SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

11th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

16th September 2024
9:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on the 27th of September 2024

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)
  Giulio Cozzi
  Sonia Marti
  Ute Knierim

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Luc Mounier

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
  Not applicable

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Eliana Lima, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
  Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 10th July 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 19th of July 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. ToR 2a: Finalisation of uncertainty assessment for: flooring, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

All the uncertainty questions formulated based on the key conclusions of ToR 2a, that were still pending were finalised and a group discussion to reach a common consensus was held.

b. ToR 2a: Recommendations (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

Guidelines on how to write recommendations for ToR 2a were discussed and agreed upon with the WG experts. An individual exercise was then carried out by the WG experts to develop recommendations for the conclusions on water access, and the results were discussed to finalise the structure for how a recommendation should be written.

c. ToR 3: Animal-based measures (ABMs) collected at slaughter to measure welfare of beef cattle on farm (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The WG experts discussed the progress made on the selected ABMs for monitoring at the slaughterhouse as indicators of on-farm welfare in beef cattle. In the section of the Scientific Opinion addressing this ToR, each selected ABM is characterised by a description, interpretation, and considerations supporting the selection process. Open comments on these topics were addressed and suggestions on how to proceed were provided.

d. ToR 2d: The risk to welfare associated with the mutilation of cattle (castration, disbudding, dehorning and tail docking) (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The experts reviewed the work done so far in the Scientific Opinion on this ToR. The open comments were read and addressed by the working group. A group discussion followed on the possibility of merging the disbudding and dehorning chapters together and it ended with a common agreement to merge them.

e. Update ToR 1: Technical Report (EFSA-Q-2024-00127)

It was agreed that the first draft developed by EFSA will be submitted to the working group at the next WG meeting.

VI. Any Other Business

Tasks and next deadlines were identified and distributed among the WG experts.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Tuesday the 8th of October 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

10th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

10th July 2024
9:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on the 19th of July 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)
  Giulio Cozzi
  Sonia Marti
  Ute Knierim

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Luc Mounier

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
  EC: Ester Alaez Pons

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
  Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 14th June 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 28th of June 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. ToR 3: Animal-based measures (ABMs) collected at slaughter to measure welfare of beef cattle on farm (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The exercise regarding the selection of ante-mortem and post-mortem ABMs to be used at slaughter to monitor the welfare of beef cattle on farm was finalized. Prior to the meeting, the experts had conducted individually, as preparatory work, the second step of the semi-quantitative exercise about the selection of ABMs in response to ToR3. During the meeting, the experts revised their judgment via group discussion and agreed on the final list of ABMs to be assessed at the slaughterhouse as indicators of the on-farm welfare of beef cattle. A total of six ABMs were selected and it was agreed that descriptions of those ABMs will be included in the Scientific Opinion.

b. ToR 2a: Finalisation of uncertainty assessment for: environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

The experts were notified that the upcoming WG meetings scheduled from September to December would be extended from half-day to full-day sessions.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Monday the 16th of September 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

9th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

14th June 2024
9:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on the 28th of June 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)
  Giulio Cozzi
  Sonia Marti
  Ute Knierim

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Luc Mounier

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
  EC: Ester Alaez Pons

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
  Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Bernadette Earley.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 30th May 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 7th of June 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. ToR 2a: Finalisation of uncertainty assessment for flooring, water access and nutrition and feeding (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The uncertainty questions formulated by EFSA Staff, based on the key conclusions identified by the experts, were presented to the working group. A subsequent rephrasing of both conclusions and uncertainty questions was conducted to refine them. The WG provided their individual judgment on the certainty for each rephrased question, according to three certainty ranges: >50-100%, 66-100% and 90-100%. The range encompassing all individual judgements was selected. If any single expert disagrees with the proposed range, a group discussion was initiated to reach a consensus on the certainty range.

b. ToR 2a: Finalisation of conclusions environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

c. Approach to minimum space allowance (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

Queries regarding the chapter « Extreme environmental heat » have been presented to the working group, and suggestions on how to proceed were taken.

