)

Participants

- **Panel Members:**

Richard Baker, Claude Bragard, Thierry Candresse, Gianni Gilioli, Jean-Claude Gregoire, Imre Holb, Michael John Jeger, Olya Evtimova Karadjova, Christer Sven Magnusson, David Makowski, Charles Manceau, Maria Navajas, Vittorio Rossi, Jan Schans, Gritta Schrader, Gregor Urek, Wopke Van Der Werf, Johan Coert Van Lenteren, Irene Vloutoglou, Stephan Winter

- **Hearing Experts:**

Bob Douma, Wageningen University for item 8

- **European Commission:**

Guillermo Cardon (DG Sanco)

- **EFSA:**

- **PLH Unit:** Gabor Hollo, Virag Kertesz, Svetla Kozelska, Doreen Russell, Giuseppe Stancanelli, Sara Tramontini
- **Other EFSA Units/Directorates:** Francesco Ciancio (CORSER Unit), Juergen de Maggio (Finance Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Panel Chair welcomed the participants to 39th plenary meeting of the EFSA Plant Health Panel. Apologies were received from Trond Rafoss (whole meeting).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interests (Dols)² and the Decision of the Executive

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

Director implementing this Policy³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest (ODoI) at the beginning of this meeting, please refer to the Annex II.

4. Agreement of the minutes of 38th Plenary meeting held on 4-5 July 2012, Parma

The minutes were agreed with minor editorial amendments.

5. Report on written procedures since 38th Plenary meeting

No outputs adopted by written procedure since the 38th plenary meeting.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

Chrysanthemum stunt viroid. The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2011-01190.

The Chair of the working group presented the draft opinion to the Panel.

The risk assessment part of the opinion is complete. The assessment of entry, establishment, spread and impact was presented and discussed by the Panel. The identification and evaluation of options available to reduce the risk was presented to the Panel.

The main issues raised in the discussion included: the role of voluntary certification schemes, the impact of de-regulation and the need for further details on the weaknesses of current regulation, as well as the need to also consider eradication as an option to reduce establishment. The European Commission representative provided feedback in relation to the need to use the terminology for imported commodities types from the Directive 2000/29/EC. It was agreed to consider these aspects, and to send a revised draft opinion to the Panel to collect further comments. Adoption of the opinion will take place at the November plenary meeting.

7. New Mandates

The Commission representative outlined the new request concerning 13 organisms listed under Annex II All of Council Directive 2000/29/EC. The new request relates to the risk to plant health of Arabis mosaic virus (EFSA-Q-2012-00798), Tomato black ring virus (EFSA-Q-2012-00801), Raspberry ringspot virus (EFSA-Q-2012-00799), Strawberry latent ringspot virus (EFSA-Q-2012-00800), Strawberry crinkle virus (EFSA-Q-2012-00803), Strawberry mild yellow edge virus (EFSA-Q-2012-00802), *Daktulosphaira vitifoliae* (Fitch) (EFSA-Q-2012-00804), *Eutetranychus orientalis* Klein (EFSA-Q-2012-00805), *Parasaissetia nigra* (Nietner) (EFSA-Q-2012-00806), *Clavibacter michiganensis* spp. *michiganensis* (Smith) Davis *et al.* (EFSA-Q-2012-00807), *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *vesicatoria* (Doidge) Dye (EFSA-Q-2012-00808), *Didymella ligulicola* (Baker, Dimock and Davis) v. Arx (EFSA-Q-2012-00809), and *Phytophthora fragariae* Hickman var. *fragariae* (EFSA-Q-2012-00810) for the EU territory.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

The Panel discussed the request in relation to the terms of reference and timescales for delivery of the opinions, with a proposal to deliver a number of opinions in 2013 and the remainder in 2014.

Other mandates in preparation by the Commission will address Citrus Canker, Citrus Black Spot as well as a mandate on soil and growing media as a pathway for plant pests and diseases were outlined. The Panel asked about any duplication of opinions already published which the Commission confirmed not to be the case. The Panel also raised concerns about the numbers of mandates for 2013 and asked which would be the priorities. The EFSA Unit, in liaison with Panel Chair, agreed to further discuss with the Commission the requests and present an updated plan at the next plenary meeting.

A proposal for new Panel self task was presented. The Panel's guidance document on the assessment of environmental risk (EFSA Journal 2011;9(12):2460) was proposed to be tested using as a case study the Panel's opinion on Pomacea (EFSA Journal 2012;10(1):2552). The self-task would undertake a structured evaluation based on biodiversity and ecosystem services, develop scenarios and potential consequences and take into account Pomacea population density. The Panel discussed the proposal, and gave their support. The EFSA secretariat agreed to initiate the procedure for this new mandate.

8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/the Scientific Panel, Working Groups, EFSA, the European Commission

8.1. Scientific Committee

The Chair provided a report from the last meeting of the EFSA Scientific Committee. The impetus for cross sectoral working across the EFSA scientific Panels is increasing and the standing working groups where this has been initiated were presented. The Chair also advised that the Scientific Committee is assuming a greater range of interests to include animal, plant and environmental health.

