

17-18 April 2024

09:00-16:00 / 09:00-16:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 26 April 2024

Location: Teleconference

Attendees:

○ **Panel Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Vasileios Bampidis (Chair), Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Henrik Christensen, Birgit Dusemund, Mojca Durjava, Maryline Kouba, Marta López-Alonso, Secundino López Puente, Francesca Marcon, Alena Pechová, Mariana Petkova, Fernando Ramos¹ and Roberto Edoardo Villa.

○ **Hearing Experts²:**

Not applicable.

○ **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not applicable.

○ **EFSA:**

FEEDCO Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Montserrat Anguita, Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Rosella Brozzi, Anna Dioni, Maria Dulak-Lis, Joana P. Firmino, Jaume Galobart, Yolanda García-Cazorla, Mary Bridget Gilsehan, Orsolya Holczknecht, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Alberto Navarro-Villa, Jordi Ortuño, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Anita Radovnikovic, Joana Revez, Barbara Rossi, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Piera Valeri and Maria Vittoria Vettori.

○ **Others:**

Not applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Baltasar Mayo and Ruud Woutersen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after the removal of the item "Indigo carmine for cats, dogs and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00502](#))".

3. Declarations of interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Present only on 18 April 2024

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ [Policy on Independence](#)

⁴ [Competing Interest Management](#)



4. Agreement of the minutes of the 172nd FEEDAP Panel plenary meeting held on 12-14 March 2024 in Thessaloniki

The minutes of the 172nd FEEDAP Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 22 March 2024.⁵

5. Report on written procedures

The Panel adopted the following opinions by written procedure since the last plenary meeting:

- Vitamin B₁₂ or cyanocobalamin produced by *Ensifer adhaerens* CGMCC 21299 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00409](#)) adopted on 22 March 2024
- *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* DSM 5284 - ATCC 55944 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00017](#)) adopted on 15 April 2024
- *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* DSM 4786 - DSM 18114 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00019](#)) adopted on 15 April 2024

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion/adoption

6.1 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 - Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories: Cedarwood Texas oil ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of cedarwood Texas oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.2 Sacox[®] (salinomycin sodium) for rabbits for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00282](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Sacox[®] (salinomycin sodium) as a coccidiostat for rabbits for fattening.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.3 Avizyme[®] 1505 (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase produced by *Trichoderma reesei* (ATCC PTA 5588), subtilisin produced by *Bacillus subtilis* (ATCC 2107) and alpha-amylase produced by *Bacillus amyloliquefaciens* (ATCC 3978)) for all poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00694](#))

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the safety of Avizyme[®] 1505 (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase produced by *Trichoderma reesei* (ATCC PTA 5588), subtilisin produced by *Bacillus subtilis* (ATCC 2107) and alpha-amylase produced by *Bacillus amyloliquefaciens* (ATCC 3978)) as a zootechnical additive for all poultry species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

⁵ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2024-03/feedap240312-14_m.pdf



6.4 *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* DSM 4787 - ATCC 55943 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00018](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* ATCC 55943 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.5 *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* DSM 4785 - DSM 18113 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00020](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* DSM 18113 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.6 *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* DSM4784 - ATCC53187 - DSM18112 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00021](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* - DSM18112 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.7 *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* ATCC PTA-6139 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00022](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lactobacillus (Lactiplantibacillus) plantarum* ATCC PTA-6139 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.8 *Lactobacillus (Lacticaseibacillus) paracasei* ATCC PTA-6135 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00199](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lactobacillus (Lacticaseibacillus) paracasei* ATCC PTA-6135 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.9 Balancius™ (muramidase, EC 3.2.1.17) for laying hens ([EFSA-Q-2022-00318](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Balancius® Muramidase (EC 3.2.1.17) as a zootechnical additive for laying hens.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.10 Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of *Macleaya cordata* extract and leaves) for suckling and weaned piglets and other growing Suidae ([EFSA-Q-2022-00357](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of *Macleaya cordata* extract and leaves) as a zootechnical additive for suckling and weaned piglets and other growing Suidae.



The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.11 *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* Canobios-BL for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2022-00373](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Canobios-BL (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae*) as a zootechnical additive for cats and dogs.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.12 *Lentilactobacillus (Lactobacillus) buchneri* LN4637 / ATCC PTA-2494 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00778](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lentilactobacillus (Lactobacillus) buchneri* LN4637 / ATCC PTA-2494 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.13 *Lentilactobacillus (Lactobacillus) buchneri* LN40177 / ATCC PTA-6138 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00780](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lentilactobacillus (Lactobacillus) buchneri* LN40177 / ATCC PTA-6138 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.14 L-Cystine (3c391) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00791](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of L-cystine (3c391) as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.15 *Limosilactobacillus fermentum* NCIMB 30169 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00363](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Limosilactobacillus fermentum* NCIMB 30169 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.16 Calcium D-pantothenate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00452](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of calcium D-pantothenate as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel endorsed the opinion which will be considered for written adoption after the outcome of the public consultation is addressed.

