

**DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 73<sup>RD</sup> PLENARY MEETING OF  
THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS  
HELD IN PARMA ON 23-24 MAY 2012**

**AGENDA:**

1. **OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
2. **OBITUARY FOR PROF DAN COLLINS, FORMER BIOHAZ CHAIR AND PANEL MEMBER**
3. **ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 72ND PLENARY MEETING**
4. **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**
5. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**
6. **NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**
  - 6.1 **VTEC - SEROPATOTYPE CONCEPT AND SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA REGARDING PATHOGENICITY ASSESSMENT**
  - 6.2 **REVISION OF THE ANNUAL MONITORING PROGRAMME FOR BSE FROM NORWAY (ART 31 REG 178/2002)**
7. **OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTION**
  - 7.1 **PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF POULTRY MEAT**
  - 7.2 **LESSONS LEARNT FROM MODELING ACTIVITIES IN BIOHAZ MANDATES**
  - 7.3 **DEVELOPMENT OF A RISK RANKING FRAMEWORK ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS**
  - 7.4 **REVIEW ON THE EUROPEAN UNION SUMMARY REPORT ON ZOOZOSES IN 2009 AND 2010 FOR *SALMONELLA*, *CAMPYLOBACTER*, VTEC, *LISTERIA MONOCYTOGENES* AND FOOD-BORNE OUTBREAKS**
8. **PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**
  - 8.1 **PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF BOVINE MEAT**
  - 8.2 **PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF SHEEP AND GOAT MEAT**

- 8.3 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF FARMED GAME MEAT**
- 8.4 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF SOLIPEDS MEAT**
- 8.5 SELF-TASKING MANDATE FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON THE MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS RECOMMENDED BIOLOGICAL AGENTS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED AS NOTIFIED TO EFSA (2012 UPDATE)**
- 8.6 QUANTITATIVE EVALUATION OF BSE RISK IN BOVINE INTESTINES AND MESENTERY**
- 8.7 THE RISK POSED BY PAHOGENS IN FOOD ON NON-ANIMAL ORIGIN**
- 9. FEEDBACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**
  - 9.1 REQUEST FOR SCIENTIFIC AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE MINIMUM SAMPLE SIZE TO TEST SHOULD AN ANNUAL BSE STATISTICAL TESTING REGIME BE AUTHORIZED IN HEALTHY SLAUGHTERED CATTLE**
- 10. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**
  - 10.1 EMERGING RISKS**
  - 10.2 INFORMATION FROM EUROPEAN COMMISSION**
  - 10.3 BIOHAZ NETWORKS**
- 11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**
- 12. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

## **PARTICIPANTS**

---

### **Panel Members:**

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka (Vice-Chair), Sava Buncic, John Griffin, Arie Havelaar, Tine Hald, James Hope, Günter Klein, Kostas Koutsoumanis, James McLauchlin (apologies), Christine Müller-Graf, Christophe Nguyen-The, Birgit Noerrung (Chair), Luisa Peixe, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci, John Sofos (Vice-Chair), John Threlfall, Ivar Vågsholm, Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

### **EFSA:**

Marta Hugas, Ernesto Liebana, Winy Messens, Pablo Romero Barrios, Michaela Hempen, Luis Vivas Alegre, Fulvio Barizzone, Pietro Stella, Maria Teresa Felicio Da Silva, Alessandro Broglia (Scientific staff).

### **European Commission (EC):**

DG Health and Consumers: S. Osaer (apologies).

## **1. OPENING AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The meeting started at 9:00 a.m. The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed everyone. The Plenary was the first since the sad loss of the member of the Panel and former Chair, Professor J.D. Collins (1938-2012<sup>†</sup>).

Apologies were received from J. McLauchlin.

## **2. OBITUARY FOR PROF DAN COLLINS, FORMER BIOHAZ CHAIR AND PANEL MEMBER**

The BIOHAZ Panel and Unit prepared an obituary for the death of the late J.D. Collins (<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/e1061.htm>). A minute's silence was held in tribute to the memory of Professor Collins.

## **ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 72ND PLENARY MEETING**

Minutes from the previous plenary meeting were adopted without changes.

## **3. ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **4. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI (as well as the ones declared at the beginning of the meeting), please refer to Annex I of these Minutes.

## **5. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**

### **5.1. VTEC - SEROPATOTYPE CONCEPT AND SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA REGARDING PATHOGENICITY ASSESSMENT**

A new mandate for a Scientific Opinion was received in EFSA from the Austrian Food Safety Authority and it was allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. An ad hoc WG will be established. The terms of reference were discussed in detail. Dr. J. Threlfall was appointed as Chair person for this WG. The deadline for adoption is under negotiation.

### **5.2. REVISION OF THE ANNUAL MONITORING PROGRAMME FOR BSE FROM NORWAY (ART 31 REG 178/2002)**

A new mandate for a Scientific and Technical assistance was received in EFSA from the EFTA Surveillance Authority and it was allocated to the BIOHAZ Unit. The terms of reference were presented for information to the BIOHAZ Panel. An *ad hoc* WG will be established that will be chaired by BIOHAZ Unit staff. The deadline for adoption is 31/10/2012.

