BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

102nd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

16 September 2024
16:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 2 October 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Mariette DUCATEZ, Alice FUSARO, Jose GONZALEZ ROJAS, Thijs KUIKEN, Christoph STAUBACH, Karl STÅHL, Calogero TERREGINO
- EFSA:
Roxane DELACOURT, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)
- ECDC:
Cyril BARBEZANGE, Olov SVARTSTRÖM, Katriina WILLGERT

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group experts discussed the draft EFSA-ECDC-EURL report 'Avian influenza overview June–September 2024', focusing mostly on the recent developments in September 2024. The additional HPAI outbreaks in poultry and captive birds in Europe were discussed in more detail, but it was agreed that the overall interpretation of the results remained the same as those discussed at the previous meeting. The Working Group experts also discussed supporting literature to be included in the report and drafted conclusions and recommendations based on the findings presented. More time was allocated to the discussions around genetic characteristics of the viruses identified and cases in humans due to avian influenza viruses. The WG experts agreed to update the data in the report up until 20 September 2024.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

101st Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

28 August 2024
14:00-16:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 6 September 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Mariette DUCATEZ, Jose GONZALEZ ROJAS, Thijs KUIKEN, Christoph STAUBACH, Karl STÅHL
- EFSA:
  Roxane DELACOURT, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)
- ECDC:
  Cyril BARBEZANGE

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group experts discussed the first draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL report 'Avian influenza overview June–September 2024' focusing mostly on the trend of HPAI virus detections in birds and mammals in Europe. It was acknowledged that there was again a rise in HPAI virus detections in colony-breeding seabirds, especially along the coastlines of Western Europe, and that most HPAI outbreaks in domestic birds were spatially related to those detections. The Working Group experts moreover discussed the results of recent retail testing of dairy products in the United States of America and the outcome of studies conducted to assess the effectiveness of different inactivation methods. It was agreed that the following meeting should be dedicated to the discussion of new data becoming available, cases of avian

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

influenza virus infection in humans and genetic characteristics of the viruses involved. The WG experts agreed to start drafting the sections on wild and domestic birds.

PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

100th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

23 August 2024
9:00-13.00
MINUTES - Agreed on 28 August 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Arjan Stegeman, Isabella Monne, Alice Fusaro, Alessio Bortolami, Claire Guinat

  Hearing experts:

  Ilaria Puglia, Iolanda Mangone, Marialuigia Caporale

- EFSA:
  Alessandro Broglia, Francesca Baldinelli

- ECDC:
  Angeliki Melidou, Theresa Enkirch, Olov SVARTSTRÖM

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The following was discussed, agreed as well as for action points:

- **Risk of mutations**:
  - A proposal for the analysis of the data received by contractor was presented by EURL experts. Aspects and limitations were summarised. More specific notes are provided in an internal document.
  - In Brief, the action is to ask a group of experts about weighs for the phenotypic categories and achieve a consensus about those.
  - Based on that, to compute the score for all the mutations, and take the top and ask the experts to confirm that ranked list.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

- The aim is to achieve a consolidated list of top mutations, which can be presented in the opinion and used to indicate in which cases specific prevention and control measures should be applied (e.g. to increase surveillance, control, investigation)
- Action point: ECDC to check their group of experts about who is available in providing weights and then EFSA to contact also AH side experts;

- **Surveillance to detect zoonotic strains**:
  - To shorten the introduction and make it more focused;
  - To provide a rationale behind number of samples to be collected and typed in the different settings and especially wild vs. domestic and importance to monitor the viral evolution, since no culling is foreseen; not every sample is suitable for sequencing; (Claire, Alessio and Arjan to check and specify this in descriptive way), the lab should specify which sample should be sequenced;
  - To make sure the text complement the table, and avoid repetition
  - To move epidemiological info about wildlife in section about wild, above in the document
  - For rodents and bats to use definition of *micromammals*, instead of *small wild mammals*
  - Action point: to go through comments and address/accept as needed.

- **Update on ECDC work on ongoing work** :
  - review of virological data in humans and link with monitoring report (linelist revision ongoing)
  - vaccination (it can be considered according to national guidelines but still scarce evidence about the latter to be able to recommend it at an EU-level)
  - Sero-epi lit review is ongoing
  - The wastewater surveillance part added and work in progress
- **Prevention, protection and preparedness measures**
  - The sections were revised, comments added
  - Action point: to go through comments and address/accept as needed
  - PH Prevention measures – upcoming meeting between ECDC and EU-OSHA colleagues for contribution

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be planned.

PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

99th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

17 July 2024
14-18h
MINUTES - Agreed on 17 July 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:Isabella MONNE, Alice Fusaro
- Hearing exerts: Iolanda Mangone, Ilaria Puglia, Marialuigia Caporale
- EFSA: Alessandro BROGLIA

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed and agreed on the categorisation of phenotypes of different AI mutations.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be planned.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

98th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

28 June 2024
14:00-18.00
MINUTES - Agreed on 3 July 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Arjan Stegeman, Isabella Monne, Alice Fusaro, Alessio Bortolami, Claire Guinat

  Hearing experts:

  Alessio Lorusso, Ilaria Puglia, Iolanda Mangone, Marialuigia Caporale, Adriano DiPasquale

- EFSA:
  Alessandro Broglia, Francesca Baldinelli, Ludovica Preite, Malin Grant

- ECDC:
  Angeliki Melidou, Theresa Enkirch, Cyril Barbezange, Katriina Willgert

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies from Olov SVARTSTRÖM and Leonidas ALEXAKIS from ECDC.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The following was discussed, agreed as well as for action points:

- Risk of mutations:

- An update was provided by the contractor about the results obtained from the sequence analysis for mutations, 1,743,261 sequences identified in 46 subtypes with spillover to mammals, 12 spreadsheets, 552 files

  - contractor and EURL to discuss to exclude clusters above 90% threshold of identity, since the focus on potential zoonotic mutations/strains; to remove the endemic influenza virus from the list (e.g. H1 and H3 for swine);

  - To define criteria to select the viruses/mutations to focus the scoring on;

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

- proposal to score at mutation level and consider also in a second step the subtype where more than one of those mutations occur.
- The proposal for output table was presented.
- Excel to be filled in by contractor and ranking by contractor/WG – need to focus on most frequent one or on certain subtypes;
- Ranking – score/weight – to assess an association between phenotype and mutation – problem is that we have too much data – only simple solution to perform association test-presence/absence of mutation linked to each phenotype;
- Initial idea to assign score to evaluate zoonotic impact per subtype – per strain, probably need to make a selection of mutations. Total mutations around 200 (so it is feasible to rank all those, but there is no weighing – frequency of co-presence of this mutation with other mutations in same virus – different scoring for impact and then combine frequency and impact scoring)
- Action point: On the ranking options: to be further discussed with contractor and biostatisticians; also to clarify how to deal with combination of mutations when linked to a specific phenotype.

- Surveillance to detect zoonotic strains:
  - To make clear the difference between sampling and sequencing
  - To use outputs from ToR1 to refine the number of sequences to be generated.
  - it was suggested to indicate a number of samples to detect dominant variants, giving specific example for some animal categories, e.g. wild mammals found dead as sporadic event, mass mortalities in wildlife, farmed mammals , pets at household;
    - discussion about enhanced testing/ sequencing if there is a significant mutation detected or if mammal-to-mammal transmission , check Wolfe et al. 2007
  - Pooling of samples can be considered for sequencing mammals samples as currently done for poultry (at least 5 animals);
  - For farmed mammals where HPAI outbreaks last for a certain time as they are not culled (e.g. mink, cattle), also sampling at different time moment is important to check any type of virus evolution/adaptation to mammals
  - Overview table:
    - Another column should be added to the overview table, about exposure to other mammals;
    - Pathognomonic term in the table to be changed to 'clinical signs' or similar
    - to emphasize the sampling when high pressure of infection
  - It was suggested that for wastewater surveillance it is important to point out the method's limitations. It was decided to add it in the corresponding section, without mentioning it in the Table.
  - Important to include a minimum requirement for sequencing;
  - Important to distinguish in the text what would be done for surveillance and what for research purposes.

- Update on ECDC work:
  - Update on work with EI on virological analyses of historical data on human cases for all subtypes
  - Update on ECDC outsourced work on the review of seroprevalence data – report by mid October
  - ECDC Informed about ECDC external expert participation – invitation to express interest sent to our OCPs/NFPs/ERLInet members – DoIs collected, 14 experts expressed interest. experts will contribute to the document by drafting certain ECDC parts and reviewing the document.
  - Action point: Angeliki to share the genetic analysis output for a rapid review and ask for suggestions on methodological issues for analyses and visualisation by end of this week. After that, the ECDC external contributors will only be able to review the text (and not methodological aspects). They can choose whether they want to be co-authored or not.

Prevention, protection and preparedness measures

- For the prevention at farm level: It was suggested to maintain the structure that separates general recommendations from the species-specific ones and to refer to the driver report when possible to avoid repetitions. Additionally, it was proposed to use a diagram to better present the preventive measure at farm level.
- to decide where backyard poultry farms will fall under the current categorisation – to keep same structure with report on drivers;
- ECDC to update PH preventive measures – on H5 vaccination will depend on whether there will be another published document to refer to
- ECDC to consider EU-OSHA involvement.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be planned.

PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

97th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

20 June 2024
14-18h
MINUTES - Agreed on 20 June 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Isabella MONNE, Alice Fusaro
- EFSA:
  Alessandro BROGLIA

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed and agreed on the categorisation of phenotypes of different AI mutations.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be planned.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

96th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

19 June 2024
16:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 11 July 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Thijs KUIKEN, Karl STÅHL, Calogero TERREGINO
- EFSA:
  Roxane DELACOURT, Sonagnon Martin GOUDJIHOUNDE, Malin GRANT, Stefania TAMPACH, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)
- ECDC:
  Leonidas ALEXAKIS

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group experts finalised their discussions on the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL report 'Avian influenza overview March–June 2024' focusing mostly on the conclusions and options for response. In particular, a new section on food safety aspects in relation to HPAI was introduced and the most recent developments of the HPAI situation in the United States of America were highlighted. Taking into account all the available information at the time of the meeting, the experts formulated several options for response in relation to the HPAI situation in dairy cattle in the United States of America, such as increasing capacities for testing of mammals in Europe and including HPAI among the differential diagnoses for unresolved and undiagnosed disease in cattle. In addition, the experts continued recommending preparedness in view of the upcoming autumn migration of wild birds in Europe and the strict implementation of biosecurity measures in poultry establishments. The

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Working Group experts agreed to review the conclusions and options for response shortly after the meeting.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

95th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

17 June 2024
16:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 11 July 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Thijs KUIKEN
- EFSA:
  Roxane DELACOURT, Malin GRANT, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group expert reviewed the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL report 'Avian influenza overview March–June 2024' and provided additional details on the HPAI situation in wild birds in Europe and worldwide. The spatiotemporal distribution of HPAI in different wild bird species as well as their migration behaviour were discussed. The expert also provided additional information on the situation in the Antarctic region and contributed to the part of the report describing the specific situation of HPAI in dairy cattle in the United States of America. The Working Group expert agreed to finalise the descriptive part of the report on wild birds until the following Working Group meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

94th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

5 June 2024
10:00-12:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 11 July 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Éric NIQUEX, Christoph STAUBACH
- EFSA:
  Roxane DELACOURT, Malin GRANT, Stefania TAMPACH, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)
- ECDC:
  Katriina WILLGERT

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group experts reviewed the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL report 'Avian influenza overview March–June 2024' and provided specific feedback on the HPAI situation in poultry and wild birds in Europe and worldwide, with a particular focus on the emerging situation in the United States of America and Asia. Attention was paid to the detection of different HPAI virus subtypes than the predominant A(H5N1) in Canada and Japan (A(H5N5)), and in Australia (A(H7N3), A(H7N8)). Reasons for the improved situation in Europe and potential risks posed from countries outside Europe were discussed. In addition, the section on mammals was further elaborated and populated with many references. The Working Group experts agreed to finalise the descriptive parts of the report until the following Working Group meeting at the end of June 2024.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

93rd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

30 May 2024
16:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 5 June 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Karl STÅHL
- EFSA:
  Roxane DELACOURT, Malin GRANT, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group expert reviewed the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL report 'Avian influenza overview March–June 2024' and provided specific feedback on the HPAI situation in poultry in Europe. The significant decrease in HPAI virus detections compared to previous years was noted as well as the dynamic development of the HPAI situation in the United States of America. Relevant epidemiological characteristics of the HPAI outbreaks in dairy cattle were discussed and relevant references provided. The Working Group expert agreed to work on the section related to poultry in Europe after the Working Group meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

92nd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

21 May 2024
9:00-13.00
MINUTES - Agreed on 23 May 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Arjan STEGEMAN, Isabella MONNE, Alice Fusaro, Alessio Bortolami
- EFSA:
  Alessandro BROGLIA, Francesca BALDINELLI, Ludovica Preite, Malin Grant
- ECDC:
  Angeliki Melidou, Katrina Willgert, Theresa Enkirch

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies from Grazina MIRINAVICIUTE and Olov SVARTSTRÖM.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed and agreed on the outline of the draft opinion and the methodology on how to address the different points (assessment protocol). In particular, it was agreed:

- For the introduction of the opinion:
  - Introduction to be drafted by EFSA and ECDC for PH-related chapters and assign ECDC experts to contribute
  - A review of AI virological data (human case detections) will be carried out by ECDC also with the involvement of EI colleagues.
  - A review of human serosurvey data could be outsourced to a contractor by ECDC (still to confirm), the work is due by end of September.
  - Regarding the review of spillover events, it will be carried out by the ENETWILD consortium by July 2024. A focus on the cattle event was proposed, some ideas

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

were shared during the meeting such as: to address cattle as a possible new reservoir, a next phase that brings new epidemiological scenarios.

- For the risk of mutations:
  - The WG experts from the EURL will carry out a preliminary work, based on the first output from the contractor, and filter for the zoonotic mutations, identifying the ones that are relevant. The aim is to generate a table containing information needed to assign a kind of zoonotic score to the mutations identified.
  - Proposals for the ranking of mutations are to keep it simple so to generate information that can guide the MSs to set up proper surveillance in the field. Possibly, scores can be assigned by WG experts together with other relevant experts indicated by EURL and ECDC (from ECDC side to contact DNCC/network experts).
- Surveillance to detect zoonotic strains:
  - The WG expert from the EURL gave a presentation on the topic, he will start drafting an initial outline of the section in the opinion. Input for the aspect of sampling strategies will be provided by other WG experts with background on epidemiology.
  - For the surveillance in public health, it will be developed by ECDC, sampling challenges will be included, ECDC colleagues will contribute to wastewater surveillance part.
- Prevention, protection and preparedness measures:
  - Biosecurity at farm level, Malin Grant will start developing the proposed points.
  - For the seasonal workers, information from the work done on ASF on this aspect could be used.
  - ECDC will focus on recommendations for specific risk groups; possible involvement of EU OSHA; the outcome of a survey launched by ECDC on implementation on PH prevention and control could be reported in this section.
  - Other measures highlighted in the draft opinion (personal protection measures, communication, awareness raising and public education and biosecurity at farm level) could be further developed. Regarding wildlife management, to consider the involvement and support by ENETWILD consortium.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be planned.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

91st Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

25 March 2024
14.00-16.00
MINUTES - Agreed on 26 March 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Arjan STEGEMAN, Isabella MONNE, Allice Fusaro, Stefano MARANGON
- EFSA:
  Alessandro BROGLIA, Francesca BALDINELLI

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies from S. Marangon

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed the methodology to address ToRs. In particular it was agreed:

- The focus will be on zoonotic avian viruses. To exclude the avian-like viruses, those adapted to swine. For a matter of time constraints, the type of analysis would require long, and the RA to be done is different than those in avian. These avian like will be just mentioned.
- A review can be done about virological and serological cases in humans of avian flu viruses, and to identify the subtypes that have priority. **Action point:** To check if ECDC has done already that. A way can be to start from those cases reported in AI monitoring report
- Most complex work will be to quantify risk of mutations.
  - Focus will be on mutation of zoonotic LPAI to zoonotic HPAI, and not all LPAI to HPAI. The latter, is already done.
  - A possible RA approach could be in 2 steps: first to conduct a LR about all mutations, there is one from 2019, we could complement with a new one to cover time frame since 2019. Once done, it is needed to analyse the avian sequences (and those jumped to mammals, excluding pigs) in databases to check if they

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

have zoonotic mutations (e.g. receptor binding, polymerase, evasion of host response, etc.). Then a descriptive epidemiology can be applied to describe frequency of zoonotic mutation in different subtypes, consider connected epidemiological data (subtypes found in which species, under which conditions, etc.) and the results can be discussed. Expertise needed is bioinformatics / biostatistician, and to provide results by mid June the latest. **Action point for all**: To check and suggest if expert are available at ECDC or FLI or Cambodia or any other group.

- Two aspects can be considered: 1- Ability of different viruses to infect humans and 2- Opportunity to jump to humans: this is linked to drivers for spread.
- To clarify whether mammal to mammal occurs, surveillance on those strains >> what kind of surveillance is able to detect mammal to mammal or zoonotic mutations.
- About "factors that influence the mutation frequency of avian influenza viruses in birds and mammals towards zoonotic virus" actually this has been already addressed in the report. **Action point:** to check with EC what else is expected. A way could be to describe these factors connected to the different subtypes.
- About the ToR b.1, on surveillance: **Action point:** to clarify with EC if to consider assays or also sampling techniques.
    - The focus should be on the surveillance to detect zoonotic mutation in birds and mammals. We could start from what is in the Regulation. A global perspective should be taken, not only EU.
    - A kind of guidance on how to conduct genomic surveillance (passive or active) to detect zoonotic mutations could be developed. Enetwild could help with this in wildlife. **Action point:** task to be outsourced to them.
    - Some aspects to be considered:
        - To consider serology to detect subclinical cases.
        - Passive surveillance should be already in place in MSs, but active is maybe only for research purpose.
        - To focus on the importance of sequencing a lot in case of mass mortality in mammals
- About ToR b.2 *the prevention, biosecurity and control measures to reduce the risk of zoonotic avian influenza:* **Action point:** to check with EC if anything else is expected than what in the report. To be discussed with ECDC.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be planned.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

90th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

20 March 2024
10:00-12:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 2 April 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Jose GONZALEZ ROJAS, Thijs KUIKEN, Éric NIQUEUX, Karl STÅHL, Christoph STAUBACH
- ECDC:
  Grazina MIRINAVIČIŪTĖ, Katriina WILLGERT
- EFSA:
  Roxane DELACOURT, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Calogero TERREGINO.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group experts reviewed the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL 'Avian influenza overview December 2023–March 2024' and compared the outputs of the second data analysis to the outputs of the first data analysis, reflecting on the most recent changes in the epidemiological situation in Europe and worldwide. Several bullet points on conclusions and options for response were discussed and agreed upon the Working Group experts. Special emphasis was put again on biosecurity, given the high number of primary outbreaks in poultry with suspected source of introduction from wild birds. The low number of HPAI virus-infected wild bird species identified to species level was noted as a follow-up action with reporting countries. The overall assessment of the Working Group experts was to continuously monitor

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

the situation, particularly in relation to the new circulating HPAI virus genotypes and the first detection of HPAI A(H5N1) in ruminants.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

89th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

15th of March 2024
09:00 -12:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 19th of March 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Arjan STEGEMAN
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA,

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01). Ludovica Preite from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/417.

Alexander FEDIAEVSKY and Beatrice GRASLAND were invited as hearing experts to discuss data information from WOAH side and from laboratory, respectively, on HPAI surveillance following vaccination.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Francesca BALDINELLI briefly updated the WG members on comments from the last Plenary, then the attention was moved on three specific topics: serological data, captive birds and modelling small scale farms. Regarding serological data, several important concepts were discussed. It was highlighted that competitive ELISA may not work for all species, a discussion on what to keep in the text and what in the Annex was carried out and an agreement was reached. The new HI and ELISA Tables were presented to the WG, merging allowed for more clarity. Also, the conclusions and recommendations were reviewed, a specific point on DIVA was added as well as one on the use of tests for direct detection of HPAI viruses, if no assay with high sensitivity and specificity are

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

available. Regarding captive birds, the WG assessed separately confined establishments and establishment of ornamental birds. It was clarified how these confined establishments are excluded from active surveillance and a specific surveillance scheme was proposed referring to the following document "EU Animal Health Law and Confined Establishments". Regarding vaccinated ornamental birds, the WG considered small and big size establishment.

