SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

9th Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

12th July 2024
09:00 -17:30
MINUTES - Agreed on 25th July 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Jutta Berk

  Joanna Marchewka

  Anja Riber

  Nienke van Staaveren

  Antonio Velarde Calvo

- Hearing Experts[1]: Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

  EC: Susanne Dittmann Rasmussen

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos, Marika Vitali (Scientific topics for discussion point V.C)

  MESE Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (Scientific topics for discussion point V.B)

- Others: Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 21st June 2024, via web conference

The minutes of the 8th Working Group (WG) meeting were agreed by written procedure on 08 July 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

Draft Scientific opinion (SO) on the welfare of turkeys on farm (**EFSA-Q-2023- 00647**)

A. Preparation for an ad-hoc technical hearing meeting

In relation to ToR 2, Requests 2C and 2F, the WG highlighted the need for more information on breeders as there is little knowledge in the literature on the housing systems where they are kept and the risk factors and practices they are subjected to, as well as the breeding and genetic traits that improve and/or impair welfare. On the basis of the EFSA Engagement Strategy for AW mandates, it was agreed to organise an *ad-hoc* technical hearing on turkeys breeders, breeding stategies and genetic traits with stakeholders who have already submitted relevant data and information to EFSA (during the stakeholder meeting or via the call for evidence) to clarify certain aspects with the WG experts.
In preparation for the technical hearing meeting, it was agreed to prepare a specific questionnaire for retrieving the necessary information. The draft questionnaire was discussed by the WG and modifications agreed: the questionnaire mainly relates to the definitions and descriptions of breeding traits, the definitions for the different categories of turkey breeders and the related husbandry systems and practices.

B. Expert knowledge elicitation (EKE) to inform the behavioural space model

To address ToR-B, request 2A of the mandate in relation to the factor 'space allowance', the WG continued the elicitation (EKE exercise) started during the 8th WG meeting. The information needed for the exercise are planimetric data for some behaviours, adaptation factors for the remaining behaviours, the interindividual distance and the time budget for each behaviour. The WG discussed the literature that was considered useful for the elicitation and the relevant data extracted from it. Considerations were provided on the differences between sexes and genotypes in relation to the dimensions of turkey individuals and the surface occupied when performing diverse behaviours.
Due to the variety of turkey production in the EU, the EKE was carried out on different values of the parameter 'body weight'; in particular the exercise was on the average area on the ground in cm^2 occupied by turkeys of 7, 12, 16, 25 kg turkey (shortly before slaughter), respectively, when performing stationary behaviour for which the lower bound, 1st quartile, median, 3rd quartile and upper bound were elicited by the working group.

C. Animal-based measures (ABMs) collected at slaughter to measure welfare of turkeys on farm.

The WG experts discussed and finalised the exercise on the selection of ABMs to suggest for monitoring at the slaughterhouse as indicators of the on-farm welfare of turkeys (ToR-B, request 5). The outcomes of the individual exercise were presented and discussed. A final set of ABMs was agreed via group discussion based on the four criteria: (i) link to welfare consequences, (ii) possibility of automatization, (iii) already measured at slaughter, (iv) relevance of the judgement of the EFSA network. The final set of ABMs will be further described on the basis of the scientific literature. Subsequently, the WG discussed the structure of the section(s) in the scientific opinion addressing this ToR which will be consistent with other Farm to Fork Scientific Opinions on animal welfare. Each selected ABM will be characterised by a description, interpretation, and considerations supporting the selection process. It was agreed that the first draft developed by the contractor will be reviewed by the working group and discussed at the next WG meeting.

