

Location: EFSA Parma (meeting rooms 00/M01 and 00/M06b) and Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Ronette Gehring, Maryline Kouba, Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Josef Holzleitner (SaluVet GmbH), Katerina Alexopoulou, Giuseppe Luca Capodiecì, María Herrera García, David John (FEFANA asbl) participated to the discussion of agenda items b and c.
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Montserrat Anguita,² Jaume Galobart² and Paola Manini
- Others:
Tuuli Tauriainen participated as an observer

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No conflicts of interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the Working Group members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of of the minutes of the 200th Working Group meeting held on 5-6 November 2025, in Parma

The minutes of the 200th Working Group meeting were agreed on 14 November 2025 by written procedure.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Participated to the discussion of agenda items b and c.

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/independence-policy-2024.pdf

⁴ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/decision-ed-on-competing-interest-management-2024.pdf



V. Scientific topics for discussion

- a. **Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Thyme tinctures. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#))**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

- b. **Applicants' Technical hearing on Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Thyme extract. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#))**

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant was given the opportunity to clarify the data previously submitted. EFSA will follow up with the applicant in accordance with the [EFSA's Catalogue of support initiatives during the life cycle of applications for regulated products](#)

- c. **Applicants' Technical hearing on Botanical Group 02 – Apiales/Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Common ivy extract. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#))**

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant was given the opportunity to clarify the data previously submitted. EFSA will follow up with the applicant in accordance with the [EFSA's Catalogue of support initiatives during the life cycle of applications for regulated products](#)

- d. **Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 14 – Malvales for all animal species and categories: Althaea tinctures. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2011-00180](#))**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG considered that additional information is needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this application. Therefore, a request for additional information will be sent to the applicant.

- e. **Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Oregano oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#))**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

- f. **Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Oregano tinctures. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#))**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

- g. **Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Spearmint oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00406](#))**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

- h. **Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Marjoram oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00407](#))**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

- i. **Draft opinion on *Vaccinium macrocarpon* extract (w.b.) as sensory additive for dogs and cats. Applicant: ACEL pharma s.r.l. ([EFSA-Q-2023-00585](#))**

The draft opinion was not discussed due to the lack of time.



VI. Any Other Business

None

VII. Next meeting

The next meetings will be held on 4 and 10 December 2025, by webconference.

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Ronette Gehring, Maryline Kouba, Francesca Marcon, and Johannes Westendorf
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Tuuli Tauriainen participated as an observer via web conference

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Josef Schlatter.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with/without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No conflicts of interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the Working Group members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of of the minutes of the 199th Working Group meeting held on 8 October 2025, via webconference

The minutes of the 199th Working Group meeting were agreed on 8 October 2025 at the end of the meeting.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

- 1.1. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Cornmint oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00406](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/decision-ed-on-competing-interest-management-2024.pdf))**

¹ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/independence-policy-2024.pdf

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/decision-ed-on-competing-interest-management-2024.pdf



The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG considered that additional information is needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this application. Therefore, a request for additional information will be sent to the applicant.

1.2. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Thyme extract. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

1.3. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales/Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Common ivy extract. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

1.4. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 17 – Miscellaneous for all animal species and categories. Capsicum tincture. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2011-00184](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG considered that additional information is needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this application. Therefore, a request for additional information will be sent to the applicant.

1.5. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 19 – Equisetales, Fucales for all animal species and categories. Horsetail tincture. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2011-00183](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

VI. Any Other Business

None

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 5-6 November 2025, in Parma.

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Maryline Kouba, Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter and Johannes Westendorf
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Tuuli Tauriainen participated as observer via web conference

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

The following items were removed from the agenda: Draft scientific opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: thyme extract ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)); Draft scientific opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales/Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: common ivy extract oil ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)).

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No conflicts of interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the Working Group members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 198th Working Group meeting held on 2 September 2025, via webconference

The minutes of the 198th Working Group meeting were agreed on 2 September 2025 at the end of the meeting.

¹ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/independence-policy-2024.pdf

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/decision-ed-on-competing-interest-management-2024.pdf



V. Scientific topics for discussion

1.1. Draft scientific opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Cornmint oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00406](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft scientific opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

1.2. Draft scientific opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Spearmint oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00405](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft scientific opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

1.3. Draft scientific opinion on Draft scientific opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Marjoram oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00407](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft scientific opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP Plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

1.4. Draft scientific opinion on the efficacy of ginkgo extract and the ginkgo tinctures. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00215](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion, in particular the additional information received on efficacy. After amendments, the draft scientific opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP Plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

1.5. Draft scientific opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 17 – Miscellaneous for all animal species and categories. Horseradish tincture. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2011-00184](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG considered that additional information is needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this application. Therefore, a request for additional information will be sent to the applicant.

VI. Any Other Business

None

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 7-8 October 2025, via webconference.

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Maryline Kouba, Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter and Johannes Westendorf
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Tuuli Tauriainen participated as an Observer via webconference

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

The following items were removed from the agenda: Draft opinions on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: cornmint oil ([EFSA-Q-2025-00406](#)), spearmint oil ([EFSA-Q-2025-00405](#)), marjoram oil ([EFSA-Q-2025-00407](#)), thyme extract ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)).

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No conflicts of interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the Working Group members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Feedback from the FEEDAP Panel plenary meeting

The Working Group was informed that at the last 183rd Panel plenary meeting, the FEEDAP Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion on ginkgo extract and the ginkgo tinctures ([EFSA-Q-2025-00215](#)), and in particular assessed data regarding product efficacy. The Panel decided that further discussion is needed and requested the WG to submit a revised opinion in a future Plenary.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/independence-policy-2024.pdf

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/decision-ed-on-competing-interest-management-2024.pdf



a. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Rosemary oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00402](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

b. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Rosemary tinctures. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00404](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

c. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Thyme oil. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00403](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP plenary meeting for further discussion and possible adoption.

d. Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Common ivy extract. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG considered that additional information is needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this application. Therefore, a request for additional information will be sent to the applicant.

e. Draft opinion on the efficacy of ginkgo extract and the ginkgo tinctures. Applicant: FEFANA asbl ([EFSA-Q-2025-00215](#))

The WG was informed on the outcome of the discussion in the 183rd plenary meeting of the FEEDAP Panel (see IV). Following the discussion in the Panel, a request for additional information was sent to the applicant.

VI. Any Other Business

None

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 2-3 September 2025, via webconference.

17-18 June 2025

09:30-13:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 18 June 2025

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Maryline Kouba, Francesca Marcon, and Johannes Westendorf

- Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

- EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Josef Schlatter.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 196th Working Group meeting held on 17-18 June 2025, via web-conference

The minutes of the 196th Working Group meeting were agreed on 18 June 2025.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topics for discussion

- a. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01307):**
- a.1 **Basil tincture (EFSA-Q-2025-00324):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.2 **Lavender tincture (EFSA-Q-2025-00325):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.3 **Peppermint tincture (EFSA-Q-2025-00326):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.4 **Sage tincture (EFSA-Q-2025-00328):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.5 **Wild thyme tincture (EFSA-Q-2025-00327):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.6 **Rosemary tinctures:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.7 **Rosemary oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.8 **Thyme extract:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - a.9 **Thyme oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.10 **Cornmint oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - a.11 **Spearmint oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - a.12 **Marjoram oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

VI. Any Other Business

None.