Regarding surveillance to assess the level of immune response induced by vaccination, it should be clearly considered separately from the simple assessment of the correct application of the vaccine in the field (vaccine coverage), also in view of the fact that the proposed model for assessing the immune response with 40/50 blood samples in turkeys or ducks could be very demanding if applied in all vaccinated flocks.

A conclusion and recommendation for this part is needed, work is ongoing. For the backyard, it was clarified that those are excluded from current assessment due to lack of data as for the previous Opinion. The model for small scale farms was re-run, with ongoing work to report latest results in the opinion. These last results have to be added in the corresponding section of the assessment and of the conclusions and recommendations by beginning of next week.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

None.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

88th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

12 March 2024
16:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 2 April 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO
- EFSA:
  Roxane DELACOURT, Alexandros GEORGANAS, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group expert reviewed the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL 'Avian influenza overview December 2023–March 2024' and provided further input on the genetic characteristics of HPAI viruses identified in affected bird and mammal species. Specific attention was paid to the large number of newly emerged HPAI virus genotypes and the expansion of the A(H5N5) subtype in Europe and worldwide. Several key mutations were discussed and included in the report. The Working Group expert agreed to finalise the sections on genetic characteristics of the HPAI viruses involved after the Working Group meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

87th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

8th of March 2024
10:00 -12:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 19th March 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Arvo VILTROP, STEGEMAN Jan Arend;
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA.

Ludovica Preite from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/417.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

During this meeting, the WG focused on specific sections of the SO. The discussion started with the surveillance to assess the level of immune response induced by vaccination, particularly on the possibility to shift from FAO's approach to a new one or to converge the two Tables proposed. Moreover, some changes were proposed, new sentences will be added (like the timing of sampling when you expect the maximum reaction and the link between the test and the type of response) and others removed. Also, a general rewording was carried out. Then, the discussion moved to conclusion and recommendation, starting from Section 4.2. The main objective was to shorten the paragraphs, removing repetitions and reshuffling assumptions and general conclusions. For the general conclusions, it was agreed to only transmit key messages (e.g testing dead birds instead of live birds; testing dead birds in the last 48 hours; the concept of repeated sampling; reasons why not increasing the maximum number of dead birds collected). It was concluded that, for early detection the text was consolidated, so we moved on discussing the surveillance to demonstrate freedom. For this section, several parts had to be rephrased; overall, the objective was to improve the clarity of the text. The WG highlighted the importance to check the terms regions/zone and flock/establishment to ensure consistency throughout the Opinion. Regarding conclusion and recommendation for surveillance for the level of immune response, it should be completely updated based on the last changes of the corresponding section in the assessment. Also for this section,

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

we rephrased and removed bullet points and additional data were included according to a new Table (R_0).

a. Planning the activities and tasks

Conclusions and recommendations on:

Surveillance

- to review assumptions and general conclusion

Surveillance for early detection

- to review the text

Surveillance for disease freedom

- to rephrase second conclusion and related recommendation
- rephrase the first and the third conclusion and related recommendation
- to review

Surveillance for level of immune response

- to rephrase the bullets
- to review

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next WG meeting has been scheduled for 12th of March.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

86th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

7 March 2024
14:00-16:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 2 April 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Jose GONZALEZ ROJAS, Thijs KUIKEN, Éric NIQUEUX, Karl STÅHL, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:
  Katriina WILLGERT
- EFSA:
  Roxane DELACOURT, Alexandros GEORGANAS, Lisa KOHNLE (chair)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Grazina MIRINAVIČIŪTĖ.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declarations of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group experts reviewed the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL 'Avian influenza overview December 2023–March 2024', and agreed on data and methodology to be used and applied to produce the scientific report. The contents and structure of the different sections were checked and discussed by the Working Group members by thoroughly analysing the data presented in form of plots and tables. Special attention was paid to the reasons for the overall lower number of HPAI virus detections in Europe (e.g. possible immunity, difference in circulating genotypes) and the specific pattern observed for HPAI outbreaks in poultry. Discussions mostly concerned the types of poultry species and production systems affected, including information on outdoor access and control measures in place. In relation to the situation worldwide, the Working Group explicitly mentioned the spread of HPAI on mainland

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Antarctica. The different sections of the document were then integrated and consolidated. The Working Group members agreed to progress on the sections reflecting on these results after the meeting.

Annex

With regard to this meeting, Karl STÅHL declared the following interest: participation in a grant with the Swedish Research Council for Environment, Agricultural Sciences and Spatial Planning on African swine fever, and participation in an ad-hoc group in WOAH on drivers of disease emergence.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

85th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

4th March 2024
09:00 -13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 19th of March 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA,

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01). Ludovica Preite from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/417.

Alexander FEDIAEVSKY and Beatrice GRASLAND were invited as hearing experts to share/discuss data information from WOAH side and from laboratory, respectively, on HPAI surveillance following vaccination.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Francesca BALDINELLI briefly summarized the state of the work with respect to specific sections of the SO and tasks assigned. The WG members reviewed and discussed some pending questions received by the AHAW Panel, in particular on how the WG members assessed the surveillance for the level of immune response and the risk mitigation measures. For the herd immunity section, a thorough discussion was carried out on whether to keep the FAO approach or stick to the experience of France. Conclusions and recommendations will be rephrased according to the decision made. Regarding the restriction and risk mitigation measure, the emergency vaccination part was rephrased. It was agreed as well to provide some practical examples in the text to support

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

the assessment of early detection and the minimum sample size reported to demonstrate freedom from disease (Table 6). It was agreed that it is important to check on the use of Rh and Rs, be sure that the former is the reference scenario in case of passive detection, whereas Rs in case of surveillance. Regarding surveillance for vaccination effectiveness, some parts were rephrased. It is important to check if, when an infection occurs in vaccinated animals, the shift should be towards emergency vaccination surveillance or the surveillance in case of an outbreak (in restricted zone). For section 4.2, the main discussion was on the length of the introductory part, efforts to make it more concise are needed. For the general conclusions, text was rephrased, repetitions removed and the WG members agreed on the content to keep.

a. Planning the activities and tasks

The coming activities are planned for the WG experts before the Opinion will be discussed with the Panel on the 13th March:

ToR 3

1. Assessment of surveillance strategies (modelling):
    a. Add examples when needed to show practical applications
2. Assessment of diagnostic methods:
    a. Add assessment of HI and NP-ELISA
3. Finalise/revise methods, results, conclusion and recommendation on surveillance strategies
4. Revise for consistency the definition of parameters used in the methodology and assessment sections
5. To revise and improve content/text across the whole opinion and ensure consistency

ToR 4

1. Finalise/revise methods, results and conclusion and recommendation on risk mitigation measures
2. To revise and improve content/text across the whole opinion and ensure consistency

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next WG meeting has been scheduled for 7th of March.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

84th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

01 March 2024
10.00-12.30
MINUTES - Agreed on 1 March 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Arjan STEGEMAN, Isabella MONNE, Stefano MARANGON
- EFSA:
  Alessandro BROGLIA, Francesca BALDINELLI

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed the comments and changes in the report and tasks were distributed.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be planned, if needed.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

83rd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

29th February 2024
10:00 – 13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 19th March 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: EFSA, Parma

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

  Ludovica PREITE from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/417

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

During this Working Group the focus was mainly given to the following three topics: assessment of risk mitigation measures, herd immunity and vaccination efficacy. We agreed on applying some minor changes to figures 6 and 7, to make them clearer and more accurate (e.g rename the two categories of measures). Afterwards, the discussion moved to risk mitigation measures in emergency vaccination and the testing strategy was redefined. The idea of a premovement test was reviewed and the section rephrased to make clear that, during emergency vaccination, an early surveillance is already in place, leading to repetitive sampling and a laboratory examination, that is always done according to the surveillance scheme chosen. The sampling scheme proposed, also slightly changed, adding that dead birds can be collected from the 2 previous days**.** Regarding the other mitigation measures, a thorough discussion was carried out on whether to keep them in place, considering that also surveillance for early detection is applied. The conclusion reached is that, except for one (keeping animals separately in the slaughterhouse), all other measures are still considered valid. Regarding emergency preventive vaccination, the same approach of linking the testing strategies to the surveillance in place, was proposed. Then, the focus was brought to vaccine effectiveness and herd immunity. For the former, there was a consensus on the core message of the topic, further comment will come after all the experts of the WG will read the section again. For herd immunity, the title of the section was changed, a brief discussion on whether antibody response is a good correlate of protection or not was carried out and it was agreed that, prior to refining conclusions and recommendations, the section should be preferably read by all the members of the WG. Regarding freedom from disease, it was highlighted that some

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

parts need to be rephrased and that a simplification of this section is needed to make it more streamlined. To conclude, a final comment regarding the use of serology was made, in the end it was agreed to remove the relevant bullet point from the conclusion, but to keep the corresponding part in the assessment.

Planning the activities and tasks

The coming activities for the WG experts are:

- to focus on the assessment of risk mitigation measures;
- to focus on the assessment of demonstration of freedom;
- to finalise conclusions and recommendations of these two parts;

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held online on the 4th of March.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

82nd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

20th February 2024
9:00 – 13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 2nd March 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: EFSA, Parma

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO (online)
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01), Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374, Ludovica PREITE from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/417

Alexander FEDIAEVSKY and Beatrice GRASLAND were invited as hearing experts to share data information from WOAH side and from laboratory, respectively, on HPAI surveillance following vaccination.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Beatrice GRASLAND, Eleonora BASTINO and Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY joined online.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Francesca BALDINELLI briefly summarised the state of the work with respect to specific sections of the Scientific Opinion (SO) and gave a general overview of the comments received during its last revision.

Firstly, the focus was given to those questions that resulted not exhaustively answered: Sub-ToR **3.2.c**, **3.3** and **4.2** of the SO. The WG tried to address each point and reach a consensus. For the first question (duration of surveillance and type of surveillance to be applied after cessation of vaccination), a knowledge gap was highlighted and the WG referred back to Opinion part 1 to answer. To address question 3.3, regarding demonstrating freedom from disease, the experts

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

agreed on incorporating more results into the conclusions and recommendations, using data currently only presented in Tables. Regarding question 4.2, a re-discussion of the whole concept of alternatives to risk mitigation measures took place, with a specific focus on possible pre-movement testing.

Afterwards, the WG focused on a number of more general comments received. The responses included reasons as why sentinels are not considered in the surveillance approach, a readaptation of the type of surveillance to be applied in peri-vaccination zone was also provided and the concern about not having specified a minimum number of dead birds to be sampled for early detection was addressed. Then, several comments on diagnostic methods were addressed in the conclusions and recommendations and clarifications were provided regarding whether the sampling scheme in the SO was at establishment level or at epidemiological unit level. When reviewing all the conclusions and recommendations, it was suggested that it would be clearer for the reader to have each conclusion presented alongside its related recommendation.

Planning the activities and tasks

The coming activities for the WG experts are:

1. ALL to work as follows on conclusions and recommendation:

   - re-arrange conclusions and recommendations in a way that each recommendation follows the relevant conclusion
   - address pending comments from AHAW Panel → change/amend the text and give answers in the side comments
   - ensure that what is in the conclusions and recommendations is consistently described in the assessment sections

The work in point 1 has been divided amongst the sub-group previously identified:

– diagnostic methods

– surveillance for early detections

– surveillance to demonstrate freedom

– surveillance for herd immunity and vaccination effectiveness

2. Rearrangement of the sections on 'peri-vaccination zone' in both assessment and conclusions and recommendations sections; revision of the general text in conclusions and recommendations for surveillance

3. Rearrangement of the sections on 'risk mitigation measures' in both assessment and conclusions and recommendations sections

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held online on 29 February.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

81st Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

9 February 2024
13.00-17.00
MINUTES - Agreed on 12 February 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Arjan STEGEMAN, Isabella MONNE, Stefano MARANGON
- EFSA:
  Alessandro BROGLIA, Francesca BALDINELLI, Lisa KOHNLE

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed the structure of the report and tasks were distributed.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be planned.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

80th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

30 & 31 January 2024
13:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 21st February 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: EFSA, Parma

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO (online)
- EFSA: Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01), Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374, Ludovica PREITE from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/417

Alexander FEDIAEVSKY and Beatrice GRASLAND were invited as hearing experts to share data information from WOAH side and from laboratory, respectively, on HPAI surveillance following vaccination.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Beatrice GRASLAND, Eleonora BASTINO and Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY joined online.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Day 1

Francesca BALDINELLI briefly summarised the state of the work with respect to specific sections of the SO and tasks assigned, namely:.

a. ToR 3

- The new methodological approach proposed to assess surveillance strategies with objective freedom from disease to be discussed along with parameters values, preliminary

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

results (deterministic model). Based on these, conclusions and recommendations to be drafted.

- Section on surveillance to assess vaccination effectiveness (E2) to be reshaped according to comments received from the AHAW Panel.
- Table 5 has to be finalized and comments on diagnostics in both methods and assessment sections to be addressed in details.

b. ToR 4

- Restrictions and risk mitigation measures as defined by EU Regulation for emergency and preventive vaccination has been summarized in two graphs to be further supported by text in both the methods and assessment sections.

The WG members split in three different groups to discuss and work in small teams in order to finalize writing specific sections of the SO, address pending comments, complete some analysis and drafting recommendations and conclusions.

The work done was presented and discussed in plenary the following day.

Group 1: Francesca Scolamacchia, Josè Gonzales Rojas, Claire Guinat, Alessandro Broglia and Francesca Baldinelli discussed comments from the panel and drafted conclusions and recommendations for the surveillance scenarios in emergency and preventive vaccination, also finalising the models.

Group 2: Calogero Terregino, Alessio Bortolami, Timm Harder, Beatrice Grasland, Eleonora Bastino, Alexander Fediaevsky and Barbara Lanfranchi discussed and addressed main comments from the panel in particular in the assessment for diagnostic methods, and drafted conclusions and recommendations for the diagnostic methods section of the opinion.

Group 3: Ludovica Preite and Arvo Viltrop, discussed the testing strategies and biosecurity measures foreseen in the Regulations, carrying out an assessment of both. Then, a proposal suggesting alternative testing strategies was formulated, as well as a first draft of conclusions and recommendations for this section of the SO.

<u>Day 2</u>

All the WG members presented their sections to the other groups and continued to work directly on the SO together, finalising text and discussing the content of each section and went together through the conclusions and recommendations.

c. Planning the activities and tasks

The coming activities for the WG experts are:

ToR 3

1. Assessment of surveillance strategies (modelling):
    a. update tables with results for early detection and freedom from disease surveillance strategies
    b. review the methodology of assessing surveillance strategies
    c. review results, conclusions and recommendations
2. Assessment of diagnostic methods:
    a. review the methods, results and conclusions
    b. merging tables

3. Finalise/revise methods, results and conclusion and recommendations on surveillance for vaccination effectiveness and herd immunity

ToR 4

4. Finalise/revise methods, results and conclusion and suggestions on risk mitigation measures
5. To revise and improve content/text across the whole opinion and ensure consistency

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held online on 20 February 2024.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

79th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

10 January 2024
10:00 - 14:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 31st January 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Josè GONZALES, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Arjan STEGEMAN, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA, Roxane DELACOURT

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01), Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

Josè GONZALES welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed in depth the following items:

- the modelling approach and the results to assess surveillance strategies, in particular the performance indicator and the results obtained so far with respect to the surveillance strategies in an emergency protective vaccination scenario;
- modelling within-flock transmission: discussion on how the parameters used for vaccinated, partially protected and non-vaccinated flocks were retrieved and the assumptions made;
- diagnostic testing methods: text and tables for the assessment of the diagnostic methods to be used for surveillance in areas where vacciantion against HPAI has been applied have

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

been added and discussed. Collection of further data on sensitivity ans specificity of each test was ongoing;
- surveillance for assessing vaccination effectiveness for the emergency protective and herd immunity in preventive vacciantion scenarios: the methodology to be used were briefly discussed and the WG members agreed on the approach to be used.

Planning the activities and tasks

The following activities have been identified for each subgroup to progress in the data and methods and results sections of the Opinion by the 15th of January, when the Opinion will be shared with the Panel to give them a good understanding of the work done and of contents of the opinion:

1. Josè GONZALES: insert the new results tables on surveillance for early detection and work on the method section for the scenario tree modelling;
2. Claire GUINAT and Arjan STEGEMAN: draft the results on the surveillance for early detection in emergency vaccination;
3. Alessio BORTOLAMI, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO: advance on diagnostic methods (methods and assessment) as discussed (table/s and text);
4. Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA: draft on P2 (methods and assessment);
5. Alessandro BROGLIA: draft on E2 (methods and assessment);
6. Francesca BALDINELLI: clean the opinion and draft on risk mitigation measures (ToR 4);
7. Arvo VILTROP: to support/follow up/revise/integrate specifically on items 4, 5 and 6;
8. Barbara LANFRANCHI: follow up on the data collection from MSs on diagnostic methods performance (sensitivity);
9. ALL: to revise and improve content/text all across the opinion.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

30 -31 January 2024 – physical meeting, EFSA Parma; 20 February 2024 – web meeting; 4 March 2024 – web meeting

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

78th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

11 December 2023
09:00 - 13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 8th January 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Josè GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO (online)
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA,

  Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01); Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374

Alexander FEDIAEVSKY and Beatrice GRASLAND were invited as hearing experts to share data information from WOAH side and from laboratory, respectively, on HPAI surveillance following vaccination.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

Josè GONZALES ROJAS welcomed the participants. Apologies from Alexander FEDIAEVSKY.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed more in depth the following points:

- the modelling approach to assess surveillance strategies, in particular the work and progress done so far with respect to layers and ducks, the parameters that were still missing and how to retrieve them;
- surveillance scenarios: based on modelling approaches, discussion focused on how to report the definition of surveillance strategies and how to link them with the specific methodology used for assessing it, and possible alternatives. A synoptic table was rearranged and questioned whether to place it in the Data & Methodologies section or in

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

the results section (assessment); the agreement was to use the table to present the surveillance strategies in the data and methodologies;
- testing methods: the sensitivity and specificity and the performance of each diagnostic test considered used for a specific objective was discussed and further data by NRLs were requested to NRLs to be descriptively included in the opinion.

a. Planning of the activities and tasks

The following activities have been identified for each subgroup in order to progress in drafting the different sections in the opinion:

- Modelling approaches: to insert tables and results for ducks and layers (Josè GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT);
- Surveillance strategies: review and complete the text in data and methodologies (linking surveillance strategy and relative objective to the modelling approach) and draft the text based on the result tables for simulations on ducks and layers (Claire GUINAT, Arjan STEGEMAN, Arvo VILTROP, Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA)
- Testing methods: to review the text on data and methodologies (focussing on selected tests) and draft the text in the assessment (on interpretation of test result) (Timm HARDER, Alessio BORTOLAMI, Calogero TERREGINO, with the support of Beatrice GRASLAND);
- Provide comments and revise text (ALL).

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

10 January 2024 – web meeting; 30-31 January 2024 – physical meeting, EFSA Parma; 20 February 2024 – web meeting; 4 March 2024 – web meeting

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

77th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

6 December 2023
09:00-12:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 19 December 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Roxane DELACOURT, Lisa KOHNLE

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG expert reviewed the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL 'Avian influenza overview September–December 2023' and agreed on data and methodology to be used and applied to produce the scientific report. The contents and structure of the different sections were checked and discussed. Specific attention was paid to the emergence of seven new highly pathogenic avian influenza (HPAI) A(H5N1) virus genotypes, for which it remains unclear whether they emerged in Europe or were introduced from outside Europe. It was emphasised that in total 11 A(H5N1) virus genotypes were circulating in Europe during the respective reporting period. The WG expert added details on the genetic characteristic of those HPAI viruses identified and gave an overview of specific mutations of concern.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

76th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

4 December 2023
13:00-16:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 19 December 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Jose GONZALEZ ROJAS, Thijs KUIKEN, Éric NIQUEUX, Karl STÅHL, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:
  Cornelia ADLHOCH, Grazina MIRINAVIČIŪTĖ, Katriina WILLGERT
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Roxane DELACOURT, Alexandros GEORGANAS, Milen GEORGIEV, Lisa KOHNLE

Camille DELAVENNE participated as EFSA contractor OC/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/02

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the EFSA-ECDC-EURL 'Avian influenza overview September–December 2023' and agreed on data and methodology to be used and applied to produce the scientific report. The contents and structure of the different sections were checked and discussed by the WG members. Specific attention was paid to the dynamics of the highly pathogenic avian influenza (HPAI) A(H5N5) virus dynamics in northern parts of Europe and the mortality events described in common cranes during this reporting period. In addition, an update on the serological survey in fur farms in Finland was provided and respective conclusions elaborated. Outside Europe, the WG placed its focus on the severity of the situation in the Americas, with a high number of HPAI outbreaks in poultry being reported

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

in the United States of America and mass mortality events taking place in mammals in several South American countries. Specific concern was mentioned for the Antarctic region, in which HPAI viruses were detected in wild birds and southern elephant seals for the first time. The different sections of the document were then integrated and consolidated. The WG members agreed to finalise and review the complete draft after the meeting focussing particularly on conclusions and options for response. The main recommendations for this reporting period were to closely monitor mortality events in both wild birds and mammals, to step up short- and long term preparedness strategies to prevent introduction of HPAI into poultry and fur farms, and different surveillance activities in wild birds and mammals.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

75th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

8th November 2023
11:00 - 15:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 16th November 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Alessio BORTOLAMI, Josè GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN
- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
Alexander FEDIAEVSKY
- EFSA:
Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01), Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374.

