

Parma, 07 May 2011

Seminar for the Candidate Countries and the Potential Candidate Countries on

Chemical Contaminants and Emerging Risks

6/7 April 2011, Ankara, Turkey

Barceló Ankara Altinel Hotel, GMK Bulvarı No:151 Tandoğan

DRAFT REPORT

Background information:

This seminar was organized within the EFSA Pre-Accession Programme 2009/2010 for the Candidate and the Potential Candidate countries* financed by the European Commission under the IPA Component.

The overall objective of the Programme is to promote the understanding of EFSA's work, share expertise and create information exchange mechanisms in order to ensure that the national authorities of the beneficiary countries can participate effectively in the activities of EFSA both prior to accession and following accession to the EU. The participation in this Programme may contribute to the beneficiaries in familiarising themselves with the EU policies and working methods particularly focusing on the integrated approach to food safety "from field to plate".

Within the programme of this seminar EFSA explained the Risk Analysis framework with an accent on separating the risk management from the risk assessment. Representative of the CONTAM Unit of EFSA explained the EFSA's role in the risk assessment of chemical contaminants. The EMRISK Unit presented its work on establishing procedures to collect up-to-date information and data in order to identify and analyze emerging risks in the field of food and feed safety. A speech on the Member State experience and the work of EFSA Focal Points was delivered by the French EFSA Focal Point while a representative of the German food authority presented a case study on dioxins in food. The objective of the "Scientific Co-operation" Unit in fostering the scientific collaboration and exchange of scientific information between EFSA and national food safety authorities in EU Member States was presented. EFSA presented a case study on risk communication. In addition the DG Health and Consumers presented their role and work in the regulatory part of the risk analyze framework. Representatives from the Candidate countries presented the state of art in the related fields in their countries and shared their views on importance of the cooperation with EFSA. The audience consisted of 60 representatives from the competent authorities of the Candidate countries and the Potential Candidate countries (see the Annex 2 List of Participants and Speakers).

Relevance of the Seminar to objectives of the Programme:

- The seminar provided an overall overview on the role and the work of EFSA's CONTAM Panel and Emerging Risks Unit explaining the procedural aspect of delivering scientific opinions and giving an insight into the opinions adopted by the Panel. In addition, participants were able to learn more about procedural mechanisms

* **Candidate countries:** Croatia, Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Turkey

Potential Candidate countries: Albania, Bosnia&Herzegovina, Kosovo (under UNSCR1244), Montenegro, Serbia

like self-tasking and public consultation and hear more about ongoing and future projects in the area of scientific cooperation and international collaboration.

- Representative from the EFSA Scientific Committee explained their work on risk assessment of nanotechnologies and presented priorities and perspectives set in the new EFSA Science Strategy. EFSA Communications Directorate representative delivered presentation on EFSA work in the area of risk communication and explained its the guiding principles by using a case study on animal cloning. The developments with the risk communication guidelines and glossary of terminology together with the new communication strategy 2010-2013 were presented. The importance of networking between peers from all over the EU and the Pre-accession countries was stressed as crucial.
- Experts from the European Commission (Unit 2, Food Hygiene Alert System and Training, Directorate General for Health and Consumers), France (French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety) and Germany (Federal Institute for Risk Assessment) presented their approaches in the area of chemical contaminants, emerging risks sharing views on the importance of risk communication and scientific cooperation, both on national and on the EU level. Representatives of Croatia, Turkey, the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and Montenegro presented their structures of competent authorities engaged in the respective topic and delivered an overview of present and future activities in the fields.
- This seminar provided a good starting point for networking and creation of information exchange systems where chemical contaminants and emerging risks are in question, and will facilitate the preparation of the Pre-accession countries for their future active participation in existing EFSA networks. The participants benefited from a valuable input from EFSA, the Commission and the EU Member States discussing possibilities for future collaboration in joint research projects.

The agenda of this seminar is enclosed as Annex 1

Conclusions and recommendations:

This seminar gave a solid platform for exchange of views and experiences between the representatives from the beneficiary countries, the European Commission, EFSA and the Member States. The participants took an active part in discussing different topics related to chemical contaminants, emerging risks, e.g. nanotechnologies and animal cloning, and possible future scientific cooperation.

The contacts established during the seminar together with the knowledge and information gained from the beneficiary countries will serve EFSA in planning of future programmes and cooperation with the enlargement countries.

