

24 April 2024

9:00-15:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 13 May 2024

Location: Teleconference

Attendees:

○ Panel Members:

ALVAREZ Julio, VELARDE Antonio, BICOUT Dominique, CALISTRI Paolo, CANALI Elisabetta, DREWE Julian Ashley, GARIN-BASTUJI Bruno, GONZALES ROJAS Jose Luis, GORTAZAR Christian, HERSKIN Mette, MICHEL Virginie, MIRANDA Miguel Angel, NIELSEN Søren Saxmose, PADALINO Barbara, ROBERTS Helen, STÅHL Karl, VILTROP Arvo, WINCKLER Christoph.

○ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

○ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

EC: ALAEZ PONS Ester, COHEN Iulia-Delia, RASMUSSEN Susanne-Dittmann, MESMAN Sanna, POPA Ana-Maria

○ EFSA:

ASHE Sean, AZNAR ASENSIO J Inmaculada, BALDINELLI Francesca, BROGLIA Alessandro, CANDIANI Denise Francesca, DHOLLANDER Sofie, FABRIS Chiara, GERVELMEYER Andrea, HEMPEN Michaela, KOHNLE Lisa, LANFRANCHI Barbara MANAKIDOU Aikaterini, MUR Lina, PREITE Ludovica, ROJO GIMENO Cristina, VAN DER STEDE Yves Pascal, VERDONCK Frank, VITALI Marika.

○ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants and observers. Apologies were received from Hans Spoolder.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4. Panel members introduction

Both the Panel Members and the Observers introduced themselves to each other.

5. Presentation of EFSA guidelines for observers

The chair presented the guidelines for the observers.

6. Agreement of the minutes of the 155th AHAW Panel Plenary meeting held on 13 March 2024, via teleconference

The minutes of the 155th Panel plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 29 March 2024.

7. Report on written procedure

- 7.1** Art. 29 - Vaccination against highly pathogenic avian influenza: TOR3 and 4 ([EFSA-Q-2023-00056](#)): report on written adoption

The Panel was informed that the Scientific Opinion on HPAI vaccination – Part 2 was unanimously adopted via written procedure on 25 March and published on the EFSA Journal on 17 April.

8. Scientific output(s) submitted for discussion

- 8.1 Art. 29 - Scientific Opinion on Welfare of sheep and goats during killing for purposes other than slaughter ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#)): thorough discussion**

The draft opinion was submitted to the Panel for in-depth reading and discussion. In particular, the Panel agreed on the changes following the previously submitted version regarding the reasons for large scale killing, the specificity of goats versus sheep, and gas stunning (for which a short separate chapter was created). Conclusions and recommendations were discussed as well. The draft will be submitted for possible adoption at next Plenary meeting in May 2024.

- 8.2 Art. 29 – Request for a Scientific Opinion concerning the protection of turkeys on farm ([EFSA-Q-2023-00647](#))- Update on the results of the public call for evidence on the welfare of turkeys.**

As part of the new engagement plan with stakeholders in the new animal welfare mandates a public call for evidence on the welfare of turkeys (*Meleagris gallopavo*) was launched between 7th December and 31st January 2024. The public call for evidence focused on 7 areas of the terms of reference including 1) husbandry systems of turkeys kept for meat production, breeders and hatcheries, 2) the impact of breeding on welfare, 3) stocking density, 4) environmental enrichment and environmental conditions, 5) the practice of mutilations, 6) separations of toms and hens, 7) the practice of thinning, 8) welfare assessment in turkey farming. A summary of the participation to the public call for evidence was provided. In total 24 respondents representing Industry, NGOs, Research/Academic institutions, Public Authorities from Member States, Other and individuals in their private capacity from 8 countries submitted over 250 inputs including published peer review research articles, industry guidelines, specific responses to the EFSA questions, reports of projects



and farm visits, conference abstracts and posters. EFSA and the working group are reviewing these inputs before using them in the risk assessment (Art. 29) and for the technical report (Art. 31).

8.3 Art. 29 - Request for a Scientific Opinion concerning the protection of Equidae ([EFSA-Q-2024-00188](#), [EFSA-Q-2024-00189](#), [EFSA-Q-2024-00187](#)): Short update

A stakeholder event is planned for June 19th in Brussels, where the mandate will be presented by EC and EFSA, followed by presentations from FVE, EUnetHorse (HORIZON project), and NGOs. After the event, a call for evidence will be held, similar to the process implemented for the mandate on the welfare of fur animals. Setting up the WG on the welfare of *Equidae* is ongoing, with Julio Álvarez Sánchez formally appointed as the chair of the WG. A literature review will support the WG carried out by a contractor, in particular, but not limited to a description of common husbandry systems for horses, donkeys and their hybrids.