Alexander FEDIAEVSKY and Beatrice GRASLAND were invited as hearing expert to share data information from WOAH side and from laboratory, respectively, on HPAI surveillance following vaccination.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

Josè GONZALES ROJAS, as Chair for the ToRs 3 & 4 of the Scientific Opinion on Vaccination against HPAI, welcomed the participants. Apologies from Beatrice GRASLAND and Eleonora BASTINO.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Discussion between WG members on how to practically address both ToR 3 and ToR 4 throughout the document, with further clarification needed on some aspects. The discussion focussed on the methods and the surveillance scenarios to be assessed.

The WG members drafted a synoptic table on surveillance strategies and the major items to be assessed in relation to their objectives in the two vaccination scenarios described in the Scientific

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Opinion on vaccination against HPAI – Part I (i.e. emergency protective and preventive vacciantion).

a. Planning the activities and tasks

The following activities have been identified for each subgroup in order to progress in drafting the different sections in the opinion at least one week ahead of the next WG meeting:

- ToRs, clarify and draft in the methodology the interpretation of some terms– (Francesca BALDINELLI)
- Work on the data and methodologies section for the assessment of surveillance strategies based on the synoptic table summarizing the elements to take into account – Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN, Beatrice GRASLAND and Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA)
- Revise the text on diagnostic test methods for virus circulation and herd immunity, prepare a summarising table – (Timm HARDER, Alessio BORTOLAMI and Calogero TERREGINO)
- Draft the data and methodologies to be used for the modelling approaches – (Josè GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Alessandro BROGLIA)
- Provide comments and revise text and the synoptic table (ALL).

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

11 December – web meeting; 30-31 January 2024 – physical meeting, EFSA Parma; 20 February 2024 – web meeting; 4 March 2024 – web meeting

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

74th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

9 October 2023
09:00 - 13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 20 October 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Experts:
Alessio BORTOLAMI, Josè GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Beatrice GRASLAND, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN

- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
Alexander FEDIAEVSKY

- EFSA:
Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01), Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374.

Beatrice GRASLAND was invited as hearing expert to support the discussion on the surveillance scenario and diagnostic tests given the ongoing France experience on HPAI vaccination; Alexander FEDIAEVSKY was invited as hearing experts to present and share data information from WOAH side on HPAI surveillance following vaccination.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair for the ToRs 3 & 4 of the Scientific Opinion on Vaccination against HPAI will be Josè GONZALES ROJAS, who welcomed the participants. Apologies from Eleonora BASTINO.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No new declarations was received at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Francesca BALDINELLI illustrated the problem formulation and assessment protocol endorsed for ToR 3 and 4, that will be used to further elaborated and discuss in details the methodology for each ToR and each subtasks. The WG experts identified the need to clarifiy some of the terms curretly present in the ToR and in the Reg (EU) with the EU Commission.

Alexander FEDIAEVSKY presented to the WG members an overview of what is forsees by WOAH as for animal health surveillance (Chapter 1.4), evaluation and monitoring of a vaccination programme (Chapter 4.18 – art 4.18.9) and the exit strategy of a vaccination programme (Chapter

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4.18 – art 4.18.10). Then, he presented the same aspects declined in case of infection with avian influenza viruses (Chapter10.4).

Alessandro BROGLIA gave an example (on Lumpy Skin Disease) on how different scenarios and elements have been assessed for different surveillance purposes in vaccinated areas.

a. Planning the activities and tasks

The following activities and subgroups have been identified in order to draft the key items in the opinion at least one week ahead of the next WG meeting:

- ToRs, ask for clarification and interpretation – (Francesca BALDINELLI)
- Overview and summary of what the EU legislation and WOAH Chapters foresee for surveillance and risk mitigation measures within restricted areas– (Barbara LANFRANCHI and Alexander FEDIAEVSKY)
- Identify surveillance scenarios for consideration in the assessment – (Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN, Beatrice GRASLAND and Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA)
- Review and collect data on existing testing methods for virus circulation and herd immunity – (Timm HARDER, Alessio BORTOLAMI and Calogero TERREGINO)
- Modelling approaches – (Josè GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Alessandro BROGLIA)
- Risk mitigation measures on EFSA Scientific Opinion on animal diseases listed as Category A in the Animal Health Law (Alessandro BROGLIA)

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

8 November (11.00-15.00) – web meeting; 14 December (tentative date) – web meeting; 30-31 January 2024 – physical meeting, location to be confirmed; end of February date to be defined – web meeting

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

73rd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

14 September 2023
15:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 4 October 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- **Working Group Members:**
  Alice FUSARO, Éric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- **ECDC:**
  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- **EFSA:**
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Lisa KOHNLE, Alessia RUSINÀ

Camille DELAVENNE participated as EFSA contractor OC/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/02

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XXVI and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The contents and structure of the different sections were checked and discussed by the WG members. A specific section was dedicated to the outbreak in fur animal farms in Finland, highlighting the different mammalian species involved (American mink, red and Arctic foxes, common raccoon dogs), wild birds as possible source of introduction, serological positivity without the occurrence of clinical signs, and genetic analyses of the samples collected. Additional cases in cats in the Republic of Korea and dogs in China were described. The different sections of the document were then integrated and consolidated. The WG members agreed to finalise and review the complete draft after the meeting focussing particularly on conclusions and options for response. The main recommendation was to increase surveillance, particularly active surveillance in wild birds and passive surveillance in wild and free-

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

roaming domestic carnivores. Biosecurity should be enhanced in fur animal farms and prompt culling of all animals present on affected farms is indicated.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

72nd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

11 September 2023
13:00-16:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 2 October 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
José L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN
- EFSA:
Francesca BALDINELLI, Lisa KOHNLE, Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XXVI and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The contents and structure of the different sections were checked and discussed by the WG members. A specific section was dedicated to the continuously evolving situation in wild birds, referring also to the spatial overlap and genetic link between outbreaks in poultry and wild birds during this reporting period. Emphasis was placed on the upcoming autumn migratory season and the differences between the British Isles and continental Europe were highlighted. The different sections of the document were then integrated and consolidated. The WG members agreed to finalise and review the complete draft after the meeting focussing particularly on conclusions and options for response. The main recommendation was to increase surveillance, particularly active surveillance in wild birds and wild bird species identification, particularly of Laridae species.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare
71st Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

1 September 2023
09:00 - 13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 18 September 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Christine MIRAS, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP, Arjan STEGEMAN

- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY

- EFSA:
Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA, Inmaculada AZNAR ASENSIO

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01), Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies from Eleonora BASTINO and Beatrice GRASLAND.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

None.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members reviewed and discussed the SO and the comments from the AHAW Panel not yet solved, in particular on how the WG members assessed points c) and d) of ToR 2 concering the type of vaccine that might be used according to species, production type and the frequency of vaccination.

It was agreed to add some text to support the practical aspects and sources of uncertainty to explain the reasons why the vaccine type per strategy/species and the frequency of vaccination were not explicitly integrated into the vaccination scenarios. Besides, general considerations and examples of which vaccines could be potentially employed were given.

a. Planning the activities and tasks

In order to share the drafted SO with the AHAW Panel experts for its adoption, the following activities for the WG experts are foreseen ahead of 8 September:

- Reviewing, improving, finalising the summary (ALL)
- Reviewing, simplify and check for redundancy all through the SO, conclusions and recommendations (ALL)

- table 4 – on antigenic distance arbitrary unit (Alessio BORTOLAMI, Calogero TERREGINO, Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA, Timm HARDER)
- check for the latest comments still pending concerning missing references (ALL)
- figure 3 – modify according to layout of the other figures in the SO (Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA)
- figure 5 – to answer to pending comments on it (Josè GONZALES)
- section 3.4.1.2 - to review the added text on consideration on vaccine type by species/age/vaccination strategy and the related conclusions in 4.2 (ALL)
- section 4.1.3 - to check bullet points of the conclusions on antigenic distance (Alessio BORTOLAMI, Calogero TERREGINO, Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA, Timm HARDER)

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

To be agreed.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

70th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

21 July 2023
14:00-16:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 3 August 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Arjan STEGEMAN
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01), Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies for absence.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

None

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The working group members focused the discussion on ToR 2, in particular on the Kernel model results for France.
The draft of first results of the kernel model and simulations of vaccination scenarios for France were debated and finalised

All figures and boxplot graphs concerning kernel results for France were revised, discussed and agreed upon by the experts.

Related conclusions and reccomendations for France were discussed and finalised; as well as a thorough revision of conclusions and discussion for finalisation of the document.

V. Any Other Business

None.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

69th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

17 July 2023
14:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 3 August 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Arjan STEGEMAN
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies for absence.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

None

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members reviewed the SO starting with ToR 2. The discussion focused on the Kernel model, in particular on parameter estimations for both Italy and the Netherlands.

Related conclusions and recommendations for IT and NL on ToR 2 were further discussed and agreed upon, as well as figures and tables to be included for clarification of model results.

The experts drafted and consolidated the conclusions and discussions as well as the results on the kernel on for both Italy and the Netherlands, and agreed to discuss Kernel results for France in the next group meeting.

V. Any Other Business

None.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

68th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

13 July 2023
14:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 3 August 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Christine MIRAS, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Beatrice GRASLAND, Arvo VILTROP
- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
  Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01), Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies for absence.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA submitted a new DoI and Timm HARDER planned to do that after the meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members reviewed the SO starting with ToR 1 and agreed on how to address pending comments.

a. ToR1

The WG members decided to add in the text a paragraph to assess which could be the desiderable characteristics of vaccines to be preferred for emergency and preventive vaccination.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Each specific section of ToR1, including all the Tables and Figures, have been thoroughly discussed and improved in plenary. Few further amendements have been agreed and assigned as Tasks to be completed by Friday 21 July 2023.

It has been agreed that it would help the policy makers to have the conclusions of the assessment and its related recommendations together in the same sections, instead of firstly listing all the conclusions and, secondly, all the recommendations in different sections of the document.

b. ToR2

A meeting to discuss the results for vaccination scenarios, conclusions and recommendations for ToR2 is planned for a small group of WG members for the 21 July 2023 in the afternoon.

c. Planning the activities and tasks

In order to share the drafted SO with the AHAW Panel experts, the following activities for the WG experts are foreseen ahead of 28 July:

ToR 1

1. Table 2 will be checked for last changes and consistency of information with those reported in Table A.1 (Alessio BORTOLAMI and Eleonora BASTINO)
2. Table 2: change the clade's name from 'classical' to 'Eurasian H5 LP or H5 HP' or 'American H5 LP or H5 HP' according to the of vaccine strains composition (Timm HARDER)
3. Updating direct acyclic graph on factors that may jeopardize a swift eradication as agreed during the meeting (Arvo VILTROP)
4. Restructure the text in Conclusions and further recommendations as agreed during the meeting (Timm HARDER and Eleonora BASTINO)
5. Complete and improve text on results and limitations of antigenic distance (Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA)
6. Replace Figure 2 with a new one as agreed during the meeting (Josè GONZALES)
7. Reviewing, improving, finalising the whole text on ToR 1 (ALL)

ToR2

1. Complete results of the kernel model and simulations of vaccination scenarios for Italy with violin graphs/boxplots (Josè GONZALES)
2. Draft first results of the kernel model and simulations of vaccination scenarios for France (Arjan STEGEMAN, Josè GONZALES and contractor)

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting for the entire WG members will be held online on 01 September 2023 (09:00-13:00).

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

67th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

5 July 2023
10:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 18 July 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, José L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Éric NIQUEUX, Karl STÅHL, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:
  Angeliki MELIDOU and Gražina MIRINAVIČIŪTĖ
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Lisa KOHNLE

Linnea LINDGREN KERO participated as EFSA contractor OC/EFSA/DATA/2021; Camille DELAVENNE participated as EFSA contractor OC/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/02

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XXV and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The contents and structure of the different sections were checked and discussed by the WG members. A specific section was dedicated to the outbreak in cats in Poland, highlighting the uncertainties involved. A couple of additional figures were requested to illustrate the changes in the situation in wild birds compared to the previous year. The different sections of the document were then integrated and consolidated. The WG members agreed to finalise and review the complete draft after the meeting focussing particularly on conclusions and options for response. The main recommendation was to increase

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

surveillance, particularly active surveillance in wild birds and passive surveillance in wild and free-roaming domestic carnivores.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

66th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

26 & 27 June 2023
14:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 17 July 2023

Location: EFSA, Parma

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS (online), Claire GUINAT, Christine MIRAS (online), Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Beatrice GRASLAND, Arvo VILTROP (chair)
- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
  Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY (online)
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO (online)
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA (online)

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01); Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Christine MIRAS, Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY, Eleonora BASTINO and Alessandro BROGLIA, joined online. No apologies for absence.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration(s) of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

The experts were informed about the extension up to September for finalising the Scientific Opinion (SO) on ToR1 and ToR2. Accordingly, a new working plan and deadlines have been defined for each task to be completed on time.

The WG experts were infomed on the outocme of the presentation and discussion of the SO at the Animal Health and Animal Welfare (AHAW) Panel meeting of the Panel, where no major comments were received.

The objective of the 2-days meeting was to review the SO and identify what is still missing and should be addressed in the next weeks.

a. ToR1

SLR:

The section on the SLR is completed and need only some rewording.

The WG members discussed and reviewed thouroghly the section on the available vaccines and the content of the tables included in the text or in the Annex. It was concluded to improve the readibility of the information included in Table A.1; to harmonize the names of the vaccines in tables and text; to improve the description of the available vaccines characteristics making clear what is indicated by the manufacturer and what is found in the studies screened in literature review.

Antigenic distance:

The section and information on antigenic distance will be revised in order to stress the relative importance of this parameter for the selection of the most suitable vaccine to use. New vaccine strains sequence became available and will be added to the analysis. A plot of the results of the model to estimate antigenic distance for the selected vaccine will be prepared to help visualizing and compare the range of the values and the differences between groups of vaccines.

Vaccine efficacy:

New data from challenge experiments conducted by EURL became available and will be included in the SO and the analysis. The WG members discussed which parameters (e.g. virus shedding, animal susceptibility), and relative uncertainty, retrieved from challenge and transmsission studies will be summarized in Tables and graphs.

It was agreed to delete Table 5, because showing antigenic distance against different field virus than H5N1 consensus sequence and it's not informative for the current SO.

Other aspects that might influence vaccine efficacy to be included in the assessment are: duration of immunity and content of antigen in the vaccine.

Aspects that may jeopardize a swift eradication:

The text on the type of vaccines and aspects that may jeopardize the swift eradication of AI was read in plenary in it was decided to add a column in Table 8 with some explanation on how to address the factor identified.

Conclusions and reccomendations:

The WG members decided to add a new section titled 'Practical considerations and limitations', where the results of the assessment will be commented to provide risk managers with information useful to make decisions while taking into consideration the uncertainty and risks.

The main items to be listed in the Conclusions and Reccomendations section for Tor1 have been discussed. It has been decided that for each specific section (technology, vaccine efficacy, jeopardizing aspects and antigenic matching) a very short text will be supplied.

b. ToR2

The WG members discussed on the definition of the farm density areas in relation to transmission parameter R_h and other assumptions of the model used for simulating the vaccination scenarios for The Netherlands and Italy.

Also for ToR 2, after the assessment it was agreed to draft a 'Practical considerations and limitations' section.

c. Planning the activities and tasks

In order to share the drafted SO with the AHAW Panel experts, the EC and the MSs who provided the data on 28 July, the following activities for the WG experts are foreseen:

ToR 1

1. Checking for completeness the overview of vaccine numbers gave in table 1 (Alessio BORTOLAMI)
2. Including new Chinese strains sequences in the antigenic matching analysis; drawing a plot on the results to show the range of antigenic distance for type of vaccine (Alessio BORTOLAMI, Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA)
3. Preparing a table with the results on vaccine efficacy indicators to be published in the Annex (Barbara LANFRANCHI)
4. Restructuring the text on VE as discussed during the meeting (Arjan STEGEMAN,Josè GONZALES)
5. Working on factors that may jeopardise a swift eradication (Table 8) (Timm HARDER)
6. Updating direct acyclic graph on factors that may jeopardize a swift eradication (Arvo VILTROP)
7. Working on the new section 'Practical consideration and limitation', where the results will be commented with practical examples and implications for MSs and EC (ALL)
8. Reviewing, improving, finalising the whole text on ToR 1 (ALL)

ToR2

9. Finalizing data on poultry population and HPAI epidemics in France to be analized in the vaccination scenarios and share it with the contractor (Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA)
10. Fitting kernel model for French and Italian data (Josè GONZALES and contractor)
11. Prepare a map on the poultry population in EU by poultry species (EFSA)
12. Elaborating a graph to visualize results for the vaccination scenarios and output of the kernel model for each country considered (EFSA)
13. Drafting the text on the results of kernel model (Claire GUINAT, Arjan STEGEMAN,Josè GONZALES)
14. Finalising the section 'General considerations and practical aspects on vaccination scenarios', where conslusions and limitation are discussed with practical implications for risk managers (ALL)
15. Reviewing, improving, finalising the whole text on ToR 2 (ALL)

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held online on 17 July 2023 (14-18 pm), web, to finalise conclusions and suggestions.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

NO CONFLICT: With regard to this meeting, Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA and Timm HARDER declared the following interest: starting the activities of an EU funded Horizon research project on avian influenza. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[3] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[4], and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

65th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

5 June 2023
11:00-15:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 9 June 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Alessio BORTOLAMI
- EFSA:
Francesca BALDINELLI

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The participants were welcomed.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The expert discussed the information from Table 2 (renamed as Table A.1) and the criteria to be applied to select those to be reported (in table and text format) into Section 3.2 of the opinion. The expert worked on extracting this information and describing them in the text; also a final checking of what was already reported in tables and text in Section 3.2 was done.

V. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held online on 26-27 June.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

64th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

26 May 2023
10:00-14:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 9 June 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Beatrice GRASLAND, Claire GUINAT, Timm Harder (10.00-12.30), Christine MIRAS, Calogero TERREGINO, Jan Arend STEGEMAN, Arvo VILTROP (chair)
- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
  Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO
- EFSA:
  Ima AZNAR, Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01); Barbara LANFRANCHI from RANDSTAD participated under the contract CP/IHUF2060/374

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest, related to the issues discussed in this meeting, were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Francesca BALDINELLI gave on overview of the state of the work of specific sections of the SO in terms of results, aspect to finalise considering that the draft SO will be shared with the AHAW experts on 13 June. WG members presented in turn the progress towards the tasks assigned (e.g. data extraction, analyses, writing SO).

