

08 February 2024

14:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 23 February 2024

Location: webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
- Hearing Experts¹:
Marien Gerritzen
- EFSA:
Denise Candiani

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 46th Working Group meeting held on 11 January 2024, webconference

The minutes of the 46th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 23 January 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



The WG discussed point a together with Marien Gerritzen. The hearing expert provided his views on the topics discussed, and information on any additional relevant scientific reference not yet considered by the WG.

a. Draft opinion on the killing of small ruminants for purposes other than slaughter – finalization of text ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

The text of the opinion and outcome tables for all stunning/killing methods were finalised. The WG agrees the draft opinion can be submitted to the AHAW Panel in their Plenary meeting for the first reading.

b. Draft conclusions and recommendations on the killing of small ruminants for purposes other than slaughter ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

WG members revised draft conclusions and recommendations of the opinion.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 16-17 April 2024, physical in Parma.

11 January 2024
09:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 23 January 2024

Location: webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
- Hearing Experts¹:
Marien Gerritzen
- EFSA:
Denise Candiani

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 45th Working Group meeting held on 11 November 2023, webconference

The minutes of the 45th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 06 December 2023.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG discussed points a and b together with Marien Gerritzen. The hearing expert provided his views on the topics discussed, and information on any additional relevant scientific reference not yet considered by the WG.

a. Draft opinion on the killing of small ruminants for purposes other than slaughter – uncertainty analysis ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

The WG run an exercise to define uncertainty around the outcomes of the opinion. Prior to the meeting, EFSA staff, WG chair and an expert appointed on uncertainty analysis developed a series of questions including well defined quantities of interest representing a relevant proportion of animals affected by the scenario included in the question. The questions were distributed among WG experts for a first individual round of uncertainty judgment. After collecting individual answers, the group discussed uncertainty ranges in a group round aimed at establishing consensual values. Consensus values for uncertainty are reported in a specific chapter of the opinion.

b. Draft opinion on the killing of small ruminants for purposes other than slaughter – revision of text ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

The text of the opinion and outcome tables for all stunning/killing methods were revised.

c. Draft conclusions and recommendations on the killing of small ruminants for purposes other than slaughter ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

WG members revised possible conclusions and recommendations of the opinion.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 8 February 2024, webconference.

**SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal Health and Welfare**
45th Working Group meeting on Slaughter and killing



15 November 2023
09:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 06 December 2023

Location: webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
- Hearing Experts¹:
Marien Gerritzen
- EFSA:
Denise Candiani

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 44th Working Group meeting held on 11-13 October 2023, physical in Parma

The minutes of the 44th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 31 October 2023.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG discussed point a together with Marien Gerritzen. The hearing expert provided his views on the topics discussed, and information on any additional relevant scientific reference not yet considered by the WG.

a. Draft opinion on the killing of small ruminants for purposes other than slaughter ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

The WG revised the text of the draft scientific opinion, and in particular dealt with comments about the sections on hazards, welfare consequences and ABMs for the pre-killing phase (handling and moving – phase 1). The new text on the killing phase (phase 2) was then discussed. Regarding the approach for phase 2, a discussion was held whether the F2F approach could be applied. It was agreed that, since the relevant welfare issues during killing are pain and fear as per the Reg. 10099/2009 for the protection of animals at the time of killing, then the F2F approach could not apply. This approach will be discussed and agree with the AHAW Panel at their meeting in December 2023.

Outcome tables for all stunning/killing methods were revised.

b. Draft conclusions and recommendations on the killing of small ruminants for purposes other than slaughter ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

WG members drafted possible conclusions for phase 1 and phase 2 of the opinion, and recommendations for phase 1.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 10-11 January 2024, in Parma.



**SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal Health and Welfare**
44th Working Group meeting on Slaughter and killing



11 - 13 October 2023
09:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 31 October 2023

Location: EFSA - Parma (Meeting Room 00/M15)

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
- Hearing Experts¹:
Marien Gerritzen
- EFSA:
Denise Candiani

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 43th Working Group meeting held on 21 July 2021, via web-conference

The minutes of the 43th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 22 July 2021.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



The scientific opinions developed under the frame of the slaughter and killing mandate – received in 2018 - were put on hold for a period due to the receipt of the mandates related to the Farm to Form strategy revision received in 2020. Up to that moment the working group on slaughter and killing had produced opinions on poultry, cattle, pigs (slaughter and other purposes than slaughter) and small ruminants (slaughter only). The working group re-starts now its work with the remainder opinions.

a. Draft opinion on the killing of small ruminants for purposes other than slaughter ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

The WG discussed the text of the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed hazards, welfare consequences and ABMs for the pre-killing phase (handling and moving). Related to the welfare consequences, it was agreed to define them in line with the new definitions proposed in the F2F methodological guidance. Accordingly, it was agreed that for the selection of relevant welfare consequences, the protocol adopted for the F2F could also be used in this mandate. Therefore, an EKE exercise was held to select the highly relevant welfare consequences for the pre-killing phase. The outcome table, summarising all hazards, welfare consequences, ABMs, preventive and corrective measures for the pre-killing phase was produced.

