

**DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 71ST PLENARY MEETING OF
THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS
HELD IN COPENHAGEN ON 7-8 MARCH 2012**

AGENDA:

1. **OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
2. **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**
3. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**
4. **NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**
 - 4.1 **QUANTITATIVE EVALUATION OF BSE RISK IN BOVINE INTESTINES AND MESENTERY**
5. **OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTION**
 - 5.1 **ASSESSMENT OF THE SCIENTIFIC ELEMENTS SUPPORTING THE PROHIBITION OF THE PLACING ON THE MARKET OF GM POTATO EH92-527-1 FOR CULTIVATION PURPOSES IN AUSTRIA**
 - 5.2 **ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN TURKEYS**
 - 5.3 **MINIMUM HYGIENE CRITERIA TO BE APPLIED TO CLEAN SEAWATER AND ON THE PUBLIC HEALTH RISKS AND HYGIENE CRITERIA FOR BOTTLED SEAWATER INTENDED FOR DOMESTIC USE.**
 - 5.4 **EVALUATION OF SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF LISTEX P100 FOR THE REMOVAL OF *L. MONOCYTOGENESS* SURFACE CONTAMINATION OF RAW FISH**
 - 5.5 **EVALUATION OF THE SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF CECURE (CETYLPYRIDINIUM CHLORIDE) FOR THE REMOVAL OF MICROBIAL SURFACE CONTAMINATION OF POULTRY**
 - 5.6 **APPLICATION FOR EFSA EVALUATION OF AN ALTERNATIVE METHOD FOR THE TREATMENT OF ANIMAL BY PRODUCTS (BIOMATION)**
6. **DRAFT OPINIONS FOR THOROUGH READING**
 - 6.1 **PUBLIC HEALTH RISKS REPRESENTED BY CERTAIN COMPOSITE PRODUCTS CONTAINING FOOD OF ANIMAL ORIGIN**

- 6.2 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF POULTRY MEAT**
- 7. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**
 - 7.1 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF BOVINE MEAT**
 - 7.2 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF SHEEP AND GOAT MEAT**
 - 7.3 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF FARMED GAME MEAT**
 - 7.4 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF SOLIPEDS MEAT**
 - 7.5 EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS**
 - 7.6 REVIEW ON THE EUROPEAN UNION SUMMARY REPORT ON ZOOSES IN 2009 – FOR *SALMONELLA*, *CAMPYLOBACTER*, VTEC, *LISTERIA MONOCYTOGENES* AND FOOD-BORNE OUTBREAKS**
 - 7.7 LESSONS LEARNT FROM MODELLING ACTIVITIES IN BIOHAZ MANDATES**
 - 7.8 DEVELOPMENT OF A RISK RANKING TOOL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS**
 - 7.9 REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON THE RISK POSED BY PAHOGENS IN FOOD ON NON-ANIMAL ORIGIN**
 - 7.10 SELF-TASKING MANDATE FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON THE MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS RECOMMENDED BIOLOGICAL AGENTS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED AS NOTIFIED TO EFSA (2012 UPDATE)**
- 8. FEEDBACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**
 - 8.1 REQUEST FOR SCIENTIFIC AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE MINIMUM SAMPLE SIZE TO TEST SHOULD AN ANNUAL BSE STATISTICAL TESTING REGIME BE AUTHORIZED IN HEALTHY SLAUGHTERED CATTLE**
- 9. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**
 - 9.1 EMERGING RISKS**
 - 9.2 INFORMATION FROM EUROPEAN COMMISSION**
 - 9.2 BIOHAZ NETWORKS**
- 10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**
- 11. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

PARTICIPANTS

Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka (Vice-Chair), Sava Buncic, John D Collins (apologies 7/03/2012), John Griffin, Arie Havelaar, Tine Hald, James Hope, Günter Klein, Kostas Koutsoumanis, James McLauchlin, Christine Müller-Graf, Christophe Nguyen-The, Birgit Noerrung (Chair), Luisa Peixe, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci, John Sofos (Vice-Chair), John Threlfall, Ivar Vågsholm, Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Ernesto Liebana, Alessandro Broglia, Michaela Hempen, Winy Messens, Luis Vivas Alegre, Pablo Romero Barrios (Scientific staff).