VI. Any Other Business

Project management, tasks and assignments

Timeline and next deadlines of the project were discussed. Tasks were identified and distributed among the WG experts, in particular in relation to ToR B, request 2A (type and condition of the litter, type and presence of enrichment and space allowance), and requests 2F and 5 of the mandate.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 16th-17th October 2024, in hybrid mode, in Parma and via web-conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

8th Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

21st June 2024
09:00 -17:30
MINUTES - Agreed on 8th July 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Jutta Berk

  Joanna Marchewka

  Virginie Michel

  Anja Riber

  Nienke van Staaveren

  Antonio Velarde Calvo

- Hearing Experts[1]: Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

  EC: Susanne Dittmann Rasmussen, Kirsten Vornhagen

- EFSA:
  -BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos, Marika Vitali (Scientific topic for discussion point V.B), Yves Van der Stede, Aitana Lopez

  -MESE Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (Scientific topic for discussion point V.A)

- Others: Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 23rd - 24th May 2024, via hybrid conference

The minutes of the 7th Working Group (WG) meeting were agreed by written procedure on 6th June 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

Draft Scientific opinion on the welfare of turkeys on farm (**EFSA-Q-2023- 00647**)

A. Expert knowledge elicitation (EKE) behavioural space model

To address ToR-B, request 2A of the mandate, and in particular to assess the factor 'space allowance' for turkeys, an EKE exercise was identified to be carried out following a model on space allowance to ascertain the space that turkeys need physiologically for performing different behaviours. An evidence dossier was prepared including scientific literature out of which data was extracted and the WG experts assessed the data; some key parameters like the turkeys 'body surface sitting and standing', 'body length with feathers', 'age of slaughter' and 'body weight' were discussed for turkey toms and turkey hens as well as the shape of the area occupied by the turkey individuals when performing diverse behaviours such as sitting and standing, preening, dustbathing and wing flapping. The working group emphasized that turkeys are slaughtered at different body weights in the EU Member States and the WG agreed to base the EKE on diverse ranges of this parameter. An EKE was carried out amongst the 6 experts on the average area on the ground in cm^2 occupied by a 20 kg turkey for which the lower bound, 1st quartile, median, 3rd quartile and upper bound were elicited.

B. Animal-based measures (ABMs) collected at slaughter to measure welfare of turkeys on farm

The assessment of ABMs at slaughter to monitor animal welfare on farm was discussed as per the ToR-B, request 5. The approach to address this ToR was presented to the WG. It consists of a two-steps exercise, starting from the list of 19 ABMs discussed in May 2023 by the EFSA Network of the scientific National Contact Points (NCPs) for Art 20 for Regulation 1099/2009 (EFSA, 2021[44]). Initially, the WG experts reached consensus on the definitions of the ABMs that can be monitored during slaughtering of turkeys in *ante*- or *post-mortem* inspections. Subsequently, a first exercise was run to screen which ABMs should be further analysed. The screening was conducted by group discussion which lead to group consensus based on four criteria: i) Relevance to animal welfare; ii) Relationship with the farm (and not transport or lairage phases); iii) Existing data in literature on the ABM; iv) Feasibility for large scale collection of the ABM. After the screening was conducted the initial list of 19 ABMs was reduced. Subsequently, a second step of this exercise will be conducted individually as preparatory work for the next WG meeting and will be based on the relevant information gathered from the scientific literature, the WG experts knowledge and experience and the outcomes of the EFSA NCPs Network discussion. This second step aims at selecting the final list of ABMs to suggest for monitoring at the slaughterhouse as indicators of the on-farm welfare of turkeys.

VI. Any Other Business

[4] https://doi.org/10.2903/sp.efsa.2023.EN-8383

Project management, tasks and assignments

Timeline and next deadlines of the project were discussed.

Tasks were identified and distributed among the WG experts; in relation to item V.B above experts were requested to perform the individual selection of ABMs at slaughter to monitor animal welfare on farm (second step will be presented and discussed at the next WG meeting).

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 12th July 2024, via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

7th Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

23rd- 24th May 2024
09:00 -17:30; 09:00 - 17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 6 June 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Hybrid (in-person in Parma EFSA/ web)

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Jutta Berk

  Joanna Marchewka (web)

  Virginie Michel

  Anja Riber

  Nienke van Staaveren

  Antonio Velarde Calvo (Chair)

- Hearing Experts[1]: Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

  EC: Susanne Dittmann Rasmussen (web), Kirsten Vornhagen (web)

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos, Yves Van der Stede

  MESE Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (Scientific topics for discussion point V.B)

- Others: Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 23rd April 2024, via web conference

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 3rd of May 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