6.17 Beta-xylanase / beta-glucanase / *Talaromyces versatilis* IMI 378536 / DSM 26702 (Rovabio® Advance) ([EFSA-Q-2023-00520](#))

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the efficacy of Rovabio® Advance (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase produced with *Talaromyces versatilis* IMI 378536 and DSM 26702) as a zootechnical additive for weaned piglets.



The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.18 Plexomin® L-Fe (ferrous lysinate sulfate) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00668](#))

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the efficacy of Plexomin® L-Fe (ferrous lysinate sulfate) as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.19 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories: Citronella oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00190](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of citronella oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.20 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories: Clove tincture ([EFSA-Q-2024-00191](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of clove tincture as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.21 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories: Eucalyptus tincture ([EFSA-Q-2024-00192](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of eucalyptus tincture as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.22 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories: Ginkgo tincture ([EFSA-Q-2024-00194](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of ginkgo tincture as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

7. Other scientific topics for information/discussion

7.1 Assessment of feed additives consisting of or containing nanoparticles

A discussion took place on the criteria to exclude the need to characterise feed additives with regards to the fraction of small particles including nanoparticles. A draft exception list was prepared and discussed. The Panel agreed that this list will be shared with the Cross-cutting Working Group on nanotechnology of the Scientific Committee, and presented for endorsement in the next plenary meeting.



8. Update on new mandates since the previous meeting

8.1 New applications under Regulation (EC) 1831/2003

The Commission has forwarded to EFSA the following new applications of feed additives seeking authorisation under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 since the last Plenary meeting. These applications were presented to the Panel:

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2024-00202	Cobalt (II) acetate tetrahydrate, cobalt(II) carbonate, cobalt(II) carbonate hydroxide (2:3) monohydrate and cobalt(II) sulphate heptahydrate for camelids
EFSA-Q-2024-00214	Xylocap® (Capsaicin CAS No. 404-86-4) for all animal species

8.2 Valid applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003

Applications considered valid for the start of the assessment:

EFSA-Q number	Subject	Valid on
EFSA-Q-2023-00549	Kofasil® (Hexamethylene tetramine sodium nitrite) for all animal species	03/04/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00674	Clinoptilolite of volcanic origin (E567) for all terrestrial animal species	12/03/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00704	Perlite (E599) as anticaking agent for all terrestrial animal species	12/03/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00722	4-Hydroxy-2,5-dimethylfuran-3(2H)-one for all animal species with the exception of cats and dogs	05/03/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00857	Bonvital (<i>Enterococcus lactis</i> DSM 7134) for sows	10/04/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00865	L-lysine sulphate produced by <i>Corynebacterium glutamicum</i> for all animal species	06/03/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00900	Preparation containing Scansmoke PET SEF 7525 (smoke flavouring extract 2b0001) for cats and dogs	12/03/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00901	Copper Bilysinate for all animal species	05/03/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00001	Plexomin L-Cu (Copper lysinate sulfate) for all animal species	10/04/2024

8.3 New questions under Regulation (EC) No 178/2002

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2024-00117	Sepiolitic clay for all animal species

9. Feedback from Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels/EFSA/European Commission/EURL

9.1 Scientific Committee

Not discussed.

9.2 Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

Not discussed.

9.3 EFSA

Not discussed.



9.4 European Commission/EURL

Not discussed.

10. Any other business

10.1 FACTS calculator

The Panel was informed that the online tool “Feed Additives maximum safe Concentration in feed for Targets Species (FACTS) calculator” available on the website⁶ contained an error for the calculation of the maximum safe concentration in milk replacer. The dry matter (DM) content should have been 94.5% but the tool was calculating for a DM content of 88%. This error has been corrected and the tool updated on the EFSA website.

10.2 Guidance on user safety – respiratory sensitisation

An editorial error has been identified in the “Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the users”⁷. There is an inconsistency between the text in section 2.2 “Skin and respiratory sensitisation” and the flowchart in Figure 1. The words “and respiratory” should be removed from the text in the bottom-left text box in the flow chart which should read “The additive should not be considered a skin and eye irritant nor a dermal sensitiser”. This editorial error will be corrected in the published guidance.

10.3 Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 4-6 June 2024 in Parma. A session open to observers will take place on 5 June PM and 6 June AM.

⁶ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/applications/feedadditives/tools>

⁷ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/8469>