

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

17th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



17th March 2025

9:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 1st of April 2025

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Ute Knierim
Sonia Marti
Siobhan Mullan
- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Eliana Lima, Giulia Cecchinato
- Others:
Martina Benedetta Zanna (ref. PO/EFSA/BIOHAW/2024/06)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 19th February 2025, via web-conference

The minutes of the 16th Working Group (WG) meeting were agreed by written procedure on 27th of February 2025.

V. Scientific topics for discussion ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

a. Conclusions and recommendations on minimum space allowance

The results of the chapter on space allowance were presented and conclusions and recommendations agreed on for space for lying, space at the feeder and total space allowance. In addition, the certainty of the main conclusions was discussed to provide a transparent view on the amount of existing evidence behind each statement ("uncertainty assessment"). Prior to the meeting, the WG experts conducted an individual exercise in which they provided their individual judgement on the certainty for each question, according to three certainty categories: >50%, >66% and >90%. The conclusions for which all WG experts expressed the same certainty judgement were presented, while the conclusions for which no agreement was reached during the individual exercise were discussed. If needed, the conclusions were revised by the experts to increase the clarity of the message. Finally, a group discussion was held on these conclusions to reach an agreement on the certainty classification.

b. Conclusions and recommendations on welfare of cattle kept at grass

The conclusions and recommendations on welfare of fattening cattle kept at grass were discussed and agreed by the WG. The uncertainty assessment of the main conclusions was carried out (following the process described in V.a).

c. Conclusions and recommendations on castration and tail docking

The conclusions and recommendations on mutilations (castration and tail docking) were also discussed and agreed by the WG. The uncertainty assessment of the main conclusions was carried out (following the process described in V.a).

d. Cull cows

To address ToR 2f about decision making criteria for the euthanasia of cull dairy and suckler cows being kept for production of beef, the decision trees outlining the reasons for culling a cow and the conditions under which a cow is deemed unfit for transport, thus requiring on-farm euthanasia, were discussed. The primary reasons for culling were identified as lameness, mastitis, low milk production, fertility issues and post-calving problems. The WG acknowledged the proposed framework, and suggestions on how to proceed were taken into consideration.

e. Breeding strategies and genetics: addressing Panel's comments

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

f. Weaning of suckler calves

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

Tasks and next deadlines were identified and distributed among the WG experts. The next steps to complete each section were discussed. Specifically, next steps for completing the mutilations and space allowance sections will be to present them to the AHAW Panel and collect their comments and feedback. The adoption for this Scientific Opinion is planned for June 2025.



VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Wednesday the 11th of April 2025 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

16th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



19th February 2025

9:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 27th of February 2025

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Ute Knierim
Sonia Marti
Siobhan Mullan
- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Eliana Lima, Giulia Cecchinato
MESE Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (Scientific topic for discussion point V.a)
- Others:
Martina Benedetta Zanna (ref. PO/EFSA/BIOHAW/2024/06)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 31st January 2025, via web-conference

The minutes of the 15th Working Group (WG) meeting were agreed by written procedure on 17th of February 2025.

V. Scientific topics for discussion ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

a. Approach to minimum space allowance – EKE exercise

To address ToR 2a – Request B of the mandate in relation to minimum space allowance at different resources an Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE) was conducted to estimate the minimum inter-individual distance cattle are motivated to keep while resting synchronously, which serves as the basis to calculate the necessary space for differently sized groups of cattle. The WG reviewed and discussed relevant literature for the elicitation process and the useful data extracted from it. The conclusions from the EKE were discussed; recommendations will be discussed in the following working group meetings.

b. Approach to minimum space allowance – draft conclusions

The WG discussed a literature review on the main welfare consequences of restricted space allowances and drafted conclusions.

c. Uncertainty assessment for ABMs at slaughter

In relation to the ABMs to be collected in slaughterhouses to assess the level of welfare of fattening cattle while on farm, the uncertainty assessment was carried out. The uncertainty questions formulated by EFSA staff, based on key conclusions identified by the WG experts, were presented to the WG. The experts provided their individual judgement on the certainty for each question, according to three certainty ranges: >50%, >66% and >90%. Few editorial changes were also made to improve clarity of the text.

