

15-16 October 2024

14:00-18:00 / 09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 23 October 2024

Location: Teleconference

Attendees:

○ **Panel Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Eleftherios Bonos, Henrik Christensen, Mojca Durjava, Birgit Dusemund, Ronette Gehring, Boet Glandorf, Maryline Kouba, Marta López-Alonso, Francesca Marcon, Carlo Nebbia, Alena Pechová, Miguel Prieto, Katerina Theodoridou and Roberto Edoardo Villa (Chair).

○ **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not applicable.

○ **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Francesca Moretti.²

○ **EFSA:**

FEEDCO Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Montserrat Anguita, Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Rosella Brozzi, Rafaella Christodoulou, Joana P. Firmino, Stefania Fusani, Jaume Galobart, Yolanda García-Cazorla, Mary Bridget Gilsonan, Davide Guerra, Orsolya Holczknecht, Laura Iancu, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Alberto Navarro-Villa, Jordi Ortuño, Fabiola Pizzo, Joana Revez, Elena Rovesti, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Piera Valeri and Maria Vittoria Vettori.

COM Unit: Francesca Avanzini, Ricardo Carvalho Rodrigues.

○ **Others:**

Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Ilen Röhe. The Chair welcomed Margherita Andriulli and Rafaella Christodoulou as new members of the FEEDCO Unit.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after the inclusion of the items "Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Clary sage oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00304](#))" and "Guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms in support of the risk assessment of products used in the food chain ([EFSA-Q-2024-00438](#))".

3. Declarations of interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Attended on 16/10/2024

³ [Policy on Independence](#)

⁴ [Competing Interest Management](#)



screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 177th FEEDAP Panel plenary meeting held on 17-19 September 2024 in Parma

The minutes of the 177th FEEDAP Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 27 September 2024.⁵

5. Report on written procedures

No written procedures to report.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion/adoption

6.1 Ponceau 4R (2a124) for freshwater fish ([EFSA-Q-2022-00781](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Ponceau 4R as a sensory additive for freshwater fish.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.2 Rovabio® Excel (endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase and endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (produced with *Talaromyces versatilis* IMI CC 378536) for all poultry species, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening and sows ([EFSA-Q-2023-00253](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Rovabio® Excel (endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase and endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (produced with *Talaromyces versatilis* IMI CC 378536) as a zootechnical additive for all poultry species, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening and sows.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel identified the need to request some clarifications to the applicant.

6.3 *Lactaseibacillus paracasei* NCIMB 30151 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00544](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lactaseibacillus paracasei* NCIMB 30151 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.4 Preparation of *Bacillus subtilis* DSM 33862 and *Lentilactobacillus buchneri* DSM 12856 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00631](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of a preparation of *Bacillus subtilis* DSM 33862 and *Lentilactobacillus buchneri* DSM 12856 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2024-10/177th-plenary-meeting-of-the-feedap-panel-minutes.pdf>



6.5 Vitamin B₂/Riboflavin produced by *Eremothecium ashbyi* CCTCCM 2019833 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00693](#))

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the safety of vitamin B₂/riboflavin produced by *Eremothecium ashbyi* CCTCCM 2019833 as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.6 *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* CNCM I-1077 for lambs, all minor ruminant species for fattening, camelids for fattening, ruminants reared for milk production/suckling/reproduction, camelids reared for milk production/suckling/reproduction, Equidae other than horses ([EFSA-Q-2023-00724](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the modification of the conditions of the authorisation under Article 13 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* CNCM I-1077 as a zootechnical additive for lambs, all minor ruminant species for fattening, camelids for fattening, ruminants reared for milk production/suckling/reproduction, camelids reared for milk production/suckling/reproduction and Equidae other than horses.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.7 *Enterococcus faecium* (ATCC 53519 and ATCC 55593) ([EFSA-Q-2024-00051](#))

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the efficacy of *Enterococcus faecium* (ATCC 53519 and ATCC 55593) as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.8 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Clary sage oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00304](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of clary sage oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The scientific opinion was initially adopted on 17 September 2024. However, after adoption, it was identified that there was a miscalculation on the target animals' intake and on the maximum safe level for the different target species. Therefore, the Panel agreed to withdraw the adoption of the opinion. An updated draft opinion with the correct calculation was discussed. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.9 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Peppermint oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00405](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of peppermint oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.10 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Sage oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00406](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of sage oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.