Practical and theoretical knowledge provided at this training seminar should enhance the beneficiary countries' capacity to disseminate competences and improve services, particularly in the framework of accession negotiations, as well as adaption, implementation and enforcement of the acquis.

The participants were informed about, and encouraged to join the EFSA's Expert Database and, in addition to apply for the open call for expressions of interest for Seconded National Experts and placement on a reserve list for renewal of Scientific Committee and Panels within EFSA.

Results of the satisfaction questionnaire

60 representatives of different competent authorities from the four Candidate countries and the 4 Potential Candidate countries attended the seminar. 50 participants answered to the evaluation questionnaire. Hotel facilities including meeting room were considered as excellent or very good by the majority of the participants (92%) as well as the written material excellent or very good (94%). Presentation skills of the speakers (71%), the content of speeches (67%) as well as responsiveness to the questions (77%) were on the highest level. 80% of the participants found presentations being on the right level and the majority felt they had enough opportunity to express their opinion and ask questions (88%). The participants considered that this seminar was an excellent or very good opportunity for improving their knowledge on this topic (66%). Additional topics they would like to see addressed in the future seminars include topics such as nutrition and health claims, risk assessment of food enzymes, and antibiotics in food. 66% of the participants found the overall value of the seminar as excellent or very good and 34% as good.

Suggested topics for future seminars/study tours etc.:

- Traceability
- Risk communication approaches (3)
- Communication with stakeholders
- Identification of emerging risk on the long run
- Chemicals (dioxins)
- Generally speaking topics shown by case studies or at workshops
- Information to the public (EFSA and national authorities)
- GMO (2)
- Heavy metals in food (2)
- Nanotechnology (2)
- Food labelling
- Nitrates in food
- Food crises
- Risk management
- EFSA accelerated procedure
- Data collection and evaluation
- Contaminants which are migrated to the food from contact material

Seminar on Chemical Contaminants and Emerging Risks

April 2011	
13.30 - 14.00	Registration
14.00 – 14.10	Welcome and Introduction by the chair <i>Finn Sheye</i> , Pre-Accession Coordinator, Legal and Policy Affairs Unit, EFSA
14.10 – 14.20	Welcome by <i>Ibrahim İlbegi</i> , Head of Control Department, The Turkish Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs.
14.20 – 15.00	Chemical contaminants in the food chain by <i>Claudia Heppner</i> , Head of CONTAM Unit, EFSA
15.00 – 15.30	Why do we need risk communications? Case study on animal cloning by <i>Laura Smillie</i> , Senior Communication Advisor, Communications Directorate, EFSA
15.30 – 16.10	Marine biotoxins in shellfish by <i>Jan Alexander</i> , Deputy Director General of the Norwegian Institute of Public Health, Member of EFSA CONTAM Panel
16.10– 16.30	Coffee break
16.30 – 17.10	Follow up of the Risk Assessment/Risk Management matters as regards marine biotoxins by <i>Paolo Caricato</i> , European Commission, DG Health and Consumers, Unit E2,
17.10 – 17.50	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cooperation of Member States with EU institutions and EFSA; • The state of play on marine biotoxins in France (research, reference, risk assessment, risk management) by <i>Philippe Prigent</i> , European and International Affairs, EFSA Focal Point, French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health & Safety (ANSES)
17.50 – 18.10	Discussion
20.00	Dinner