VII. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 23 July 2025, via webconference.

20 May 2025

09:30-13:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 20 May 2025

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Francesca Marcon, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini and Laura Ruggeri²
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Josef Schlatter.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 194th and 195th Working Group meetings held on 15 and 20 May 2025, via web-conference.

The minutes of the 194th and 195th Working Group meetings were agreed on 20 May 2025.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Attending only for discussion on item 4.4.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topics for discussion

- a. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):**
 - a.1. **Basil tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.2. **Lavender tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.3. **Peppermint tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.4. **Sage tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.5. **Wild thyme tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
 - a.6. **Rosemary tinctures:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - a.7. **Rosemary oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- b. **Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)): Purple loosestrife tincture.** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- c. **Not discussed: Application on a preparation of carvacrol, cinnamaldehyde and capsicum oleoresin (4d11) as zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening (XTRACT EVOLUTION-B, CODE X60-6930) ([EFSA-Q-2024-00573](#)); Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):** Thyme oil.
- d. **General discussion on caffeic acid and chlorogenic acid.**

VI. Any Other Business

None.

VII. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 17-18 June 2025, via web-conference.

15 May 2025

09:30-13:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 20 May 2025

Location: Web-conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Ronette Gehring, Maryline Kouba, Francesca Marcon, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini, and Eirini Kouloura²
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 194th Working Group meeting held on 20 May 2025, via web-conference

The minutes of the 194th Working Group meeting were agreed on 20 May 2025.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Attending only for discussion on item 4.5.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topics for discussion

v.a Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

v.a.1 Rosemary tinctures: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

v.a.2 Rosemary oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

v.b Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)): Purple loosestrife tincture. The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

v.c Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 16 – Rosales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00188](#)):

v.c.1 Meadowsweet tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

v.c.2 Dwarf nettle tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

v.d Application on the efficacy of ginkgo extract and the ginkgo tinctures ([EFSA-Q-2025-00215](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.

v.e Presentation of the new Compendium on Botanicals

VI. Any Other Business

None.

VII. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 20 May 2025, via web-conference.

14 and 16 April 2025

09:30-13:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 16 April 2025

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos,¹ Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Ronette Gehring,² Maryline Kouba,² Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts³:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini, and Maria Mountricha⁴ and Alberto Navarro⁴
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 193rd Working Group meeting held on 14 and 16 April 2025, via web-conference

The minutes of the 193rd Working Group meeting were agreed on 16 April 2025.

¹ Attending only on April 16th.

² Attending only on April 14th.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ Attending only on April 14th (for discussion on item 4.5).

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):**

- 1. Basil tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 2. Lavender tincture, peppermint tincture, sage tincture, wild thyme tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinions and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 3. Rosemary tinctures:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4. Rosemary oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5. Lilac chastetree tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

b. **Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 13 – Malpighiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00185](#)): White willow tincture.** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

c. **Application on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets and pigs for fattening, calves, sheep, fish and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2024-00245](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.

d. **Application on *Vaccinium macrocarpon* extract (w.b.) as sensory additive for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2023-00585](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

e. **Application on 31 compounds of Chemically Defined Groups (CDGs) as flavouring additives for all animal species (Toasted cereals) ([EFSA-Q-2025-00158](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

VI. Any Other Business

None.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 15 and 20 May 2025, via web conference.

10-11 March 2025

09:30-13:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 11 March 2025

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos,¹ Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom,² Andrew Chesson,
Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Maryline Kouba,¹ Francesca Marcon,
Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts³:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo⁴
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Attending only on March 10th.

² Attending only on March 11th.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ Attending only on March 11th (for discussion on item 4.5).

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 192nd Working Group meeting held on 10-11 Month 2025, via web-conference

The minutes of the 192nd Working Group meeting were agreed on 11 March 2025.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

V.1 Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

V.1.a **Basil tincture, lavender tincture, peppermint tincture, sage tincture, wild thyme tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinions and decided that further discussion is needed.

V.1.b **Rosemary tinctures:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

V.1.b **Rosemary oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

V.1.c **Patchouli oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00542](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.

V.2 Application on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets and pigs for fattening, calves, sheep, fish and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2024-00246](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.

V.3 Application on 1-Methoxy-4-(prop-1(*trans*)-enyl)benzene and Eugenol for all avian species. ([EFSA-Q-2023-00744](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.

V.4 Application on *Vaccinium macrocarpon* extract (w.b.) as sensory additive for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2023-00585](#)): The WG discussed the application and decided that further discussion is needed.

V.5 Application on Cashew nutshell liquid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00354](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

V.6 Revision of the wording “low concern” in the conclusions of the safety for the target species in seven opinions on additives belonging to Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Groups 02, 06 and 07 ([EFSA-Q-2022-00107](#), [EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#), [EFSA-Q-2023-00180](#), [EFSA-Q-2023-00398](#), [EFSA-Q-2023-00587](#), [EFSA-Q-2023-00397](#), [EFSA-Q-2024-00190](#)): The Working Group discussed the revision of the wording “low concern” and decided to present the opinions, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.

VI. Any Other Business

None.

VII. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 15-16 April 2025, via web conference.

4 - 5 February 2025

09:30-13:30

MINUTES – Agreed on 5 February 2025

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the WG members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 191st Working Group meeting held on 4-5 February 2025, via web-conference

The minutes of the 191st Working Group meeting were agreed at the end of the meeting, on 5 February 2025.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topics for discussion

- a. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):**
 - **Basil tincture, lavender tincture, peppermint tincture, sage tincture, wild thyme tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinions and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - **Marjoram oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - **Spearmint oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - **Rosemary oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - b. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 03 – Asparagales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01508](#)):** The WG discussed the application and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
 - c. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 04 – Asterales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01509](#)):** The WG discussed the application and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
 - d. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 05 – Fabales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01511](#)):** The WG discussed the application and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
 - e. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 10 – Ericales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01321](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
 - f. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 11 – Dipsacales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01321](#)):** The WG discussed the application and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
 - g. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 10 – Ranunculales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01518](#)):** The WG discussed the application and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
 - h. **Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 20 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2010-01510](#)):** The WG discussed the application and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
-



VI. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

VII. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 10-11 March 2025, via web conference.

8-9 January 2025

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini, Natasa Mikulic²
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on 1-Methoxy-4-(prop-1(*trans*)-enyl)benzene and Eugenol for all avian species (EFSA-Q-2023-00744): The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion. The Working Group decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Attending only on January 9th.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

- 4.2.1. **Patchouli oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00542](#)):** The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.2. **Marjoram oil:** The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.3. **Spearmint oil:** The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.4. **Rosemary tinctures:** The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 16 – Rosales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00118](#)):

- 4.3.1. **Meadowsweet tincture:** The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3.2. **Dwarf nettle tincture:** The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.4. Application on the renewal of the authorisation of a preparation of carvacrol, cinnamaldehyde and capsicum oleoresin (4d11) as zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening (XTRACT EVOLUTION-B, CODE X60-6930) ([EFSA-Q-2024-00573](#)): The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 4-5 February 2025, via web conference.