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Wednesday the 10th of July 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

8th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

30th May 2024
14:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on the 7th of June 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)
  Bernadette Earley
  Giulio Cozzi
  Sonia Marti

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Luc Mounier

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
  EC: Ester Alaez Pons

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Yves Pascal Van der Stede, Sean Ashe, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
  Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Ute Knierim.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 18th – 19th April 2024, in Parma

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 30th of April 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. ToR 2a: Finalization of conclusions and uncertainty assessment for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The Working Group revised the latest conclusions written for the chapters on flooring, water access, and nutrition and feeding. A rephrasing step followed to homogenize their structure. The uncertainty questions for the flooring chapter, previously prepared by EFSA staff, were presented, evaluated and rephrased by the working group.
The finalization of the conclusions related to environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access and mixing of cattle was postponed due to lack of time.
The principles behind the EFSA Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments were explained to the working group, but its implementation was postponed due to lack of time.

b. Approach to minimum space allowance (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

VI. Any Other Business

None

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Friday the 14th of June 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

7th Working Group meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

18th / 19th April 2024
9:00-18:00 / 9:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on the 30th of April 2024

Location: Parma

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)
  Bernadette Earley
  Giulio Cozzi
  Sonia Marti
  Ute Knierim

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  Luc Mounier
  Maria Mountricha
  Martina Zappaterra

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
  EC: Not applicable

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Sean Ashe, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio, Martina Benedetta Zanna

- Others:
  Barbara Padalino, Leonardo Nanni Costa and Noad Thomas Masebo participated as ISA (Individual Scientific Advisor) contractor (ref. GP/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/10) for agenda item V.g and V.h, via web conference on the second day (19 April 2024)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. On the second day of the meeting (19 April 2024), apologies were received by Christoph Winckler and Leonardo Nanni Costa.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 15th March 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25th of March 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. ToR 3: ABMs at slaughter (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The working group was briefed on the exercise regarding the selection of ante-mortem and post-mortem ABMs to be used at slaughter to monitor the welfare of beef cattle on farm. The first phase of the exercise, which consists of screening the ABMs from the initial list of 25 ABMs proposed by the AHAW Network members, was carried out. A brief info session followed on what the next steps of the exercise would be and the WG members were tasked with completing the second phase of the exercise individually before the next meeting.

b. ToR 2a: finalisation of conclusions and uncertainty assessment for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment and mixing of cattle (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The work done so far in relation to conclusions for the above-mentioned topics was presented and evaluated by the working group. A rephrasing step followed for the conclusions related to flooring to standardize the structure and a decision was made on how to proceed with the drafting of the other conclusions. The uncertainty assessment exercise was explained to the working group, but it was postponed to the next meeting.

c. Discussion and finalisation of the WCs selected for extreme environmental heat (in housed cattle), castration, disbudding, dehorning and tail docking (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The results of the individual welfare consequences selection exercise for the above-mentioned topics were presented to the working group. A discussion on each selected WC followed to reach a common consensus.

d. Discussion and finalisation of the WCs selected for fattening cattle kept at grass, fattening cattle kept in feedlots, welfare of suckler cows and calves at weaning (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

The results of the individual welfare consequences selection exercise for the above-mentioned topics were presented to the working group. A discussion on each selected WC followed to reach a common consensus.

e. ToR 2a: Approach to minimum space allowance at different resources (EFSA-Q-2023-00535).

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

f. ABMs tables (EFSA-Q-2023-00535)

This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

g. ToR 1: Technical report (Art. 31) on husbandry systems and current practices (EFSA-Q-2024-00127)

The contractors provided an overview of the progress on assigned tasks and suggestions from the working group experts were taken.

h. ToR 2e: Breeding strategies and Genetics

The contractors provided an overview of the progress on assigned tasks and suggestions from the working group experts were taken.