Draft Scientific opinion (SO) on the welfare of turkeys on farm (**EFSA-Q-2023- 00647**)

A. Definitions of Welfare Consequences and related ABMs

The definitions for the following Welfare Consequences (WC): handling stress, inability to express prelaying and nesting (maternal) behaviours, inability to perform comfort behaviour, prolonged thirst, sensory under and/or over estimulation and predation stress were revised and agreed by the Working Group (WG) members. The ABMs that can be used to assess these WCs and soft tissue and integument damage were also discussed in detail; on the basis of the literature and previous EFSA SOs on poultry welfare, the WG agreed on a final set of ABMs and on their definitions.

B. Hazard characterization of the mandate's factors: 'space allowance', 'type and presence of enrichment', and 'type and condition of the litter'

In relation to 'type and presence of enrichment', 'type and litter condition' and 'space allowance', the WG discussed the evidence retrieved from the literature review and complemented it with the results of the public call for evidence. It was agreed to perform a semi-formal expert knowledge elicitation on the impact of space allowance on the welfare of turkeys on farm. Literature will be examined in detail to extract data for the exercise on space allowance.

Regarding the factor 'type and presence of enrichment' the WG discussed the differences between nutritious and non-nutritious enrichments, elevated platforms and perches and how they could influence turkeys' welfare. In the case of 'type and condition of the litter' the WG discussed the impact of different kinds of litter on the identified welfare consequences. Additional evidence would be collected and explored for a complete assessment of these two factors.

C. Assessment of other factors listed in ToR2

The WG discussed the data and information needed to answer to ToR B Request 2f on how breeding and genetic traits can improve and/or impair turkeys' welfare.

VI. Any Other Business

Project management, tasks and assignments

Timeline and next deadlines of the project were discussed.

Tasks were identified and distributed among the WG experts.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 21st June 2024, via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

6th Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

23rd April 2024
09:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 03 May 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Jutta Berk

  Joanna Marchewka

  Virginie Michel

  Anja Riber

  Nienke van Staaveren

  Antonio Velarde Calvo (Chair)

- Hearing Experts[1]: Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

  EC: Kirsten Vornhagen, Susanne Dittmann Rasmussen

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos

- Others: Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 26th March 2024, via web conference

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 5th of April 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

A. Draft Scientific opinion (SO) on the welfare of turkeys on farm (EFSA-Q-2023- 00647)

a. Definition of the relevant Welfare consequences (WC) and list and definition of animal-based measures (ABMs)

The WG members agreed on the definitions of the following WCs identified as relevant for turkeys: cold stress, group stress, heat stress, locomotory disorders, prolonged hunger, restriction of movement, and soft tissue and integument damage. The WG members agreed on a list of ABMs to assess the above-mentioned WCs in turkeys and defined them.

b. Hazard characterization of the mandate's factor 'space allowance', the 'type and presence of enrichment', and the 'type and condition of the litter'

The WG members discussed the preliminary outcomes on the mandate's factor 'space allowance' that were produced based on the literature collected through Web of Science (WOS) and supplemented by the scientific inputs obtained from the Public Call for Evidence. For the factors 'type and presence of enrichment' and 'type and condition of the litter' a similar process will be followed.

VI. Any Other Business

Project management, tasks and assignments

Timeline and next deadlines of the project were discussed.

Tasks were identified and distributed among the WG experts. It was agreed that the WG will draft the description of the remaining WCs and ABMs; the sections of the draft SO reporting on the 'type and presence of enrichment', the 'type and condition of the litter' and 'space allowance' will be presented for discussion at the next WG meeting.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 23rd-24th May 2024, in hybrid mode, in Parma and web-conference.