The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion and agreed that further discussion is needed. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at a future plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

6.11 Guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms in support of the risk assessment of products used in the food chain ([EFSA-Q-2024-00438](#))

This question refers to a self-task of the Scientific Committee of EFSA to prepare a guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms used in the food chain.

The Panel was informed that following the consultation of the relevant Scientific Panels, no major comments were received. The Panel endorsed the document which will be proposed for endorsement by the Scientific Committee, prior to public consultation.

7. Other scientific topics for information/discussion

7.1 Protocol for an environmental risk assessment of the feed additives containing trace elements: cobalt, copper, iodine, manganese, molybdenum, selenium and zinc

The Panel discussed and endorsed the protocol on the problem formulation and approach selected by the Panel to elaborate a scientific opinion on the environmental risk assessment of the feed additives containing trace elements: cobalt, copper, iodine, manganese, molybdenum, selenium and zinc. The document will be updated during the mandate as necessary and changes tracked in the dedicated section.

7.2 Self-task mandate on nano-risk assessment of feed additives

The Panel endorsed the draft self-task mandate on the development of a specific guidance document for risk assessment of feed additives containing nanoparticles. It will now be sent to the Executive Director.

8. Update on new mandates since the previous meeting

8.1 New applications under Regulation (EC) 1831/2003

The Commission has forwarded to EFSA the following new applications of feed additives seeking authorisation under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 since the last Plenary meeting. These applications were presented to the Panel:

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2024-00563	Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (4a1606i) produced with <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> LMG S-15136 as a zootechnical additive for all suidae and poultry species
EFSA-Q-2024-00573	Preparation of carvacrol, cinnamaldehyde and capsicum oleoresin (4d11) as zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening
EFSA-Q-2024-00580	Preparation of <i>Lactiplantibacillus plantarum</i> NCIMB 30238 and <i>Pediococcus pentosaceus</i> NCIMB 30237 (1k21008) as technological additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00594	Xanthan gum (E415) produced with <i>X. campestris</i> strains ATCC SD 7012, DSM 23730, CNCM 1-4861, CIP 74.23 as a technological additive for salmonids and ornamental fish
EFSA-Q-2024-00599	Canthaxanthin (2a161g) as sensory additive for chickens and minor poultry species for fattening, laying poultry and poultry reared for laying and ornamental fish and ornamental birds



8.2 Valid applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003

Applications considered valid for the start of the assessment:

EFSA-Q number	Subject	Valid on
EFSA-Q-2024-00394	Taurine (3a370) as nutritional additive for all animal species	04/10/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00395	<i>Bacillus velezensis</i> ATCC PTA-6737 (4b1823) as zootechnical additive for laying hens and other birds kept for egg production or breeding	08/10/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00408	Betaine as betaine anhydrous (3a920) and betaine hydrochloride (3a925) as nutritional additive for all animal species	25/09/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00423	L-Arginine (3c363) produced with <i>Corynebacterium glutamicum</i> KCCM 80393 as nutritional additive for all animal species and categories	25/09/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00504	Beta-carotene (3a160(a)) as nutritional additive for all animal species	12/09/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00505	Tocopherol extracts from vegetable oils (1b306(i)), tocopherol-rich extracts from vegetable oils (delta-rich) (1b306(ii)) and alpha-Tocopherol (1b307) as technological additives for all animal species	12/09/2024

8.3 New questions under Regulation (EC) No 178/2002

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2024-00534	Glyceryl polyethyleneglycol ricinoleate for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00576	Folic acid (3a316) for aquatic species

9. Feedback from Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels/EFSA/European Commission/EURL

9.1 Scientific Committee

Not discussed.

9.2 Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

Not discussed.

9.3 EFSA

A member of the COM Unit made a presentation on the Media and Content Management team and the communication activities related to the work of the FEEDAP Panel.

9.4 European Commission/EURL

The European Union Reference Laboratory (EURL) has recently finished an addendum of the EURL evaluation report for L-cystine linked to FAD-2010-0261 ([EFSA-Q-2010-01313](#)). The addendum referred to the identification of L-cystine in the feed additive, and to the determination of cystine in the feed additive and in premixtures. The EURL recommended for official control the Food Chemical Codex "L-cystine monograph" for the identification of L-cystine in the feed additive, and the Ion-exchange chromatography coupled with post-column derivatisation and optical detection (IEC-VIS/FLD) for the determination of cystine in the feed additive and in premixtures. The Panel verified the addendum to the report.



10. Any other business

10.1 Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 26-28 November 2024 via teleconference.