d. Conclusions and recommendations on castration

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

e. Conclusions and recommendations on cattle kept on grass

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

Tasks and next deadlines were identified and distributed among the WG experts.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Wednesday the 17th of March 2025 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

15th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



31st January 2025

9:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 17th of February 2025

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Ute Knierim
Sonia Marti
Siobhan Mullan
- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Ester Alaez Pons
- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Eliana Lima, Marika Vitali, Sean Ashe, Yves Van der Stede,
MESE Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (Scientific topic for discussion point V.e)
- Others:
Martina Benedetta Zanna (ref. PO/EFSA/BIOHAW/2024/06); Eléa Bailly-Caumette (ref. EOI/EFSA/2022/01 – CT 24 BIOHAW) for discussion of scientific topic point V.a)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from the EFSA staff Giulia Cecchinato.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 3rd December 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 14th Working Group (WG) meeting were agreed by written procedure on 12th of December 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. Art.31 - Technical Report on the most common husbandry systems and practices for keeping beef cattle ([EFSA-Q-2024-00127](#))

The draft Technical Report on the most common husbandry systems and practices for keeping beef cattle (ToR 1 – Request A of the mandate) was presented to the WG. The comments submitted by WG members were discussed and addressed. Few editorial changes were also made to avoid repetitions and improve clarity of the text. Suggestions on how to improve the overall structure of the main text of the report were also provided.

b. Breeding and Genetics ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The draft text addressing polledness, temperament, hypermuscularity, dystocia and C-section and maternal ability (ToR 2e – Request B of the mandate) was presented. The main pending comments within the body of the text were discussed with the WG and addressed. The uncertainty questions formulated by EFSA staff, based on the key conclusions on polledness, temperament, hypermuscularity, dystocia and C-section and maternal ability identified by the WG experts, were presented to the WG. Prior to the meeting, the WG experts conducted an individual exercise in which they provided their individual judgement on the certainty for each question, according to three certainty ranges: >50%, >66% and >90%. The conclusions for which all WG experts expressed the same certainty judgement were presented. The conclusions for which no agreement was reached during the individual exercise were discussed and revised by the experts. Minor editorial changes were also made. Finally, a group discussion was held on these conclusions and uncertainty questions to reach an agreement on the certainty range.

c. ABM at slaughter: Lung lesions ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

In relation to the selected ABM at slaughter lung lesions, the main pending comments were discussed with the WG and addressed. Few editorial changes were also made to avoid repetitions and improve clarity of the text. Suggestions for improvement of the text were proposed and agreed.

d. Welfare of cattle kept outside ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The WG reviewed the progress of the drafted section, discussed and agreed on the phrasing of the main text. The main pending comments were discussed and addressed.

e. Approach to minimum space allowance ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The approach to be taken to address ToR 2a – Request B of the mandate in relation to minimum space allowance at different resources was discussed. An Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE) exercise was identified to be carried out to estimate the space needs for beef cattle using a behavioural space model taking into account the importance of synchronous lying behaviour and spacing behaviour for the welfare beef cattle. The protocol for this EKE was presented to the WG and discussed.

f. Selection of Panel's comments ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))



A brief discussion was conducted on the few pending comments on environmental enrichment and lack of outdoor access.

g. Castration ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

Tasks and next deadlines were identified and distributed among the WG experts.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Wednesday the 19th of February 2025 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

14th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



3rd December 2024

9:00-17:00

DRAFT MINUTES - Agreed on the 12th of December 2024

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Ute Knierim
Sonia Marti
- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Ester Alaez Pons
- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Eliana Lima, Marika Vitali
- Others:
Martina Benedetta Zanna (ref. PO/EFSA/BIOHAW/2024/06)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from the WG member Siobhan Mullan and the EFSA staff Giulia Cecchinato.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 19th November 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 13th Working Group (WG) meeting were agreed by written procedure on 28th of November 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

a. Breeding and Genetics

The WG discussed the overall structure of the chapter on breeding and genetics and agreed on it. The draft conclusions of each section (polledness, temperament, hypermuscularity, dystocia and C-sections, maternal ability) were reviewed, and editorial changes were made. The next steps will be to tidy up the text, carry on the uncertainty assessment on the conclusion and draft recommendations.