9-10 December 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Emilio Benfenati,¹ Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini, Natasa Mikulic³
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-](#)

¹ Attending only on December 9th (for discussion on items 4.1 and 4.2 and 5).

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Attending only on December 9th.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



2010-01282): **Niaouli oil**. The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01307):

4.2.1. **Patchouli oil (EFSA-Q-2024-00542)**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2.2. **Marjoram oil**: The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion. The Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2.3. **Thyme oil**: The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion. The Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on 1-Methoxy-4-(prop-1(*trans*)-enyl)benzene and Eugenol for all avian species (EFSA-Q-2023-00744): The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 16 – Rosales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2011-00118):

4.4.1. **Dropwort tincture**: The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion. The Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4.2. **Dwarf nettle tincture**: The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion. The Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

A general discussion took place on read-across and on methodological aspects in the assessment of botanicals.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 8-9 January 2025, via web conference.

12-13 November 2024

09:30-13:30

MEETING MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Francesca Marcon, Carlo Nebbia,¹ Josef Schlatter, Dieter Schrenk,² and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts³:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Montserrat Anguita² and Paola Manini
MESE Unit: Daniela Maurici² and Alicia Paini²
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ Attending only on November 12th (for discussion on items 4.1 and 4.2.1).

² Attending only for discussion on item 4.1

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1. Discussion on the interpretation of the wording “low concern” in the safety assessment of the target species in FEEDAP opinions: The discussion was aimed at providing further clarification on the wording “low concern” used in the conclusions on the safety for the target species (long living and reproductive animals) in FEEDAP opinions. The Working Group developed a proposal and decided to present it to the Plenary meeting of the FEEDAP Panel for further discussion.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

- 4.2.1. **Sage oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00406](#)):** The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2.2. **Peppermint oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00405](#)):** The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2.3. **Cornmint oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.4. **Patchouli oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00542](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.5. **Marjoram oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on 1-Methoxy-4-(prop-1(*trans*)-enyl)benzene and Eugenol for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00744](#)): The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Not discussed: Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)): Niaouli oil

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 9-10 December 2024, via web conference.

9-10 October 2024

09:30-18:00

MINUTES

Location: Parma and Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom,¹ Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter,¹ and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini and Jordi Ortuño Casanova³
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

¹ Attending only on October 9th (in the morning).

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Attending for discussion on item 4.6.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1.1. **Peppermint oil (EFSA-Q-2024-00405)**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.1.2. **Sage oil (EFSA-Q-2024-00406)**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.1.3. **Patchouli oil (EFSA-Q-2024-00542)**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.1.4. **Cornmint oil**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01282):

4.2.1. **Niaouli oil** : The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on 1-Methoxy-4-(prop-1(*trans*)-enyl)benzene and Eugenol for all avian species (EFSA-Q-2023-00744): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.4. Application on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets and pigs for fattening, calves, sheep, fish and dogs (EFSA-Q-2024-00245): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.5. Application on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets and pigs for fattening, calves, sheep, fish and dogs (EFSA-Q-2024-00246): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.6. Application on XTRACT RUMINANT, CODE X60-7065 (Preparation of eugenol, cinnamaldehyde and capsicum oleoresin) for dairy cows for milk production and cows for reproduction (EFSA-Q-2024-00123): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 12-13 November 2024, via web conference.

13 September 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Maria Dulak-Lis,² Paola Manini and Jordi Ortuño Casanova³
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Minutes of the
FEEDAP WG on
Feed Flavourings

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Attending for discussion on items 4.5 and 4.6.

³ Attending for discussion on item 4.7.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1.1. **Thymus origanum oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00541](#))**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

4.2.1. **Tea tree oil: ([EFSA-Q-2024-00119](#))**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting

4.3. Application on Cosap® (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00471](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.4. Application on a preparation containing a smoke flavouring extract-2b0001 (Scansmoke PET SEF7525) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2023-00900](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.5. Application on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets and pigs for fattening, calves, sheep, fish and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2024-00245](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.6. Application on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets and pigs for fattening, calves, sheep, fish and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2024-00246](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.7. Application on XTRACT RUMINANT, CODE X60-7065 (Preparation of eugenol, cinnamaldehyde and capsicum oleoresin) for dairy cows for milk production and cows for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2024-00123](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.8. Item not discussed: Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)): Peppermint oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00405](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 9-10 October 2024, in Parma.

5 September 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Josef Schlatter.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1.1. **Sage oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00406](#))**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

4.2.1. **Tea tree oil: ([EFSA-Q-2024-00119](#))**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting

4.3. Application on 1-Methoxy-4-(prop-1(*trans*)-enyl)benzene and Eugenol for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00744](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Items not discussed: Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)): Niaouli oil; Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)): Patchouli oil.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 13 September 2024, via web conference.

18 – 19 July 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Maria Dulak-Lis,² Jaume Galobart³ and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Attending for discussion on item 4.4.

³ Attending for discussion on item 4.2.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1.1. **Peppermint oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00405](#))**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.1.2. **Thymus origanum oil**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.1.3. **Thyme oil**: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to that further discussion is needed.

4.2. Application on Cosap® (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00471](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.3. Application on the Renewal of authorisation of a preparation containing a smoke flavouring extract-2b0001 (Scansmoke PET SEF7525) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2023-00900](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.4. Application on *Vaccinium macrocarpon* extract (w.b.) as sensory additive for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2023-00585](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.5. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 17 – Miscellaneous angiosperms (Brassicales, Cucurbitales, Fagales, Saxifragales, Solanales, Vitales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00184](#)): The WG discussed the application and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.6. Item not discussed: Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniaceales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)): Niaouli oil.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 5 September 2024, via web conference.

18 – 19 June 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies of absence were received from Francesca Marcon for the first day.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



- 4.1.1. **Spanish sage oil (EFSA-Q-2024-00404):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.1.2. **Sage oil (EFSA-Q-2024-00406):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.1.3. **Peppermint oil (EFSA-Q-2024-00405):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.1.4. **Wild thyme tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.1.5. **Peppermint tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.1.6. **Basil tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.1.7. **Lavender tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.1.8. **Sage tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.1.9. **Lapacho (Pau d'arco) tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 18-19 July 2024, via web conference.

21 – 22 May 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Gabriele Aquilina,² Claudia Bolognesi² and Rainer Gürtler²
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi²
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Hearing experts and FIP secretariat attending for the discussion on item 4.1.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

The WG finalised the assessment of the genotoxicity of perillaldehyde, which is relevant to the opinions on:

- 4.1.1. **Celery seed oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00060](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.1.2. **Caraway oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00305](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

- 4.2.1. **Clary sage oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00304](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2.2. **Lavender oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00306](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2.3. **Wild thyme tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.4. **Peppermint tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.5. **Basil tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.6. **Lavender tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.7. **Sage tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 18-19 June 2024, via web conference.