Agreement of the minutes	
Jutta Berk	Yes
Joanna Marchewka	Yes

Virginie Michel	Yes
Anja Riber	Yes
Nienke van Staaveren	Yes
Antonio Velarde Calvo	Yes

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

5th Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

26th March 2024
09:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 5th April 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Jutta Berk

  Joanna Marchewka

  Virginie Michel

  Anja Riber

  Nienke van Staaveren

  Antonio Velarde Calvo (Chair)

- Hearing Experts[1]: Nedra Abdelli, Alexandra Contreras attending via web conferencing the scientific topic for discussion 'b.' via the Framework Partnership Agreement No GP/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/10 LOT 1 and specific agreement No 5-2022

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

  EC: Kirsten Vornhagen

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos, Yves Van der Stede

- Others: Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Susanne Dittmann Rasmussen and Aranzazu Varvaro sent their apologies.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 28th February 2024, via web conference

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 12th of March 2024.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

A. Draft Scientific opinion (SO) on the welfare of turkeys on farm (EFSA-Q-2023- 00647)

a. Feedback on the draft Husbandry systems report prepared by the contractor

The working group (WG) provided feedback on the contractor's report on the husbandry systems of turkeys kept on farm based on the results of a survey and a literature review. The contractor accepted to include additional summary tables of the results of the surveys of relevant factors of the mandate in the following version of the report.

b. Hazard characterization: results of literature searches on enrichment, space allowance and litter

EFSA presented the results of the literature searches conducted to retrieve scientific evidence on three of the factors listed in the mandate: type and presence of enrichment, space allowance and type and condition of the litter. The WG members screened titles and abstracts of the extracted records against specific inclusion and exclusion criteria and agreed to look for any additional publications that could be of relevance.

c. Definition of Welfare consequences and list and definition of animal-based measures (ABMs)

The WG reviewed and revised the definition of the welfare consequences 'gastroenteric disorders', 'respiratory disorders', 'soft tissue lesions and integument damage', 'group stress' and 'resting problems' included in the Methodological Guidance for the development of animal welfare mandates in the context of the farm to fork strategy (EFSA AHAW Panel, 2022)[4]. A list of animal-based measures (ABMs) that, according to scientific publications, can be used to assess the welfare consequences relevant for turkeys was provided and discussed by the WG. The ABMs for 'locomotory disorders (including lameness)', 'gastroenteric disorders' and 'inability to perform comfort behaviour' were discussed and agreed.

[4] EFSA AHAW Panel (EFSA Panel on Animal Health and Welfare), Nielsen, SS, Alvarez, J, Bicout, DJ, Calistri, P, Canali, E, Drewe, JA, Garin-Bastuji, B, Gonzales Rojas, JL, Gortazar Schmidt, C, Herskin, M, Miguel ´Angel Miranda, Chueca, Michel, V, Padalino, B, Pasquali, P, Roberts, HC, Spoolder, H, Stahl, K, Velarde, A, Viltrop, A, Edwards, S, Ashe, S, Candiani, D, Fabris, C, Lima, E, Mosbach-Schulz, O, Gimeno, CR, Van der Stede, Y, Vitali, M and Winckler, C, 2022. Scientific opinion on the methodological guidance for the development of animal welfare mandates in the context of the Farm to Fork Strategy. EFSA Journal 2022;20(7):7403, 29 pp. https:// doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2022.7403

VI. Any Other Business

Project management, tasks and assignments

Timeline and next deadlines of the project were discussed.

Tasks were identified and distributed among the WG experts. It was agreed that the sections of the draft SO reporting litter, enrichment and space allowance and the related hazards (see point b. above) and the welfare consequences and ABMs (see point c. above), will be drafted by the WG members and presented for discussion at the next WG meeting.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 23rd April 2024, via web conference.

Agreement of the minutes	
Jutta Berk	Yes
Joanna Marchewka	Yes
Virginie Michel	Yes
Anja Riber	Yes
Nienke van Staaveren	Yes
Antonio Velarde Calvo	Yes

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

4th Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

28th February 2024
09:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 12th March 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  Jutta Berk
  Joanna Marchewka
  Virginie Michel
  Anja Riber
  Nienke van Staaveren
  Antonio Velarde Calvo
- Hearing Experts[1]: Not applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives: not applicable
- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos
- Others: Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 26th January 2024, via web conference

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 12th of February 2024[3].