European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumers: S. Osaer.

1. OPENING AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The meeting started at 9:00 a.m. The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from J.D. Collins (only 7/03/2012).

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI (as well as the ones declared at the beginning of the meeting), please refer to Annex I of these Minutes.

4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ

4.1. QUANTITATIVE EVALUATION OF BSE RISK IN BOVINE INTESTINES AND MESENTERY

A new Mandate from the European Commission was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. An ad hoc WG will be established. The terms of reference were discussed in detail. Prof. Herbert Budka was appointed as Chair person for this WG. The deadline for adoption is 30th September 2013.

5. OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS

5.1. ASSESSMENT OF THE SCIENTIFIC ELEMENTS SUPPORTING THE PROHIBITION OF THE PLACING ON THE MARKET OF GM POTATO EH92-527-1 FOR CULTIVATION PURPOSES IN AUSTRIA

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the BIOHAZ Panel on the 8th of March 2012. The GMO panel also adopted the document on the same day.

5.2. ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN TURKEYS

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 8th of March 2012.

5.3. MINIMUM HYGIENE CRITERIA TO BE APPLIED TO CLEAN SEAWATER AND ON THE PUBLIC HEALTH RISKS AND HYGIENE CRITERIA FOR BOTTLED SEAWATER INTENDED FOR DOMESTIC USE.

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 8th of March 2012. The CONTAM Panel had previously adopted the chapters on chemical risks.

5.4. EVALUATION OF SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF LISTEX P100 FOR THE REMOVAL OF *L. MONOCYTOGENES* SURFACE CONTAMINATION OF RAW FISH

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 8th of March 2012.

In addition, the Panel recommended that guidelines for the evaluation of bacteriophages as decontaminating substances with regards to safety and risk/benefit analysis should be developed

5.5. EVALUATION OF THE SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF CECURE (CETYLPYRIDINIUM CHLORIDE) FOR THE REMOVAL OF MICROBIAL SURFACE CONTAMINATION OF POULTRY

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 8th of March 2012. The CEF Panel is to adopt its part at its next plenary meeting.

5.6. APPLICATION FOR EFSA EVALUATION OF AN ALTERNATIVE METHOD FOR THE TREATMENT OF ANIMAL BY PRODUCTS (BIOMATION)

The Draft Opinion was presented by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 8th of March 2012.

6. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR THOROUGH READING

6.1. PUBLIC HEALTH RISKS REPRESENTED BY CERTAIN COMPOSITE PRODUCTS CONTAINING FOOD OF ANIMAL ORIGIN

The fifth WG meeting took place on 27th of January 2012. The chair of the WG briefed the Panel on the progress of the draft opinion. The next meeting of the WG is taking place on the 12th of March 2012. The deadline for adoption is April 2012.

6.2. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF POULTRY MEAT

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of poultry had a meeting on 26-27th January in Parma. The draft Opinion was presented to the Panel by the Chair of the WG. The next WG Meeting was scheduled for 8-9th March.

The deadline for the opinion on meat inspection of poultry is June 2012.

7. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES

7.1. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF BOVINE MEAT

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of bovines will meet in Copenhagen following the current BIOHAZ Panel Plenary meeting. The deadline for this Opinion is June 2013.

7.2. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF SHEEP AND GOAT MEAT

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of small ruminants met in Parma on February 16-17th. The next meeting will take place April 17th. The deadline for this opinion is June 2013.

7.3. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF FARMED GAME MEAT

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of farmed game met for the third time on the 26/27 January 2012. A new WG meeting is scheduled on the 24th April 2012. The deadline for this opinion is June 2013.

7.4. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF SOLIPEDS MEAT

The BIOHAZ “ad hoc” WG on meat inspection of solipeds met for the second time on 7th of February 2012. The second meeting of the WG will be held on 16th of April 2012. The deadline for this opinion is June 2013.

7.5. EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS

EFSA received from the EURL for TSE the report on the field trial of the tests under evaluation. The BIOHAZ WG met on 28th of February. The draft Opinion was presented to the Panel by the Chair of the WG. Adoption of the Opinion of the BIOHAZ Panel is expected by April 2012.