b. Conclusions and Recommendations on Extreme Environmental Heat

The uncertainty questions formulated by EFSA staff, based on the key conclusions on extreme environmental heat identified by the WG experts, were presented to the WG. Prior to the meeting, the WG experts conducted an individual exercise in which they provided their individual judgement on the certainty for each question, according to three certainty ranges: 50-100%, 66-100%, and 90-100%. The conclusions for which all WG experts expressed the same certainty judgement were presented. The conclusions for which no common agreement was reached during the individual exercise were discussed and revised by the experts. Minor editorial changes were also made, taking into consideration the suggestions provided so far by the AHAW Panel. Finally, a group discussion was held on these conclusions and uncertainty questions to reach a common agreement on the certainty range.

c. Conclusions and Recommendations on Disbudding and dehorning

The uncertainty questions formulated by EFSA staff, based on the key conclusions on disbudding and dehorning identified by the WG experts, were presented to the WG. Prior to the meeting, the WG experts conducted an individual exercise in which they provided their individual judgement on the certainty for each question, according to three certainty ranges: >50-100%, 66-100%, and 90-100%. The conclusions for which all WG experts expressed the same certainty judgement were presented. The conclusions for which no common agreement was reached during the individual exercise were discussed and revised by the experts. Minor editorial changes were also made, taking into consideration the suggestions provided so far by the AHAW Panel. Finally, a group discussion was held on these conclusions and uncertainty questions to reach a common agreement on the certainty range.

d. Discussion on pending comments on mutilations section - castration

The WG discussed pending comments in the main text of the castration sub-chapter. Suggestions on how to solve them were provided.

e. Welfare of cattle kept outside

The WG discussed and agreed the animal categories that should be considered when drafting the chapter entitled "Welfare of cattle kept outside". The highly relevant welfare consequences (WCs) for this chapter were selected, taking into account the three hazards outlined in the mandate (outwintering, nutrition and feeding, water access).



f. Approach to minimum space allowance (feed bunk and lying area)

The WG continued the discussion held during the last WG meeting on availability of data on the literature on the relationship between space allowance and certain behaviour (e.g. locomotion, lying behaviour and play behaviour). EFSA staff presented to the WG the search strings and the results of the literature search on the relationship between space allowance and lying behaviour in beef cattle. A group discussion followed on the best approach to proceed.

g. Discussion on decision making criteria for the euthanasia of cull dairy and suckler cows being kept for the production of beef

A brief discussion was conducted on the information to be found and the approach to be used regarding decision making criteria for the euthanasia of cull cows.

h. Discussion on ABM tables

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

Tasks and next deadlines were identified and distributed among the WG experts.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Friday the 31st of January 2025 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

13th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



19th November 2024

9:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 28th of November 2024

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Ute Knierim
Sonia Marti
Siobhan Mullan
- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Giulia Cecchinato, Eliana Lima, Marika Vitali
- Others:
Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. All the members were present. One new WG member and one new EFSA staff member were introduced.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Scientific topics for discussion ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

a. Sections on ToR2a on current practices in indoor housing and related welfare consequences (flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, extreme environmental heat, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle)

The WG discussed pending comments in the main text discussing the welfare consequences of selected housing topics. These sections focus on the welfare consequences experienced by fattening cattle, which is the animal category most frequently kept indoors. Some additional text was added on suckler cows and suckler calves because these animals can also be kept indoors (e.g. during winter in northern regions or areas with high altitude). It was concluded that most welfare consequences from indoor housing conditions are also experienced by suckler cows and suckler calves, but when differences exist, some text was added to the text to explain it. The conclusions and recommendations on these aspects were reviewed by the working group. Editorial changes were made on the section on conclusions on environmental enrichment and on mixing of cattle. The next step is to finalise the section on extreme environmental heat. The AHAW Panel will review these sections in their December meeting and will provide feedback to the WG.

b. Conclusions and recommendations on mutilations - disbudding and dehorning

The welfare consequences of three types of mutilations will be assessed by the WG in the context of this mandate: castration, disbudding/dehorning, and tail docking. The first section assessed was disbudding/dehorning and the structure of the text was reviewed and agreed on. The WG also discussed conclusions and recommendations and agreed to include further detail on criteria to assess the efficacy of analgesia. The next step will be to estimate the certainty of the key conclusions in this section.

c. ABMs at slaughter

The WG discussed the final edits in this section and drafted recommendations.

d. Sources of uncertainty

In line with the EFSA guidance on uncertainty assessment, the WG identified the main sources of uncertainty potentially impacting the scientific assessment (specifically on TOR2a). The next step will be to identify sources of uncertainty relevant to the other sections of the scientific opinion.

e. Approach to minimum space allowance

There was a discussion on the methodological approach for the assessment of minimum space allowance. The WG discussed availability of data on the literature on the relationship between space allowance and certain behaviours (e.g. locomotion, lying behaviour and play behaviour). This discussion will be continued in the next working group meeting.