8.4 Art. 29 - Request for a scientific opinion concerning the protection of animals kept for fur production ([EFSA-Q-2023-00869](#)) – Update

A summary of the mandate and background was presented. An update on the engagement plan was provided, along with the initial overview of participation in the four public calls for evidence regarding the welfare of animals kept for fur production (excluding killing), which took place from March 1st to April 19th, 2024. It was noted that an additional two weeks for submissions had been ensured for stakeholders encountering technical issues during the allotted period. Evidence provided will be reviewed by EFSA and working group experts.

Lastly, an update was given regarding the advancement and planning of the working group's activities concerning the various terms of reference outlined in the mandate. More specifically, the working group commenced discussions on the main topics raised by stakeholders during the Stakeholder meeting organized by EFSA the 22nd of January 2024 and initiated the process of revising and updating the information pertaining to the biology of the animals (response to ToR1a of the mandate).

8.5 Art. 29 - Request for a Scientific Opinion concerning the protection of beef cattle – ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#)) – Short update

A summary of the mandate and background was presented. An update on the advancement and planning of the working group's activities concerning various terms of references outlined in the mandate was provided. The presentation focused on ToR 2 (a,b,c,d,e) and ToR3 of the Mandate.

8.6 Art.29 - Pandemic drivers of Avian Influenza ([EFSA-Q-2024-00172](#)): Update

An update was provided on the activities for the Scientific Opinion, i.e. task 2 of the mandate on AI pandemic preparedness. The approach that was developed by the working group was presented to the Panel, as well as the timeline for the finalisation of the Scientific Opinion. The Panel was briefed that the contractor for the sequence analysis was identified. There is a discussion ongoing in the working group concerning the definition of tasks.

8.7 Art. 29 - Request for a Scientific Opinion concerning the use of high-expansion foam for stunning and killing pigs and poultry ([EFSA-Q-2022-00344](#)): First reading.



The draft Scientific Opinion was submitted to the Panel for first reading. Positive feedback was received, most of the comments raised by the Panel had already been resolved and some of them were further discussed constructively. It was suggested to summarize the content of few tables formulating sentences, to improve the description of handling, to explain the reason why quantitative method for equivalence of killing methods has not been further used, to explain the methodology used for the qualitative assessment in relation to the choice of hazards and the comparison that has been made among methods, to explain better why pain, distress or suffering have been used together and to add clarification about the method for the assessment of uncertainty. It was agreed that these comments will be taken into consideration and the conclusions will be summarised. The draft opinion will be submitted for thorough discussion at the Plenary in May 2024.

9. Other scientific topics for information/discussion

9.1 Survival time of African swine fever virus in different matrices

A summary of the project funded by EFSA on the survival of African swine fever (ASFV) in different feed-based matrices and arthropods was presented to the Panel. The project results and detailed methodology can be found in the report recently published in <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/sp.efsa.2024.EN-8776>.

9.2 Practical arrangements for the 157th Plenary meeting in Parma

The Panel agreed on the practical arrangements for the 157th plenary meeting that will be held in Parma.

10. Update on new mandates

Not applicable

11. Feedback from the Scientific Committee

The Chair provided feedback from the Scientific Committee meeting on the strategic issues and use of guidance documents of relevance to AHAW.

12. Questions from and answers to Observers (in application of the guidelines for Observers)

No questions were made by the observers.

13. Preparatory meetings

Since the last 155th Plenary meeting, a preparatory meeting chaired by EFSA staff was held on the 22nd of April to prepare the plenary meeting.

14. Next Meeting

The next meeting will be held on 21-22nd May 2024 in Parma.



Annex III List of Observers

Online:

About 25 registered, of which 12 observers attended.

Observer	Organisation
Bárbara Barbosa	European Forum of Farm Animal Breeders (EFFAB)
Abbey Olsen	University of Copenhagen
Piotr Janiszewski	Institute of Agricultural and Food Biotechnology – State Research Institute (IBPRS-PIB)-Poland
Raussi Satu	Finnish Centre for Animal Welfare, Natural Resources Institute Luke Finland
Dóra Sulyok	Veterinarian Hungarian farm-Enyingi Agrár Zrt
Beatriz Belloni	Brazilian Association of Animal Protein (ABPA)
Kis Andrásné	Water fowl sector
Ingrid Morvan	Committee Linking Entrepreneurship – Agriculture – Development (COLEAD)
Mariia Barbara	Innovation Laboratories for Climate Actions (ILCA) Project- Risk Assessment Unit in Ukraine
Michele De Angeli	Trouw Nutrition Italia spa
Michael McMenamy	Agri-Food & Biosciences Institute Northern Ireland (AFBI)
Diana Teixeira	Animal health Europe