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

a. ToR 1

- Most of the work on this ToR has been done. In some sections text need to be restructured and improved. An overview on available vaccines is given in three Tables and a more narrative discussion is provided in the text
- A plenary discussion followed on how to describe the vaccines available selected by being either commercialized, authorized or tested/in the pipeline in EU and possibly the experiences with those vaccines
- Results on antigenic distance were illustrated and discussed, in order to find a possible threshold that can be considered enough to have an HI level sufficient to protect, similarly to what is done for seasonal flu in humans. The limitations of this method was discussed as well and it was agree to make clear in the text that the antigenic distance works better for inactivated vaccines than for live or vectorized ones. Variation within and between the clade(s) might be useful for the correct interpretation
- Vaccine efficacy: data from 11 transmission studies have been summarized, presented and discussed in order to decide the best parameter(s) to be presented in the SO. It was agreed that susceptibility will be provided in the SO, which is not prone to distorsions like the others (shedding, mortality, susceptibility-shedding)

b. ToR 2

- Vaccination scenarios: A plenary discussion was held on the assumptions of the kernel (between farm spread) and the interpretation. It has been decided that a qualitative assessment of the emergency suppressive vaccination will be given in the SO. The geographical zone to implement the vaccination, either emergency protective or preventive, will be match with the extention of restricted zones (3 and 10 km). Of the possible vaccination scenarios, at least two, one preventive and one emergency, with the same characteristics (species, timing, geographical zone) will be considered and tested for all the three countries
- Italy provided data for the last two HPAI H5N1 epidemic seasons. France provided the data for 2 outbreaks seasons and the poultry reference population, but clarifications are needed before using them

c. Planning the activities and tasks

A complete draft should be ready by 13 June, with the only exception to that being the outcome of the kernel for France. The activities foreseen for the WG experts are:

<u>ToR 1</u>

1. Eleonora BASTINO, Claire GUINAT, Alessio BORTOLAMI will finalise the summary of the tables on H5 and H7 vaccines
2. Calogero TERREGINO and Timm HARDER will follow up the text on ToR 1
3. Calogero Terregino will summarize the Italian experience with vaccination against AI in the past
4. Beatrice GRASLAND will provide data on relevant transmission and challenge experiments from France
5. Alessio BORTOLAMI will provide data from relevant challenge experiments from EURL AI & ND. Add clade of vaccine seed strain in Table 2

6. Alessio BORTOLAMI and Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA will review and finalise section on antigenic match and genetic distance, with graphical integration to support results as necessary
7. Josè GONZALES, with the support of Barbara LANFRANCHI for data preparation will look after the section on vaccine efficacy
8. Arvo VILTROP will add the DAG and relative text in support to the aspects that may jeopardise a swift eradication
9. ALL will review and improve text on ToR 1

ToR 2

10. Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA will carry on data cleaning for France while waiting for clarification from data provider (liaising with Claire for farm locations and size)
11. Josè GONZALES and External Contractor will generate outputs for NL according to changes agreed and will parametrize the kernel for IT
12. Arjan STEGEMAN will draft the limitation of the kernel and the results obtained for the NL
13. ALL: review, improve, finalise text on ToR 2

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next meetings will be held on 26 – 27 June, in Parma.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

63rd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

8 May 2023
10:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 26 May 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Eric NIQUEUX, Karl STAHL, Christoph STAUBACH
- ECDC:
  Cornelia ADLHOCH and Grazina MIRINAVICIUTE
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Lisa KOHLNE

Linnea LINDGREN KERO participated as EFSA contractor OC/EFSA/DATA/2021; Camille DELAVENNE participated as EFSA contractor OC/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/02

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XXIV and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The contents and structure of the different sections were checked and discussed by the WG members. The different sections of the document were integrated and consolidated. The WG members agreed to finalise and review the complete draft after the meeting focussing particularly on conclusions and options for response.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

62nd Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

24 April 2023
10:00-14:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 28 April 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The participants were welcomed.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The experts discussed and progressed in the work in relation to the section on vaccine efficacy in the data and methodology and in the assessment parts. In addition, the experts worked on the whole opinion reviewing and improving the text in the different sections.

V. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held online on 26 May.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

61st Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

21 April 2023
09:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 28 April 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Christine MIRAS, Calogero TERREGINO, Beatrice GRASLAND, Arvo VILTROP (chair)
- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
  Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Linnea LINDGREN KERO

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01)

Linnea LINDGREN KERO participated under the contract OC/EFSA/DATA/2021.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Timm HARDER and Stefano MARANGON, who could not join the meeting.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest, related to the issues discussed in this meeting, were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Francesca BALDINELLI gave on overview of the state of the work of specific sections of the SO. Working group members presented in turn the progress towards the tasks assigned (e.g. data extraction, analyses, writing SO).

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

a. ToR 1

- Table 2 data synthesis: Alessio BORTOLAMI presented a recap on the status of data extraction from the original papers. All data have been extracted. Only data about vaccine efficacy parameters are still missing. Next steps will be to:
  - Clean Table 2
  - provide in the text a summary of the main findings of Table 2
  - finalise data extraction to fill in the last columns of Table 2
- Data on genetic distance: more sequence for vaccines seed strains will be added in order to test and validate the model
- Vaccine efficacy: data from 11 transmission studies have been already extracted, models will be run again with data from Sitaras et al paper (2016) [new treshold for HI level was set], in order to update preliminary results already discussed during the previous meeting. Data from transmission and/or challenge esperimental studies done in France, Italy and The Netherlands, and those from papers collected through SLR will be extracted and used to summarize secondary vaccine efficacy parameters.
- Table 3: aspects that may jeopardize a swift eradication of the virus in the vaccinated area have been translated into a causal diagram (dagitty model), discussed and Table 3 reviewed.

b. ToR 2

- Claire GUINAT gave an update on the section on vaccination scenarios, which were only partially defined for the countries chosen as example to be used for testing vaccination strategies
- The status of the data, including autorisation from Competent Authorities, to be used in the mathematical model to assess effectiveness of vaccination and surveillance strategies was discussed.

The WG members discussed and worked in 2 small teams in order to review and finalize writing specific sections of the SO, data extraction and creating summary tables.

The work done was presented and discussed in plenary. Table 2 was discussed and cleaned. WG members decided to have two tables in the SO summarizing the main characteristics and data limitation of the available vaccines identified from the literature review. The full details extracted from the papers of the SLR and reported in Table 2, will be archived and shared via Zenodo.

The WG members continued to work individually directly on the SO text and tables.

c. Planning the activities and tasks

The coming activities for the WG experts are:

<u>ToR 1</u>

1. Alessio BORTOLAMI: to clean and finalise Table 2 within a week from the meeting
2. Claire GUINAT and Eleonora BASTINO will summarise Table 2 in the SO, describing in short paragraphs each variable reported in the table

3. EFSA will work on data extraction from papers on challenge experiments for evaluating secondary vaccine efficacy parameters. The data model was illustrated and discussed during the meeting
4. Josè GONZALES and Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA will write results on vaccine efficacy
5. Alessio BORTOLAMI and Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA will continue working on antigenic match and genetic distance: testing and validating the model with more vaccine seed strains (included H2 vaccine and strains very different from the currently circulating H5N1) and with homologous sequences
6. ALL: review and finalize table 3
7. ALL: review, improve and finalize the SO towards ToR 1

ToR 2

8. EFSA will trigger the official answer to share and use the AI data from The Netherlands, Italy and France.
9. Josè GONZALES will describe epidemiological situation for AI in the Netherlands to define vaccination scenarios
10. As soon as received, Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA will prepare and clean the data before sharing those for the kernel model
11. ALL: improve the text for the vaccination scenarios

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next meetings will be held online on 26 May and physically in Parma on 26 – 27 June.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

60th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

15 & 16 March 2023
09:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 4 April 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: EFSA, Parma

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Christine MIRAS, Timm HARDER, Calogero TERREGINO, Beatrice GRASLAND, Arvo VILTROP (chair)
- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
  Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY
- European Medicines Agency (EMA):
  Eleonora BASTINO
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01).

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Beatrice GRASLAND and Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY joined online. Apologies from Stefano MARANGON, who could not join the meeting neither in presence or online.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. Jose GONZALES ROJAS declared orally that he will submit a new DOI, after receiving a new institutional research funding on avian influenza.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Participants presented in turn the state of the work of specific sections of the SO and tasks assigned (e.g. data extraction, analyses).

a. ToR 1

- EMA and WOAH network consultation additional data: Eleonora Bastino gave a follow up on the outcome and the interest from industries on EMA survey. Discussion followed on how to contact countries and/or pharma companies and ask for availability on sharing data

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

on experiences on the use of vaccines on HPAI in the field (transmission experimental data, serological surveillance/monitoring data and antibodies levels after vaccination).

- Table 2 data synthesis: Alessio Bortolami and Claire Guinat presented a recap on the status of data extraction from the original papers collected through the LR on available vaccines and how Table 2 was populated accordingly. Further steps will be:
    - to finalise the data extraction;
    - to extract data and fill in fields about vaccine efficacy parameters;
    - to summarize in a descriptive way the data in the text of the SO;

  The Table will be provided with full details in Zenodo.
- Data on genetic distance: Francesca Scolamacchia presented the results on the predicted antigenic distance based on genetic difference for which a full paragraph on methodology used was drafted in the SO. The group is still waiting to retrieve sequence of the vaccines seed strains to validate the model. It has been decided that, for those vaccine for which the entire sequence of the seed strain is missing, that vaccine will not be evaluated with the model, which does not perform properly in those situations. This will be explicitly mentioned in the SO. As a proof of concept the model will be tested with homologous sequence and sequence of H2 vaccine or very different vaccines.
- Data from transmission studies: Josè Gonzales presented the data extracted so far from literaure that will be used for vaccine efficacy evaluation and model updates. By the end of this meeting, data extraction will be finalized and models run in order to have some preliminary results to discuss.

b. ToR 2

- Claire Guinat gave an update on the section on vaccination scenarios, focussing on specific epidemiological situation, poultry population and environmental factors for Italy, The Netherlands and France, as countries chosen as example to be used for testing vaccination strategies. A discussion followed on how the results from kernel model could be interpreted.
- Members of the WG decided to add a paragraph on small holder farms/backyard farms and how HPAI vaccination could be implemented in this productive category.
- The section 'Types of vaccines and aspects that may jeopardize a swift eradication of the virus in the vaccinated area' was structured into a table by vaccine technology.

The WG members discussed and worked in small teams in order to finalize writing specific sections of the SO, data extraction and some analysis and creating summary tables.

The work done was presented and discussed in plenary. The WG members continued to work directly on the SO text and discussed the content of the tables.

A discussion followed on how to interpret the vaccination strategies foreseen under the Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2023/361 of 28 November 2022. Given the uncertainty, the WG members agreed to ask for clarification to EU Commission about the definition and application (with practical examples) of the different vaccination strategies that is emergency suppressive, emergency protective and preventive vaccination.

c. Planning the activities and tasks

The coming activities for the WG experts are:

ToR 1

1. To continue revising the different sections of the SO and answer/solve the comments made by the Panel by the end of March.

2. Table 2:
    a. to contact countries/companies not previously contacted to finalise the data collection
    b. to continue data extraction for fields on challenge experiments; EFSA will seek for further support for data extraction; Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA and Jose GONZALES ROJAS will provide indications on which data have to be extracted

3. Antigenic and genetic distance: to carry out model validation with more vaccine seed strains (included H2 vaccine) and homologous sequences

4. Vaccine efficacy: tabulate data on transmission experiments based on different antibodies level

ToR 2

5. To describe the epidemiological situation and risk factors for the countries chosen for evaluating vaccination strategies by applying a transmission kernel model.
6. To arrange a call to clarify which data are needed to feed the kernel model

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held online on 21 April 2023.

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

59th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

7 March 2023
12:00-14:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 24 March 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Eric NIQUEUX, Stefano MARANGON, Christoph STAUBACH
- ECDC:
  Cornelia ADLHOCH and Grazina MIRINAVICIUTE
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Linnea LINDGREN KERO participated as EFSA contractor OC/EFSA/DATA/2021.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Calogero TERREGINO.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed and agreed on the contents of the main sections on HPAI virus detections in birds, mammals and humans. The different sections of the document were integrated and consolidated. The report will be circulated again among the WG experts after the meeting to finalise the drafted the sections on conclusions and options for response.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

58th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

3 March 2023
10:00-12:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 24 March 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Eric NIQUEUX, Stefano MARANGON, Christoph STAUBACH
- ECDC:
  Cornelia ADLHOCH and Grazina MIRINAVICIUTE
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Alessandro BROGLIA

Camille DELAVENNE and Linnea LINDGREN KERO participated as EFSA contractors OC/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/02 and OC/EFSA/DATA/2021, respectively.

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Calogero TERREGINO.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XXIII and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The WG was informed on the request received from the European Commission to issue the AI report as soon as possible, ahead of end of March as originally planned. The timelines to anticipate the production and publication of the report were discussed and agreed within the WG. The increased detections of HPAI virus in gulls, the recent detections in mammals in and outside Europe and the genetic evolution of the virus (EURL) were extensively discussed. ECDC presented data regarding human cases of avian influenza. The structure of the report was adapted to allow reporting and focussing the text on these recent findings that were discussed (HPAI virus detections in animals, mammals and humans). The contents and data of the different sections were checked and discussed.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

V. Next meeting

The next meeting was scheduled on 7 March.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal health and Welfare

57th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

17 February 2023
09:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 3 March 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Stefano MARANGON, Christine MIRAS, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP (chair)
- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
  Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01).

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Beatrice GRASLAND, Timm HARDER and Eleonora BASTINO.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. ToR 1

- Alessio Bortolami and Claire Guinat presented a recap on the status of data extraction from the original papers collected through the literature review on available vaccines and how Table 2 was populated accordingly. Further help is need to complete data extraction on vaccine name/seed and challenge virus.
- Table 2 with full details and data will be provided in Zenodo as Excel file. More discussion followed on which fields about vaccine efficacy parameters and antigenic distance could be added.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

- Following the approach proposed by Peeters (2017)[3], the results on the predicted antigenic distance based on genetic difference between currently available vaccines and a consensus sequence of the H5Nx viruses circulating during the 2022-23 flu season, have been presented. A discussion followed on how to interpret the results, the possible limitations, if other indicators (e.g. sequence homology) could be added to evaluate antigenic matching, and how to validate the predictive linear model. EURL AI will provide more data on antigenic distance and the limitation of the model will be explicitly mentioned in the SO.
- The WG experts rapidly examined Table 1 and the changes/amendments made on it.
- Josè Gonzales presented the vaccine efficacy indicators: susceptibility (% of challenged individuals that escaped infection), shedding (relative values against a control) and mortality or survival (challenged individuals that got infected). An extraction table was presented containing already data from some of the challenge/transmission papers, that will be used to build a multivariable model and derive which parameter(s) will affect the reduction in transmission (R_0<1).
- EFSA requested to assess available data on poultry vaccines against HPAI under study (experimental challenges and trials).

b. ToR 2

- The WG experts further discussed the section on vaccination scenarios, focussing on specific epidemiological situation, poultry population and environmental factors to be accounted for when assessing the best vaccination strategies as well as vaccination area(s). The figure to summarize the steps to choose the most suitable vaccination strategy, based on the risk factors and policy priorities, will be completed once each scenario will be tested with the kernel model.
- EFSA requested to assess available data on poultry population and HPAI outbreak data that will be used into a mathematical model to assess effectiveness of vaccination and surveillance strategies

c. Planning the activities and tasks

The coming activities for the WG experts are:

ToR 1

1. To revise Table 1 and related text
2. To draft the text on available vaccines, their antigenic matching with current circulating virus strain and their efficacy
3. To continue data extraction and to populate Table 2; EFSA will seek for further support for data extraction
4. To validate the predictive model on antigenic distance with experimental data
5. To continue extract data from transmission studies in order to run the model on factors affecting vaccine efficacy based on reduction of shedding
6. To structure into a table by technology the section '*Types of vaccines and aspects that may jeopardize a swift eradication of the virus in the vaccinated area*'
7. To follow up on the outcome and the interest from industries on EMA survey
8. To contribute with data (according to table 2) from WOAH stakeholders/Network
9. To follow up on available results from OFFLU Avian Influenza Matching (AIM) pilot project on antigenic characterisation using cartography

[3] Peeters B, Reemers S, Dortmans J, de Vries E, de Jong M, van de Zande S, Rottier PJM, de Haan CAM. Genetic versus antigenic differences among highly pathogenic H5N1 avian influenza A viruses: Consequences for vaccine strain selection. Virology. 2017 Mar;503:83-93. doi: 10.1016/j.virol.2017.01.012. Epub 2017 Jan 28. PMID: 28135661.

ToR 2

10. To identify the vaccination scenarios to be tested with the kernel model

V. Any Other Business

The WG experts were informed about changes in EFSA rules on expert indemnity for meeting from January 2023 (https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Experts_compensation_guide.pdf).

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 15-16 March.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
Animal Health and Welfare

56th Working Group meeting on Avian Influenza

24 January 2023
10:00-14:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 1 February 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Stefano MARANGON, Christine MIRAS, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP (chair)
- Hearing Experts[1]:
Beatrice GRASLAND
- European Medicine Agency (EMA):
Eleonora BASTINO
- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):
Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY
- EFSA:
Francesca BALDINELLI

Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. EOI/EFSA/SCIENCE/2020/01).

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. ToR 1

- Alessio Bortolami presented a recap on the actual list of vaccines and original papers collected through a literature review, how it was cleaned with respect to the original list, and info to be added in order for example to assess cross protection. A discussion followed

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

whether the list should include or not only papers about vaccine of the currently circulating AI virus strain. Data to be extracted was further discussed

- The WG experts examine rapidly Table 1 and decided that it does not need further amendments
- Table 2: it has been discussed whether to place the Table with full details and data in an Appendix or Zenodo and to report the info collected in a simpler Table accompanied by a description in a narrative way in the text of the SO. Some fields will be moved from Table 2 to Table 1, or merged with info provided in Table 1. More discussion on which info has to be used to fill each field followed. As an example, WG experts tried to fill each field in Table 2 with info available in the product information and EPAR of an authorized vaccine. Information collected from stakeholders within the network of the WG Experts will be useful to complement missing elements in Table 2
- Josè Gonzales presented how to derive a good indicator of vaccine efficacy (reduction in transmission quantified by R0<1) from challenge experiments and which data to extract. Some literature have been already collected and data extraction is ongoing
- A discussion was initiated on the more appropriate method, given data availability and time constraints, to derive antigenic matching. It was agreed to follow the approach proposed by Peeters (2017)[4] which is based on genetic distance and meanwhile to look for data/info on antigenic distance if available from other sources.

b. ToR 2

- The WG experts briefly discussed the vaccination scenarios drafted based on the strategies provided by the EU Regulation (emergency suppressive and protective and preventive vaccination) and considering policy priorities and several operational factors (e.g. species and production systems, timing of vaccination and vaccination zone sizes). It was briefly approached how to define them and the way to present those in the opinion.

c. Planning the activities and tasks

The coming activities for the WG experts are:

<u>ToR 1</u>

- To start filling in Table 2
- To extract data on genetic distance and to estimate antigenic distance
- To follow up on data on antigenic distance that might be available from other sources
- To liase with the WG to update on the status of the EMA survey
- To contribute with data from stakeholders/network different from the ones that will be contacted by EMA
- To define the structure of ToR 1 (identify the different sections)
- To further look at Table 1 and start drafting the sections in the text of SO related to that Table
- To extract data from transmission studies to estimate vaccine efficacy based on reduction of shedding (data extraction+R code)

<u>ToR 2</u>

- To integrate comments received on the vaccination scenarios draft and discuss it in a short meeting

[4] Peeters B, Reemers S, Dortmans J, de Vries E, de Jong M, van de Zande S, Rottier PJM, de Haan CAM. Genetic versus antigenic differences among highly pathogenic H5N1 avian influenza A viruses: Consequences for vaccine strain selection. Virology. 2017 Mar;503:83-93. doi: 10.1016/j.virol.2017.01.012. Epub 2017 Jan 28. PMID: 28135661.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The dates of the next working group meetings have been scheduled for 2023 according to the availabilities of the members of this WG. Five meetings are foreseen: 3 web conference on 17 February, 21 April, 26 May and one physical meeting on 15-16 March (location to be confirmed, the EFSA Officer will check the availability of a suitable location as suggested by the WG experts).

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 55th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INFLUENZA: VACCINATION AGAINST HPAI

Held on VIDEO -conference, 12 December 2022

(Agreed on 22 December 2022)[1]

Participants

- Working Group Members:[2]

  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Stefano MARANGON, Christine MIRAS, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP (chair)

- Hearing Experts[3]:

  Beatrice GRASLAND, Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA

- European Medicine Agency (EMA):

  Eleonora BASTINO

- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):

  Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY

- EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health):

  Francesca BALDINELLI

[1] Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.
[2] Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.
[3] As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

Arvo Viltrop declared orally that he submitted a new DOI, after receiving a new research funding on avian influenza.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The EFSA Officer briefly reported the clarifications obtained by EU Commission concerning the interpretation of some aspects of TOR1. A discussion on the development on the draft protocol followed.