V. Any Other Business

The WG discussed and agreed on the timelines for completion of the next tasks.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Tuesday the 3rd of December 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

12th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



8th October 2024

9:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 17th of October 2024

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Ute Knierim
- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Eliana Lima, Marika Vitali, Martina Benedetta Zanna
- Others:
Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Sonia Marti.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 16th September 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 27th of September 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. Conclusions and Recommendations for ToR 2a: flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

Editorial changes to improve clarity of the text and avoid duplicated information were made to the conclusions and recommendations on the topics flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle. Conclusions that received major changes were subject to uncertainty assessment.

b. Approach to minimum space allowance ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The methodological approach for the assessment of minimum space allowance at different resources was presented to the WG members. A discussion followed and suggestions on the approach to assess the amount of space required to allow housed cattle to express their normal behavioural repertoire were taken.

c. Breeding and genetics: addressing comments from WG experts ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The reviews carried out by the experts as an assigned exercise in the previous WG meeting were discussed and open comments were addressed.

d. ABMs at slaughter ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

The experts were informed about the final dates chosen for next year's WG meetings. They were also informed that a new member will join the WG from the next meeting.

Lastly, possible solutions to the problem of accessibility of shared files via sharepoint were discussed.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Tuesday the 19th of November 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

11th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



16th September 2024

9:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 27th of September 2024

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Sonia Marti
Ute Knierim

- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Eliana Lima, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 10th July 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 19th of July 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. ToR 2a: Finalisation of uncertainty assessment for: flooring, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

All the uncertainty questions formulated based on the key conclusions of ToR 2a, that were still pending were finalised and a group discussion to reach a common consensus was held.

b. ToR 2a: Recommendations ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

Guidelines on how to write recommendations for ToR 2a were discussed and agreed upon with the WG experts. An individual exercise was then carried out by the WG experts to develop recommendations for the conclusions on water access, and the results were discussed to finalise the structure for how a recommendation should be written.

c. ToR 3: Animal-based measures (ABMs) collected at slaughter to measure welfare of beef cattle on farm ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The WG experts discussed the progress made on the selected ABMs for monitoring at the slaughterhouse as indicators of on-farm welfare in beef cattle. In the section of the Scientific Opinion addressing this ToR, each selected ABM is characterised by a description, interpretation, and considerations supporting the selection process. Open comments on these topics were addressed and suggestions on how to proceed were provided.

d. ToR 2d: The risk to welfare associated with the mutilation of cattle (castration, disbudding, dehorning and tail docking) ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The experts reviewed the work done so far in the Scientific Opinion on this ToR. The open comments were read and addressed by the working group. A group discussion followed on the possibility of merging the disbudding and dehorning chapters together and it ended with a common agreement to merge them.

e. Update ToR 1: Technical Report ([EFSA-Q-2024-00127](#))

It was agreed that the first draft developed by EFSA will be submitted to the working group at the next WG meeting.

VI. Any Other Business

Tasks and next deadlines were identified and distributed among the WG experts.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Tuesday the 8th of October 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

10th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



10th July 2024

9:00-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 19th of July 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Sonia Marti
Ute Knierim

- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Ester Alaez Pons

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 14th June 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 28th of June 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. ToR 3: Animal-based measures (ABMs) collected at slaughter to measure welfare of beef cattle on farm ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The exercise regarding the selection of ante-mortem and post-mortem ABMs to be used at slaughter to monitor the welfare of beef cattle on farm was finalized. Prior to the meeting, the experts had conducted individually, as preparatory work, the second step of the semi-quantitative exercise about the selection of ABMs in response to ToR3. During the meeting, the experts revised their judgment via group discussion and agreed on the final list of ABMs to be assessed at the slaughterhouse as indicators of the on-farm welfare of beef cattle. A total of six ABMs were selected and it was agreed that descriptions of those ABMs will be included in the Scientific Opinion.