The text related to the killing phase was then discussed. Outcome tables for all stunning/killing methods were produced.

b. Draft opinion on the killing for slaughter of other species – horses ([EFSA-Q-2023-00310](#))

The WG discussed the pre-slaughter phase. Related to the pre-slaughter phase, it was agreed that for the processes Arrival and Unloading the opinion will refer to the recently published opinion on transport of horses that covers already these two processes. For the remaining processes of the pre-slaughter phase (Lairage and Handling and moving), it was agreed to adopt the protocol of the F2F methodological guidance and an EKE exercise was run to select the highly relevant welfare consequences applying to the pre-slaughter phase (Lairage, Handling and moving) and the slaughter phase (Restraint).

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 15 November 2023, via web conference.



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 43rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 21st July 2021, Parma

(Agreed on 22/07/2021)

Participants

- Working group experts
Virginie Michel (chair)
Antonio Velarde
- Hearing Experts:
Marien Gerritzen
Mohan Raj
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 42nd Working Group meetings held by web on 18th of May 2021.

The minutes of the 42nd Working Group meeting held on 18th May via web, were agreed on 20th May 2021 at the end of the meeting.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinion on slaughter, regarding minor species (small ruminants). Experts revised the document following Panel feedback, with special attention to space allowance, electrical parameters, and the bleeding without stunning section. The full Opinion was then revised, and the experts also checked the Thermal stress in 'Arrival' section. Experts solved all the comments and, in addition, revised the consistency of terminology concerning the transport in the Arrival section.

6. Next meeting

To be decided

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2018-00721>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 42nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 18th May2021, Parma

(Agreed on 20/05/2021)

Participants

- Working group experts
Virginie Michel (chair)
Antonio Velarde
- Hearing Experts:
Marien Gerritzen
Mohan Raj
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 41st Working Group meetings held by web on 11th of May 2021.

The minutes of the 41st Working Group meeting held on 11th May via web, were agreed on 12th May 2021 at the end of the meeting.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinion on slaughter, regarding minor species (small ruminants). Experts revised the full Opinion, discussed Conclusion and Recommendations, solved comments for the pre-stunning part, and for gas stunning. In addition, experts revised the sections on pre stunning and killing in the draft version of the On-farm killing Opinion regarding small ruminants.

6. Next meeting

To be decided

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 41th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 11st May2021, Parma

(Agreed on 12/05/2021)

Participants

- Hearing Experts:
Marien Gerritzen
Mohan Raj

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 40th Working Group meetings held by web on 26th of April 2021.

The minutes of the 40th Working Group meeting held on 26th April via web, were agreed on 27th April 2021 at the end of the meeting.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinions on slaughter, regarding minor species (small ruminants). Experts were consulted on hazards and their origin during the bleeding phase (slaughter with stunning and slaughter without stunning). The experts addressed comments and revised the sections in the draft version of the document.

6. Next meeting

18-05-2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 40th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 26th April 2021, Parma

(Agreed on 27/04/2021)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde

■ Hearing Experts:

Marien Gerritzen
Mohan Raj

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 39th Working Group meetings held by web on 22nd of April 2021.

The minutes of the 39th Working Group meeting held on 22nd April via web, were agreed on 22nd April 2021 at the end of the meeting.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinions on slaughter, regarding minor species (small ruminants). Experts were consulted on hazards and their origin during the stunning phase (electrical, penetrative and non-penetrative captive bolt stunning, firearm with free projectile). The experts addressed comments and revised the sections in the draft version of the document.

6. Next meeting

11-05-2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 39th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 22nd April 2021, Parma

(Agreed on 22/04/2021)

Participants

- Working group members:
Virginie Michel
- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 38th Working Group meetings held by web on 14th April 2021.

The minutes of the 38th Working Group meeting held on 4th April 2021 via web, were agreed on 14th April 2021

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinion on slaughter and on farm killing of small ruminants. The hearing experts revised the scientific opinion and solved comments raised by WG members, especially for the pre-stunning phase.

6. Next meeting

26/04/2021.

[THIS TABLE IS FOR INTERNAL USE - REMOVE FROM THE VERSION TO BE PUBLISHED]

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 38th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 9th April 2021, Parma

(Agreed on 14/04/2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde

- Hearing Experts:
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 37th Working Group meetings held by web on 29th January 2021.

The minutes of the 37th Working Group meeting held on 29th January 2021 via web, were agreed on 1st February 2021.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinion on slaughter regarding small ruminants. Experts revised the work delivered by the external contractor of an ISA call on this topic (preparatory work about description of processes for slaughter of small ruminants), and, after discussion, integrated such work into the draft opinion. In addition, conclusions and recommendations on the pre-stunning phase were drafted.

6. Next meeting

22/04/2021.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 37th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 29th January 2021, Parma

(Agreed on 01/02/2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel

- Hearing Experts:
Marien Gerritzen
Mohan Raj

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 36th Working Group meetings held by web on 20th October 2020.

The minutes of the 36th Working Group meeting held on 20th October 2020 September via web, were agreed on 27th October 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinions on slaughter and on farm killing for other purposes than slaughter, regarding minor species (small ruminants, horses, ostriches and deer). Experts were consulted on hazards and their origin during the pre-stunning phase (arrival, unloading, lairage, handling and moving) for deer. The experts addressed comments and revised the sections in the draft version of the document.

6. Next meeting

Next meeting date to be fixed.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 36th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 20th October 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 27/10/2020)

Participants

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 35th Working Group meetings held by web on 15th October 2020.

