SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

169th Plenary meeting 26-28 September 2023

09:00-18:00 / 09:00-18:00 / 09:00-13:00

MINUTES – agreed on 4 October 2023

Location: Online

Participants:

- **Panel Members:**

  Giovanna Azimonti, Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Henrik Christensen, Birgit Dusemund, Mojca Durjava, Maryline Kouba, Marta López-Alonso, Secundino López Puente, Francesca Marcon, Baltasar Mayo, Alena Pechová, Mariana Petkova, Fernando Ramos[1], Roberto Edoardo Villa and Ruud Woutersen.

- **Hearing Experts:**

  Not applicable.

- **European Commission:**

  Not applicable.

- **EFSA:**

  FEEDCO Unit: Natalia Alija Novo, Angelica Amaduzzi, Montserrat Anguita, Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Rosella Brozzi, Yvette Dirven, Joana Firmino, Stefani Fruk, Jaume Galobart, Yolanda García Cazorla, Mary Bridget Gilsenan, Orsolya Holczknecht, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Alberto Navarro Villa, Jordi Ortuño, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Anita Radovnikovic, Joana Revez, Barbara Rossi, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.

- **Others:**

  Not applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without modifications.

3. Declarations of Interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

---

1 Present on 26 and 28 September only.

2 Policy on Independence

3 Competing Interest Management

4. Report on written procedures since the 168th FEEDAP Plenary meeting

The minutes of the 168th FEEDAP Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 19 July 2023.[4]

The Panel adopted the following opinions by written procedure:

- Sodium hydroxide for dogs, cats and ornamental fish (EFSA-Q-2022-00376) adopted on 5th of September 2023
- Iron (II) - betaine complex for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00624) adopted on 5th of September 2023

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. E 566 Natrolite-phonolite (PHIL 75®) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2014-00888)

This question refers to the re-evaluation under Article 10 and the modification of the conditions of the authorisation under Article 13 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of E 566 Natrolite-phonolite (PHIL 75®) as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed. Further discussion is needed and the opinion will be tabled in a future plenary.

5.2. Cylactin®, Cernivet® (*Enterococcus lactis* – formerly identified as *Enterococcus faecium* NCIMB 10415) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor poultry species for fattening, minor poultry species reared for laying, chicken and minor poultry species reared for breeding, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, ornamental birds, calves for fattening, calves for rearing, kids for fattening, kids for rearing, lambs for fattening, lambs for rearing, minor or other ruminant species for rearing and fattening, sows, piglets (suckling), piglets (weaned), pigs for fattening, pigs for rearing, pigs for reproduction, minor pig species (suckling), minor pig species (weaned), minor pig species for rearing and fattening and minor pig species for reproduction (EFSA-Q-2020-00391)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Cylactin®, Cernivet® (*Enterococcus lactis* NCIMB 10415) as a zootechnical additive for several poultry, porcine and ruminant species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.3. Dicopper chloride trihydroxide for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2021-00547)

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisations under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of dicopper chloride trihydroxide as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

[4] https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2023-07/feedap_230704-06_m.pdf

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation and safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.4. *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* (formerly *Lactobacillus plantarum*) LMG P-21295 for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2021-00738)

This question refers to renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* (formerly *Lactobacillus plantarum*) LMG P-21295 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.5. RONOZYME WX (CT), RONOZYME WX (L) (Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8) for all pigs and all avian species (EFSA-Q-2022-00156)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4, the modification of the conditions of the authorisation under Article 13, and the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of RONOZYME WX (CT), RONOZYME WX (L) (Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8) as a zootechnical additive for all pigs and all avian species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.6. TechnoSpore50 (*Weizmannia faecalis* DSM 32016) for poultry reared for breeding, poultry reared for laying, poultry for fattening, ornamental birds, suckling and weaned Suidae piglets (EFSA-Q-2022-00221 and EFSA-Q-2022-00316)

These questions refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the modification of the conditions of the authorisation under Article 13 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of TechnoSpore50 (*Weizmannia faecalis* DSM 32016) (4b19900) as a zootechnical additive for poultry reared for breeding, poultry reared for laying, poultry for fattening, ornamental birds, suckling and weaned Suidae piglets.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.7. Biomin® C5 (Preparation of *Enterococcus faecium* DSM 33761, *Pediococcus acidilactici* DSM 33758, *Bifidobacterium animalis* DSM 16284, *Limosilactobacillus reuteri* DSM 33751 and *Ligilactobacillus salivarius* DSM 16351) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor avian species other than laying species (EFSA-Q-2022-00321)

This question refer to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Biomin® C5 (Preparation of *Enterococcus faecium* DSM 33761, *Pediococcus acidilactici* DSM 33758, *Bifidobacterium animalis* DSM 16284, *Limosilactobacillus reuteri* DSM 33751 and *Ligilactobacillus salivarius* DSM 16351) as a zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor avian species other than laying species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.8. aXiphen (Phenylcapsaicin) for chickens for fattening (EFSA-Q-2022-00355)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of aXiphen (Phenylcapsaicin) as a zootehcnical additive for chickens for fattening.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel endorsed the draft and will be considered for written adoption after the outcome of the public consultation is addressed.