23 – 24 April 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter,¹ and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo,³ and Anita Radovnikovic⁴
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ Attending on the second day

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Attending for discussion on item 4.2 and 4.3

⁴ Attending for discussion on item 4.1

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1. Application on Cosap® (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00471](#)): The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2. Application on MAGNI-PHI® (*Quilaja saponaria* and *Yucca schidigera*) for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2021-00310](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on 4-Hydroxy-2,5-dimethylfuran-3(2H)-one (2b13010) for all animal species other than cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2023-00072](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

4.4.1. **Patchouli oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4.2. **Lavender oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4.3. **Lavender tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4.4. **Sage tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.5. Application on the renewal of authorisation of a preparation containing a smoke flavouring extract-2b0001 (Scansmoke PET SEF7525) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2023-00900](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 21-22 May 2024, via web conference.

26 – 27 March 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos,¹ Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Fabiola Pizzo³ and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.
No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-](#)

¹ Attending on the second day

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Attending for discussion on item 4.4

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



2010-01286): **Caraway seed oil**. The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01516):

4.3.1. **Ginkgo tincture (EFSA-Q-2024-00194)**. The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.3.2. **Cedarwood Texas oil (EFSA-Q-2010-01516)**: The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.4. Application on MAGNI-PHI® (*Quilaja saponaria* and *Yucca schidigera*) for poultry (EFSA-Q-2021-00310): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.5. Items not discussed:

4.5.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01307) - Patchouli oil.

4.5.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories: Tea tree oil (EFSA-Q-2024-00119).

4.5.3. Application on the renewal of authorisation of a preparation containing a smoke flavouring extract-2b0001 (Scansmoke PET SEF7525) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2023-00900).

5. Any Other Business

A general discussion took place on the need to adapt the structure of the opinions on botanicals to take into account for the recent changes on the template for FEEDAP opinions.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 23-24 April 2024, via web conference.

20 – 21 February 2024

09:30-13:30

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom,¹ Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Jaume Galobart³ and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of Macleaya cordata extract and leaves) for piglets and other growing Suidae ([EFSA-Q-2022-](#)

¹ Attending on the first day

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Attending for discussion under AOB

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



00357): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the safety for the consumer.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

- 4.2.1. **Clary sage oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.2. **Spanish sage oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.3. **Patchouli oil:** Not discussed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)):

- 4.3.1. **Ginkgo extract and tincture ([EFSA-Q-2024-0063](#)).** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3.2. **Cedarwood Texas oil ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

- 4.4.1. **Ginseng tincture ([EFSA-Q-2024-00055](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4.2. **Omicha tincture ([EFSA-Q-2024-00061](#)):** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

A general discussion took places on the information to be included under 1.2 Additional information.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 26-27 March 2024, via web conference.

23 – 24 January 2024

09:00-13:00 (23.01.2024), 09:30-13:30 (23.01.2024)

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos,¹ Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon,² Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts³:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Pages Plaza,⁴ and Fabiola Pizzo⁵
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ Attending on the first day and for discussion on item 4.4 on the second day

² Attending on the first day

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ Attending for discussion on item 4.4

⁵ Attending for discussion on item 4.1 and 4.2

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1. Application on 4-hydroxy-2,5-dimethylfuran-3(2H)-one for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2023-00068](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

4.2.1. **Melaleuca oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2.2. **Tea tree oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2.3. **Citronella oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2.4. **Eucalyptus tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2.5. **Clove tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)): Ginkgo extract and tincture. The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.4. Application on Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of Macleaya cordata extract and leaves) for piglets and other growing Suidae ([EFSA-Q-2022-00357](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 20-21 February 2024, via web conference.

11 – 12 December 2023

09:30-13:30 (12.10.2023), 09:30-13:30 (13.10.2023)

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven, Paola Manini, Jaume Galobart,² Daniel Pages Plaza,³ and Anita Radovnikovic²
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Attending for discussion on item 4.1

³ Attending for discussion on item 4.4

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1. Application on Cosap® (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00471](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

4.2.1. **Omicha tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2.2. **Ginseng tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2.3. **Celery seed oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)): Ginkgo extract and tincture. The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.4. Application on Cashew nutshell liquid (CNSL) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00354](#)): The WG discussed the characterisation of the additive. The WG decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 23-24 January 2024, via web conference.

07 – 08 November 2023

09:30-13:30 (07.11.2023), 09:30-13:30 (08.11.2023)

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Almudena Rodríguez Sánchez-Beato has participated for item 4.1
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.
No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. General approach to assess the safety for the target species of botanical preparations which contain compounds that are genotoxic and/or carcinogenic when used as feed additives.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



The WG discussed the need to review the approach in view of the experience gained in the last two years. The WG agreed that the principles are still valid, and the approach does not need to be modified.

4.2. Application on Cosap® (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00471](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

4.2.1. **Omicha tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2.2. **Ginseng tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Mirtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

4.3.1. **Tea tree oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 11-12 December 2023, via web conference.

12 – 13 October 2023

09:30-13:30 (12.10.2023), 09:30-13:30 (13.10.2023)

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven, Paola Manini and Anita Radovnikovic
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Cosap® (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish (EFSA-Q-2021-00471): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

4.2.1. **Omicha tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2.2. **Ginseng tincture:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)):

4.3.1. **Patchouli oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Item not discussed: Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)): Ginkgo extract and tincture.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 7-8 November 2023, via web conference.

7 - 8 September 2023

09:30-13:30 (07.09.2023), 09:30-13:30 (08.09.2023)

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom¹, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter¹ and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven, Jaume Galobartt, Paola Manini and Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.
No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on the safety of 41 flavouring compounds (Herbal mixture) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2023-00030](#)): The WG discussed

¹ Attending on the first day of the WG, discussing items 4.1, 4.2, 4.4.2, 4.4.3 and 4.5.2.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01516): Ginkgo tincture: The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01307):

4.3.1. Peppermint oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3.2. Thymus origanum oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3.3. Spanish sage oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01286):

4.4.1. Star anise terpenes (EFSA-Q-2023-00399): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.4.2. Coriander oil (EFSA-Q-2023-00586): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.4.3. Fennel oil (EFSA-Q-2023-00587): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.5. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01282):

4.5.1. Eucalyptus tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.5.2. Citronella oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

MEETING MINUTES – 7 - 8 September 2023
174th Working Group meeting on Feed Flavourings



The next meeting will be held on 12-13 October 2023, via web conference.

10 -11 July 2023

10:00-18:00 (10.07.2023), 09:00-16:00 (11.07.2023)

MINUTES

Location: Porto, PORTUGAL

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies of absence were received from Dieter Schrenk.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01307): Peppermint oil:** The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

- 4.2.1. Coriander oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2.2. Fennel oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

- 4.3.1. Eucalyptus tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.2. Clove tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3.3. Melaleuca oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.4. Citronella oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)): Ginkgo extract and ginkgo tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 7-8 September 2023, via web conference.