The minutes of the 35th Working Group meeting held on 6th of October via web, were agreed on 15th October 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinions on slaughter and on farm killing for other purposes than slaughter, regarding minor species (small ruminants, horses and ostriches). Experts were consulted on hazards and their origin during the pre-stunning phase (arrival, unloading, lairage, handling and moving).

6. Next meeting

Date to be confirmed

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?9>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 35th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 6th October 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 15/10/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 34th Working Group meetings held by web on 10th September 2020.

The minutes of the 34th Working Group meeting held on 2nd of September via web, were agreed on 10th September 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinions on slaughter and on farm killing for other purposes than slaughter, regarding minor species (small ruminants, horses and ostriches). Based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, per each phase of the slaughter and killing, outcome tables are being produced listing main hazards, their origin, welfare consequences, animal-based measures and finally corrective and preventive measures.

6. Next meeting

October 20th, 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?9>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 34th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 2nd September 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 11/09/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler
Antonio Velarde
Virginie Michel

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 33rd Working Group meetings held by web on 8th-9th July 2020.

The minutes of the 33rd Working Group meeting held on 8th-9th of July via web, were agreed on 13th July 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the Opinion on "Killing of cattle for other purposes than slaughter". The experts addressed comments and revised the sections on methods for killing and the section on unacceptable methods. Working group members also discussed and revised possible conclusions and recommendations in order to finalise the document for the discussion that is planned on 23rd of September 2020 at next AHAW Panel Plenary meeting.

6. Next meeting

Next meeting date: 6th October 20 (slaughter minor species).

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 33rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 8th – 9th July 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 13/07/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler
Antonio Velarde
Virginie Michel

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 32nd Working Group meetings held by web on 22nd -26th of June 2020.

The minutes of the 32nd Working Group meeting held on 22nd-26th of June 2020 via web, were agreed on 29th June 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinion on slaughter of cattle and on killing of cattle for other purposes than slaughter.

For cattle slaughter, the experts addressed comments from the AHAW Panel in order to finalise the document for the discussion aimed to adoption that is planned in September 2020. For the draft scientific opinion on killing of cattle, experts discussed about methods for killing and the main text of the draft was reviewed with view to conclusions and recommendations.

Next meeting

2nd September 2020 via web, slaughter/killing cattle

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 32nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 22nd – 26th June 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 30/06/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Christoph Winckler (22-23-26 June 20)
 - Antonio Velarde (22-23-26 June 20)
 - Virginie Michel (22-23-26 June 20)
 - Hans Spoolder (22-23 June 20)

- Hearing Experts:
 - Mohan Raj (22-23-24-25-26 June 20)
 - Marien Gerritzen (22-23-24-25-26 June 20)

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed. Apologies were received from Hans Spoolder.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 31st Working Group meetings held by web on 28th -29th of May 2020.

The minutes of the 31st Working Group meeting held on 28th-29th of May 2020 via web, were agreed on 5th June 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinion on slaughter of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719), on killing of cattle for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00720) and the opinion on killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00718).

For the opinion on killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter, the experts addressed comments received from the AHAW Panel with view to the discussion of the Opinion during the AHAW Plenary of June 2020 where it was planned for adoption. For the opinion on slaughter of cattle, the comments received from AHAW Panel members were discussed and relevant actions were taken to respond to the comments. The opinion was submitted for in depth discussion at the Plenary meeting. For the draft scientific opinion on killing of cattle for other purposes than slaughter, experts discussed about methods for killing and the main text of the draft was reviewed.

Next meeting

8th – 9th July 2020 via web, slaughter/killing cattle

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 31st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 28th – 29th May 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 08/06/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler
Antonio Velarde
Virginie Michel

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed. Apologies were received from Hans Spoolder.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 30th Working Group meetings held by web on 4th-5th-6th-7th-8th of May 2020.

The minutes of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 4th-5th-6th-7th-8th of May 2020 via web, were agreed on 13th May 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinion on slaughter of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719), and the opinion on killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00718).

For the opinion on killing of pigs, the comments received from AHAW Panel members were discussed and relevant actions were taken to respond to the comments, especially with view to Conclusions and Recommendations. For the draft scientific opinion on slaughter of cattle, experts discussed about methods for bleeding (phase 3) and related corrective and preventive measures. The main text of the draft was reviewed.

Next meeting

22nd -23rd -24th -25th -26th 2020 via web, slaughter/killing cattle and pigs

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 30th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 4th - 5th - 6th -7th - 8th May 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 13/05/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Christoph Winckler (4 -5 -8 May)
 - Antonio Velarde (4 -5 -8 May)
 - Virginie Michel (4 -5 -8 May)
 - Hans Spoolder (4 -5 May)

- Hearing Experts:
 - Mohan Raj (4-5-6-7-8 May)
 - Marien Gerritzen (4-5-6-7-8 May)

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 29th Working Group meetings held by web on 20th-21st-22nd April 2020.

The minutes of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 20th-21st-22nd of April 2020 via web, were agreed on 30th April 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinions on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717), slaughter of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719), killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00718).

The comments about the welfare on slaughter of pigs draft Scientific Opinion received from AHAW Panel members in preparation of the AHAW Panel adoption were discussed and relevant actions were taken to respond to the comments, especially with view to Conclusions and Recommendations. Similarly, the feedback from the Panel about the on-farm killing of pigs draft Scientific Opinion were discussed in detail. For the draft scientific opinion on slaughter of cattle, experts discussed about methods for bleeding (phase 3) and reviewed the main text of the draft.