## **6. OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS**

### **6.1. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF POULTRY MEAT**

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 24<sup>th</sup> of May 2012.

### **6.2. LESSONS LEARNT FROM MODELING ACTIVITIES IN BIOHAZ MANDATES**

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 24<sup>th</sup> of May 2012.

### **6.3. DEVELOPMENT OF A RISK RANKING FRAMEWORK ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS**

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 24<sup>th</sup> of May 2012.

### **6.4. REVIEW ON THE EUROPEAN UNION SUMMARY REPORT ON ZOONOSES IN 2009 AND 2010 FOR SALMONELLA, CAMPYLOBACTER, VTEC, LISTERIA MONOCYTOGENES AND FOOD-BORNE OUTBREAKS**

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 24<sup>th</sup> of May 2012.

## **7. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**

### **7.1. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF BOVINE MEAT**

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of bovines will meet on 13<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> June. The deadline for this Opinion is June 2013.

### **7.2. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF SHEEP AND GOAT MEAT**

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of small ruminants met in Parma on April 17<sup>th</sup>. The WG also met with hearing experts representing stakeholder organizations. The next meeting will take place June 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup>. The deadline for this opinion is June 2013.

### **7.3. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF FARMED GAME MEAT**

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of farmed game met for the 5<sup>th</sup> time on the 16 May 2012. The WG also met with hearing experts representing stakeholder organizations. The next WG meeting is scheduled on the 18<sup>th</sup> September 2012. The deadline for this opinion is June 2013.

### **7.4. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF SOLIPEDS MEAT**

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of solipeds had its third meeting on 16<sup>th</sup> of April 2012. The next WG meeting is scheduled on the 31<sup>st</sup> May 2012. The deadline for this opinion is June 2013.

### **7.5. SELF-TASKING MANDATE FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON THE MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS RECOMMENDED BIOLOGICAL AGENTS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED AS NOTIFIED TO EFSA (2012 UPDATE)**

An “ad hoc” WG was established and the first web-conference WG meeting took place on 13 March. Physical WG meetings are foreseen for 25 June and 20 September. The deadline for adoption is December 2012.

### **7.6. QUANTITATIVE EVALUATION OF BSE RISK IN BOVINE INTESTINES AND MESENTERY**

The first meeting of the BIOHAZ *ad hoc* WG on BSE risk in bovine intestine and mesentery was held on 23<sup>rd</sup> April in Brussels. A web-conference of a sub-WG was held on 4<sup>th</sup> May with the aim to discuss the different approaches to model the evolution of infectivity in bovine intestine and mesentery. The second WG meeting is scheduled for Thursday 12<sup>th</sup> July in Parma. Dr. Olivier Andreoletti was appointed as new Chair for this WG.

## **7.7. REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON THE RISK POSED BY PAHOGENS IN FOOD ON NON-ANIMAL ORIGIN**

The second meeting of the WG took place on 21<sup>st</sup> of May 2012 as a telemeeting. The next meeting is scheduled for the 21<sup>st</sup> June in London. The deadline for adoption of the terms of reference 1 and 2 is December 2012.

## **8. FEEDBACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**

### **8.1. SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE**

The last SC Plenary meeting took place on the 21<sup>st</sup> May in Parma. The agenda and minutes of that meeting will be available on the EFSA website (<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/120521.htm>).

### **8.2. REQUEST FOR SCIENTIFIC AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE MINIMUM SAMPLE SIZE TO TEST SHOULD AN ANNUAL BSE STATISTICAL TESTING REGIME BE AUTHORIZED IN HEALTHY SLAUGHTERED CATTLE**

A meeting of the *ad hoc* WG took will take place on 13th July. The deadline for completion of the document is 30 September 2012.

## **9. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**

### **9.1. EMERGING RISKS**

Nothing to report

### **9.2. FEEDBACK FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION INFORMATION FROM EC: FOLLOW-UP TO SCIENTIFIC EFSA ADVICE AND ONGOING WORK**

Nothing to report.

### **9.3. BIOHAZ NETWORKS**

The 7<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the MRA Network meeting will be held on 9/10 October 2012.

The 7<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the BSE-TSE Network will be held in the second half of 2012.

## **10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

Nothing to report.

## **11. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

The meeting closed at 15:00 pm.

## ANNEX I

### INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADoI OR SDoIs

CONFLICT LEVEL B: In the SDoI filled for the present meeting Dr. James Hope declared the following interest for the agenda item “*REQUEST FOR SCIENTIFIC AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE MINIMUM SAMPLE SIZE TO TEST SHOULD AN ANNUAL BSE STATISTICAL TESTING REGIME BE AUTHORIZED IN HEALTHY SLAUGHTERED CATTLE*”: he is responsible for all things TSE at AHVLA (incorporating the EURL-TSE) and he was required to read and sign off as valid the report itself. In addition the AHVLA is the recipient of an EFSA contract for the provision of a model for evaluation of TSE monitoring options in cattle in the EU.

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest (level B). Pursuant to EFSA’s Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said experts incur the limitations identified under point C.III.b1. That is, the mentioned expert did not take part in the discussions on this agenda item.