6-7 June 2023

09:30-13:30 (06.06.2023), 09:30-13:30 (07.06.2023)

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson¹, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter¹ and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.
No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

¹ Attending for discussion on items 4.1.1, 4.1.2, 4.2.4 and 4.3.1

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1.1. Anise star oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.1.2. Anise star terpenes: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)):

4.2.1. Pine tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2.2. Ginkgo extract and ginkgo tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

4.3.1. Eucalyptus tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3.2. Clove tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3.3. Clove oils: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.3.4. Melaleuca oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

The WG was informed that the Nutrition and Food Innovation Unit (NIF) has launched three new protocols on plant preparations launched for public consultation:

- Draft Protocol for the Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of the safety in use of preparations from the fruits of sweet and bitter fennel (*Foeniculum vulgare* Mill. and *Foeniculum piperitum* (Ucria) C.Presl)
- Draft Protocol for the Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of the safety in use of plant preparations containing berberine
- Draft Protocol for the Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of the safety in use of plant preparations containing hydroxycitric acid and isolated hydroxycitric acid (*Garcinia Cambogia*)

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 10-11 July 2023, as a hybrid conference hosted in Porto (Portugal).

26-27 April 2023

09:30-13:30 (26.04.2023), 09:30-13:30 (27.04.2023)

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.
No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1.1. Anise star oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.1.2. Anise star terpenes: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2. Application on the safety of 41 flavouring compounds (Herbal mixture) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2023-00030](#)): The WG discussed the scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2023-00030](#)): Spanish sage oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

4.4.1. Clove oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4.2. Melaleuca oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.5. Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of *Macleaya cordata* extract and leaves) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00454](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.6. Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 29, Part III - thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives: 4-methyl-5-vinylthiazole [15.018] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00184](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 6-7 June 2023, via web conference.

28-29 March 2023

09:30-13:30 (28.03.2023), 09:30-13:30 (29.03.2023)

MINUTES

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven, Stefani Fruk² and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Attending the WG meeting on the 29th of March.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – GYMNOSPERMS (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)):

- 4.1.1.** Ginkgo extract and tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion after received Supplementary information about the ginkgo extract. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.1.2.** Cedarwood Texas oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2. Application on the safety of 41 flavouring compounds (Herbal mixture) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2023-00030](#)): The WG discussed the scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)): Fennel oil. The WG discussed the scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

- 4.4.1.** Lemongrass oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4.2.** Eucalyptus oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4.3.** Clove oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.5. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)): Nutmeg oil

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 26-27 April 2023, via web conference.

20-21 February 2023

09:30-13:30 (20.02.2023), 09:30-13:30 (21.02.2023)

MINUTES – Agreed by written procedure on 24 February 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter,¹ Dieter Schrenk¹ and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven, Stefani Fruk, Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo³
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies of absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ Attending for discussion on items 4.1.1, 4.2, 4.3.1.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Attending for discussion on item 4.5.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – GYMNOSPERMS (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)):

- 4.1.1.** Ginkgo tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.1.2.** Juniper oil and juniper tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.2. Draft opinion on BIOSTRONG® 510 (preparation of essential oils of thyme and star anise, and quillaja bark powder) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00344](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.3. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):

- 4.3.1.** Anise oil and anise tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3.2.** Anise tincture ([EFSA-Q-2022-00565](#)): The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.4. Draft opinion on Nor-Grape alpha (dry grape extract) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00467](#)):

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. The WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.5. Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)): Lemongrass oil

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.6. Items not discussed:

- 4.6.1.** Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)): Eucalyptus oil.
- 4.6.2.** Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, and Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)): Nutmeg oil.



5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 28-29 March 2023, via web conference.

17-18 January 2023

09:30-13:30 (17.01.2023), 09:30-13:30 (18.01.2023)

MINUTES –Agreed on 18th January 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

○ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

○ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

○ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

○ EFSA:

Yvette Dirven, Stefani Fruk, Paola Manini, and Fabiola Pizzo

○ Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topics for discussion

a) Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)):

- i. Anise tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



- ii. Taiga root tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP Plenary meeting in January for further discussion and possible adoption.

b) Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – GYMNOSPERMS (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)):

- i. Ginkgo tincture: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.
- ii. Pine white oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP Plenary meeting in January for further discussion and possible adoption.

c) Draft opinion on Nor-Grape alpha (dry grape extract) for avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00467](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed the supplementary information regarding the characterisation of the additive and the safety. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

d) Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):

- i. Eucalyptus oil: The WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- ii. Geranium rose oil: The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP Plenary meeting in January for further discussion and possible adoption.

Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales ([EFSA-Q-2022-00466](#)): Gentian tincture.

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP Plenary meeting in January for further discussion and possible adoption.

e) Application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)): Laurel oil.

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP Plenary meeting in January for further discussion and possible adoption.

f) Application/Draft opinion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 – Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms; difurfuryl sulfide [13.056], 4-(2-furyl)but-3-en-2-one [13.044], 2-acetylfuran [13.054], 2-pentylfuran [13.059] and difurfuryl ether [13.061] ([EFSA-Q-2015-00819](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion. After amendments, the draft opinion will be presented at the next FEEDAP Plenary meeting in January for further discussion and possible adoption.

V. Dates for the next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 20-21 February 2023, via web conference.

VI. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 167TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 6-7 December 2022

(Agreed on 7 December 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Yvette Dirven, Stefani Fruk and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2022-00466](#)/ FEFANA asbl): *Gentiana lutea* L. (gentian tincture) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)):
 - 4.2.1. Laurel leaf oil for all animal species: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):
 - 4.3.1. Bitter fennel oil for all animal species and sweet fennel oil for dogs and cats: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)):
 - 4.4.1. Ginkgo tincture for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on BIOSTRONG® 510 (preparation of essential oils of thyme and star anise, and quillaja bark powder) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00344](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):
 - 4.6.1. Clove tincture for all animal species: the WG decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
 - 4.6.2. Eucalyptus tincture for all animal species: the WG decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
 - 4.6.3. Eucalyptus oil for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 13 - Malpighiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00185](#)) and decided to inform applicant on issues that require clarification.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



- 4.8.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 19 - Equisetales, Fucales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00183](#)) and decided to inform applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meetings

17-18 January 2023



FEEDCO UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 166TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 2 December 2022

(Agreed on 2 December 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon Josef Schlatter, Dieter Schrenk and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Yvette Dirven, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo and Daniel Pagés
Plaza

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)):
 - 4.1.1. Laurel leaf oil for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):
 - 4.2.1. Bitter fennel oil for all animal species and sweet fennel oil for dogs and cats: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)):
 - 4.3.1. Ginkgo tincture for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2022-00466](#)/ FEFANA asbl): *Gentiana lutea* L. (gentian tincture).

5. Any Other Business

Feedback was provided on the discussion on the applicability of the margin of exposure in the risk assessment of botanicals and botanical preparations used as feed additives, held in the EFSA Scientific Committee on 16 November.