b. ToR 2a: Finalisation of uncertainty assessment for: environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

The experts were notified that the upcoming WG meetings scheduled from September to December would be extended from half-day to full-day sessions.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Monday the 16th of September 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

9th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



14th June 2024

9:00-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 28th of June 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Giulio Cozzi
Sonia Marti
Ute Knierim

- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Ester Alaez Pons

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Bernadette Earley.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 30th May 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 7th of June 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. ToR 2a: Finalisation of uncertainty assessment for flooring, water access and nutrition and feeding ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The uncertainty questions formulated by EFSA Staff, based on the key conclusions identified by the experts, were presented to the working group. A subsequent rephrasing of both conclusions and uncertainty questions was conducted to refine them. The WG provided their individual judgment on the certainty for each rephrased question, according to three certainty ranges: >50-100%, 66-100% and 90-100%. The range encompassing all individual judgements was selected. If any single expert disagrees with the proposed range, a group discussion was initiated to reach a consensus on the certainty range.

b. ToR 2a: Finalisation of conclusions environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

c. Approach to minimum space allowance ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

Queries regarding the chapter « Extreme environmental heat » have been presented to the working group, and suggestions on how to proceed were taken.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Wednesday the 10th of July 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

8th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



30th May 2024

14:00-18:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 7th of June 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Bernadette Earley
Giulio Cozzi
Sonia Marti
- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Ester Alaez Pons
- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Yves Pascal Van der Stede, Sean Ashe, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio,
Martina Benedetta Zanna
- Others:
Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Ute Knierim.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 18th – 19th April 2024, in Parma

The [minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 30th of April 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. ToR 2a: Finalization of conclusions and uncertainty assessment for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The Working Group revised the latest conclusions written for the chapters on flooring, water access, and nutrition and feeding. A rephrasing step followed to homogenize their structure. The uncertainty questions for the flooring chapter, previously prepared by EFSA staff, were presented, evaluated and rephrased by the working group.

The finalization of the conclusions related to environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle was postponed due to lack of time.

The principles behind the EFSA Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments were explained to the working group, but its implementation was postponed due to lack of time.

b. Approach to minimum space allowance ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

None

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Friday the 14th of June 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

7th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



18th / 19th April 2024

9:00-18:00 / 9:00-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 30th of April 2024

Location: Parma

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Christoph Winckler (Chair)
Bernadette Earley
Giulio Cozzi
Sonia Marti
Ute Knierim

- Hearing Experts¹:
Luc Mounier
Maria Mountricha
Martina Zappaterra

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Not applicable

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
Barbara Padalino, Leonardo Nanni Costa and Noad Thomas Masebo participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. GP/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/10) for agenda item V.g and V.h, via web conference on the second day (19 April 2024)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. On the second day of the meeting (19 April 2024), apologies were received by Christoph Winckler and Leonardo Nanni Costa.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 15th March 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 25th of March 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. ToR 3: ABMs at slaughter ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The working group was briefed on the exercise regarding the selection of ante-mortem and post-mortem ABMs to be used at slaughter to monitor the welfare of beef cattle on farm. The first phase of the exercise, which consists of screening the ABMs from the initial list of 25 ABMs proposed by the AHAW Network members, was carried out. A brief info session followed on what the next steps of the exercise would be and the WG members were tasked with completing the second phase of the exercise individually before the next meeting.

b. ToR 2a: finalisation of conclusions and uncertainty assessment for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment and mixing of cattle ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The work done so far in relation to conclusions for the above-mentioned topics was presented and evaluated by the working group. A rephrasing step followed for the conclusions related to flooring to standardize the structure and a decision was made on how to proceed with the drafting of the other conclusions. The uncertainty assessment exercise was explained to the working group, but it was postponed to the next meeting.

c. Discussion and finalisation of the WCs selected for extreme environmental heat (in housed cattle), castration, disbudding, dehorning and tail docking ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The results of the individual welfare consequences selection exercise for the above-mentioned topics were presented to the working group. A discussion on each selected WC followed to reach a common consensus.

d. Discussion and finalisation of the WCs selected for fattening cattle kept at grass, fattening cattle kept in feedlots, welfare of suckler cows and calves at weaning ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

The results of the individual welfare consequences selection exercise for the above-mentioned topics were presented to the working group. A discussion on each selected WC followed to reach a common consensus.

e. ToR 2a: Approach to minimum space allowance at different resources ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#)).