Next meeting

28th-29th May 2020 via web, slaughter/killing cattle and pigs

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 29th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 20th -21st-22nd April 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 30/04/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Christoph Winckler (20-21-22 April)
 - Antonio Velarde (20-21-22 April)
 - Virginie Michel (20-21-22 April)
 - Hans Spoolder (20 - 21 April)

- Hearing Experts:
 - Mohan Raj (20-21-22 April)
 - Marien Gerritzen (20-21-22 April)

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 28th Working Group meetings held by web on 1st April 2020.

The minutes of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 1st of April 2020 via web, were agreed on 6th April 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinions on slaughter of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719), killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00718) and on-farm killing of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00720).

For the draft on slaughter of cattle, a revision of the Interpretation of the mandate was carried and expanded with view to the development of the section on unacceptable methods (this revision will apply to all opinions on slaughter and killing). It was agreed to refer to methods and practices that lead to severe welfare consequences. Preventive and corrective measures were discussed. For the on-farm killing of cattle, main killing methods were discussed.

For the killing of pigs, the "Assessment" section of the draft was analysed and the relevant actions to address the comments were discussed in detail.

Next meeting

4th -5th -6th -7th -8th - May 2020 via web, slaughter/killing cattle and pigs

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 28th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 1st April 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 06/04/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Hans Spoolder

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 27th Working Group meetings held by web on 16th-20th March 2020.

The minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 16th -20th March 2020 in Parma, were agreed on 24th March 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinions on killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00718).

A revision of all stunning or stunning and killing methods was carried over. It was decided to merge the assessment for the two electrical methods (two steps electrical killing and head to body electrical killing) since hazards, welfare consequences and preventive and corrective measures are the same. Draft conclusions were discussed for the pig killing opinion and possible recommendations were drafted.

6. Next meeting

20th-21st-22nd April 2020 via web, slaughter/killing cattle and pigs

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 27th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 16-17-18-19-20 March 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 24 March 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel (16-17-20 March 20)
 - Antonio Velarde (16-17-20 March 20)
 - Christoph Winckler (16-17-20 March 20)
 - Hans Spoolder (16-17 March 20)

- Hearing Experts:
 - Mohan Raj (16-17-18-19-20 March 20)
 - Marien Gerritzen (16-17-18-19-20 March 20)

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 26th Working Group meetings held by web on 03rd March 2020.

The minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting held on 03rd March 2020 in Parma, were agreed on 05 March 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinions on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717), slaughter of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719), killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00718).

The comments about the welfare on slaughter of pigs draft Scientific Opinion received from AHAW Panel members in preparation of the AHAW Panel in-depth discussion were analysed and the relevant actions to address the comments were discussed in detail, especially with view to Conclusions and Recommendations.

For the draft scientific opinions on slaughter of cattle SOs and killing of pigs, information from expert opinion about hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures was reviewed. Conclusions were drafted for the pig killing opinion.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



6. Next meeting

1st April 2020 via web, pig (on-farm killing)



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 26th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference on 3th March 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 05/03/2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Christoph Winckler
Hans Spoolder

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 25th Working Group meetings held on 10-11-12 February 2020, Parma.

The minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting held on 10-11-12 February 2020 in Parma, were agreed on 3rd March 2020 via webconference.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinion on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717). Hazards were reviewed for all phases, especially for stunning methods. Conclusions and recommendations were drafted and discussed. The opinion is scheduled for in depth discussion at next AHAW Panel meeting.

6. Next meeting

16th-17th -18th-19th -20th March 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 25th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 10-11-12 February 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 03 March 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel
 - Antonio Velarde
 - Christoph Winckler (10th-11th am February 2020)
 - Hans Spoolder (11th – 12th pm February 2020)

- Hearing Experts:
 - Mohan Raj
 - Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 24th Working Group meetings held on 20-21-22-23-24 January 2020, Parma.

The minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting held on 20-21-22-23-24 January 2020 in Parma, were agreed on 29th January 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinion on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717) and cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719), killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00718).

After testing a new structure on the opinion on pig slaughter, the same structure was applied to the opinion on cattle and on the killing of pigs.

Draft conclusions for phase 1 (pre-stunning processes) were discussed for the opinion on pig slaughter.

6. Next meeting

3rd March 2020 via web

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 24th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 20-21-22-23-24 January 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 29 January 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel (20th, 21st, 24th January 2020)
Antonio Velarde (20th, 21st, 24th)
Christoph Winckler (24th)
- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj (20th - 24th)
Marien Gerritzen (20th - 24th)
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 23rd Working Group meetings held on 18 December 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting held on 18 December 2019 via web were agreed on 24th December 19³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion⁴

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinion on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717). Following the discussion with the EC services, a new structure was developed where hazards are presented together with welfare consequences under their related stunning method. This structure will be used as a reference for the future opinions within the same mandate. The same approach will be used also for the slaughter of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719). For the latter opinion, a discussion was initiated about main hazards, their origin, welfare consequences, animal-based measures and finally corrective and preventive measures for each cattle slaughter process.