VI. Any Other Business

None

VII. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will be held on Thursday the 30th of May 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

6th Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

15th March 2024
9:00-13:00 CET
MINUTES - Agreed on the 25th of March 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Giulio Cozzi
  Bernadette Earley
  Ute Knierim
  Sonia Marti
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts[1]:

  Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

  BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

  Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. **Feedback on work done about summary conclusions for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding strategies, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access as well as mixing of cattle**
   The work done so far by WG members in relation to interventions to summary conclusions was presented. Open comments in relation to these topics were addressed and suggestions on how to proceed were taken.
2. **Approach to minimum space allowance**
   The model used to deal with space allowance in the Scientific Opinion on welfare of ducks, geese and quail on farm was presented to the WG experts and a discussion on its suitability for cattle followed. Subsequently, the approach to take into account the behavioural needs of cattle was discussed.
3. **Update on progress in the Scientific Opinon of: heat indoors, feedlots, fattening cattle at grass, weaning, mutilations, breeding, and cull cows.**
   This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.
4. **Selection of WCs for extreme environmental heat, castration, disbudding, dehorning, tail docking.**
   A brief info session was conducted to introduce the WG members to the new tool with which welfare consequences for topics not yet covered in the Opinion will be selected from now on.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Thursday the 18th and Friday the 19th of April 2024.

[2] https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

5th Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

7th February 2024
9:00-13:00 CET
MINUTES - Agreed on the 15th of February 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Giulio Cozzi
  Bernadette Earley
  Ute Knierim
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts:

  Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

  BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali, Roberta D'Alessio and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

  Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. **ABMs tables: definition of feasibility**
   The introduction to the chapter « ABMs useful for detecting and monitoring each welfare consequence » was presented to the WG. A discussion followed on the broadness of the concept of feasibility and clarifications on the expression of sensitivity and specificity were given. Subsequently, the selection of the welfare consequences « Bone lesions » and « Locomotory disorders » in relation to flooring was discussed and suggestions on definitions of some ABMs were taken.
2. **Feedback on work done about preventive and mitigating measures & initial thoughts on recommendations for flooring, nutrition and feeding strategies, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access as well as mixing of cattle**
   The work done so far by WG members in relation to interventions to prevent or mitigate the selected WCs was presented. Suggestions on how to proceed in drafting ultimate conclusions and recommendations were taken.
3. **Approach to minimum space allowance**
   An update on the data available in the literature regarding recommended space allowances for housed cattle was presented to the WG. A discussion followed on the approach to assessing the amount of space required to allow housed animals to express their normal behavioural repertoire. Documentation suggested by experts was taken.
4. **Initial thoughts about decision making criteria for the euthanasia of end of career dairy and suckler cows**
   A brief discussion was conducted on the information to be found and the approach to be used regarding the fitness for transport of cull cows. Documentation suggested by experts was taken.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Friday the 15th of March 2024.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

4th Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

15th January 2024
14:00-18:00 CET
MINUTES - Agreed on the 25th of January 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Giulio Cozzi
  Bernadette Earley
  Ute Knierim
  Sonia Marti
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts:

  Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

  BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

  Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. **ABMs tables for each welfare consequences**
   The updated ABMs tables were presented to the WG. A discussion followed regarding the expression of feasibility, sensitivity and specificity (in terms of terminology and number of options) and how to deal with different animal categories within the tables.
2. **Feedback on work done & initial thoughts on preventive and mitigating measures for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of outdoor access as well as mixing of cattle**
   The work done so far by WG members was presented. Current practices, interventions to prevent or mitigate the selected WCs and their effect on the WCs experienced by the animals were discussed.
3. **Approach to minimum space allowance**
   The recently used approaches to space allowance from other EFSA Opinions were presented to the WG. A discussion followed regarding what husbandry systems and animal categories should be considered and what ABMs/behaviours should be assessed to recommend a minimum space allowance for housed animals. To address the latter topic, a summary of behavioural variables, with related description, was presented to the WG.
4. **EFSA network questionnaire**
   Brief info sessions to inform the WG experts about updates and deadlines of the EFSA network questionnaire.
5. **Dealing with references**
   Brief info sessions to agree on how to handle references.
6. **Protocol for technical report**
   This agenda item was not covered, but questions that address the tasks EFSA assigned to the University of Bologna were presented to the WG.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Wednesday the 7th of February 2024.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