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

f. ABMs tables ([EFSA-Q-2023-00535](#))

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.



g. ToR 1: Technical report (Art. 31) on husbandry systems and current practices ([EFSA-Q-2024-00127](#))

The contractors provided an overview of the progress on assigned tasks and suggestions from the working group experts were taken.

h. ToR 2e: Breeding strategies and Genetics

The contractors provided an overview of the progress on assigned tasks and suggestions from the working group experts were taken.

VI. Any Other Business

None

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Thursday the 30th of May 2024 via web conference.

15th March 2024

9:00-13:00 CET

MINUTES - Agreed on the 25th of March 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Giulio Cozzi

Bernadette Earley

Ute Knierim

Sonia Marti

Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts¹:

Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. Feedback on work done about summary conclusions for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding strategies, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access as well as mixing of cattle

The work done so far by WG members in relation to interventions to summary conclusions was presented. Open comments in relation to these topics were addressed and suggestions on how to proceed were taken.

2. Approach to minimum space allowance

The model used to deal with space allowance in the Scientific Opinion on welfare of ducks, geese and quail on farm was presented to the WG experts and a discussion on its suitability for cattle followed. Subsequently, the approach to take into account the behavioural needs of cattle was discussed.

3. Update on progress in the Scientific Opinion of: heat indoors, feedlots, fattening cattle at grass, weaning, mutilations, breeding, and cull cows.

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

4. Selection of WCs for extreme environmental heat, castration, disbudding, dehorning, tail docking.

A brief info session was conducted to introduce the WG members to the new tool with which welfare consequences for topics not yet covered in the Opinion will be selected from now on.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Thursday the 18th and Friday the 19th of April 2024.

²https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

**SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE**

**5th Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF
CATTLE**



7th February 2024

9:00-13:00 CET

MINUTES - Agreed on the 15th of February 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Giulio Cozzi

Bernadette Earley

Ute Knierim

Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts:

Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion



1. ABMs tables: definition of feasibility

The introduction to the chapter « ABMs useful for detecting and monitoring each welfare consequence » was presented to the WG. A discussion followed on the broadness of the concept of feasibility and clarifications on the expression of sensitivity and specificity were given. Subsequently, the selection of the welfare consequences « Bone lesions » and « Locomotory disorders » in relation to flooring was discussed and suggestions on definitions of some ABMs were taken.

2. Feedback on work done about preventive and mitigating measures & initial thoughts on recommendations for flooring, nutrition and feeding strategies, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access as well as mixing of cattle

The work done so far by WG members in relation to interventions to prevent or mitigate the selected WCs was presented. Suggestions on how to proceed in drafting ultimate conclusions and recommendations were taken.

3. Approach to minimum space allowance

An update on the data available in the literature regarding recommended space allowances for housed cattle was presented to the WG. A discussion followed on the approach to assessing the amount of space required to allow housed animals to express their normal behavioural repertoire. Documentation suggested by experts was taken.

4. Initial thoughts about decision making criteria for the euthanasia of end of career dairy and suckler cows

A brief discussion was conducted on the information to be found and the approach to be used regarding the fitness for transport of cull cows. Documentation suggested by experts was taken.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Friday the 15th of March 2024.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

4th Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



15th January 2024

14:00-18:00 CET

MINUTES - Agreed on the 25th of January 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Giulio Cozzi

Bernadette Earley

Ute Knierim

Sonia Marti

Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts:

Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.



IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. ABMs tables for each welfare consequences

The updated ABMs tables were presented to the WG. A discussion followed regarding the expression of feasibility, sensitivity and specificity (in terms of terminology and number of options) and how to deal with different animal categories within the tables.

2. Feedback on work done & initial thoughts on preventive and mitigating measures for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access as well as mixing of cattle

The work done so far by WG members was presented. Current practices, interventions to prevent or mitigate the selected WCs and their effect on the WCs experienced by the animals were discussed.