6. Next meeting

10th-11th-12th February 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00718>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 23rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference on 18 December 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 24 December 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22nd Working Group meetings held on 2-3-4 December 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting held on 2 3 4 December were agreed on 18 December 19³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion⁴

The working group met to work on the scientific opinion on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717). Based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, the hazards for the bleeding phase were identified, discussed and included in the respective outcome table.

6. Next meeting

20-24 January 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 22nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 2-3-4 December 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 18 December 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st Working Group meetings held on 26 28 of November 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting held on 26 28 November via web were agreed on 2 December 19³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion⁴

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinion on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717). Based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, per each phase of the slaughter process a table is being produced listing main hazards, their origin, welfare consequences, animal-based measures and finally corrective and preventive measures. The discussion focussed on the hazards during the stunning phase.

6. Next meeting

18th December 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 21st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference on 26th and 28th November 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 2 December 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th Working Group meetings held on 18th -19th of November 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 18 19 November were presented and agreed on 26 November 19³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion⁴

EFSA-Q-2018-00717 (output 4): Slaughter of pigs. The literature search outcomes related to the identification of hazards for on-farm killing (phases: handling, restraint) were analysed and discussed with view to the structure of the opinion.

6. Next meeting

2nd -3rd -4th December 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 20TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 18th -19th November 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 26 November 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj (webconference)

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th Working Group meetings held on 4th -6th of September 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 4th November were presented and agreed on the first day of meeting, on 18 October 19³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion⁴

EFSA-Q-2018-00717 (output 4): Slaughter of pigs. The outcomes of the literature search related to the identification of hazards at slaughter (phases: arrival, unloading, lairage) were analysed and the experts discussed them with view to the structure of the opinion.

6. Next meeting

26th and 28th November 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 19TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference on 4th November 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 18 November 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde

- Hearing Experts:
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th Working Group meetings held on 16th -17th of October 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 16 17 October were agreed by written procedure on 29 October 19³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion⁴

The draft scientific opinion on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717) was initiated. Tasks were distributed among WG members and the first step of the opinion development - i.e. the identification of hazards at slaughter for the phases: arrival, unloading, lairage - was discussed at high level, mainly with view to the major differences observed for this species where animals are dealt with individually, and not in crates as for poultry and rabbits.

6. Next meeting

18th -19th November 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 18TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 16-17 October 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 29 October 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Hans Spoolder

- Hearing Experts:
Marie Bourin (webconference 16 October)
Mohan Raj
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Marie Louise Schneider
AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Working Group meetings held on 4th -6th of September 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 4th 5th 6th September were agreed on 20 September 19³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion⁴

The draft scientific opinions on rabbit slaughter and on farm killing were discussed. Conclusions and recommendations were drafted. The methodological approach for the assessment of the uncertainty of the outcomes of the Expert Knowledge Elicitation exercise on the the easiness of use of the indicators was revised. The outcomes of such assessment were incorporated in tables reporting values of sensitivity, specificity and easiness of use of the indicators of unconsciousness and death. In the next AHAW Plenary meeting the draft version of the opinion on slaughter will be presented and discussed.

6. Next meeting

4th November 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 17TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 4-6 September 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 20 September 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Hans Spoolder

■ Hearing Experts:

Marie Bourin
Mohan Raj
Lotta Berg (webconference on 4 Sept)
Julio Alvarez (webconference on 5 Sept)

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Marie Louise Schneider
AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed. Apologies were presented for Marien Gerritzen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meetings held on 3rd -4th of July 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting on poultry were agreed on 23 July 19³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion⁴

The draft scientific opinion on rabbit slaughter was discussed: information from expert opinion about hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures was reviewed. The chapter on preventive measures was compared with the produced outcome tables and drafted. The outcome tables were completed and adjusted by the experts. The corrective measures were discussed, and it was concluded that for some hazards no corrective measures can be applied; however, measures to mitigate the welfare consequences can be considered. The uncertainty assessment was elaborated for both sections i) related to the identification of the hazards and ii) related to the estimates for sensitivity and specificity of the indicators of unconsciousness and death. In the next AHAW Plenary meeting the draft version of the opinion on slaughter will be presented and discussed.

6. Next meeting

16th -17th October 2019 - Parma

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 16TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 03-05 July 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 23 July 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Hans Spoolder (on 03/07)
Antonio Velarde (on 05/07)

- Hearing Experts:
Marie Bourin
Marien Gerritzen (via Web)
Mohan Raj

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Marie Louise Schneider, Andras Szoradi (on 03/07)



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meetings held on 13th -14th of June 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting on poultry were agreed on 24th of June 2019³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion^{4,5}

For both draft Scientific opinions (SOs; poultry slaughter and killing for other purposes than slaughter) information from expert opinion about hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures was reviewed. The comments received during the AHAW Panel in-dept discussion and from the EC were analysed and the relevant actions to address the comments were discussed in detail. The WG agreed to restructure the draft SOs by including hazards and welfare consequences to the process description, and preventive/corrective measures to the hazard description. References to the definition of ABMs and measures to mitigate the welfare consequences will also be added. The WG experts assessed the uncertainty related to the identification of the hazards. Uncertainty ranges on false-positive and false-negative hazards will be added to the relevant Conclusions.

6. Next meeting

4-5-6 September 2019 - Parma - rabbit

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00715>.