3rd Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

20th December 2023
14:00-18:00 CET
MINUTES - Agreed on the 8th of January 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Giulio Cozzi
  Bernadette Earley
  Ute Knierim
  Sonia Marti
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts:

  Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

  BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

  Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. **Structure of the Scientific Opinion**
   The structure of the Scientific Opinion was presented and questions/suggestions were taken.
2. **Feedback on work done & selection of welfare consequences for flooring, water access, nutrition and feeding, environmental enrichment, lack of ourdoor access as well as mixing of cattle.**
   The work done so far by WG members and the welfare consequences selected for each topic were presented and discussed and suggestions were taken.
3. **ABM tables for each welfare consequence**
   The ABMs tables retrieved from previously published Opinions on cattle were presented to the WG. A discussion followed regarding the choice to merge the tables of calves and of every other category of adult cattle and regarding the expression of feasibility, sensitivity and specificity.
4. **Approach to minimum space allowance**
   The methodology used to recommend a minimum space allowance in the Scientific Opinion on welfare of cattle during transport was presented and discussed to see if and how it can be adapted to the beef cattle Opinion.
5. **Tollgate dates**
   Brief info session on the 152nd AHAW Panel Plenary web meeting had last week where the protocol was presented and Tollgate1 was passed.
6. **EFSA network questionnaire**
   Brief info sessions on retrieving some information about mutilation from the EFSA network. The draft questionnaire to be sent to all the network members representative was presented.
7. **Dealing with references**
   This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.
8. **Call for Evidence**
9. This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.
10. **Next tasks**
    This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Monday the 15th of January 2024.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

2nd Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

14th November 2023
09:00-13:00 CET
MINUTES - Agreed on the 22nd of NOVEMBER 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Giulio Cozzi
  Bernadette Earley
  Ute Knierim
  Sonia Marti
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)

- Hearing Experts:

  Luc Mounier

- EFSA:

  BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean, Marika Vitali and Martina Benedetta Zanna.

- Others:

  Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

1. **The Protocol**
   The problem formulation and approach was discussed and developed for Terms of Reference (ToRs) 2 and 3.
2. **External support**
   The scientific preparatory work potentially available to the working group was discussed.
3. **Briefing on the stakeholder's meeting and next steps**
   Feedback on the Welfare of Beef Cattle stakeholder's meeting hosted by EFSA in Brusssels on the 7th of November was given to the working group.
4. **Summary of housing studies**
   This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.
5. **Structure of the Scientific Opinion**
   This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.
6. **Selection of topic by experts**
   This agenda item was postponed due to lack of time.

V. Any Other Business

None.

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place on Wednesday the 20th of December 2023.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

1st Working Group Meeting on the PROTECTION OF BEEF CATTLE

03rd October 2023
14:00-18:00 CET
MINUTES - Agreed on the10th of October 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Giulio Cozzi
  Sonia Marti
  Christoph Winckler (Chair)
  Ute Knierim
  Bernadette Earley

- Hearing Experts:

  Not Applicable

- EFSA:

  BIOHAW Unit: Ashe Sean and Marika Vitali.
  CSO: Maria Mountricha

- Others:

  Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest

related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

IV1. Presentation of the mandate

The Terms of Reference of the mandate were presented. Some discussion followed regarding the interpretation of some of the Terms of Reference.

IV2. Presentation of the animal welfare assessment methodology

EFSA's approach to Risk Assessment in animal welfare was presented and discussed including the identification and description of current practices that will be assessed. For the categories of cattle, husbandry practices and hazards described in the mandate EFSA will:

Identify the most relevant welfare consequences.

Describe suitable Animal Based Measures to detect and monitor the most relevant Welfare Consequences.

Provide recommendations to prevent or mitigate the welfare consequences.

The list of Welfare Consequences (WCs) and affective states used by EFSA in its assessments was presented to the WG. Examples of some relationships between hazards and ABMs was presented and discussed.

V. Any Other Business

A timeline for completion of the Scientific Opinion was presented and discussed. The deadline for adoption of the scientific opinion by the AHAW Panel is June 2025

VI. Next meeting

The next Working Group meeting will take place in November 2023, the date has yet to be confirmed.