4.1. Protocol for the assessment[4]

- TOR1: the WG experts decided to assess those vaccines that have been licensed, used in the field or those in a late stage of development. As an example for the table to summarize all the parameters/aspects to be considered in the assessment of the available vaccines against HPAI, WG experts propose to refer to some examples set up for Covid-19 vaccine.
- TOR2: the WG experts discussed about the possible vaccination strategies to effectively reduce the spread of the disease (emergency protective and preventive vaccination) and whether or not an emergency suppressive vaccination strategy can be realistic for HPAI. No strategy will be discarded at this stage, but all the strategies will be first reviewed through the application of the kernel/spatial model to some scenarios. Josè Gonzales provide some general information about the kernel model and the data needed to implement it (e.g. reference population data on farms active in the area where the epidemic affected the poultry sector, geographical coordinates, the active farms during the course of the epidemic). It was agreed to check for data availability and any permission needed. The WG experts will identify different vaccination scenarios to be tested, but they will not be listed in the Protocol.
- TOR 3: The interpretation of this TOR was discussed within the group. Following the same principles used in TOR 2, several surveillance approaches to be used after vaccination implementation will be defined and their suitability assessed by the same spread model.
- TOR 4: The interpretation of this TOR was discussed within the group. Discussion on the movement restrictions and granting derogations followed, in particular on the length of restrictions application with respect to vaccination coverage and outbreaks identification. The WG experts identified some aspects of TOR 4 to be clarified with the EC.
- Josè Gonzales presented the results of the systematic literature review on challenges and transmission studies with HPAI vaccines performed within another EFSA project (disease profile). Discussion followed on parameters used in the papers to assess vaccine efficacy; on how to update the list of papers on this topic and, briefly, on the structure of a data extraction table.

[4]: EFSA-Q-2022-00551 (https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health)

4.2. Planning the activities

The EFSA Officer presented a tentative Gantt chart showing the deadlines for TOR 1 & 2 until July2023, to be agreed with the participants. The coming activities for the WG experts are:

a) to finalise the protocol of this Mandate by 22 December
b) to review and integrate the lists of available vaccines by 22 December
c) to update and integrate the list of papers related to transmission studies to be considered for TOR 1 and 2 by 26 December
d) to finalize the structure of table 1 and table 2 by the 26 December
e) to define the minimum dataset related to the reference poultry population in order to feed the kernel model by 16 January
f) to start drafting the vaccination scenarios including the ones provided by the EU Regulation and others considered relevant by the next meeting in January

b) for EFSA to liase with the EC to clarify the definition of the recovery period for HPAI following emergency protective vaccination as laid down in the Regulation by the 22 December

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

The dates of the next working group meetings will be scheduled for 2023 according to the availabilities of the members of this WG. Five meetings are foreseen, 4 web meetings and one physical meeting that will be held in Parma.

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

BIOHAW UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 54th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 7 December 2022

(Agreed on 16 December 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Thijs KUIKEN, Josè L GONZALES, Stefano MARANGON, Christoph STAUBACH,
- AUSVET:
  Camille DELAVENNE
- ECDC:
  Cornelia ALDLHOCH
- EFSA:
  Francesca BALDINELLI, Linnea LINDGREN KERO

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Calogero Terregino.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2,] EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed and agreed on the contents of the main sections The 'captive birds' was extensively discussed and it was decided to specify in the report that within the 'captive birds' category also wild birds kept in captivity might be included. The WG experts agreed in replacing the 'epidemic season' with the terms 'epidemiological year' as with these terms the whole year is meant. The WG experts commented on the main findings of this report period: the observed decreasing trend of virus detections in sea birds and the increasing trend of virus detections in waterfowl; the increased number of poultry outbreaks mainly due to virus incursions from the wild bird reservoir; the PCR positive results in the human case from Spain. Also the experts discussed about the reported A(H5N1) outbreaks in Americas, particularly from Perù and Venezuela. The EURL gave an overview of the genotypes of the virus currently circulating in Europe. ECDC gave an update on the situation in humans followed by a brief discussion on passive versus active surveillance in people in contact with HPAI. The different sections of the document were integrated and consolidated. Some plots/table will be updated and the report will be circulated again among the WG experts to finalise the drafted the sections on analysis of avian influenza spread and on observations and conclusions and options for response.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
3 This designation is without prejudice to positions on status and is in line with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 and the International Court of Justice Opinion on the Kosovo Declaration of Independence

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 53rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INFLUENZA: VACCINATION AGAINST HPAI

Held on VIDEO -conference, 5 December 2022

(Agreed on 21 December2022)[1]

Participants

- Working Group Members:[2]
  Jose GONZALES ROJAS

- EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health):
  Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The participant was welcomed. No apologies were received. The chair invited everyone to introduce themself in around the table.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[3] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[4], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the

[1] Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.
[2] Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The list of papers, the data extracted and the main outcome of the systematic literature search on HPAI conducted under another EFSA project (disease profile) was discussed to present it to the WG experts at the upcoming WG meeting foreseen on 12 December.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meeting is scheduled on 12 December (10.00-14.00).

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

BIOHAW UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 52nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA: MONITORING

Held on VIDEO -conference, 28 November 2022

(Agreed on 16 December 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members: Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Christoph STAUBACH
- AUSVET: Camille DELAVENNE
- ECDC: Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA, BIOHAW Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Linnea LINDGREN KERO

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2,] EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XXII and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The WG discussed the definition of the 'captive birds' category (not currently based on the size of the farm). Thereafter, the WG discussed the HPAI detections in poultry and wild birds reported during the autumn. The outbreaks are concentrated along the coast of the North Sea in France, Belgium, The Netherlands and Germany showing a different pattern compared to the same period the last year. There was a discussion regarding the terminology 'epidemiological season' and it was proposed and agreed to replace it with 'epidemiological year' which correctly reflects the time period from October to September of the yar after. The EURL presented the results of the genetic analysis of currently circulating viruses with particular attention to the results of virus detected in humans and in the mink farm. ECDC presented data regarding human cases of avian influenza. The contents and data of the different sections were checked and discussed. The WG members agreed to complete the current draft looking after the sections assigned to them. The updated figures, plots and finalised text will be presented and discussed in the next WG meeting (7 December 2022).

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 51st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INFLUENZA: VACCINATION AGAINST HPAI

Held on VIDEO -conference, 15 November 2022

(Agreed on 25 November2022)[1]

Participants

- Working Group Members:[2]

  Alessio BORTOLAMI, Jose GONZALES ROJAS, Claire GUINAT, Timm HARDER, Stefano MARANGON, Christine MIRAS, Calogero TERREGINO, Arvo VILTROP (chair)

- Hearing Experts[3]:

  Beatrice GRASLAND, Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA

- European Medicine Agency (EMA):

  Eleonora BASTINO

- World Organisation for Animal Health (WOAH):

  Alexandre FEDIAEVSKY

- EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health):

  Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

[1] Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.
[2] Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.
[3] As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received. The chair invited everyone to introduce themself in around the table.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[4] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[5], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The EFSA Officer briefly presented how EFSA works, its remit and the working procedures. Eleonora Bastino, Alessio Bortolami, Beatrice Grasland and Josè Gonzales presented on past and ongoing work on HPAI vaccination at EMA, EURL, ANSES, WUR.

4.1. Protocol for the assessment[6]

The WG experts discussed the interpretation of the Terms of Reference (TOR) and the problem formulation of the first two TOR.

- TOR1: The WG experts discussed on how to interpret the 'available vaccines against HPAI' mentioned in the text of the mandate, that have to be assessed in the scientific opinion. It was proposed to scrutinize all vaccines that have a full commercial authorization and those at a late experimental stage, without a specific geographical scope, and then to possibly narrow the list down. The sources to find out about the vaccines and technologies available to be considered were discussed (literature, online platforms, possible ad hoc data collection). Also, the WG agreed to set up a table to summarize all the parameter/aspects to be considered or assessed about the available vaccines against HPAI. Some possible aspects related to the use of different types of vaccines that may jeopardize a swift eradication of the virus in the vaccinated area were briefly mentioned to be further elaborated at the time of drafting the Scientific Opinion (SO).
- TOR2: The interpretation of this TOR was discussed within the group; it was anticipated that a quantitative approach will be used to assess vaccination strategies: a kernel model/spatial model of HPAI virus transmission between poultry farms procured via an EFSA external contract. The model might be applied to simulate different scenarios identified by the WG experts and applied on the main poultry species: domestic ducks, turkey and chickens (the level of details of data needed will be clarified and discussed at the next meeting).
- TOR 3 and 4 were only briefly discussed and their interpretation will be further discussed in the next meeting in December

The WG experts identified some aspects to be clarified with the EC.

4.2. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The coming activities for the WG to be implemented by 5 December are:

[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[5] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[6] : EFSA-Q-2022-00551 (https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health)

a) to improve and finalise the draft of the protocol of this Mandate to be presented in the next AHAW plenary meeting on 14-15 December

b) to work on the draft SO to structure it and to work on the structure of table 1

b) for EFSA to liase with the EC to clarify some aspects related to TOR 1 and 2

5. Any Other Business

Technical issues related to use of the EFSA credentials to access the working documents were raised by the WG experts; EFSA will look for solutions after the meeting.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meeting is scheduled on 12 December (10.00-14.00).

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

BIOHAW UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 50th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 15 September 2022

(Agreed on 6 October 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Thijs KUIKEN, Josè L GONZALES, Stefano MARANGON, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- AUSVET:

  Camille DELAVENNE
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ALDLHOCH
- EFSA:

  Francesca BALDINELLI, Linnea KERO

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2,] EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed and agreed on the contents of the main sections. The persistence of HPAI virus along the summer months in colony-breeding sea birds and its implication in term of risk of further virus spread within wild birds populations and to poultry was extensively discussed during the meeting. The EURL gave an overview of the genotypes of the virus currently circulating in Europe. In relation to the HPAI cases in wild mammals, it was decided to order in table 2 the case notified by clade and species order. The different sections of the document were integrated and consolidated. Some plots/table will be updated and the report will be circulated again among the WG experts to finalise the drafted the sections on analysis of avian influenza spread and on observations and conclusions and options for response.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
3 This designation is without prejudice to positions on status and is in line with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 and the International Court of Justice Opinion on the Kosovo Declaration of Independence

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

BIOHAW UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 49th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 29 August 2022

(Agreed on 16 September 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members: Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH
- AUSVET: Camille DELAVENNE
- ECDC: Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA, BIOHAW Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Kateryna CHUZHAKINA

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XXI and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The WG discussed the HPAI detections in poultry and wild birds reported across the summer-time. Un unprecedent persistence of HPAI virus over the summer was observed in wild birds and in poultry when compared to previous years. The virus reached sea bird species that breed in colonies causing severe mortality; for this reason, it was decided to add these birds as an additional wild bird category (definition and complete list of species included will be given in the report). Also, it was observed that in wild bird a third peak of detection characterised the summer period. For the first time HPAI virus was detected in Svalbard islands. The EURL presented the results of the genetic analysis of currently circulating viruses. The contents and data of the different sections were checked and discussed. The WG members agreed to complete the current draft looking after the sections assigned to them. The updated figures, plots and finalised text will be presented and discussed in the next WG meeting (15 September 2022).

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

BIOHAW UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 48th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 16 June 2022

(Agreed on 5 July 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- AUSVET:

  Camille Delavenne
- ECDC:

  Grazina MIRINAVICIUTE
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the contents of the main sections and agreed. The possible role of the wild birds during the reporting period March-June 2022 was discussed (particularly the shift of HPAI detections from waterfowl to raptors and other species), as well as the epidemiological situation in poultry in France in relation not the main three clusters in west, central west and south-west. Correctness of some plots was discussed and during the meeting those plots were already amended by the contractor. For figure 4, the WG decided to keep the three epidemic seasons in separate plots to increase readability and to show those where the bird populations are displayed in different colours. As one H7N7 notification from March 2021 was not confirmed by the AI-ND EURL due to the very low viral load and the lack of other samples to repeat the analysis, it was decided to remove it from the data presented. Figure 6 on surveillance streams leading to the outbreak detection was removed from the current report (further development of the future will be discussed for the next report in September 2022). The results of the genetic analysis of HPAI H5N8 detected in Kosovo[3] and Albania were discussed; the EURL also gave an overview of the genetic types that are currently circulating in Europe. In relation to the HPAI cases in wild mammals, it was decided to report in table 2 the case officially notified in WOAH WAHIS for Canada, USA and Japan instead of using media news website. Those mammals case should be the not reported in the maps in section 4.5. The different sections of the document were integrated and consolidated. As soon as data, plots and tables will be updated the report will be circulated again among the WG experts to finalise the drafted the sections on analysis of avian influenza spread and on observations and conclusions and options for response.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
3 This designation is without prejudice to positions on status and is in line with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 and the International Court of Justice Opinion on the Kosovo Declaration of Independence

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

BIOHAW UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 47th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 30 May 2022

(Agreed on 17 June 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members: Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH
- AUSVET: Camille DELAVENNE, Celine FAVERJON
- ECDC: Cornelia ADLHOCH, Grazina MIRINAVICIUTE
- EFSA, ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Linnea LINDGREN KERO

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XX and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The new plots and maps format proposed by AUSVET were discussed and suggestions were made to improve readability and to adapt to the current reporting period: figure 4 – it was proposed to use different colour for the different bird population and to also produce the same figure only on wild birds; figure 6 – the WG discussed the key message of this figure and wanted to take the decision if to include it or not in the report at the second WG meeting when looking at the updated figure. The discussion focussed on the current 2021-2022 epidemic season, on its geographical extent (wider spread compared to the previous epidemic season) and on the prolonged HPAI detections in wild birds (epidemic still ongoing) and on how this prolong the risk of HPAI incursion into the poultry population.

The WG discussed the wild bird detections in Iceland and in raptors in north Norway querying if they might be a consequence of an increased sensitivity in the surveillance/monitoring system or not, EFSA will check with the affected MSs. The contents and data of the different sections were checked and discussed. The WG members agreed to complete the current draft looking after the sections assigned to them. The updated figures, plots and finalised text will be presented and discussed in the next WG meeting (16 June 2022).

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

BIOHAW UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 46th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 16 March 2022

(Agreed on 30 March 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH, Grazina MIRINAVICIUTE
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eleonora CHINCHIO, Ludovico LOMBARDO

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the contents of the main sections and agreed to keep the document updated with data on HPAI detections occurred up to 15 March. The content of the sections on the scientific analysis of avian influenza spread from non-EU/EEA countries and within the EU/EEA (4.6), on observations and conclusions (2) and options for response (3) were integrated and consolidated. As soon as data, plots and tables will be updated the report will be circulated again among the WG experts to finalise the drafted the sections on analysis of avian influenza spread and on observations and conclusions and options for response.

BIOHAW UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 45th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 9 March 2022

(Agreed on 30 March 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH

- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eleonora CHINCHIO

5. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

6. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

7. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[3] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[4], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

8. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XIX and agreed on data and methodology to be applied to produce the scientific report. The contents and data of the different sections were checked and discussed. Further analysis of the data were discussed and agreed to be presented in the next WG meeting.

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 44th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 2 March 2022

(Agreed on 24 March 2022)

Participants

- Working Group:

  Gabriel GARGALLO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO, Jonas WALDENSTROM
- AUSVET:

  Celine FAVERJON, Camille DELAVENNE
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Inma AZNAR, Francesca BALDINELLI, Lisa KOHNLE

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The topic of the discussion was the EFSA list of HPAI target species for passive surveillance in the EU. This list was published in 2017 and EFSA aims to update this list according to the current epidemiological situation in relation to HPAI in the EU and had a contract in place on this topic with AUSVET. AUSVET was invited to the meeting and presented to the WG experts the outcome of the procurement. The discussion focussed on the method used to conduct the analysis and on the outcome of the analysis. The WG experts expressed their view on how to improve the analysis and to reduce the identified bias. It was proposed to conduct the analysis at species level (not a genus level) and on selected area for which more data are available (EBP and surveillance data). EFSA will explore the way forward to conduct further analysis on the data and inform the experts.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 43rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 9 December 2021

(Agreed on 20 December 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eleonora CHINCHIO

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the contents of the main sections and agreed to keep the document updated with data on HPAI detections occurred up to 8 December. The content of the sections on the scientific analysis of avian influenza spread from non-EU/EEA countries and within the EU/EEA (4.6), on observations and conclusions (2) and options for response (3) were consolidated. As soon as data, plots and tables will be updated the report will be circulated again among the WG experts to finalise the drafted the sections analysis of avian influenza spread and on observations and conclusions and options for response.

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 42nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 2 December 2021

(Agreed on 20 December 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eleonora CHINCHIO

5. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

6. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

7. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[3] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[4], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

8. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XVIII. The contents and data of the different sections where checked and discussed. Further analysis of the data were discussed and agreed to be presented in the next WG meeting.

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 41st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 15 September 2021

(Agreed on 23 September 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eleonora CHINCHIO

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the contents of the main sections and agreed to keep the document updated with data on HPAI detections occurred up to 15 September. The content of the sections on the scientific analysis of avian influenza spread from non-EU/EEA countries and within the EU/EEA (4.6), on observations and conclusions (2) and options for response (3) were consolidated. As soon as data, plots and tables will be updated the report will be circulated again among the WG experts to finalise the drafted the sections analysis of avian influenza spread and on observations and conclusions and options for response.

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 40th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 3 September 2021

(Agreed on 23 September 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eleonora CHINCHIO

5. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

6. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

7. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[3] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[4], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

8. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XVII. The contents and data of the different sections where checked and discussed. Further analysis of the data were discussed and agreed to be presented in the next WG meeting.

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 39th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 26 May 2021

(Agreed on 11 June 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eliana LIMA

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed and finalised the drafted the sections on conclusion and options for response.

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 38th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 11 May 2021

(Agreed on 11 June 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO

- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH

- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eliana LIMA

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

5. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

6. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

7. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[3] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[4], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

8. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XVI. The contents and data of the different sections where checked and discussed.

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 37th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 23 February 2021

(Agreed on 2 March 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eliana LIMA

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed and finalised the drafted the sections on conclusion and options for response.

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 36th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 16 February 2021

(Agreed on 2 March 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO

- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH

- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Eliana LIMA

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

5. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

6. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

7. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[3] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[4], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

8. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XV. A comparison between the monthly distribution of HPAI detections in this epidemic season and that occurred in 2016-2017 was made to support any conclusion on the possible length of the risk period for this season. The situation in France, with the duck sector being heavily affected was extensively discussed; particular attention was given to presence/absence of clinical signs to make conclusion whether mortality could be suggested as a good indicator to early detect the virus if present. Mass mortality events in wild birds were reported by the experts with the aim to describe them in the report (red knot). It was agreed to report information for UK in the section covering countries reporting via ADNS, integrating ADNS data with data from OIE WAHIS. The group discussed and reviewed the extent of analysis usually performed with the GISAID data and agreed on the level of detail to be published. The information available on the human cases from Russia was discussed as well as the source of the information. It was agreed to end the reporting period for this report on 23 February. The group felt the need to re-discuss the conclusions and options for response of the report after the update of the data on 23 February.

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 35th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 1 December 2020

(Agreed on 18 December 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè L GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XIV. I section 4.1, the WG agreed to present geographical data separately in different maps for i) the epidemic seasons 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020 and 2020-2021 and ii) for October and November 2016 and 2020 to allow comparison of the geographical evolution of the two epidemics. Also, epicurves in this section will report data from October 2019 onward only. In section 4.2, individual map for HPAI detections in domesticated animals and wild birds will be provided. In section 4.5, different elements will be taken into account when further analysing the current situation, e.g. detection of HPAI virus in apparently healthy wild birds via active surveillance, detection of HPAI outbreaks in high biosecurity poultry farms, the relevance of enhancing high level of biosecurity measures, similarities and difference with the 2016-2017 epidemic. The different sections of the document will be aligned to report data from the same reporting period. As the avian influenza situation is rapidly evolving in Europe, the WG agreed to update the report with data up to 7 December 2020. The WG will finalise drafting the sections on conclusion, suggestion and on the scientific analysis of avian influenza spread from non-EU/EEA countries and within the EU/EEA by end of the week (4 December), and will then review the text by 8 December. Publication is foreseen by 11 December 2020.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 34th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

Held on 27 November 2020, web meeting

(Agreed on 6 December 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Nicola FERRE'; Matteo MAZZUCATO; Stefano MARANGON; Paolo MULATTI
- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI
- Hearing Experts[1]:
  BFSA: Aleksandra MITEVA; Anna Zdravkova; Daniel PAVLOV

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The meeting was dedicated to the second part of the GIS training, whose first part was administered in the previous meeting on 29 October 2020. The training was dedicated on the usage of QGIS to support the outbreak data management. The subjects presented and discussed included:

- management of the outbreak layer
- spatial analysis: buffer (for defining restriction areas, such as protection and surveillance areas)
- selection of farms in the restriction areas
- data presentation (map layouts)

Practical exercises were proposed to the BFSA participants, to assess the level of understanding of the activities and operations presented.