V. Scientific topics for discussion

A. Draft Scientific opinion (SO) on the welfare of turkeys on farm (EFSA-Q-2023-00647)

a. Feedback on the discussion of the protocol at the 154th AHAW Panel plenary meeting

The WG chair and EFSA updated the WG members on the outcomes of the AHAW Panel discussion on the protocol for the SO on the welfare of turkeys on farm that was presented at the 154th EFSA AHAW Panel plenary meeting. The protocol covers the problem formulation and the approach to be used for developing the SO. It was reported that the Panel agreed with the protocol and that Tollgate 1 was successfully passed.

b. Update on the linkages between factors and welfare consequences based on literature review

The WG discussed the scientific evidence that was provided in support to the identification of the links between the factors and practices listed in the mandate and the relevant welfare consequences. The overall results of this exercise were updated accordingly.

c. Identification of the hazards for the mandate factors

To address request 2.B (a) of the mandate, for turkeys kept for meat production, turkey breeders and poults, the WG members discussed, identified, and characterized the hazards related to the following factors: litter, enrichment and space allowance. The structure of the sections of the draft SO reporting on these factors and hazards, their descriptions and relationship with the relevant welfare consequences was also discussed and agreed.

d. Update on the outcomes of the Public call for evidence on the welfare of turkeys

EFSA informed the WG members about the outcome of the Public call for evidence on the welfare of turkeys that was launched between 7th December 2023 and 31st January 2024: a structured summary of the scientific content of the comments and attachments submitted was presented and discussed in detail.

VI. Any Other Business

Project management, tasks and assignments

Timeline and next deadlines of the project were discussed.

Tasks were identified and distributed among the WG experts. It was agreed that the sections of the draft SO reporting on litter, enrichment and space allowance and the related hazards (see point c. above), will be drafted by the WG members and presented for discussion at the next WG meeting.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 26th March 2024, via web conference.

Agreement of the minutes	
Jutta Berk	yes
Joanna Marchewka	yes
Virginie Michel	yes
Anja Riber	yes
Nienke van Staaveren	yes
Antonio Velarde Calvo	yes

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

3rd Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

26th January 2024
09:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 12th February 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Jutta Berk

  Joanna Marchewka

  Virginie Michel

  Anja Riber

  Nienke van Staaveren

  Antonio Velarde Calvo
- Hearing Experts: Not applicable
- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos
- Others: Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Susanne Dittmann Rasmussen from the European Commission sent her apologies.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 18th December 2023, via web conference

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 9th of January 2024[3].

V. Scientific topics for discussion

A. Draft opinion on the welfare of turkeys on farm (EFSA-Q-2023-00647)

a. Relevant welfare consequences for turkeys

Starting from the list of welfare consequences produced by the AHAW Panel (EFSA AHAW Panel, 2022), the working group (WG) carried out an exercise to identify which welfare consequences are relevant for turkeys in the diverse production systems and to be further assessed.

In addition, the WG agreed that additional welfare consequences could be described narratively (e.g., skin disorders, inability to perform play behaviour, and metabolic disorders).

b. Linking the factors and practices of the mandate to the relevant welfare consequences

The WG run an exercise to identify the links between the factors and practices listed in the mandate to the relevant welfare consequences. The factors and practices are: 1) litter condition, 2) enrichment, 3) covered veranda, 4) outdoor space, 5) space allowance, 6) concentration of ammonia, 7) concentration of CO_2, 8) temperature, 9) light condition, 10) group size, 11) separation of males and females, 12) final weight, 13) average daily weight gain, 14) the practice of thinning, 15) feed and water restriction, 16) age of onset of breeding, 17) nests conditions, 18) the practice of artificial insemination, 19) hatchery conditions, 20) the practice of mutilations (e.g. 21 beak trimming), 22) Breeding and genetics.

c. Protocol presentation

EFSA presented the draft protocol to the WG; it includes the problem formulation and the approach to be used. The protocol will be presented for consultation at the 154th EFSA AHAW Panel plenary meeting.

d. Update on the survey of mutilations on turkeys

The final version of the questionnaire on the mutilations practiced to turkeys was presented, discussed and agreed by the WG. The questionnaire will be sent to the EU Member States of the EFSA for AHAW (AW Topic) Network.