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 15TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 13-14 June 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 24 June 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde

- Hearing Experts:
Lotta Berg
Marie Bourin
Marien Gerritzen
Mohan Raj

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Marie Louise Schneider, Yves Van der Stede



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meetings held on 11th -12th of June 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting on poultry were agreed on 13th of June 2019³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion^{4,5}

For both draft Scientific opinions (SOs; poultry slaughter and killing for other purposes than slaughter) information from expert opinion about hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures was reviewed. The outcome tables were completed by the experts as it was decided to group all Animal Based Measures at the end of each table. The corrective measures were discussed, and it was concluded that for some hazards no corrective measures can be applied; however, measures to mitigate the welfare consequences can be considered. The scientific opinions were entirely revised, and the comments were addressed. In the next AHAW Plenary meeting the draft version of the two opinions will be presented.

6. Next meeting

3-4-5 July 2019 - Parma - poultry

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00715>,

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 14TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 11-12 June 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 13 June 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Hans Spoolder
 - Antonio Velarde
 - Virginie Michel

- Hearing Experts:
 - Marie Bourin
 - Marien Gerritzen
 - Mohan Raj

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Marie Louise Schneider, Yves Van der Stede
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meetings held on 28th -29th of May 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 13th Working Group meetings were agreed by written procedure on 06 June 2019³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

Information from expert opinion about hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures was reviewed. The graphs showing the results of the Expert Knowledge Elicitation about sensitivity, specificity and easiness of use of the indicators for monitoring of the slaughter process were presented. The Working Group ranked the indicators of unconsciousness considering the judgements of the experts on severity, sensitivity and easiness of use. A flow chart with the ranked indicators was produced. As the easiness of use is not always in line with a high sensitivity/specificity it was decided to add the less specific/sensitive indicators that are easy to use to the flowchart to ensure practicability. This is shown by a dotted line in the graphic.

The draft opinion was reviewed by the group and comments were discussed and incorporated.

6. Next meeting

13-14 June 2019 - Parma -poultry

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00909>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 13TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 28-29 May 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 06 June 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Hans Spoolder
 - Antonio Velarde
 - Virginie Michel

- Hearing Experts:
 - Marie Bourin
 - Marien Gerritzen
 - Mohan Raj

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Marie Louise Schneider, Yves Van der Steede
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 27-28 May April 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 12nd Working Group meeting were agreed on 28 May 2019³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Slaughter and on-farm killing draft Scientific opinions on rabbits⁴

Information from bibliography and from expert opinion about hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures was reviewed. A format for presentation of results from the Expert Knowledge Elicitation exercises about sensitivity, specificity and easiness of use of the indicators for monitoring of the slaughter process was agreed.

6. Next meeting

11-12 June 2019- Parma - rabbits

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00909>

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 12TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 27-28 May 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 28 May 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Antonio Velarde
Virginie Michel

- Hearing Experts:
Lotta Berg
Marie Bourin
Marien Gerritzen
Mohan Raj

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Marie Louise Schneider, Yves Van der Steede



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 09-11 April 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 06 May 2019³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Slaughter and on-farm killing Scientific opinions on poultry^{4,5}

For both draft Scientific opinions (SOs; poultry slaughter and killing for other purposes than slaughter) information from bibliography and from expert opinion about hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures was reviewed. It was agreed that "consciousness" is a welfare consequence to be considered among the others. The outcome tables relevant to the two SOs have been discussed in details. To improve clarity, a new format for the outcome tables linking all above mentioned aspects was agreed and tables were revised accordingly.

6. Next meeting

28-29 May 2019- Parma -rabbits

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00715>.

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 11TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 09-10-11 April 2019, Monticelli (PR)

(Agreed on 06 May 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Hans Spoolder
Antonio Velarde
Virginie Michel (on 11/04)

- Hearing Experts:
Marie Bourin

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris (on 11/04), Marie Louise Schneider
AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 08-09-10 April 2019.

The minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 06 May 2019³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Slaughter and on-farm killing draft Scientific opinions on rabbits⁴

On 09-10 April, the meeting on Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE) took place in Monticelli (PR) in order to select the best indicators of unconsciousness. For such selection a survey was carried over about sensitivity, specificity and easiness of use of several indicators of unconsciousness and death (in case of slaughter without stunning). During the EKE meeting, experts discussed and refined the estimates for sensitivity, specificity and easiness of use, especially for those indicators that might vary among different phases of the slaughter process. Stunning methods for which these indicators were evaluated are: mechanical stunning (penetrative and non-penetrative captive bolt) and electrical stunning. Part of the meeting was also dedicated to the discussion about main reasons and methods for on-farm killing of rabbits.

6. Next meeting

27-28 May 2019- Parma - poultry

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00909>

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 10TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 08-09-10 April 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 06 May 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Antonio Velarde (on 08/04)
Mohan Raj
Virginie Michel

- Hearing Experts:
Julio Alvarez (on 08/04 pm)
Lotta Berg (on 08/04 via web)
Marie Bourin (on 08/04)
Marien Gerritzen

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani (on 08/04), Chiara Fabris, Marie Louise Schneider (on 08/04)



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 02 April 2019, via web-conference.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 16 April 2019³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Slaughter and on-farm killing draft Scientific opinions on Poultry^{4,5}

The first day (08/04) the WG discussion was focused on the Conclusions and Recommendations (C&Rs) section and the relevant assessment of Uncertainty. The WG agreed to work firstly on C&Rs of the Scientific Opinion (SO) on slaughter of poultry in order to agree on the format that C&Rs should have. Successively, the matrices relevant to the two SOs (poultry slaughter and killing for other purposes than slaughter) have been revised and finalised. A discussion on the uncertainty analysis was held: in accordance with the EFSA uncertainty guidance, this analysis will mainly relate to the methodology employed to retrieve information. The WG also agreed that reference to the Chapter 7.5.10 of the OIE Terrestrial code should be included in the slaughter SO.