6. Next meetings

6-7 December 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEEDCO UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 165TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 15 November 2022

(Agreed on 15 November 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Yvette Dirven, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza and Fabiola Pizzo

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on MAGNI-PHI® (*Quillaja saponaria* and *Yucca schidigera*) for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2021-00310](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms; difurfuryl sulfide [13.056], 4-(2-furyl)but-3-en-2-one [13.044], 2-acetylfuran [13.054], 2-pentylfuran [13.059] and difurfuryl ether [13.061] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2015-00819](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):
 - 4.3.1. Taiga root tincture for all animal species: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):
 - 4.4.1. Clove tincture for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
 - 4.4.2. Eucalyptus tincture for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meetings

2 December 2022

6-7 December 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEEDCO UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 164TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 20 October 2022

(Agreed on 20 October 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on MAGNI-PHI® (Quillaja saponaria and Yucca schidigera) for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2021-00310](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):
 - 4.2.1.** Taiga root tincture for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on BIOSTRONG® 510 (preparation of essential oils of thyme and star anise, and quillaja bark powder) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00344](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)):
 - 4.4.1.** Clove tincture for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed
- 4.5.** The following item was not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms; difurfuryl sulfide [13.056], 4-(2-furyl)but-3-en-2-one [13.044], 2-acetylfuran [13.054], 2-pentylfuran [13.059] and difurfuryl ether [13.061] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2015-00819](#)); Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)): eucalyptus tincture.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

15 November 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 163RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 20-21 September 2022

(Agreed on 21 September 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2022-00466](#)): *Gentiana lutea* L. (gentian tincture) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)):
 - 4.2.1. Dong quai tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00568](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.2. Cumin oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00566](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.3. Anise tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00565](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.4. Dill tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00567](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.5. Fennel tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00569](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.6. Parsley tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00570](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.7. Star anise tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00571](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.8. Taiga root tincture for all animal species: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)): quebracho extract and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 27 flavouring compounds to provide a Milky-Vanilla flavour for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2022-00158](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the safety for the consumer.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

20-21 October 2022

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 162ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 20 July 2022

(Agreed on 20 July 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of *Macleaya cordata* extract and leaves) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00454](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The following items were not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)); Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

20-21 September 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEEDCO UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 161ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 14 June 2022

(Agreed on 14 June 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)):
 - 4.1.1.** Nutmeg oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)): the WG decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of *Macleaya cordata* extract and leaves) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00454](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

20-21 July 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEEDCO UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 160TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 23-24 May 2022

(Agreed on 24 May 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Paola Manini, Daniel Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo and
Anita Radovnikovic

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)):
 - 4.1.1. Cassia leaf oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00104](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.1.2. Cinnamon leaf oil and cinnamon bark oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00105](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.1.3. Pepper oil and pepper oleoresin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00106](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.1.4. Laurel leaf oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00105](#)): the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
 - 4.1.5. Nutmeg oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)): the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Cosap® (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00471](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Nor-Grape alpha (dry grape extract) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00467](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

6. Next meeting

14 June 2022



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 159TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 26-27 April 2022

(Agreed on 27 April 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Plaza and Fabiola Pizzo

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson for the second day.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)):
 - 4.1.1. Cinnamon leaf oil and cinnamon bark oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00105](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.1.2. Pepper oil and pepper oleoresin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00106](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on BIOSTRONG® 510 (preparation of essential oils of thyme and star anise, and quillaja bark powder) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00344](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of *Macleaya cordata* extract and leaves) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00454](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

23-24 May 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 158TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 15-16 March 2022

(Agreed on 16 March 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo and Anita Radovnikovic
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 157th Working Group meeting held on 14-15 February 2022, TELE-conference

The minutes of the 157th Working Group meeting held on 14-15 February 2022 were agreed by written procedure on 18 February 2022.³

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)):
 - 5.1.1. Cassia leaf oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00104](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting
 - 5.1.2. Pepper oil and pepper oleoresin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00106](#)): the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
 - 5.1.3. Laurel leaves oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00105](#)): the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of 27 flavouring compounds to provide a Milky-Vanilla flavour for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2022-00158](#)) and that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The WG discussed the application on BIOSTRONG® 510 (preparation of essential oils of thyme and star anise, and quillaja bark powder) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00344](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.6. The WG discussed the application on Cosap® (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00471](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website



6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

26-27 April 2022



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 157TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 14-15 February 2022

(Agreed by written procedure on 18 February 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter (1st day), Dieter Schrenk (1st day) and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes. Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon for the 1st day.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 156th Working Group meeting held on 11-12 January 2022, TELE-conference

The minutes of the 156th Working Group meeting held on 11-12 January 2022 were agreed by written procedure on 13 January 2022.³

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of 37 flavourings compounds as feed additives ([EFSA-Q-2021-00632](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

15-16 March 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 156TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 11-12 January 2022

(Agreed by written procedure on 13 January 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)):
 - 4.1.1.** Olibanum extract for use in dogs and horses ([EFSA-Q-2021-00145](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Sangrovit® Extra (preparation of *Macleaya cordata* extract and leaves) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00454](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

14-15 February 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 155TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 07 December 2021

(Agreed on 07 December 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon
Josef Schlatter, Dieter Schrenk and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
FIP Unit: Chantra Eskes and Ellen Van Haver
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

11-12 January 2022

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 154TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 18-19 November 2021

(Agreed on 19 November 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Plaza and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on MAGNI-PHI® (*Quilija saponaria* and *Yucca schidigera*) for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2021-00310](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

7 December 2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 153RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 21-22 October 2021

(Agreed on 22 October 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo and Anita Radovnikovic
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8– Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)):
 - 4.1.1. Olibanum extract for all animal species and categories: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
 - 4.1.2. Buchu leaves oil for all animal species and categories: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)):
 - 4.2.1. Camphor white oil for all animal species and categories: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.2. Ylang ylang oil for all animal species and categories: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.3. Cinnamon tincture for all animal species: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.4. Laurel oil for all animal species and categories: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Rosemary extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2020-00728](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

18-19 November 2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 152ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 21-22 September 2021

(Agreed on 22 September 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8– Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)):
 - 4.1.1. Buchu leaves oil for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2021-00146](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)):
 - 4.2.1. Camphor white oil for all animal species and categories: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.2. Ylang ylang oil for all animal species and categories: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.3. Cinnamon tincture for all animal species: the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.2.4. Cassia oil for all animal species and categories: the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Rosemary extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2020-00728](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting

21-22 October 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 151ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 29-30 July 2021

(Agreed on 30 July 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo and Anita Radovnikovic
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes. Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8– Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)):
 - 4.1.1.** Expressed orange oil and its fractions from the fruit peels of *Citrus sinensis* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00146](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.1.2.** Buchu leaves oil for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)): the WG and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00175](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Lemon extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00680](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

21-22 September 2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 150TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 14 June 2021

(Agreed on 14 June 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Plaza and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on *Verbascum thapsus* L. (great mullein tincture) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00449](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. Blend of grape (*Vitis vinifera* L.) and wild blueberry (*Vaccinium angustifolium* A.) extracts (FLAMORE) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00598](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The following items were not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)); Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8– Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)): Expressed orange oil and its fractions from the fruit peels of *Citrus sinensis* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00146](#))

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

29-30 July 2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 149TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 21 May 2021