3. Approach to minimum space allowance

The recently used approaches to space allowance from other EFSA Opinions were presented to the WG. A discussion followed regarding what husbandry systems and animal categories should be considered and what ABMs/behaviours should be assessed to recommend a minimum space allowance for housed animals. To address the latter topic, a summary of behavioural variables, with related description, was presented to the WG.

4. EFSA network questionnaire

Brief info sessions to inform the WG experts about updates and deadlines of the EFSA network questionnaire.

5. Dealing with references

Brief info sessions to agree on how to handle references.

6. Protocol for technical report

This agenda item was not covered, but questions that address the tasks EFSA assigned to the University of Bologna were presented to the WG.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Wednesday the 7th of February 2024.

20th December 2023

14:00-18:00 CET

MINUTES - Agreed on the 8th of January 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Giulio Cozzi

Bernadette Earley

Ute Knierim

Sonia Marti

Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts:

Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.



IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. Structure of the Scientific Opinion

The structure of the Scientific Opinion was presented and questions/suggestions were taken.

2. Feedback on work done & selection of welfare consequences for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access as well as mixing of cattle.

The work done so far by WG members and the welfare consequences selected for each topic were presented and discussed and suggestions were taken.

3. ABM tables for each welfare consequence

The ABMs tables retrieved from previously published Opinions on cattle were presented to the WG. A discussion followed regarding the choice to merge the tables of calves and of every other category of adult cattle and regarding the expression of feasibility, sensitivity and specificity.

4. Approach to minimum space allowance

The methodology used to recommend a minimum space allowance in the Scientific Opinion on welfare of cattle during transport was presented and discussed to see if and how it can be adapted to the beef cattle Opinion.

5. Tollgate dates

Brief info session on the 152nd AHAW Panel Plenary web meeting had last week where the protocol was presented and Tollgate1 was passed.

6. EFSA network questionnaire

Brief info sessions on retrieving some information about mutilation from the EFSA network. The draft questionnaire to be sent to all the network members representative was presented.

7. Dealing with references

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

8. Call for Evidence

9. This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

10. Next tasks

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Monday the 15th of January 2024.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

2nd Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE



14th November 2023

09:00-13:00 CET

MINUTES - Agreed on the 22nd of NOVEMBER 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Giulio Cozzi

Bernadette Earley

Ute Knierim

Sonia Marti

Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts:

Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.



IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. The Protocol

The problem formulation and approach was discussed and developed for Terms of Reference (ToRs) 2 and 3.

2. External support

The scientific preparatory work potentially available to the working group was discussed.

3. Briefing on the stakeholder's meeting and next steps

Feedback on the Welfare of Beef Cattle stakeholder's meeting hosted by EFSA in Brussels on the 7th of November was given to the working group.

4. Summary of housing studies

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

5. Structure of the Scientific Opinion

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

6. Selection of topic by experts

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Wednesday the 20th of December 2023.

**SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE**

**1st Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF
CATTLE**



03rd October 2023

14:00-18:00 CET

MINUTES - Agreed on the 10th of October 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Giulio Cozzi

Sonia Marti

Christoph Winckler (Chair)

Ute Knierim

Bernadette Earley

- Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable

- EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean and Marika Vitali.

CSO: Maria Mountricha

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest



related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

IV1. Presentation of the mandate

The Terms of Reference of the mandate were presented. Some discussion followed regarding the interpretation of some of the Terms of Reference.

IV2. Presentation of the animal welfare assessment methodology

EFSA's approach to Risk Assessment in animal welfare was presented and discussed including the identification and description of current practices that will be assessed. For the categories of cattle, husbandry practices and hazards described in the mandate EFSA will:

Identify the most relevant welfare consequences.

Describe suitable Animal Based Measures to detect and monitor the most relevant Welfare Consequences.

Provide recommendations to prevent or mitigate the welfare consequences.

The list of Welfare Consequences (WCs) and affective states used by EFSA in its assessments was presented to the WG. Examples of some relationships between hazards and ABMs was presented and discussed.

V. Any Other Business

A timeline for completion of the Scientific Opinion was presented and discussed. The deadline for adoption of the scientific opinion by the AHAW Panel is June 2025

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place in November 2023, the date has yet to be confirmed.