7.6. REVIEW ON THE EUROPEAN UNION SUMMARY REPORT ON ZOOSES IN 2009 – FOR SALMONELLA, CAMPYLOBACTER, VTEC, LISTERIA MONOCYTOGENES AND FOOD-BORNE OUTBREAKS

A WG web-meeting on the EUSR Review was held on 15 February and a physical WG meeting will take place on 28 March 2012 in Copenhagen. The deadline for this opinion is May 2012.

7.7. LESSONS LEARNT FROM MODELLING ACTIVITIES IN BIOHAZ MANDATES

An ad hoc WG has been set up. The second Web-meeting was held on 29th February 2012 and the next one is scheduled for 29th March 2012. The deadline for adoption is May 2012.

7.8. DEVELOPMENT OF A RISK RANKING TOOL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

A meeting was held on 6th March. The document was presented for first reading at the Plenary in March. The next web-meeting is foreseen on 23rd March. The deadline for adoption is May 2012.

7.9. REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON THE RISK POSED BY PAHOGENS IN FOOD ON NON-ANIMAL ORIGIN

A new Mandate from the European Commission was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. An ad hoc WG has been established. The first WG meeting will take place in Brussels on the 19 and 20th March 2012. The deadline for adoption of the terms of reference 1 and 2 is December 2012.

7.10. SELF-TASKING MANDATE FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON THE MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS RECOMMENDED BIOLOGICAL AGENTS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED AS NOTIFIED TO EFSA (2012 UPDATE)

An ad hoc WG was established and the first web-conference WG meeting will take place on 13 March. The deadline for adoption is December 2012

8. FEEDBACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS

8.1. SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

The last SC Plenary meeting took place on the 7th February in Parma. The agenda and minutes of that meeting will be available on the EFSA website (<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/120207.htm>).

8.2. REQUEST FOR SCIENTIFIC AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE MINIMUM SAMPLE SIZE TO TEST SHOULD AN ANNUAL BSE STATISTICAL TESTING REGIME BE AUTHORIZED IN HEALTHY SLAUGHTERED CATTLE

A teleconference of the *ad hoc* WG took place on 16th March. The deadline for completion of the document is 30 September 2012.

9. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

9.1. EMERGING RISKS

Nothing to report

9.2. FEEDBACK FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION INFORMATION FROM EC: FOLLOW-UP TO SCIENTIFIC EFSA ADVICE AND ONGOING WORK

The EC official provided feedback to the group on the risk management actions resulting from recently adopted opinions.

9.3. BIOHAZ NETWORKS

The 6th Meeting of the MRA Network meeting will be held on 20/21 March 2012 in Brussels.

The 7th Meeting of the BSE-TSE Network will be held in the second half of 2012.

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Some panel members expressed the wish to be involved in the evaluation of bids from outsourced EFSA calls. The EFSA secretariat informed them that under the current financial regulations this was not possible

11. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

The meeting closed at 15:00 pm.

ANNEX I

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADoI OR SDoIs

CONFLICT LEVEL B: In the SDoI filled for the present meeting Dr. Tine Hald declared the following interest for the agenda item “*ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF SALMONELLA IN TURKEYS*”: To be the recipient of an EFSA contract to develop a user friendly interface for a risk assessment model.

CONFLICT LEVEL B: In the SDoI filled for the present meeting Dr. James Hope declared the following interest for the agenda items “*EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS*” and “*REQUEST FOR SCIENTIFIC AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE MINIMUM SAMPLE SIZE TO TEST SHOULD AN ANNUAL BSE STATISTICAL TESTING REGIME BE AUTHORIZED IN HEALTHY SLAUGHTERED CATTLE*”: he is responsible for all things TSE at AHVLA (incorporating the EURL-TSE) and he was required to read and sign off as valid the report itself. In addition the AHVLA is the recipient of an EFSA contract for the provision of a model for evaluation of TSE monitoring options in cattle in the EU.

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest (level B). Pursuant to EFSA’s Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said experts incur the limitations identified under point C.III.b1. That is, the mentioned experts did not take part in the discussions on this agenda item.