6. Next meeting

09-10-11 April 2019- Monticelli (PR)-rabbits

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00715>,

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 9TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held on 02 April 2019 by WEB -conference

(Agreed on 16 April 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel
Hans Spoolder

- Hearing Experts:
Not Applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Chiara Fabris

- Others:
Not Applicable



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 06-07 March 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18 March 2019³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

For all the Scientific opinions (SOs) the WG is dealing with (AW of poultry at slaughter and during killing for other purposes than slaughter, AW of rabbits at slaughter and during killing for other purposes than slaughter), the discussion was focused on the Conclusions and Recommendations (C&Rs) section. It was agreed that the main outcomes of the scientific assessment are the matrices linking hazards, origins, welfare consequences, animal-based measures, and preventive and corrective actions; in addition, specific conclusions are needed to address each ToR.

It was proposed and agreed that C&Rs should be structured by phases (Phase1-prestunning, Phase2-stunning and Phase3-bleeding). The possibility of ranking the identified hazards (or the welfare consequences provoked by each hazard) in terms of severity, frequency and magnitude, to be included in the C&Rs, was also discussed; however, and it was agreed that the mandate doesn't require for it and it is not feasible due to the deadlines for the adoption of the SOs.

Specific C&Rs were drafted and discussed. It was agreed that a proposal of C&Rs will be circulated among the WG experts and discussed during next WG meeting.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health-and-welfare/wgAhaw-Welfare-at-slaughter-and-killing.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00715>,

<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00716>

<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00909>



6. Next meeting

08-09-10 April 2019 Parma -poultry

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Animal Welfare

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on slaughter and killing

Held on 6 7 March 2019

(Agreed on 18 March 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Hans Spoolder

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Virginie Michel

- **Hearing Experts:**

Marie Bourin

Marien Gerritzen

- **EFSA:**

Denise Candiani

Chiara Fabris

Rodrigo Guerrero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 5-6 March 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting were agreed on 6 March 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft approach and contents for the opinion ([EFSA-Q-2018-0909](#))

The working group met to work on the opinion on rabbit slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00909): the structure of the survey that will be launched aimed at the identification of indicators of unconsciousness was discussed. In addition, the experts discussed about the origin of the hazards for animal at slaughter and focussed on their preventive and corrective measures. These can be divided into structural and managerial changes. Also, a new structure for the opinion was agreed, where all hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures are presented in narrative chapters and supplemented by bibliographic references, when possible. The matrices, linking all above mentioned aspects, will then be the main outcomes from this project and presented in the main body of the scientific opinion.

6. Next meeting

8 9 10 April 2019 (Parma)-poultry

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Animal Welfare

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on slaughter and killing

Held on 5 6 March 2019

(Agreed on 6 March 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Hans Spoolder

Lotta Berg

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Virginie Michel

- **Hearing Experts:**

Marie Bourin

Marien Gerritzen

- **EFSA:**

Denise Candiani

Chiara Fabris

Rodrigo Guerrero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 23-25 January 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 30 January 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft approach and contents for the opinion ([EFSA-Q-2018-00715](#))

The working group met to work on the opinion on poultry slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00715); the experts discussed about the origin of the hazards for animal at slaughter and focussed on their preventive and corrective measures. These can be divided into structural and managerial changes. Also, a new structure for the opinion was agreed, where all hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures are presented in narrative chapters and supplemented by bibliographic references, when possible. The matrices, linking all above mentioned aspects, will then be the main outcomes from this project and presented in the main body of the scientific opinion.

6. Next meeting

6-7 March 2019 (Parma)-rabbits

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Animal Welfare

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on slaughter and killing

Held on 23 24 25 January 2019

(Agreed on 30 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Virginie Michel

- **Hearing Experts:**

Marie Bourin

Marien Gerritzen

- **EFSA:**

Denise Candiani

Rodrigo Guerrero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received for Lotta Berg.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5ft Working Group meeting held on 21-23 December 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 5ft Working Group meeting were agreed on 23 December 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft approach and contents for the opinion ([EFSA-Q-2018-00715](#))

The working group met to work on both the opinion on poultry slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00715); the experts discussed about the hazards during the slaughter process and, based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, identified hazards for the following phases: handling, restraint, stunning, bleeding.

6. Next meeting

5 - 6 March 2019 (Parma) - poultry

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

²

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Animal Welfare

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on slaughter and killing

Held on 21 22 23 January 2019

(Agreed on 23 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Hans Spoolder (21-22 January)

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Virginie Michel (22-23 January)

- **Hearing Experts:**

Marie Bourin

Marien Gerritzen

- **EFSA:**

Denise Candiani

Rodrigo Guerrero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received for Lotta Berg.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 11 12 December 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 20 December 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft approach and contents for the opinion ([EFSA-Q-2018-0909](#))

The working group met to work on the opinion on rabbit slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00909), a discussion was held in preparation to a survey that will be launched aimed at the identification of indicators of unconsciousness during stunning of rabbits. Also, the experts discussed about the hazards during the slaughter process and, based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, identified hazards for the following phases: handling, restraint, stunning, bleeding.