Next meeting

A follow-up meeting has been proposed for 2021, focussing on the adopted changes in the Bulgarian Livestock Registry (Vet-IS) and related GIS aspects.

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 33rd MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 18 November 2020

(Agreed on 1 December 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Josè GONZALES, Thijs KUIKEN, Stefano MARANGON, Eric NIQUEUX, Krzystof SMIETANKA, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Inmaculada AZNAR, Francesca BALDINELLI, Yves VAN DER STEDE

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XIII. The structure of the document was adapted to better address the risk of HPAI virus introduction and of further spread within the EU/EEA and UK. Information available on the most affected wild birds species reported to the ADNS in relation to the migratory flyways, boundaries of the populations as well as on real time observations in Europe were shared among the experts. Information available on the genetic characterisation of H5N8, H5N5 and H5N1 detected in Europe were also presented and discussed. The experts drafted the section on conclusions and options for response and each expert had assigned specific text and sections to finalise according to their expertise. Timeline for finalising the document and getting the approval by ECDC, EURL and EFSA were agreed. Publication was confirmed on Friday 20 November.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 32nd MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

Held on 29 October 2020, web meeting

(Agreed on 24 November 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:

  Nicola FERRE'; Matteo MAZZUCATO; Stefano MARANGON; Paolo MULATTI
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI
- Hearing Experts[1]:BFSA

  Aleksandra MITEVA; Anna Zdravkova; Toncho VACHEV; Milena GYONOVA, Samuil PAUNOV, Daniel DENEV, Daniel PAVLOV;

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The first part of the meeting was dedicated to the analysis of poultry holding data quality. In order to prepare the work, an updated list of poultry holdings in Bulgaria extracted from VetIS was provided by colleagues at BFSA. EURL analysed the quality of geographical data on poultry holding locations as a first step to identify suitable methodologies to improve their precision. During the meeting, the completeness and spatial accuracy of geo-data were presented and discussed. Excel and GIS functionalities to perform the data quality analysis, were briefly presented.

The second part of the meeting was dedicated to a GIS tutorial to map the poultry holdings. To prepare the meeting, the Bulgarian colleagues were invited to install the QGIS software and guidelines shared. During the session the following topics were presented:

- types of GIS software features and characteristics;
- QGIS overview and graphical user interface;
- shape file structure and usage;
- how to use geographical data and importing excel data with coordinates;
- how to use the plugins and the 'QGIS Map Services'.

Some practical exercises with QGIS were also performed by the Bulgarian colleagues.

5. Next meeting

Next meeting to continue the GIS training was planned and agreed on 27 November 2020.

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Minutes of the 31st meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

(AI workshop)

TELE-conference, 30th September 2020

(Agreed on 15th October 2020)[1]

Participants

Bedriova	Marta	NIQUEUX	Éric
BESSI	OLIVIA	PERDIKARIS	SOKRATIS
Brouwer	Adam	Piret	Marjorie
Brugger	Brigitte	Prelipcean	Flavius
Bruhn	Silke	Prommik	Helen
Carvalho	Renata	Rosado Martín	Pedro
Cohen	Iulia	RUOCCO	LUIGI
Dahl Nielsen	Pernille	Savić	Vladimir
Gagliazzo	Laura	Scanlan	Hana
García Villacieros	Elena	Sjurseth	Siri
Garza Cuartero	Laura	Śmietanka	Krzysztof
Gonzales	Jose	Spierenburg	Marcel
Grant	Malin	Stahl	Karl
GRIGALIUNIENE	VILIJA	Staubach	Christoph
Harder	Timm	Stegeman	Arjan
Hari	Aleksandra	Tammiranta	Niina
Helyes	Georgina	Tuupanen	Tiia
Hjulsager	Charlotte	Užule	Māra
Huneau	Adeline	Wallo	Richard
Jaarma	Kärt	White	Eithne
Kozak	Edyta	Wodak	Eveline
KRASIAS	GEORGIOS	Zecchin	Bianca
Lozano	Jose Maria	Gargallo	Gabriel
Miškić	Tihana	Paunov	Samuil

[1] Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

- EFSA:
  - ALPHA: Inma Aznar (Co-chair), Yves van der Stede (Chair), Elisabeth Dorbek-Kolin, Francesca Baldinelli, Gabriele Zancanaro
  - DATA: Anca Stoicescu, Alexandra Papanikolau

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants and went through the technical and practical aspects of the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Avian Influenza: approach under the AHL

Pedro Rosado Martín from European Commission presented to the participants the regulatory aspects of Avian Influenza under Animal Health Law. The topics touched during the presentation were general legal framework and AI surveillance.

4.2. HPAI A(H5Nx) viruses in Europe in 2019-2020: genetic perspective

Bianca Zecchin from EURL presented the genetic perspective of highly pathogenic avian influenza viruses. HPAI A(H5) outbreaks and their viral characteristics during season 2019-2020 were discussed in more detail.

4.3. First results for 2019 AI surveillance report

Inma Aznar from EFSA (ALPHA) presented the first results for the AI surveillance report for 2019. The overview of the 2019 serological results and sampling carried out by reporting country for poultry

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

were presented. Sampling overview for wild birds was presented based on the surveillance stream and reporting country.

4.4. Avian influenza outbreaks in the EU (EFSA scientific reports)

Francesca Baldinelli (ALPHA) from EFSA presented the EFSA, ECDC and IZSVe joint scientific reports of monitoring of Avian influenza outbreaks in the EU (published quarterly). The HPAI situation in European birds during the last three seasons was presented.

4.5. HPAI H5N8 in Poland in 2019/20

Krzysztof Śmietanka from National Reference Laboratory for AI/ND, NVRI Pulawy, Poland presented the epidemiological situation of avian influenza in his country during the ongoing season of 2019-2020.

4.6. Highly pathogenic avian influenza epidemic in Hungary in 2020

Georgina Helyes from National Disease Control Centre of Hungary presented the epidemiological situation of avian influenza in her country during the ongoing season of 2019-2020.

4.7. HPAI in Bulgaria, national experience

Aleksandra Miteva from Bulgarian Food Safety Agency presented the epidemiological situation of avian influenza in her country during the ongoing season of 2019-2020. First, she gave an overview of the poultry sector in Bulgaria in general and then moved on to the HPAI H5 outbreaks in 2020.

4.8. Feedback on the 2019 AI data collection

Anca Stoicescu from EFSA (DATA) presented the feedback on data collection of 2019.

4.9. SIGMA update: the ASF data collection

Gabriele Zancanaro from EFSA (ALPHA) provided an update on the SIGMA project with ASF data collection as an example.

4.10. Supporting avian influenza surveillance through the generation and visualization of data on the migratory routes of wild bird

Gabriel Gargallo from Catalan Ornithological Institute/EBCC spoke about the role of EBP (EuroBirdPortal) and EURING (The European Union for Bird Ringing) datasets as part of avian influenza surveillance.

4.11. Wrap-up

Elisabeth Dorbek-Kolin from EFSA (ALPHA) presented the results of the online questionnaire introduced by Inma Aznar during her presentation. Inma Aznar from EFSA (ALPHA) thanked the presenters and participants of the meeting and gave concluding remarks of the workshop.

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 30th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 7 September 2020

(Agreed on 27 September 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Thijs KUIKEN, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XII. Given the evolution of the situation outside the EU and the detection of HPAI A(H5) cases in poultry and in a wild bird of unknown species in Russia, the WG decided to describe in the report also those findings and any other that would have occurred in Russia and in geographically close areas outside the reporting period. This was deemed necessary due to the increased risk of HPAI introduction via infected wild birds migrating from those areas in the EU. Also, the EURL will contact colleagues in Russia to collect more information on the virus type, the species of the affected wild birds and any others available information to better characterise the risk of HPAI introduction in the EU. The WG experts reviewed the drafted sections on conclusions (main observations and conclusions), and suggestions. Publication is foreseen by end of September 2020.

5. Next meeting(s)

Next WG meeting planned for the AI report XIII (reporting period 16 August – 15 November 2020) on 1 December (9.00-13.00).

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 29th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

Held on 01 July 2020, web meeting

(Agreed on 10 July 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Nicola FERRE'
  Matteo MAZZUCATO
  Stefano MARANGON
  Paolo MULATTI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Aleksandra MITEVA
  Toncho VACHEV

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG continued the discussion on the different sections and the related data fields of the Bulgarian registry of animals (Vet-IS), with a view to enhance the data collection on poultry holdings in the context of avian influenza outbreaks and epidemics. The data fields related to the collection of information on repopulation, animal health status, movements, links with other holdings were reviewed and possible enhancements were proposed and discussed. A first analysis of the quality of a sample of GIS data extracted from VetIS, assessed with data downloaded from EUROSTAT, was presented and discussed.

5. Next meeting

October 2020, date to be confirmed

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 28th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

Held on 12 June 2020, web meeting

(Agreed on 2 July 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Nicola FERRE'
  Matteo MAZZUCATO
  Stefano MARANGON
  Paolo MULATTI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Aleksandra MITEVA
  Toncho VACHEV

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG continued the discussion on the different sections and the related data fields of the Bulgarian registry of animals (Vet-IS), with a view to enhance the data collection on poultry in the context of avian influenza outbreaks and epidemics. The data fields related to the collection of information on the holdings, holding owner, type of holdings and poultry production data were reviewed and possible enhancements were proposed. Data on repopulation, health status, movement, link with other holdings will be discussed in the next meeting.

5. Next meeting

July 2020, date to be confirmed

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 27th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 28 May 2019

(Agreed on 16 June 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:

  Alice FUSARO, Thijs KUIKEN, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO
- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Cornelia Adlhoch.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts reviewed the draft of the AI report XI. Given the number of outbreaks that in the reporting period for this report were observed in goose in the EU, it was decided to amend figure 5 (on distribution of HPAI outbreaks in Europe by week of suspicion and by affected poultry species) adding domestic goose as a separate poultry species category to the figure. The WG extensively discussed possible explanations to reason why in this reporting period and in the previous one only few wild bird HPAI cases (n=3) were reported compared to the number of outbreaks in poultry (n=290); data form surveillance activities on wild birds carried out by Member States in 2020, as well as data on susceptibility and pathogenesis from experimental studies, once available, may help to understand the low mortality reported this year in wild birds. The WG hypothesised that the decreased number of HPAI outbreaks reported from Asia and Africa compared to the previous three-months reporting period may be explained, among other reasons, also by the COVID-19 pandemic and will look for official analysis done by OIE or FAO on animal diseases underreporting in COVID-19 time. The WG experts reviewed the drafted sections on conclusions (main observations and conclusions), and suggestions. Publication is foreseen by end of June 2020.

5. Next meeting(s)

Next WG meeting planned for the AI report XII (reporting period 16 May – 15 August 2020) on 7 September (14.00-18.00).

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 26th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

Held on 30 April 2020, web meeting

(Agreed on 11 May 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Nicola FERRE'
  Matteo MAZZUCATO
  Stefano MARANGON
  Paolo MULATTI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Aleksandra MITEVA
  Milena GIONOVA
  Toncho VACHEV

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI
  GPS Unit: Mimi KALCHEVA

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The informative needs of the poultry population register data, with a view of using that information in the context of avian influenza outbreaks and epidemics, were further discussed. The specific fields related to the poultry production data (e.g. type of holding, species, type of farming, production phase, breeding mode, line of breeding, types of breeders), in relation to the context of Bulgarian poultry production system, were extensively examined.

5. Next meeting

June 2020, date to be confirmed

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 25th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 2 March 2019

(Agreed on 23 March 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Thijs KUIKEN, Eric NIQUEUX, Christoph STAUBACH, Calogero TERREGINO

- ECDC:
  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts were informed on the EFSA new rules for expert compensation related to WG meeting attendance and preparatory work. Also, the experts were informed on new way of working on scientific output via digital collaboration; all experts will be supported to access the digital collaboration space, and this will apply for the next AI report (June). The WG discussed and reviewed the draft of the AI report X. Particular attention was given to the sections on conclusions (main observations and conclusions), and suggestions, where the experts contributed to add points for conclusions and suggestions and to further develop the ones already drafted. In section 4.1 it was decided to report both the proposed figures presenting the distribution of total number of HPAI outbreaks detected in Europe in seasons 2016–2017, 2017–2018, 2018–2019 , 2018–02019 and in the last three seasons, respectively; in the map on the geographical distribution of HPAI outbreaks in Europe the outbreak will be stratified by epidemic season. For section 4.2, EFSA will check that the data reported to characterise the HPAI affected establishments in the tabular form are coherent with those mentioned elsewhere (text and figures) in the section. Publication is foreseen by the end of March 2020.

5. Next meeting(s)

The following dates for WG web-meetings on AI monitoring in 2020 were agreed: 28 May (14.00-18.00); 7 September (14.00-18.00); 1 December (9.00-13.00).

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 24th MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

Held on 10-11 February 2020, Sofia and Plovdiv

(Agreed on 03 March 2020)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Nicola FERRE'
  Matteo MAZZUCATO
  Stefano MARANGON
  Paolo MULATTI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Aleksandra MITEVA

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI
  GPS Unit: Mimi KALCHEVA

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Calogero Terregino.

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

EFSA, EURL and BFSA assessed together the informative system on poultry population register data in use in Bulgaria, this included a day visit to the Regional Office in Plovdiv. The aim of this assessment was to identify elements of this informative system to be enhanced for a fit for purpose poultry register dataset for HPAI surveillance and eradication activities; for a rapid extraction/production of datasets for GIS and data analysis; for an automatic extraction of datasets suitable for web publication of data on poultry holdings as provided for in the EU law.

5. Next meeting

March 2020, to be confirmed

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 23rd MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(SURVEILLANCE)

Held on 12th December 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 16th of December 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Jose Gonzales Rojas has participated via teleconference
- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Inma Aznar
- Apologies:
  N/A

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Revision of the final draft of the 2018 annual surveillance report prior to its publication in the EFSA website[3]

Final changes needed were discussed prior to the final publication of the annual surveillance report.

5. Next meeting

TBD with SWG members

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[3] http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00039

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 22ND MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 6 December 2019

(Agreed on 18 December 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Alice FUSARO, Thijs KUIKEN, Krzysztof SMIETANKA, Christoph STAUBACH

- ECDC:
  Cornelia ADLHOCH
- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts discussed and reviewed the draft of the AI report IX. Particular attention was given to the sections on conclusions (main observations and conclusions), and suggestions. The review questions and the relevant criteria for the literature searches foreseen in section 4.2.2 and 4.4 were discussed and clarified. In the section on the detection of H7N9, an overview of the results of the vaccination campaign reported on the EMPRES-i website of the Food and Agriculture Organization will be reported in this report. From the next report, only a reference to that website will be added. The WG expressed the view of allowing some flexibility in the reporting period foreseen for each of the AI scientific report that will be published in 2020; depending on the situation of AI, it might be that the AI report would cover longer or shorter reporting period, compared to the usually three months reporting period.

5. Next meeting(s)

Possible dates for WG meetings in 2020 were proposed and will be confirmed asap; for 2020 one meeting will be physical and all the others will be organised as web-meetings. Next WG meeting is scheduled in March 2019.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 21RT MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

WEB-conference, 29 November 2019

(Agreed on 4 December 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Nicola FERRE'
  Matteo MAZZUCATO
  Stefano MARANGON
  Calogero TERREGINO

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Aleksandra MITEVA
  Samuil PAUNOV

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

EFSA, in the framework of the mandate M-2017-0062[4], has been requested to assist Member States carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on Avian influenza (AI). EU legislation on Avian influenza requires MS to carry out compulsory surveillance programmes in poultry and wild birds. Surveillance in poultry and wild birds is crucial in order to early detect the occurrence of new AI viruses in the EU that pose a risk to animal and potentially to human health. The epidemiological situation on AI in Bulgaria in 2016-2018 has been proven how important continuous surveillance and monitoring of domestic and wild bird populations is. Collection of data on AI and their timely analysis are essential to contribute to awareness and preparedness to face AI epidemics. A prerequisite for a good epidemiological analysis (temporal and spatial) is an appropriate data collection including all required stages (metadata at farm/herd level, laboratory data, metadata on population, etc). In order to harmonise and streamline data collection and analysis of results of monitoring and surveillance in poultry, wild and captive birds, during the meeting the national databases on poultry population and the AI monitoring and surveillance system were presented and discussed.

5. Next meeting(s)

February 2020, Sofia, to be confirmed

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[4] http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?2

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 20TH MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(SURVEILLANCE)

Held on 7th November 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 17th of June 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Adam Brouwer has participated via teleconference
  Adeline Huneau has participated via teleconference
  Arjan Stegeman has participated via teleconference
  Jose Gonzales Rojas has participated via teleconference
  Thijs Kuiken has participated via teleconference
  Christoph Staubach has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Inma Aznar

- Apologies:
  Paolo Mulatti

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paolo Mulatti as he could not participate on the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion on the final draft of the 2018 annual surveillance report[3]

The final draft of the 2018 annual surveillance report for avian influenza had been, prior to the meeting, shared with SWG members. Comments made by SWG members were scrutinized and amendments to the draft were made in preparation for the meeting; comments that needed to be clarified were brought up at the meeting for further discussion. During the meeting comments submitted by Member States representatives were also discussed. Among other changes, specific changes to be made in the maps and other figures of the document were suggested. SWG members agreed on the need to add further appendixes including: an itemization of wild birds included in the list of 'target species' and a table with English common names of the wild bird species included in Figures 8 and 11 of the report. A proposal to include a new figure with the species of wild birds sampled and those testing negative to HPAI, was made by the SWG. A revision of the logistic regression analysis presented in the draft was also suggested. A table summarising the risk factors considered by MSs when designing their surveillance programme was also shared with the SWG. No amendments to the table were needed. EFSA agreed to deal with changes suggested at the SWG meeting and shared the final draft once more with SWG members for their approval on Monday 19th of November prior to its publication.

5. Next meeting

TBD with SWG members

Note: In view of the grant on technical and scientific assistance to Bulgaria on avian influenza, additional hearing experts may be invited to future WG meetings (the required administrative steps will be dealt with by EFSA).

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[3] http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00039

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 19TH MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

WEB-conference, 04 September 2019

(Agreed on 13 September 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:

  Dominique BICOUT, Alice FUSARO, Thijs KUIKEN, Isabella MONNE, Krzysztof SMIETANKA, Christoph STAUBACH, Jan Arend STEGEMAN, Preben WILLEBERG

- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH

- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Yves VAN DER STADE

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paolo MULATTI.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The SWG discussed the draft of the AI report VIII. In section 4.2 on AI outbreaks in Europe, it was agreed to report the non-notifiable LPAI A(H1N1) and A(H3N1) viruses detected in the relevant period for the report in Italy and Belgium, respectively, as those viruses were characterised by an unusual animal and public health impact. In section 4.4 on the overview of the HPAI outbreaks reported from other countries not reporting via ADNS, it was agreed to include the description of the information on the HPAI A(H7N3) detected in a poultry meat product in Japan in the sub-section on A(H7N9), as the Japan virus was a reassortant of the zoonotic A(H7N9) and since there are no evidence indicating a sustained circulation of the virus. The WG experts reviewed the drafted sections on conclusions (main observations and conclusions), and suggestions. WG experts will review the document with attention to the sections on conclusions and suggestions and on the scientific analysis of AI spread from non-EU countries to poultry in the EU. Publication is foreseen by the end of September 2019.