8.2. Working Groups

- 8.2.1. An update on the new mandate (EFSA-Q-2012-00561) on the phytosanitary risk associated with some coniferous species and genera for the spread of pine wood nematode was provided. The comments collected in the annual surveys conducted by the Portuguese National Forestry Authority and due to be provided to the working group have not yet been received. This may delay delivery of the opinion as the data from the Portuguese authorities is needed in order to progress the opinion.
 - 8.2.2. Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of the Tospoviruses for the EU territory: *Tomato spotted wilt virus*. The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2012-00076. The Chair of the working group provided an update on the status on the opinion. Though the working group have adopted the same procedures as those used by the Annex II/III working groups the timescale for delivery of the opinion - even though the risk assessment section is almost complete - remains a challenge. The Chair advised that the working group would like to present a shorter opinion by reducing the discussion on pathways in the opinion. The Panel discussed the difficulty of making a judgement as to what is significant and what is not.
 - 8.2.3. Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of *Bemisia tabaci* for the EU territory. The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2011-01157. The working group Chair provided an update
-

on the progress of the opinion. The difficulty of addressing the mandate was mentioned particularly in relation to the identification of *Bemisia* pathways, the large host range, absence of some important data from Member States and the challenge of addressing probabilities. Consideration of the efficacy of current legislation and options to reduce the risk remain the main areas of work to be addressed by the working group but the Chair was committed to provide the document to the Panel well in advance of the November plenary meeting.

8.2.4. Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of some harmful organisms listed in Directive 2000/29/EC Annex IIAII for the EU territory:

- *Scirrhia pini*, registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2011-0118; *Puccinia horiana (fungi)*, registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-201101188 and *Phialophora cinerescens*, registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2011-01187. The Chair of the sub-working group addressing the Annex IIAII fungal organisms provided an update on the progress. The conclusions for all three organisms are almost complete and the experts have commenced consideration of the options to reduce the level of risk and their technical feasibility. The working group are developing a common structure for risk reduction options to be used in the three scientific opinions.
- *Pseudomonas caryophylli* (Burkholder). The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2011-01186. The Chair of the working group provided an update on the progress. The conclusions of the risk assessment were presented to the Panel while the options to reduce the level of risk are still to be considered. A key challenge relates to separate the effect of current cultivation practices from the effect of current phytosanitary measures.
- *Erwinia chrysanthemi* pv. *dianthicola*. The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2011-01185. An overall workplan of the activities remaining for the working groups to address until adoption was given; particularly in relation to the options to reduce risk.
- *Liriomyza trifolii* and *Liriomyza huidobrensis*. The request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2011-01158 and EFSA-Q-2011-01184 respectively. The working group Chair provided an update on the progress of the opinion. The conclusions on the risk assessment was presented to and discussed by the Panel including the challenge of the assessment of the pests' spread as much of this is reliant on expert judgement owing to the lack of inspection data. The consideration of options to reduce the level of risk will follow.

8.3. EFSA

The Deputy Head of PLH Unit gave an overview of current plant health outsourced projects. The Panel was informed of the new rules regarding the expert's annual declarations of interest.

A presentation on the centralisation of meeting organisation was given to the Panel. The rationale behind the new arrangements was explained as well as how the new organisation would function for the experts.

8.4. European Commission

Apart from the new mandates no other matters were raised by the Commission representative.

9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

9.1. Hearing of Bob Douma, Wageningen University (NL), on the EFSA procurement “Probabilistic pathway models for risk assessment of plant pest invasions” (Lot 2 Non-edible plant products)

The outline of this new project was introduced to the Panel and one of the models was illustrated using a simulation of a consignment arriving from a Third Country. Comments on the presentation included the availability of data and the use of the models not only in risk assessment but also in scientific advice on derogation requests.

9.2. Lessons learned from the Annex II All 1st batch of mandates

The Panel Chair initiated a discussion on the lessons learned from the first batch of Annex II All opinions. The purpose of the discussion was to see what lessons had been learned from the first experience of dealing with these opinions including the benefits of a coordination group.

The main issues discussed related to data needs and preparatory work (including the questionnaire for Member States, extensive literature searches and use of technical hearings) as well as to the need to continue the methodological coordination of the risk assessments either through coordination by working group Chairs or through dedicated discussion at Panel plenary meetings. The Panel suggested that preparatory work should be done in advance. With regard to the methodological coordination of the risk assessments both options were discussed based on the lessons learned from current mandates.

10. Any Other Business

10.1. Next meeting confirmation

The next plenary meeting will take place on **21-22 November 2012** in **Parma** (Palazzo Ducale).

Annex II

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE ORAL DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS DONE

AT THE BEGINNING OF THE MEETING

a) **NO CONFLICT:** With regard to this meeting PROF. Wopke Van Der Werf declared the following interest: He informed the meeting he is the co-ordinator of the ongoing EFSA outsourced project presented under item 9.1. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes regarding Declarations of Interests (Dols) and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a conflict of Interest for the expert concerned, as the discussion did not involve any decision or vote on this item.