7 April 2011	
09.00 – 09.30	EFSA Fostering the scientific collaboration in Europe by <i>Stef Bronzwaer</i> , Senior Scientific Officer, Scientific Cooperation Unit, EFSA
09.30 – 10.00	Information on the dioxin incident in Germany by <i>Dr. Helmut Schafft</i> , Head of Unit, Feed and Feed Additives/Contaminants in the Food Chain, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment (BfR), Germany
10.00 – 11.00	Presentations on the latest developments in the field of chemical contaminants and emerging risks by the Candidate Countries authorities: Croatia - <i>Andrea Gross-Boskovic</i> , Head of Risk Assessment Department, Croatian Food Agency Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia - <i>Elena Arsevska</i> , Associate in Border Veterinary Inspection Sector, Food and Veterinary Agency Montenegro – <i>Veselin Delevic</i> Head of department, Institute for Public Health Turkey – <i>Nergiz Özbag</i> , Head of Risk Assessment Unit, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs
11.00 – 11.20	Coffee break
11.20 – 11.50	EFSA work in the area of Emerging Risks followed by a case study <i>Andrea Altieri</i> , Scientific Officer, EMRISK Unit, EFSA
11.50 – 12.20	EFSA Networking with Member States and the European Commission: Case study on Nanotechnologies by <i>David Carlander</i> , Scientific Officer, Scientific Committee and Advisory Forum Unit, EFSA
12.20 - 12.40	The Pre-Accession Programme, state of art and future perspectives by <i>Goran Kumrić</i> , Legal and Policy Affairs Unit, EFSA
12.40 – 13.10	Discussion and short input by appointed <i>National Rapporteurs</i> from each of the beneficiary countries
13.10 - 13.20	Conclusions of the meeting by <i>Stef Bronzwaer</i> , Senior Scientific Officer, Scientific Cooperation Unit, EFSA
13.20	Lunch

List of Participants and Speakers

Speakers

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Andrea Altieri	EMRISK Unit, EFSA	Scientific Officer
2.	Andrea Gross-Bošković	Croatian Food Agency	Head of Risk Assessment Department
3.	Claudia Heppner	CONTAM Unit, EFSA	Head of Unit
4.	David Carlander	Scientific Committee and Advisory Forum Unit, EFSA	Scientific Officer
5.	Elena Arsevaska	Food and Veterinary Agency, Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	Associate in Border Veterinary Inspection Sector
6.	Finn Sheye	Legal and Policy Affairs Unit, EFSA	Pre accession coordinator
7.	Goran Kumric	Legal and Policy Affairs Unit, EFSA	Policy Officer
8.	Helmut Schafft	Federal Institute for Risk Assessment (BfR), Germany	Head of Unit, Feed and Feed Additives/Contaminants in the Food Chain
9.	Jan Alexander	Member of EFSA CONTAM Panel	Deputy Director General of the Norwegian Institute of Public Health
10.	Laura Smillie	Communications Directorate, EFSA	Senior Communication Advisor
11.	Nergiz Özbağ	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs, General Directorate for Protection and Control, Control Department, Turkey	Head of Risk Assessment Unit
12.	Paolo Caricato,	European Commission, DG Health and Consumers, Unit E2	Deputy Head of Unit, Food Hygiene Alert System and Training
13.	Philippe Prigent	French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health & Safety (ANSES)	European and International Affairs, EFSA Focal Point
14.	Stef Bronzwaer	Scientific Cooperation Unit, EFSA	Senior Scientific Officer
15.	Vaselin Delevic,	Institute of Public Health, Montenegro	Head of Department

Participant from Albania

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Ada Omeri	National Food Authority Albania	Intra-agency liaison & coordination Sector; Risk Assessment & Communication Directorate
2.	Rezart Kthupi	National Food Authority Albania	Director of Risk Assessment and Communication

Participant from Bosnia and Herzegovina

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Sejad Mačkić	Food Safety Agency of Bosnia and Herzegovina	Director

Participants from Croatia

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Brigita Hengl	Croatian Food Agency	Expert Associate, Risk Assessment Directorate
2.	Ivana Ujević	Institute of Oceanography and Fisheries	Associate Research Scientist, Technical Head of Laboratory
3.	Ivona Babić	Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development	Head of Section for Food Safety Coordination
4.	Martina Jurković	Croatian Food Agency	Senior Adviser in Department for Scientific Support and Databases
5.	Miljenko Vuić	Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development	Senior State Veterinary Inspector
6.	Natalija Džafić	Croatian Veterinary Institute, Veterinary Department Rijeka	Head of Veterinary Department in Rijeka
7.	Sandra Bašić	Croatian Food Agency	Senior Adviser in Department for Scientific Support and Databases

Participants from the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Daniela Ristoska	Food and Veterinary Agency	Advisor- official veterinarian in the Sector
2.	Dimce Petreski	Food and Veterinary Agency	Head of Unit for the control of non-animal food
3.	Ilija Georgiev	Food and Veterinary Agency	Advisor in Sector for Veterinary border inspection
4.	Jagoda Dimitrovska	Food and Veterinary Agency	Advisor-food inspector in Sector for food of non-animal origin
5.	Katerina Jonovska	Food and Veterinary Agency	Associate in Sector for food of non-animal origin
6.	Metodija Milenkovski	Food and Veterinary Agency	Advisor-food inspector in Sector for food of non-animal origin
7.	Valentina Gjorgijeva	Food and Veterinary Agency	Advisor-official veterinarian in Sector for Veterinary border inspection
8.	Stanislava Lazarevska	Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and Food - Skopje	Full Professor