5. Next meeting(s)

Next WG meeting is scheduled for 2 December 2019.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 18TH MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(SURVEILLANCE)

Held on 17th June 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 22nd of February 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Adam Brouwer has participated via teleconference
  Adeline Huneau has participated via teleconference
  Arjan Stegeman has participated via teleconference
  Jose Gonzales Rojas has participated via teleconference
  Thijs Kuiken has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Inma Aznar

- Apologies:
  Christoph Staubach
  Paolo Mulatti

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Christoph Staubach and Paolo Mulatti as they could not participate on the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion on the first draft of the 2018 annual surveillance report[3]

An initial draft of the 2018 annual surveillance report for avian influenza was presented by Jose Gonzales Rojas. The initial draft contained a short introduction followed by a results section. In the results section, the tables and graphs that had been discussed at the previous SWG meeting on avian influenza surveillance, plus several other proposed graphs, were shown. An appendix with further graphs on poultry was also present. The main results were presented separately for poultry and wild birds. The tables and graphs presented were created using a non-fully validated dataset provided by EFSA. This dataset did not contain any geographical information. The discussion focused on the assessment and optimization of the tables and graphs produced by WBVR. Minor changes were suggested to improve the clarity of some of the graphs. In order for WBVR to create maps with the geographical location of the sampled wild birds and flocks, as well as to include an interpretation of these data, EFSA will provide the necessary shapefiles and data to WBVR. Once the 2018 annual surveillance data are fully validated, the new dataset will be supplied to Wageningen Bioveterinary Research (WBVR) by the 5th of July (including geo-location data), and the written scripts will be run with the final dataset. It was agreed that once the final dataset is supplied to WBVR, a new draft will be produced and shared with the rest of the SWG members on the last week of August 2019. This draft should have a revised text and should include all sections that will appear in the final report (including the discussion). SWG members will then have a chance to work on the report, prior to the next SWG meeting, with the aim to have a close-to-be final draft for the next meeting. EFSA suggested to share the document using Sharepoint so all members could work on the same document. EFSA will provide access to SWG members to this document.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[3] http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00039

4.2. Validation tables in MicroStrategy (2019 annual surveillance report)

The tables to be used for validation of data submitted to EFSA from 2019 onwards were made available to SWG members prior to the meeting. As there was no time to discuss them at the meeting, SWG members agreed to review them prior to the beginning of the data collection in July 2019.

5. Next meeting

12th of September

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 17TH MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

Held on 10-11 April 2019, Sofia

(Agreed on 8 May 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Nicola FERRE'
  Matteo MAZZUCATO
  Paolo MULATTI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Stefano MARANGON
  Aleksandra MITEVA

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 21-22 February 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 16th Standing Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 7 May 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

EFSA organised the meeting in close collaboration with the EURL on AI with the aim to assist Bulgaria in enhancing the collection and the analysis of the data collected in the framework of the monitoring of AI. The context (mandate M-2017-0062[4]) of the meeting was explained and discussed. Bulgaria presented the data and the information that are routinely collected in case of suspicion and of confirmation of AI outbreak in Bulgaria. The discussion focussed on how the data collection is structured at regional level, on the data flow up to the central level, and on the IT supports available. The EURL reported the experience of Italy in case of suspicion/confirmation of AI outbreaks. The questionnaire used to collect information, the flow of these data and how these data are used to generate information needed to go ahead with the investigation (e.g. tracing, zoning) in Italy were discussed and taken into consideration when analysing and assessing the different scientific and technical components of the system in place in Bulgaria. Also, the demographic data on the poultry population available in Bulgaria were presented and discussed. Possible GIS training of Bulgarian staff to support spatial analysis of outbreak data was proposed. A further assessment of the IT infrastructure in place in Bulgaria (supporting the collection and the analysis of AI outbreak data) would help to identify the way forward to enhance the collection and the analysis of the AI data.

6. Next meeting(s)

June, to be confirmed.

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[4] http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?2

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 16TH MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING: assisting MS carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI)

WEB-conference, 04 April 2019

(Agreed on 7 May 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:
  Nicola FERRE'
  Matteo MAZZUCATO

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 21-22 February 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 15th Standing Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25 March 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

EFSA, in the framework of the mandate M-2017-0062[3], has been requested to assist Member States carrying out the collection and the analysis of the epidemiological data on AI. EFSA should strive to collect data from all Member States affected by AI but limit the required data to those that are necessary and meaningful. EFSA can offer technical and scientific assistance on data collection to enhance analysis of data working in close collaboration with the EURL on AI, in order to generate useful information to effectively improve the surveillance and monitoring of AI. In the meeting, the technical aspects of the data collection (e.g. structure, IT systems) and their analysis (GIS) were discussed.

6. Next meeting(s)

10-11 April 2019, Sofia.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[3] http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/wicket/page?2

ANIMAL AND PLANT UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 15TH MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(MONITORING)

Held on 04-05 March 2019, Brussels

(Agreed on 25 March 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:

  Thijs KUIKEN

  Isabella MONNE

  Paolo MULATTI

  Krzysztof SMIETANKA

  Christoph STAUBACH

  Calogero TERREGINO

- European Commission:

  Maria PITTMAN (DG SANCO) has participated in the agenda points 1, 2, 3, 5.1

- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

- ECDC:

  Cornelia ADLHOCH

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 21-22 February 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 14th Standing Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 11 of March 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Structure and contents of the scientific reports on avian influenza overview[3]:

5.1.1. ToR 1 – 2

The description of the LPAI findings in Europe in the scientific report was discussed, considering that, according to the Regulation (EU) 2016/479[4], from 2021 it will not be mandatory for Member States to immediately notify LPAI in the EU via ADNS but report LPAI in the framework of AI surveillance. The WG agreed to continue to report and describe LPAI findings in Europe and to re-discuss this decision in the future when the new legislation will be effective.

The Commission informed the WG that it might be decided to postpone the publication of the next report to September 2019 if in the next three months the epidemiological situation of AI in the EU would not change (low virus circulation and only a few outbreaks). For this purpose, the WG will review the data on AI outbreaks coming from the ADNS and EMPRES-i for the period 16 February – 30 April 2019 to rapidly assess whether the epidemiological situation has changed or not from previous reporting period (16 November 2018 – 15 February 2019). The tables and figures for the section 'Overview of HPAI outbreaks in Europe during the current and previous seasons' were reviewed; it was decided to present in this section: an epicurve showing the weekly distribution of the outbreaks for the last three AI seasons; for the last two AI seasons a map showing the geographical distribution of the outbreaks; three epicurves for the weekly distribution of the outbreaks by virus subtype, affected poultry and wild birds

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[3] http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-01043
[4] Regulation (EU) 2016/429 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 9 March 2016 on transmissible animal diseases and amending and repealing certain acts in the area of animal health ('Animal Health Law'). OJ L 84, 31.3.2016, p. 1–208.

species; pie charts showing the distribution of the outbreaks in poultry by bird species and sampling programme leading to the outbreak detection.

For the literature review on phenotypic characterisation of HPAI viruses circulating in Europe and in other continents, only the HPAI infections with viruses circulating within the last two years will be described in the AI reports; whereas for the search on the genetic characterisation of HPAI viruses circulating in other continents, the information retrieved will be reported only if new.

5.1.2. ToR 3 – 4

For the applied prevention and control measures, in case only few countries in Europe would be affected by HPAI outbreaks in poultry or wild birds during a specific reporting period, it was discussed and agreed to include in the scientific report only the case-reports as they are provided by the affected countries.

Maps in TOR 4 showing the geographical distribution of outbreaks by virus subtype will report historical data limited to one year before the starting of the reporting period (e.g. for reporting period 16 November 2018 – 15 February 2019, historical data showed on the map will cover 15 November 2017 – 15 November 2018). In case of findings of HPAI outbreaks different from H5N1, H5N6, H5N8, H7N9, it was agreed to report them all in a dedicated section with the description of the detections in birds and without a dedicated literature search to retrieve information on phenotypic and genetic characterisation of the virus. As good working practise, it was suggested to dedicate the WG meetings to discuss any controversial points of the scientific reports and to exchange drafted text, proposals for changes, or comments via mail before the meeting.

5.2. Scientific report 'Avian influenza overview November 2018 – February 2019' (AI report VII)

The WG experts reviewed and updated the text in the sections on conclusions (main observations and conclusions) and suggestions during the meeting. The whole draft of the report was reviewed, and the main comments and proposed changes discussed and fixed.

As a consequence of the HPAI A(H5N6) virus isolated from a common gull in Russia in October 2018, it was agreed to actively search for any information available related to this finding via ECDC and EURL network with the aim of reporting it, and to include in the document a description of the migratory pathway for this species. Methods other than passive surveillance were discussed with a view to early detect HPAI virus in wild birds and to complement passive systems that may not be sensitive enough if the prevalence or case fatality in wild birds is very low. It was agreed to mention in the report the AI outbreaks occurred in Europe and notified to the ADNS outside the reporting period for this report (after 15 February 2018). For the HPAI outbreak in Bulgaria in the establishment rearing mixed species, it was suggested to specify which species showed signs of HPAI infection. Figures and tables in TOR 4 will be updated reporting the historical data as decided in the previous day (point 5.1. of the minutes of the meeting).

Also, the timeline for finalisation, approval and publication of the document was agreed as in the table below:

Date (from–to)	Activity
8–13 Mar	WG to finalise draft 3 and review phase

14–21 Mar	Approval of the report by ECDC
21 Mar–25 Mar	Approval of the report by EURL to approve
25 Mar–26 Mar	Approval of the report by EFSA to approve
26 Mar	EFSA send the report VII to Wiley for publication
29 Mar	Wiley publish report VII

6. Next meeting(s)

EFSA scientific report on AI monitoring	Dates for the WG web-meetings
Report VIII	June (TBD)
Report IX	4 September (14.00-18.00)
Report X	2 December (14.00-18.00)

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 14TH MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AVIAN INLFLUENZA

(SURVEILLANCE)

Held on 21-22nd February 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 11 March 2019)

Participants

- Standing Working Group Members:

  Adam Brouwer

  Adeline Huneau

  Arjan Stegeman

  Christoph Staubach has participated via teleconference

  Jose Gonzales Rojas has participated via teleconference

  Paolo Mulatti

  Thijs Kuiken has participated via teleconference, in the second day of the meeting

- EFSA:

  ALPHA Unit: Inma Aznar

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Thijs Kuiken as he could not participate on the first day of the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 19 December 2019, Legnaro.

The minutes of the 13th Standing Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 09th of January 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Structure of the 2018 annual surveillance report[3]

The SWG agreed on the structure of the 2018 annual surveillance report. At the meeting, it was agreed that this report will, in general, mirror the structure of the 2017 annual report produced by APHA (Weybridge, UK). The main changes proposed for the 2018 report will be associated with a reduction in the length of the report by restricting the text to scientifically highlighted data events (main results, unexpected results, or any other important information relevant for the reporting year).

5.2. Poultry tables and figures (2018 annual surveillance report)

The tables and figures for poultry data shown in the APHA 2017 annual report were reviewed in terms of the scientific information provided, as well as ease of interpretation. The reviewing was carried out on a one-to-one basis. Each visual was assessed and an agreement was made on whether the item should be kept in the 2018 report. When the item was considered to be scientifically relevant to be kept, possible improvements were also discussed. An overview of the full content of information provided in the 2017 report was also carried out. Some suggestions were made on how to merge information currently provided via several tables/figures, into a unique table/figure.

5.3. Poultry tables and figures (2019 annual surveillance report)

The tables and figures for poultry data to be shown in the 2019 annual report were reviewed as a separate exercise from the reviewing of the 2018 tables/figures. EFSA is expecting MSs to submit data aggregated at NUTS 3 and monthly level, starting with the surveillance data submission taking place in 2019. If data are submitted aggregated at monthly level (rather than at 6 month level as previously), showing the timeline aspect of the sampling carry out by MSs would be a scientifically important output to include in the 2019 report. The main change with respect to the 2018 annual report was therefore foreseen as the introduction of timeline graphs/figures describing the sampling carry out by MSs over a calendar year. Most of the other figures and tables would remain the same as per 5.2.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf
[3] http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00039

5.4. Zenodo/dashboards

During the meeting, a discussion took place in relation to the size of some of the tables shown in the 2017 annual report. As showing data for all MSs in an A4 format can become cumbersome and not always easy, the SWG agreed on exploring the possibility of using Zenodo as a repository for excel sheets containing these data in the 2018 annual report. The link to access these data would then be provided in the annual report. The use of dashboards to display data in an interactive manner was also discussed. Although not possible for the 2018 report, a dashboard for poultry was designed for the 2019 annual report.

5.5. Wild birds tables and figures (2018/2019 annual surveillance reports)

The tables and figures shown in the 2017 annual surveillance report for wild bird data were reviewed in a similar way to the poultry tables and figures. In this case, as very little changes are expected in the type of data that MSs will report to EFSA from 2019 onwards (with respect to that submitted to the EC), all changes discussed will apply to both the 2018 and 2019 annual reports.

5.6. Zenodo/dashboards

As in 5.4., the use of Zenodo for the 2018 annual report, and the use of dashboards for the 2019 report were discussed. Two potential dashboards showing wild bird data were designed. A third dashboard showing data from poultry and wild birds together was also discussed.

6. Next meeting

TBD

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

(AI monitoring and surveillance)

19 December 2018, IZSVe (Legnaro)

(Agreed on 9 January 2019)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:** Calogero TERREGINO, Paolo MULATTI, Isabella MONNE
- **Hearing Experts:** Francesca SCHOLAMACCIA, Stefano MARANGON
- **EFSA:** Inma AZNAR, Francesca BALDINELLI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The points raised by email were adopted as agenda points without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

Ahead of the appointment for IZSVe to become the new EURL for Avian Influenza from 2019 onwards, EFSA wanted to welcome its new working partner and expressed its appreciation for the beginning of a close productive working relationship. Several points to be discussed were distributed among the participants by email prior to the meeting, and they were considered the agenda items. The main topics discussed are summarized below.

- Avian influenza monitoring activities

– EFSA expressed its interest in collaborating closely with IZSVe in the production and publication of the quarterly scientific reports on AI monitoring. These reports have been produced to date in collaboration with the current EURL and ECDC. EFSA envisages the role of IZSVe in this report as not only providing a specific contribution on certain scientific topics (e.g. genetic characterisation of the AI viruses circulating in Europe, pathogenicity mapping, evaluation of human adaptation and transmissibility of relevant avian flu viruses for the report), but also getting involved in the approval process of each of these reports. IZSVe indicated that they were aware of these scientific reports and that they would be happy to contribute towards them. IZSVe stressed the need of a working agreement to be put in place to clearly itemize the work that it would be expected from them. EFSA will circulate this agreement to IZSVe for them to review.

- Support activities in case of a special situation with regard of AI outbreaks in Europe

- IZSVe highlighted the changing nature of the AI situation in Europe and reflected on the need for a detailed look up of the epidemiological picture at times when an unexpectedly large number of outbreaks occur in specific countries, or when facing any other unpredicted situations. EFSA agreed and specifically referred to the current situation in Bulgaria. EFSA announced that it has committed support to Bulgaria and that a meeting is expected to take place early in January to discuss the specifics of their needs. EFSA invited IZSVe to be part of this initiative by nominating a person that could follow up on these activities. For this, IZSVe would like to first see a description of the activities and the specific work that they will be required to carry out. EFSA will revert back to IZSVe once a clear pathway in relation to actions to be taken to support Bulgaria has been designed. The Bulgaria example could then be used to put in place a specific long term agreement between EFSA and IZSVe describing the expected support from IZSVe when dealing with these special situations.

- Avian influenza surveillance activities

- EFSA will be in charge of collecting, collating and analysing the AI surveillance data gathered by MSs in poultry and wild birds with an annual report being

produced from 2019 onwards. The data submitted by MSs to the EC for the surveillance activities carried out in 2018 will also be analysed by EFSA, with the annual report being produced by EFSA at the end of next year. EFSA invited IZSVe to nominate a representative who could be part of the SWG on AI for the surveillance activities. The initial activities planned for the SWG would encompass the shaping and the design of the annual surveillance report. For that, EFSA will organize a number of SWG meetings (approximately 3) where SWG members will provide support in the design of the lay-out of the report and subsequently will help to analyse, produce and edit such report. Most of the workload will be carried out during the SWG meetings but members will be required to support EFSA outside the meetings to prepare for these meetings. IZSVe will consider this offer; EFSA suggested putting together a draft detailing the specific work to be required from IZSVe in this regard.

- Other topics

- EFSA informed IZSVe on other initiatives such as the two procurements forms signed lately with the ENETWILD consortium to gather data on wild bird species in Europe. EFSA agreed to share the details with IZSVe.

- EFSA signalled its intention to design a pilot project looking at surveillance strategies in some of the MSs that voluntarily want to share this information. IZSVe was keen on the initiative and offered to be part of this pilot project. Further information will be shared with IZSVe in the short future.

- IZSVe informed EFSA that the next Annual Meeting of the National Laboratories for Avian Influenza and Newcastle Disease of the European Union Member States will take place in Padua, probably in late June 2019. IZSVe will be in charge of organizing the event. EFSA expressed its wish to collaborate with IZSVe in drafting the agenda of the meeting. IZSVe will provide EFSA further information in the near future.

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

(AI monitoring report)

4 December 2018, web-meeting

(Agreed on 2 January 2019)

Meeting date: 4/12/2018 (14:30-18:30)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members as hearing expert:**

Aleksandra MITEVA

- **EFSA:**

Francesca BALDINELLI, Andrey GOGIN (ALPHA)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

The situation in Bulgaria with regard of HPAI H5N8 outbreaks occurring since April 2018 was discussed in details.

Bulgaria expressed the interest in collaborating with EFSA for describing in the AI monitoring report VI the outbreaks occurred in the relevant period for the report. In particular EFSA and Bulgaria will work together to give in the document a description of the poultry establishments in Bulgaria by Regions and species, and of the enhanced surveillance activities carried out in the last months.

EFSA will check the proportion of affected establishments in Bulgaria where poultry showed signs (clinical and non-clinical) of HPAI infection looking at the data collected via the EFSA data model since 2016. This will help in reviewing the current conclusions of the AI report VI and to have an indication of the sensitivity of the passive surveillance particularly in duck establishments.

The possibility of having a WG meeting beginning 2019 in Bulgaria in order to give scientific support to Bulgarian authorities in further investigate the current situation in relation of AI was discussed and agreed. Possible actions and specifics of the support that EFSA would be pleased to offer as well as specific needs from Bulgaria will be discussed early January 2019.

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

(AI monitoring report)

4 December 2018, web-meeting

(Agreed on 2 January 2019)

Meeting date: 4/12/2018 (10:00-14:00)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:**

Adam BROUWER, Thijs KUIKEN, Krzysztof SMIETANKA, Christoph STAUBACH

- **Other:**

Cornelia ADLHOCH (ECDC)

- **EFSA:**

Francesca BALDINELLI (ALPHA)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paolo MULATTI.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf

interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

The SWG experts reviewed the drafted sections on conclusions (main observations and conclusions), and suggestions.

The experts were informed that EFSA was working with representative from Bulgaria to finalise section 4.1.2.1 on the characterisation of the HPAI affected poultry establishments in Bulgaria. The SWG was also informed on the on-going genetic analysis being performed by EURL on characterisation of the HPAI viruses isolated from Bulgaria. Section 4.3 on genetic characterisation of AI viruses circulating in Europe will be drafted by EURL as soon as the results will be available. Also, EURL will draft conclusions and suggestions accordingly to these results.

A HPAI A(H5Nx) outbreak, detected in the relevant period for this report in western Russia, was reported to OIE. No information on the N type is available from official sources (i.e. OIE or FAO); EURL will inform the WG in case any information on the N type would become available. This outbreak was reported from an European area of Russia; it was discussed whether to describe it or not in section 4.1 (HPAI and LPAI outbreaks in Europe), since the outbreak was not reported via ADNS as all the ones described in this section. It was left to EFSA to report the outbreak in section 4.1 or 4.4 and to structure the two sections accordingly.

In section 4.4 on the overview of the HPAI outbreaks reported from other countries not reporting via ADNS, it was agreed to report in Table 4 and Figure 8 only outbreaks occurring in birds.

The SWG agreed to keep the Figures on distribution of outbreaks/human cases over time even if no new detections were reported in the period of interest; this will help to give a clear and complete view of the situation to the reader and avoiding to go back to the previous published reports to retrieve these information. Also, for the sake of completeness it was discussed and agreed to keep the second section of the paragraph 4.5 on scientific analysis of AI spread from non-EU/EEA countries to poultry in the EU/EEA, even if there are no changes from previous published report,.

For the section on LPAI and HPAI A(H7N9) in birds, as no new cases have been reported in the reporting period, the map will not be showed.

The way of retrieving information on phenotypic and genetic characterisation of HPAI viruses circulating in Europe and in other countries via literature search was discussed. As recently published papers usually do not report information on the most recently detected

viruses, some criticisms were highlighted on the relevance of reporting information on non-recently detected viruses (e.g. viruses from 2012). It was decided to continue with this approach for the current report but to further discuss this point for the next report.

SWG experts will review the document with particular attention to the sections on conclusions and suggestions and on the scientific analysis of AI spread from non-EU countries to poultry in the EU.

Publication is foreseen by the end of 2018.

5. Next meeting

Next WG meeting is scheduled for 4-5 March in Brussels.