6. Next meeting

23-25 January 2019 (Parma) - poultry

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Animal Welfare

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on slaughter and killing

Held on 11 12 December 2018

(Agreed on 20 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Hans Spoolder

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Virginie Michel

- **Hearing Experts:**

Marie Bourin

Marien Gerritzen

- **EFSA:**

Alessandro Broglia

Denise Candiani

Rodrigo Guerrero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 10-11 December 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed on 11 December 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft approach and contents for the opinion; [EFSA-Q-2018-0909](#)

The working group met to continue the development of the opinion on rabbit slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00909). Based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, per each phase of the slaughter process a table is being produced listing main hazards, their origin, welfare consequences, animal-based measures and finally corrective and preventive measures. For both outputs, the table on handling and the one restraint were compiled.

6. Next meeting

21-23 January 2019 (Parma) - rabbits

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Animal Welfare

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on slaughter and killing

Held on 10 - 11 December 2018

(Agreed on 11 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Virginie Michel

- **Hearing Experts:**

Lotta Berg (10 December)

Marien Gerritzen

- **EFSA:**

Alessandro Broglia

Denise Candiani

Rodrigo Guerrero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 19 20 November 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 28 November 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft approach and contents for the opinion ([EFSA-Q-2018-00715](#))

The working group met to continue the development of the opinion on poultry slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00715). Based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, per each phase of the slaughter process a table is being produced listing main hazards, their origin, welfare consequences, animal-based measures and finally corrective and preventive measures. For both outputs, the table on handling and the one restraint were compiled.

6. Next meeting

11-12 December 2018 (Parma) - rabbits

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Animal Welfare

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on slaughter and killing

Held by WEB-conference, 19 20 November 2018

(Agreed on 28 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Hans Spoolder

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

- **Hearing Experts:**

Marie Bourin

- **EFSA:**

Denise Candiani

Rodrigo Guerrero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 23 24 October 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 05 November 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft approach and contents for the opinion (M-2018-0182; EFSA-Q-2018-00909)

The approach to develop the scientific opinion on the slaughter and killing of rabbits was drafted and agreed during this working group meeting. The draft structure and table of contents were agreed. Specific literature searches will be run to support the listing of hazards and welfare consequences during the various phases of the slaughter process. Based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, per each phase a table will be drafted listing main hazards, their origin, welfare consequences, animal-based measures and finally corrective and preventive measures. A discussion about stunning methods currently used for rabbits was held; such methods will be included in the above mentioned table and assessed.

6. Next meeting

10-12 December 2018 (Parma)

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Animal Welfare

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on slaughter of poultry

Held on 23 24 October 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 05 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

- **Hearing Experts:**

Marien Gerritzen

- **EFSA:**

Denise Candiani

Alessandro Broglia

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Draft approach and contents for the opinion ([M-2018-0182](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00715](#))

The approach to develop the scientific opinion was drafted and agreed during this first working group meeting. The draft structure and table of contents were agreed. Specific literature searches will be run to support the listing of hazards and welfare consequences during the various phases of the slaughter process. Based on literature findings and working group expert discussion, per each phase a table will be drafted listing main hazards, their origin, welfare consequences, animal-based measures and finally corrective and preventive measures. During the meeting, tables were initiated for poultry slaughter during the phase of arrival and during stunning.

5. Next meeting

10-12 December 2018 (Parma)

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 27th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SLAUGHTER AND KILLING

Held by web conference 16-17-18-19-20 March 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 24 March 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel (16-17-20 March 20)
 - Antonio Velarde (16-17-20 March 20)
 - Christoph Winckler (16-17-20 March 20)
 - Hans Spoolder (16-17 March 20)

- Hearing Experts:
 - Mohan Raj (16-17-18-19-20 March 20)
 - Marien Gerritzen (16-17-18-19-20 March 20)

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani, Cristina Rapagnà, Sara Gisella Omodeo



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcomed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 26th Working Group meetings held by web on 03rd March 2020.

The minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting held on 03rd March 2020 in Parma, were agreed on 05 March 2020.

5. Scientific topics for discussion³

The working group met in order to progress on the development of the opinions on slaughter of pigs (EFSA-Q-2018-00717), slaughter of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719), killing of pigs for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2018-00718).

The comments about the welfare on slaughter of pigs draft Scientific Opinion received from AHAW Panel members in preparation of the AHAW Panel in-depth discussion were analysed and the relevant actions to address the comments were discussed in detail, especially with view to Conclusions and Recommendations.

For the draft scientific opinions on slaughter of cattle SOs and killing of pigs, information from expert opinion about hazards, welfare consequences, preventive and corrective measures was reviewed. Conclusions were drafted for the pig killing opinion.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?8>



6. Next meeting

1st April 2020 via web, pig (on-farm killing)



[THIS TABLE IS FOR INTERNAL USE - REMOVE FROM THE VERSION TO BE PUBLISHED]

Document history

Document reference	Version 1
Prepared by	Denise Candiani
Reviewed by	
Last date modified	23. 03.2020