Participant from Kosovo

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Blerim Hajdari	Food and Veterinary Agency	Head of Veterinary Public Health Sector
2.	Ilirjana Zymberaj	Food and Veterinary Agency	Head of Sanitary Inspectorate

Participant from Montenegro

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Ljiljana Jovičević	Ministry of Health	Chief Health- Sanitary Inspector
2.	Ljiljana Milovanović	Veterinary Directorate	Senior Adviser
3.	Ljiljana Žižić	Institute of Public Health	Head of department, President of Council for Food Safety Risk Assessment
4.	Milka Petrušić	Phytosanitary Directorate	Advisor in Phytosanitary Directorate for food safety, pesticides and fertilizer
5.	Tatijana Babović	Veterinary Administration	Senior adviser
6.	Zora Šćepanović	Ministry of Health	Sanitary inspector
7.	Zorka Prljević	Phytosanitary Directorate	Director of Phytosanitary Directorate

Participant from Serbia

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Branislav Raketec	Ministry of Agriculture, Trade, Forestry and Water Management, Sector for Analytics and Agriculture Policy	Food Quality Expert
2.	Goran Stojković	Ministry of Health, Department for Inspections, Group for Internal Control	Independent Advisor

Participants from Turkey

	Name and Surname	Institution	Title
1.	Ali Özcan	MARA, Bursa Control and Central Research Institute, Division of Animal Products	Head of Animal Products Lab.
2.	Ayla Şener	MARA, GDPC, Control Department, Division of Risk Assessment	Expert
3.	Aysu Memişsevil	MARA, GDPC, Department of Food Business Operators and Codex	Food Engineer
4.	Berna Bilgi Boyacı	MARA, GDPC, Control Department, Division of Labs	Expert (Food Engineer)
5.	Betül Vazgeçer	MARA, GDPC Department of Food Business Operators and Codex	Food Expert, Engineer
6.	Ebru Evcil	MARA, İzmir Provincial Control Lab., Organik Agriculture and Residue	Food Chemist on Residue Analysis
7.	Emine Gül Yılmaz	MARA, GDPC, Department of Border Inspection of Plant and Plant Originated Products	Food Engineer
8.	Ercan Koca	MARA, Ankara Provincial Control Laboratory, Mycotoxin Lab	Biologist
9.	Esra Darga	MARA, Ankara Provincial Directorate, Control Division	Food Engineer / Food Inspector
10.	F. Nevra Özcan	MARA, GDPC, Control Department, Division of Risk Assessment	Expert (Food Engineer)
11.	Fadime Doğanay	MARA, GDPC, Department of Border Inspection of Plant and Plant Originated Products	Agriculture Engineer

12.	Fahrettin Doğan	MARA, İstanbul Provincial Directorate, Control Division	Agriculture Engineer
13.	Gül Çelik Çakıroğulları	MARA, National Reference Laboratory, Dioxin Lab	Engineer
14.	İbrahim İlbeği	MARA, GDPC, Control Department	Head of Department
15.	Muammer Ünlüer	Ministry of Health, GD of Primary Health Services	Food expert
16.	Pınar Kalgay	MARA, GDPC, Department of Food Business Operators and Codex	Director of Food Codex Division
17.	Şennur Özkaya	Assistant Coordinator of PAP for Turkey	Assistant Coordinator for EFSA Pre-Accession Programme
18.	Tolga Sarı	MARA, İzmir Provincial Directorate, Control Division	Food Engineer
19.	Ümit Okudur	MARA, Antalya Provincial Directorate, Control Division	Food Inspector
20.	Zehra Karagöz	MARA, GDPC Control Department, Division of Risk Assessment	Food expert
21.	Zühra Tepe	MARA, GDPC, Division of Domestic Control	Food engineer

Meeting Secretary

- Maria Chiara Petrolini, Administrative Assistant, Legal and Policy Affairs Unit, EFSA