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

(AI surveillance report)

09 October 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 16th October2018)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:** Adeline HUNEAU SALAUN (via web), Arjan STEGEMAN (via web), Thijs KUIKEN (via web), Christoph STAUBACH (via web), Adam BROUWER (via web).
- **EFSA:** Inma AZNAR

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Scientific report 'Reporting avian influenza surveillance'

A brief summary of the main topics discussed at the latest Avian Influenza (AI) Workshop held in Parma on the 20-21st of September was presented. The aim was to inform SWG members of the feedback received from Member States (MSs) representatives during the workshop. A number of changes in the AI surveillance scientific draft report were made to detail the gradual implementation of the collection framework. Also, a subsection was added to all the sections in the document with a description of the expected framework for the 2019 data collection. The new subsections added were discussed and it was agreed that SWG members will read the document once more and make remaining changes prior to circulating it to MSs representatives.

5. Next meeting

Teleconference TBD

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

(AI workshop)

20-21 September 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 8th October 2018)

Meeting date: 20-21/09/2018 (9.00-13.00)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:**

  Paolo MULATTI, Christoph STAUBACH, Jan Arend STEGEMAN, Calogero TERREGINO

- **Hearing experts:**

  HOEFLECHNER Andrea (AT), KRASIAS Giorgios (CY), Richard WALLO (CZ), Timm HARDER (DE), Pernille NIELSEN (DK), Charlotte HJULSAGER (DK), Kärt JAARMA (EE), Elena GARCIA VILLACIEROS (ES), Niina TAMMIRANTA (FI), Marie GRANDCOLLOT-CHABOT (FR), Eric NIQUEUX (FR), PERDIKARIS Sokratis (GR), Tihana MISKIC (HR), Mark HOVARI (HU), Laura GARZA CUARTERO (IR), Francesca SCOLAMACCHIA (IT), Vilija GRIGALIUNIENE (LT), Mara UZULE (LV), Marcel SPIERENBURG (NL), Siri Kulberg SJURSETH (NO), Edyta SWIETON (PL), Renata CARVALHO (PT), Theodora CHESNOIU VASILE (RO), Linda ERNHOLM (SE), Vilem KOPRIVA (SK), Aleksandra HARI (SI), Helen ROBERTS (UK)

- **Other:**

  Cornelia ADLHOCH (ECDC)

- **EFSA:**

  Laura AMATO, Inma AZNAR, Francesca BALDINELLI, Andrey GOGIN, Frank VERDONCK, Nik KRIZ (ALPHA), Jane RICHARDSON, Anca STOICESCU (DATA), Irene MUNOZ GUAJARDO, José CORTINAS ABRAHANTES (AMU)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Adam BROUWER, Ian BROWN, Philip HOUDART, Adeline HUNEAU, Thijs KUIKEN, Aleksandra MITEVA and Krzysztof SMIETANKA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Scientific reports on 'Avian influenza overview'

4.1.1. Francesca Baldinelli and Christoph Staubach presented to the participants the EFSA scientific reports on 'avian influenza overview'. The background of the mandate, the terms of reference as received from the Commission, and the aim of the document, were presented. The structure and the contents of the animal health sections within Europe and worldwide were illustrated and discussed with the MS representatives.

4.1.2. Cornelia Adlhoch presented some statistics on page views and pdf downloads from the ECDC website for the four reports published so far. An overview of the human cases worldwide was presented according to the AI virus subtype.

4.1.3. The feedbacks received from MSs on the scientific report on 'avian influenza overview' were presented. MSs that commented the document gave more background and explained the reasons behind the different proposals. All the proposals received from the MS representatives will be further discussed within the AI SWG and when feasible, they will be

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf

implemented to improve the quality of report and to make it more informative for the MSs.

4.2. Scientific report on Avian influenza surveillance

4.2.1. A review of the challenges encountered and lessons learnt during the compilation and analysis of the AI surveillance data was presented by Helen Roberts from slides prepared by Adam Brouwer. The most common errors occurring during the data submission were described and some recommendations were given in terms of data validation.

A presentation with a summary of the results of the latest Avian Influenza surveillance report was also prepared by Adam Brower and presented by Helen Roberts.

4.2.2. Jane Richardson presented the basic concepts of the Standard Sample Description (SSD2) for reporting data to EFSA. The different data collections for which SSD2 have been already implemented were briefly described. The presentation followed with a description of the SSD2 elements that will be used for submitting AI surveillance data to EFSA and the equivalent fields in the current submission to the European Commission. A description of the submission and validation process was presented.

4.2.3. The SSD2 model designed to collect AI surveillance data in EFSA was tested using real data from Ireland through a pilot project. Prior to this presentation, and as part of the pilot project, the details on how to submit data to EFSA and the different elements of the SSD2 model were shown to Laura Garza. Laura had the opportunity to fit the Irish AI surveillance data on poultry and wild birds onto the model. During the presentation Laura Garza provided feedback on her experience when trying to submit AI surveillance data using the newly designed EFSA model.

4.2.4. An open discussion commenced where MS representatives were able to make some queries in relation to the SSD2 model and express their concerns in relation to data availability. A questionnaire was distributed through the MS representatives with specific questions on data availability and ease of access of these data. The questionnaire was distributed electronically via EUSurvey. The results were discussed the following day.

4.2.5. Calogero Terregino introduced the new European Reference Laboratory for Avian Influenza (starting from the 1st of January 2019): Istituto Zooprofilattico Sperimentale delle Venezie (IZSVe). In this presentation, the current activities of the laboratory were described.

4.2.6. A spatial tool currently used by EFSA to visualise ASF surveillance and disease data was presented by Andrey Gogin and José Cortinas. The type of outputs produced as well as a quick tutorial on how to use the application were presented.

4.2.7. A spatial tool to visualize ASF developed by FLI was introduced by Christoph Staubach. 15 MSs use this tool in order to visualize their own data and avail from standardized reports. The record viewer, map explorer and analytical options within the tool were briefly presented.

4.2.8. An open discussion was held between EFSA and the participants on the usefulness of a similar tool to the tools used for ASF, to visualise AI surveillance and disease data. As MSs did not consider it useful it was agreed that it would not be a priority for EFSA.

4.2.9. The Delta Flu project and the different partners of the Delta Flu consortium were introduced by Francesca Scolamacchia. The work done within the work package 2 (task 2.1) to determine the environmental factors associated with an increased risk of AI virus incursion in poultry was presented. To validate the model, the same data analysis on historical AI outbreaks in poultry would be needed. For this purpose, EFSA might receive an external request for sharing data on AI outbreaks published in the 'Avian Influenza' scientific opinion in 2017 and those collected for the reports on 'Avian influenza overview'. In that case, all the involved Member States will be contacted by EFSA.

4.2.10. A summary of the responses to the EUSurvey questionnaire on data availability and ease of access of these data, provided the day before to participants, was presented.

4.2.11. A presentation on the added value of carrying out virological follow up of H5/H7 seropositive holdings was done by Arjan Stegeman. After consideration of the limitations of this type of follow up, some recommendations in terms of how to interpret and carry out epidemiological follow up were given.

4.2.12. The comments made by MS representatives on the AI scientific draft report circulated early this summer were discussed in light of the discussions held during the workshop. Amendments currently made to the initial draft were presented and further amendments were discussed and will be implemented before the report is finalised.

4.2.13. A summary of the topics discussed during the workshop was presented. Further, action points to be carried out by EFSA in the short term were announced. Aside, MSs were reassured

that ongoing help will be provided by EFSA to facilitate the initial data submission. It was agreed that an initial package will be circulated to Mss shortly, for them to practice the data collation and submission. EFSA announced that help in terms of technical support will be provided to MSs that wish to submit non-aggregated data to EFSA.

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

(AI surveillance report)

04 September 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 11th September2018)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:** Adeline HUNEAU SALAUN (via web), Arjan STEGEMAN (via web), Thijs KUIKEN (via web), Christoph STAUBACH (via web).
- **EFSA:** Inma AZNAR

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Adam Brouwer.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Scientific report 'Reporting avian influenza surveillance'

The phases of the implementation of the Data Collection Framework (DCF) for Avian Influenza (AI), the submission process and the interface for submitting data were discussed at the meeting. At the meeting it was agreed that a step-by-step process for data collection will be proposed to MSs at the forthcoming workshop on AI. A draft summarising the list of variables to be submitted to EFSA in the first phase of the DCF (including the corresponding codes/elements in SSD2) was shared with SWG members prior to the meeting and discussed at the meeting. At the meeting it was agreed that, in the first phase of the DCF, the type of data requested by EFSA would, in essence, be similar to the type of data requested and submitted currently to the Commission. The small number of differences in the data requested, with respect to that submitted to the Commission, were also discussed and agreed with SWG members. In order to help with the design of the second phase of the DCF it was agreed that EFSA, at this workshop, will discuss the possibility for some MSs to submit non-aggregated, spatially explicit data to EFSA as part of a pilot study. These spatially explicit data would help EFSA to assess the risk factors for AI introduction, and also to better define the data needs and changes to be proposed to MSs for the second phase of the DCF. The feed-back from MSs in terms of the pilot study will then be discussed at the next SWG meeting. During the meeting, comments received from MSs representatives on the scientific draft report on 'Reporting Avian Influenza surveillance' were discussed. EFSA will make changes to the scientific report in agreement with the topics discussed at the meeting and the report will be circulated again to SWG members.

5. Next meeting

Teleconference 9th October

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

(AI monitoring report)

3 September 2018, web-meeting

(Agreed on 10 September 2018)

Meeting date: 3/09/2018 (14:00-18:00)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:**

Thijs KUIKEN, Krzysztof SMIETANKA, Christoph STAUBACH

- **Other:**

Cornelia ADLHOCH (ECDC)

- **EFSA:**

Francesca BALDINELLI, Laura AMATO (ALPHA)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Adam BROUWER and Paolo MULATTI.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf

conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

The SWG experts drafted the sections on conclusions, including the main observations, and suggestions. A few outbreaks were observed in the reporting period in the EU. Since the assignment of a virus to a clade is based on the H5 sequence only, it was clarified that all European AI outbreaks in domestic and wild birds cluster with their 2.3.4.4b clade but the overall gene composition is different to the human case detected in China, and no human infection related to A(H5) viruses detected in birds in Europe has been reported so far. It was agreed to report the HPAI A(H5N2) outbreak that occurred in poultry in Russia and to look into the OIE reports and in other possible sources to find out information about the clade. For this reporting period a decreasing number of outbreaks have been observed outside Europe compared to the previous reporting period. However, the situation in Russia (connected with fall migration route of wild birds), the fall migration of wild birds that will start next weeks and, the reduced temperature expected in the next weeks are of concern for the possible introduction of AI viruses into the EU. It was agreed to start the ECDC approval one day before the planned timetable below.

Date (from-to)	**Activity**
3 Sep	WG meeting
7–13 Sep	WG to finalise report V and start the review phase
7–17 Sep	ECDC to approve report V
18–20 Sep	EURL to approve report V
21–24 Sep	EFSA to approve report V
25 Sep	EFSA to send Report IV to Wiley for publication
28 Sep	Wiley to publish report IV

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

7th August 2018, web meeting

(Agreed on 21th August 2018)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:** Dominique Bicout, Helen Roberts, Krzysztof Smietanka
- **Working Group hearing experts:** Farouk El Allaki, Ingrid Kotowski
- **EFSA:** Frank VERDONCK (ALPHA unit), Angel ORTIZ PELAEZ (BIOCONTAM unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Dominique Bicout was only involved in reviewing of the draft document whereas the hearing experts were only involved in the expert hearing session. Apologies were received from Jose Luis Gonzales Rojas.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

The meeting consisted of three main parts:

- **Review of the draft document**

  A detailed review of the document took place and suggestions to improve the methodology section were made.

- **Detailed discussion on the table egg part**

  A simplified version of the risk pathway was discussed and it was agreed to describe the rules used to combine two or more probabilities. The different steps of the assessment on LPAI transmission via table eggs were discussed in detail and consensus was obtained on the corresponding probabilities.

- **Expert hearing session**

  The role of hearing expert was again explained and the scope of the mandate was clarified. A detailed discussion took place on a study that was not yet considered by the working group. Also additional studies on the comparison of different inoculation routes were brought to the attention of the working group. The methodology used to determine the probabilities was clarified and the EFSA Guidance Document on uncertainty was mentioned as basis for the uncertainty assessment. A better separation of the origin of raw poultry meat/table eggs (i.e. from commercial or non-commercial flocks) was taken on board.

5. Next meeting

Teleconference 3-4 September 2018

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

30 July 2018, web meeting

(Agreed on 7th August 2018)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:** Helen Roberts, Krzysztof Smietanka
- **EFSA:** Frank VERDONCK (ALPHA unit), Angel ORTIZ PELAEZ (BIOCONTAM unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

The risk pathway and the probabilities of each step were discussed in detail and consensus was achieved. The argumentations underpinning the probability of infection and the probability of establishment and spread were clarified and elaborated in the draft document. It was agreed to make it clear in the document that exposure, infection and establishment are interlinked. Commercial and non-commercial holdings were differentiated in the consequence assessment. An initial discussion took place on the assessment of LPAIV exposure, infection, establishment and spread via table eggs. The assessment will consider only LPAIV present inside table eggs.

5. Next meeting

Teleconference 7 August 2018

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

18 July 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 24th July 2018)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:** Jose Gonzales (via web), Helen Roberts, Krzysztof Smietanka (via web)
- **EFSA:** Frank VERDONCK (ALPHA unit), Angel ORTIZ PELAEZ (BIOCONTAM unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

The background of the mandate and the Terms of Reference were presented and debated. A detailed discussion took place on the approach that would be taken. It was agreed to perform a qualitative risk assessment based on the available scientific evidence and expert opinion. The literature collected for the latest avian influenza opinion will be used and updated from 2016 till mid-2018. Terms like raw meat, table eggs and poultry were clarified. The borders of the assessment were discussed and defined.

5. Next meeting

Teleconference 30 July 2018

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

05 July 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 18th July 2018)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:** Adam BROUWER (via web), Adeline HUNEAU SALAUN (via web), Arjan STEGEMAN (via web), Thijs KUIKEN (via web), Christoph STAUBACH (via web).
- **EFSA:** Inma AZNAR, Frank VERDONCK (ALPHA unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Scientific report 'Reporting avian influenza surveillance'

The scientific report was discussed in details with Standing Working Group (SWG) members focusing on comments previously made by them. The 'active' 'passive' terms to describe the surveillance activities carried out by Member States (MSs) were discussed at the meeting in the context of replacing them by terms used by OIE and FAO such as "general" and "targeted" surveillance. The SWG agreed that EFSA will read a recent document submitted to MSs in terms of Animal Health Law (AHL) where these terms were discussed. EFSA will follow up on creating a glossary of terms aligned with AHL. The incorporation of outbreak data to the surveillance data was also discussed. SWG members agreed that these data should be included as 'desirable data' in the scientific report. EFSA will review the document to incorporate this data need in the most appropriate place(s). An initial draft of a questionnaire to collect information from MSs on the criteria used to design their respective Risk Based Surveillance programmes for Avian Influenza in poultry had been previously circulated to SWG members. This questionnaire was discussed with the intention to collect suggestions on how it could be improved. Due to the uncertainty on whether or not the questionnaire would be applicable to all MSs, EFSA and SWG members agreed on EFSA collecting all readily available information on the criteria used by a selected number of MSs. This information would then be used as a trial to examine the validity of the questionnaire.

5. Next meeting

Teleconference 3-4th September

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

04-05 June 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 15 June 2018)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:** Adam BROUWER (via web), Adeline HUNEAU SALAUN, Thijs KUIKEN (via web), Christoph STAUBACH, Arjan STEGEMAN
- **EFSA:** Laura AMATO, Inma AZNAR, Francesca BALDINELLI, Frank VERDONCK (ALPHA unit)
- **ECDC:** Cornelia ADLHOCH

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paolo MULATTI, Krzysztof SMIETANKA and Ian BROWN. Cornelia ADLOCH only participated in the discussion of the scientific report 'AI overview Feb-May 2018 (AI report IV)', whereas Adeline HUNEAU SALAUN and Arjan STEGEMAN only participated in the discussion of the scientific report 'reporting AI surveillance'.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes1 and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest2, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Scientific report 'Avian influenza overview February – May 2018' (AI report IV)

The current version of the draft document was discussed in detail. A few questions were listed which required clarification by the Member States with affected poultry holdings and/or wild bird cases within the reporting period. The main observations, conclusions and suggestions were reviewed and edited where required. The number of HPAI-positive raptors was high in the reporting period. It was agreed to check the evolution of sampling raptors over the last decade. The number of HPAI outbreaks in poultry holdings was low in comparison to the number of wild bird events and possible explanations were discussed. The detection of HPAI A(H5N8) infected wild birds in Southern Africa was noted, followed by a discussion on their possible inclusion in targeted active surveillance schemes at a few priority locations in Europe in order to detect HPAI A(H5) antibodies. The number of suggestions was reduced.

4.2. Scientific report 'Reporting avian influenza surveillance'

The purpose of the future annual reports on AI surveillance was discussed in detail. For each identified outcome, it was clarified whether it was applicable to poultry, wild birds or both and the possible methodological approach was discussed. It was agreed to describe the add-on value to risk managers in case the outcome would be achieved. The WG went systematically through the document to describe which outcomes would be achieved in case mandatory and/or desirable data would be submitted by the Member States. The practical aspects of data collection, reporting and analysis were discussed in detail. It was clear that the future data collection system should be able to receive individual data as well as aggregated information. It would be a major step forward if data would be aggregated maximally by month (time dimension) and at NUTS3 level (geographical dimension). On the other hand, reporting follow up of seropositive establishments should be done at individual level. Questionnaires could be used, for instance to collect information on how Member States determine risk factors and their weighting (in case of risk-based surveillance) or information on the sampling strategy (in case of representative surveillance). This could be done once and updated only when the implemented approach would be changed.

5. Next meeting

Teleconference July

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Standing Working Group on AVIAN INFLUENZA

23-24 April 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 02 May 2018)

Participants:

- **Working Group Members:**

Adam BROUWER, Adeline HUNEAU SALAUN, Thijs KUIKEN, Christoph STAUBACH, Arjan STEGEMAN

- **Other:**

none

- **EFSA:**

Francesca BALDINELLI, Frank VERDONCK (ALPHA)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paolo MULATTI.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes1 and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest2, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting.

For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI or the SDoI, please refer to Annex. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

4. Scientific topics for discussion

The current version of the draft document was discussed in detail. The continuous dimension of the AI surveillance, the relation to preparedness and the reporting of wild bird findings will be clarified in the interpretation of the Terms of Reference. Reference will be made to the latest EFSA scientific opinion on avian influenza to iterate the suggestion to consider targeted active (and enhanced passive) wild bird surveillance at a few key sites within the EU. The objectives of the report were discussed and a preliminary list was made. The mandatory and desired data will be described, explaining how these are linked to the listed objectives. The report will stipulate how all types of surveillance (active, passive, risk-based, representative) could be reported. It will be requested to report the species names of wild birds, to differentiate the three main domestic duck species, whereas group names could be reported for other domestic species (e.g. chicken, turkey). It would be scientifically very useful to report the date and location of the sampling at NUTS4/5 level to allow epidemiological analysis and to compare wild bird and poultry data. Having access to the location of poultry holdings within the EU will facilitate the analysis of the surveillance results in relation to poultry densities. The experts will assess the possibility of Member States transferring results at holding and sample levels to EFSA. It will be discussed with Member States whether it would be feasible or not to collect a proxy for the size/capacity of the holdings. It will be requested to describe how sampling and follow-up epidemiological investigations have been implemented. It will be explored whether this information can be prefilled by EFSA for the subsequent reporting years, asking the Member States only to update this information if changes were done. Automation of data transfer would be relevant for laboratory results and will be discussed under the SIGMA project.

5. Next meeting

4-5 June 2018

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI) or Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI)

In the ADoI or in the SDoI filled for the present meeting, Dr Adam Brouwer, declared the following interest: he has involvement in risk assessment activities at national level; Dr. Adeline Huneau Salaun declared the following interest: she has involvement in risk assessment activities at national level; Dr. Paolo Mulatti declared the following interest: he has involvement in risk assessment activities at national level; Dr. Christoph Staubach declared the following interest: he has involvement in risk assessment activities at national level. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[3] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[4], and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted.
Therefore the concerned experts shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the EFSA Scientific report on Avian influenza surveillance.

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[4] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014