VI. Any Other Business

Project management, tasks and assignments

Timeline and next deadlines of the project were discussed. Tasks were identified and distributed among the WG experts accordingly.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 28th February 2024, via web conference.

Agreement of the minutes	
Jutta Berk	Yes
Joanna Marchewka	Yes
Virginie Michel	Yes
Anja Riber	Yes
Nienke van Staaveren	Yes
Antonio Velarde Calvo	Yes

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

2nd Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

18th December 2023
09:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 9th January 2024

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Jutta Berk

  Joanna Marchewka

  Virginie Michel

  Anja Riber

  Nienke van Staaveren

  Antonio Velarde Calvo

- Hearing Experts: Nedra Abdelli and Alexandra Contreras Jodar (attending the scientific topic for discussion 'b' via the Framework Partnership Agreement No 5-2022 GP/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/10 LOT 1):
- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos
- Others:
  Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 21st November 2023, via web conference

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 4th of December 2023[3].

V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. Definitions of the animal categories of turkeys

The working group agreed on the definitions of the animal categories to be assessed in the scientific opinion on the welfare of turkeys: turkey hens and turkey toms will be used for turkeys kept for meat production and breeders. Turkey hens are the female turkeys and turkey toms are the male turkey. Poults will be used for newly hatched turkeys up to 5-7 days of life.

b. Working group feedback on the preparatory work by the contractor

The contractor presented draft documents on the turkeys' production cycle and surveys to gather information on the husbandry systems of turkeys. The documents were discussed in detailed by the working group and the inputs received will be addressed by the contractor in the updated versions.

c. Identification of relevant welfare consequences for turkey breeders, poults and turkeys kept for meat production

The working group agreed on assessing three less relevant welfare consequence: inability to perform sexual behaviour, inability to avoid unwanted sexual behaviour and reproductive disorders that will be addressed with a narrative assessment.

VI. Any Other Business

Project management, tasks and assignments

Timeline and next deadlines of the project were discussed. Tasks were identified and distributed among the WG experts accordingly.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 26th January 2024, via web conference.

Agreement of the minutes	
Jutta Berk	Yes
Joanna Marchewka	Yes
Virginie Michel	Yes
Anja Riber	Yes
Nienke van Staaveren	Yes
Antonio Velarde Calvo	Yes

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

1st Working Group meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm

21st November 2023
09:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 4 December 2023

EUROPEAN FOOD SAFETY AUTHORITY

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

  Jutta Berk
  Joanna Marchewka
  Virginie Michel
  Anja Riber
  Nienke van Staaveren
  Antonio Velarde Calvo

- Hearing Experts:
  Not Applicable

- European Commission:
  Susanne Dittmann Rasmussen

- EFSA:
  BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Chiara Fabris, Oana-Maria Balmos

- Others:
  Not applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence1 and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management2, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Short introduction of the working group members.

The Chair and the WG members introduced themselves and provided their scientific background related to the remit of the mandate on the welfare of turkeys on farm.

b. EFSA Corporate presentation and Farm to fork (F2F) mandates

A presentation of the functioning of the EFSA Working groups and an overview and methodology of the F2F mandates was provided by the EFSA secretariat.

c. Presentation of the Terms of reference of the mandate on the protection of turkeys on farm (EFSA-Q-2023-00648 and EFSA-Q-2023-00647)

The ToRs of the mandate were presented and discussed. Working group members were informed of the preparatory work related to ToR A of the mandate that have been outsourced to an external contractor.

d. Outcomes and next steps: Stakeholders meeting on the welfare of turkeys on farm: farming practices and data.

The objectives of the stakeholders' meeting held on 8th November were described. Subsequently, the engagement plan with the stakeholders was presented.

e. Distribution of tasks of the Scientific Opinion on the welfare of turkeys on farm.

Specific tasks were assigned and agreed as well as their specific deadlines. In particular, WG experts were invited to work on sections addressing ToRs 1.

V. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 18th of December 2023, via web conference.

Agreement of the minutes	
Jutta Berk	Yes
Joanna Marchewka	Yes
Virginie Michel	Yes
Anja Riber	Yes
Nienke van Staaveren	Yes
Antonio Velarde Calvo	Yes