(Agreed on 21 May 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)):
 - 4.1.1.** Bitter orange extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00144](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 4.1.2.** Expressed orange oil and its fractions from the fruit peels of *Citrus sinensis* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00146](#)): the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on *Verbascum thapsus* L. (great mullein tincture) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00449](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.6.** The WG discussed the application on Nor-Balm® (*Melissa officinalis* dry extract) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00175](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7.** The WG discussed the application on Rosemary extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2020-00728](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

6. Next meeting

14 June 2021





FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 148TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 15-16 April 2021

(Agreed on 16 April 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 147th Working Group meeting held on 12 March 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 147th Working Group meeting held on 12 March 2021 were agreed by written procedure on 15 March 2021.³

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The WG discussed the application on Lemon extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00680](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8– Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)):
 - 5.2.1. Bitter orange extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00144](#)): the WG decided that further discussion is needed.
 - 5.2.2. Petitgrain bigarade oil from the leaves of *Citrus x aurantium* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00134](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - 5.2.3. Expressed mandarin oil from the fruit peels of *Citrus reticulata* Blanco for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00143](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))
 - 5.3.1. Litsea berry oil from the fruits of *Litsea cubeba* (Lour.) Pers. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00132](#)): the WG decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.4. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/panels/feedap#working-groups>



- 5.5.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6.** The WG discussed the application on Rosemary extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2020-00728](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

21 May 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 147TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 12 March 2021

(Agreed by written procedure on 15 March 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon, Josef Schlatter, Dieter Schrenk and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01517) and decided to present the draft opinion on expressed lemon oil and its fractions from *Citrus limon* (L.) Osbeck and lime oil from *Citrus aurantiifolia* (Christm.) Swingle, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2011-01182) and decided to present the opinion on gentian tincture, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Lemon extract for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2018-00680) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 16 – Rosales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2011-00188/ FEFANA asbl) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

15 April 2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 146TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 19 February 2021

(Agreed on 19 February 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on *Panax Ginseng* C.A. Mey. (Ginseng extract CoE 318) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2018-00320) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on *Ginkgo biloba* L. extract for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2018-00318) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on *Arctium lappa* extract (Great Burdock extract CoE 57) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2018-00439) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 - Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01296) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2011-01182) and decided that further discussion is needed/ to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.6. The following items were not discussed: Lemon extract for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2018-00680); Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01517)

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

12 March 2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 145TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 22 January 2021

(Agreed on 22 January 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on *Echinachea angustifolia* DC. extract (Blacksamson echinacea extract) and *Echinachea purpurea* (L.) Moench. extract (Echinacea extract) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2018-00319) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the application on *Plantago ovata* L. husk (Fleawort absolute) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2018-00441) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG continued the discussion on the application on *Garcinia cambogia* Desrouss. (Garcinia extract) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2018-00440/) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales (EFSA-Q-2010-01286) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2011-01182) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 8 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01517) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

19 February 2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 144TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 9 December 2020

(Agreed on 9 December 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing experts:
Loic Bureau (expert in phytochemistry and nutraceuticals, consultant for MANGHEBATI SAS), Florence Hinault (MANGHEBATI SAS, contact point for FEFANA asbl) and Isabelle Machet (MANGHEBATI SAS, contact point for FEFANA asbl)
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Experts

Mr. Loic Bureau, Ms. Florence Hinault and Ms. Isabelle Machet were invited to present their view for item 5.2 of the present meeting "irrespective of whether they hold potential CoI", in accordance with Article 9 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.³ They attended the meeting from 10:00 for one hour.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA invited Mr. Loic Bureau, Ms. Florence Hinault and Ms. Isabelle Machet to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.2. Clarification on the additional information submitted and discussion on the data required for the risk assessment of substances of concern in botanical preparations.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant MANGHEBATISAS, contact point for FEFANA asbl, was given the opportunity clarify some outstanding issues related to the presence of substances of concern in several preparations from Botanically defined group 02. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant.

EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed and the next steps and relative timelines.

5.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-01182](#)/ FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



- 5.4.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

The WG composition will be updated with two new members. The relevant procedure has been started.

7. Next meeting

22 January 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 143RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 27 November 2020

(Agreed on 27 November 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

The following item was removed from the agenda: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided to invite the applicant to a technical hearing at the next meeting of the WG to provide clarification on the additional information submitted.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)/ FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

9 December 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 142ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 10-11 November 2020

(Agreed on 11 November 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01296 ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decide to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

27 November 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 141ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 20 October 2020

(Agreed on 20 October 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01296 ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

10-11 November 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 140TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 2 October 2020

(Agreed on 2 October 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Jaume Galobart and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.



The following item was removed from the agenda: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

20 October 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 139TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 15-16 September 2020

(Agreed on 16 September 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.



The following item was removed from the agenda: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

2 October 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 138TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 17 July 2020

(Agreed by written procedure on 21 July 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on *Verbascum thapsus* L. (great mullein tincture) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00449](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales: Gentian tincture for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00182](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

15 September 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 137TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 23 June 2020

(Agreed on 23 June 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

17 July 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 136TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 3 June 2020

(Agreed on 3 June 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on the Mugwort tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00344](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.4.** The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

23 June 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 135TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 8 May 2020

(Agreed on 8 April 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)/ FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

3 June 2020



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 134TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 3 April 2020

(Agreed on 3 April 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The meeting originally scheduled as a physical meeting was converted into teleconference to avoid traveling to Parma in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection.

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

8 May 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 133RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 3-4 March 2020

(Agreed on 4 March 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The meeting originally scheduled as a physical meeting was converted into teleconference to avoid traveling to Parma in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection. EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Lemon extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00680](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

3 April 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 132ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 7 February 2020

(Agreed on 7 February 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the application on Dry grape extract 60-20 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2019-00036](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 14 for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00180](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Lemon extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00680](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

The WG composition has been updated with a new member, Francesca Marcon (starting from this meeting). Francesca Marcon is a member of the FEEDAP Panel and during 2019 has participated in several WG meetings as a hearing expert.

6. Next meeting

3-4 March 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 131ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 17 January 2020

(Agreed on 17 January 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing experts:
Francesca Marcon
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The Working Group discussed the application on Dry grape extract 60-20 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2019-00036](#)/ ACTIV'INSIDE and Spécialités Pet Food (SPF - DIANA PET FOOD) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

7 February 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 130TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 13 December 2019

(Agreed on 13 December 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

17 January 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 129TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 6 December 2019

(Agreed on 6 December 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf

■ Hearing experts:

Benjamin Costerousse (Saqual – consultant for FEFANA asbl), Alicia Juárez Pallarés (FEFANA asbl) and Manfred Lützow (Saqual– consultant for FEFANA asbl) have participated for item 5.2

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Almudena Rodríguez Sánchez-Beato has participated for item 5.2

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Experts

Mr. Benjamin Costerousse, Ms. Alicia Juárez Pallarés and Mr. Manfred Lützow were invited to participate in the working group meeting "irrespective of whether they hold potential CoI", in accordance with Article 9 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.³ They attended the meeting from 9:30 for two hours.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA invited Mr. Benjamin Costerousse, Ms. Alicia Juárez Pallarés and Mr. Manfred Lützow to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)/ FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.2. Discussion on the data required for the risk assessment of substances of concern in botanical preparations.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant FEFANA was given the opportunity to clarify some outstanding issues related to the presence of substances of concern in several *Citrus* preparations from Botanically defined group 08. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant.

EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



7. Next meeting

13 December 2019

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 128TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 26 November 2019

(Agreed on 26 November 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf

■ Hearing experts:

Francesca Marcon

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

6 December 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 127TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 5 November 2019

(Agreed on 5 November 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

26 November 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 126TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 28 October 2019

(Agreed on 28 October 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Francesca Marcon
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

5 November 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 125TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Held on 16-17 October 2019

(Agreed on 17 October 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Johannes Westendorf and Maria de Lourdes Bastos.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Paola Manini and Lucilla Gregoretti
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Olive extract, olive leaf extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters: 4-phenylbut-3-en-2-one [07.024] and benzophenone [07.032] for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00453](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 - Gentianales: Gentian tincture for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00182](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

28 October 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 124TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 27 September 2019

(Agreed on 27 September 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Maria de Lourdes Bastos and Lucilla Gregoretti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the applications on the CGD 05 II ([EFSA-Q-2015-00599](#)) and CDG 08 II ([EFSA-Q-2016-00163](#)) for all animal species and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanical Group 09 Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) for all animal species and categories and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) for all animal species and categories and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

16-17 October 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 123RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Meeting, 19 July 2019

(Agreed on 19 July 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the applications on the CGD 05 II ([EFSA-Q-2015-00599](#)) and CDG 08 II ([EFSA-Q-2016-00163](#)) for all animal species and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanical Group 09 Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

27 September 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 122ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Meeting, 25-26 June 2019

(Agreed on 26 June 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom,¹ Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Attended by teleconference.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanical Group 09 Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working group continued the discussion on the application on the Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

19 July 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 121ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Tele-web conference, 7 June 2019

(Agreed on 7 June 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts:
Francesca Marcon
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The following items were not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)), Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)), Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

25-26 June 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 120TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Tele-web conference, 10 May 2019

(Agreed on 10 May 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

■ Hearing Experts:

Francesca Marcon

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Dry grape extract 60-20 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2019-00036](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The following items were not discussed: *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)), Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)).

5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

7 June 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 119TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Held on 26-27 March 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 27 March 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf.
Paul Brantom attended on both days via web conference.

■ Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Macleaya cordata extract for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01066) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Mugwort tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Melissa officinalis dry extract all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from Zingiber officinale Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7. The following item was not discussed: Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#))

5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

10 May 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 118TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Held on 28 February 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 28 February 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos and Birgit Dusemund
Andrew Chesson and Johannes Westendorf have participated via teleconference
- Hearing Experts¹:
Gabriele Aquilina, Diane Benford, Claudia Bolognesi, Rainer Gürtler and Josef Schlatter
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Miguel-Angel Granero-Rosell
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Maria Vittoria Vettori and Frank Verdonck
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Carla Martino and Camilla Smeraldi
SCER Unit: Daniela Maurici
- Others:

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Experts⁴

Gabriele Aquilina, Diane Benford, Claudia Bolognesi, Francesca Marcon, Rainer Gürtler and Josef Schlatter were invited to present their view for item 5.1 of the present meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2013-01029) and decided that further discussion is needed.**

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1. Not Applicable**

7. Next meeting

26-27 March 2019.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 117th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 15 February 2019

(Agreed on 15 February 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on *Mugwort* tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 - Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.5. Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 03 - Alfa, beta-unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing alfa, beta-unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing alfa, beta-unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes: hex-2-en-1-ol [02.020], nona-2,6-dien-1-ol [02.049], pent-2-en-1-ol [02.050], non-2(cis)-en-1-ol [02.112], tr-2, cis-6-nonadien-1-ol [02.231], 2-dodecenal [05.037], nona-2(trans),6(cis)-dial [05.058], nona-2,4-dienal [05.071], trans-2-nonenal [05.072], hex-2(trans)-enal [05.073], 2,4-decadienal [05.081], 2,4-heptadienal, hepta-2,4-dienal [05.058], deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dial [05.140], dodec-2(trans)-enal [05.144], hept-2(trans)-enal [05.150], non-2-enal [05.171], nona-2(trans),6(trans)-dial [05.172], undec-2(trans)-enal [05.184], trans-2-octenal [05.190], trans-2-decenal [05.191], tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal [05.194], tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal [05.196], allyl heptanoate [09.097], allyl hexanoate [09.244], hex-2(trans)-enyl acetate [09.394] and hex-2-enyl

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



butyrate [09.396] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00344](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

28 February 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 116th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 29 January 2019

(Agreed on 29 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued its discussion on chemically defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on *Mugwort* tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

15 February 2019 (web conference)

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 115th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 8 January 2019

(Agreed on 8 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued its discussion on Oil of *Origanum vulgare* L. subsp. *Hirtum* for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2018-00121](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Oregano oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00122](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 - Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.6. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)), Chemically

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

29 January 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 114th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 03 December 2018

(Agreed on 03 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The agenda was adopted with changes. The following item was not discussed *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on Oil of *Origanum vulgare* L. subsp. *Hirtum* for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2018-00121](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

6. Next meeting

8 January 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 113th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 07 November 2018

(Agreed on 07 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 112nd Working Group meeting held on 19 October 2018, Tele web-conference.

The minutes of the 112nd Working Group meeting held on 19 October 2018 were agreed on the same day⁴.

5. Scientific Topics for discussion

- 5.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 5.2.** The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 20 - aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di-thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulphides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups when used as flavourings: 8-mercapto-p-methan-3-one [12.038], p-menth-1-ene-8-thiol [12.085] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00325](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3.** The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 03 - Alpha, beta-unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing alpha, beta-unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing alpha, beta-unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes: hex-2-en-1-ol [02.020], nona-2,6-dien-1-ol [02.049], pent-2-en-1-ol [02.050], non-2(cis)-en-1-ol [02.112], tr-2, cis-6-nonadien-1-ol [02.231], 2-dodecenal [05.037], nona-2(trans),6(cis)-dienal [05.058], nona-2,4-dienal [05.071], trans-2-nonenal [05.072], hex-2(trans)-enal [05.073], 2,4-decadienal [05.081], 2,4-

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

heptadienal, hepta-2,4-dienal [05.058], deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal [05.140], dodec-2(trans)-enal [05.144], hept-2(trans)-enal [05.150], non-2-enal [05.171], nona-2(trans),6(trans)-dienal [05.172], undec-2(trans)-enal [05.184], trans-2-octenal [05.190], trans-2-decenal [05.191], tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal [05.194], tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal [05.196], allyl heptanoate [09.097], allyl hexanoate [09.244], hex-2(trans)-enyl acetate [09.394] and hex-2-enyl butyrate [09.396] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00344](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Oregano oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00122](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.5. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable

7. Next meeting

3 December 2018