5.9. Biomin® C3 (Preparation of *Enterococcus faecium* DSM 21913, *Bifidobacterium animalis* DSM 16284 and *Ligilactobacillus salivarius* DSM 16351) for all growing poultry (EFSA-Q-2022-00374)

This question refers to the modification of the conditions of the authorisation under Article 13 and the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Biomin® C3 (Preparation of *Enterococcus faecium* DSM 21913, *Bifidobacterium animalis* DSM 16284 and *Ligilactobacillus salivarius* DSM 16351) as a zootechnical additive for all growing poultry.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.10. Niacin (3a314) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00477)

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of niacin (3a314) as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation and safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.11. Niacinamide (3a315) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00512)

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of niacinamide (3a315) as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation and safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.12. *Lentilactobacillus buchneri* DSM 19455 (previously *Lactobacillus kefiri* DSM 19455) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00524)

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lentilactobacillus buchneri* DSM 19455 (previously *Lactobacillus kefiri* DSM 19455) as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation and the safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.13. Bonvital (*Enterococcus lactis* DSM 7134) for chickens for rearing and minor poultry species other than those used for laying (EFSA-Q-2022-00531)

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Bonvital (*Enterococcus lactis* DSM 7134) (4b1841) as a zootechnical additive for chickens for rearing and minor poultry species (other than those used for laying).

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation and safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.14. Folic acid for all animal species (3a316) (EFSA-Q-2022-00555)

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of folic acid (3a316) as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed. The Panel identified the need for further discussion and an updated draft of the opinion will be presented in the next plenary meeting.

5.15. Manganese (II) - betaine complex for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00556)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of manganese (II) - betaine complex as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.16. Biosprint® (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* MUCL 39885) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2022-00587)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the efficacy of Biosprint® (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* MUCL 39885) as a zootechnical additive for cats and dogs.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.17. Orthophosphoric acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00812)

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of orthophosphoric acid as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation and the safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.18. Provita LE (*Enterococcus faecium* DSM 7134 and *Lacticaseibacillus rhamnosus* DSM 7133) for calves (EFSA-Q-2022-00820)

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Provita LE (*Enterococcus faecium* DSM 7134 and *Lacticaseibacillus rhamnosus* DSM 7133) as a zootechnical additive for calves.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation and safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.19. 41 flavouring compounds to provide a Herbal flavour for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2023-00030)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the safety of 41 flavouring compounds to provide a Herbal flavour as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.20. BIO-THREE® (*Bacillus subtilis* TO-A (BS), *Enterococcus faecium* T-110 (EF), *Clostridium butyricum* TO-A (CB)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and minor poultry species (EFSA-Q-2023-00186)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the efficacy of BIO-THREE® (*Bacillus subtilis* TO-A (BS), *Enterococcus faecium* T-110 (EF), *Clostridium butyricum* TO-A (CB)) as a zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and minor poultry species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.21. Nutrase P (6-phytase) for chickens for fattening, other poultry for fattening, reared for laying and ornamental birds (EFSA-Q-2023-00376)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the efficacy of Nutrase P (6-phytase) as a zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening, other poultry for fattening, reared for laying and ornamental birds.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.22. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Anise star terpenes (EFSA-Q-2023-00399)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Anise star terpenes as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.23. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Coriander oil (EFSA-Q-2023-00586)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of coriander oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.24. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Fennel oil (EFSA-Q-2023-00587)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of fennel oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6. New mandates

6.1. New applications under Regulation (EC) 1831/2003 since the previous meeting

The Commission has forwarded to EFSA the following new applications of feed additives seeking authorisation under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 since the last Plenary meeting. These applications were presented to the Panel:

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2023-00451	Preparation of lactic acid bacteria for dogs
EFSA-Q-2023-00452	Calcium D-pantothenate

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2023-00453	Chromium-DL-methionine (Availa® Cr 1000)
EFSA-Q-2023-00454	*Bacillus paralicheniformis* DSM 33902 + *Bacillus subtilis* DSM 33903
EFSA-Q-2023-00482	Modification of an existing authorisation L-lysine base, liquid 3c320
EFSA-Q-2023-00483	Lutein-rich extract from *Tagetes erecta* (2a161b) for turkeys for fattening
EFSA-Q-2023-00484	L-Lysine sulphate containing non-viable biomass of genetically modified *Corynebacterium glutamicum*
EFSA-Q-2023-00485	Canthaxanthin (4d161g) (CAROPHYLL Red)
EFSA-Q-2023-00486	*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* CNCM I-1079 in Canidae
EFSA-Q-2023-00518	Pantothenic acid as calcium D-pantothenate and D-panthenol
EFSA-Q-2023-00539	Fumaric Acid
EFSA-Q-2023-00543	*Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 16627 for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00544	*Lacticaseibacillus paracasei* NCIMB 30151
EFSA-Q-2023-00547	L-valine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80366 for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00548	*Pediococcus acidilactici* NCIMB 3005 for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00549	Hexamethylene tetramine sodium nitrite for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00551	L-valine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80058 for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00585	*Vaccinium macrocarpon* extract (w.b.) as Flavouring compound for dogs and cats
EFSA-Q-2023-00631	Preparation of *Bacillus subtilis* DSM 33862 and *Lentilactobacillus buchneri* DSM 12856

6.2. Valid applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 since the previous meeting

Applications considered valid for the start of the assessment:

EFSA-Q number	Subject	Valid on
EFSA-Q-2022-00581	*Levilactobacillus brevis* (formerly *Lactobacillus brevis*) DSMZ 21982	12/07/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00800	AveMix XG 10 (xylanase and beta-glucanase produced by *T. longibrachiatum* MUCL 49755 & 49754)	07/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00801	Bentonite (1m558i)	06/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00829	Bentonite	05/07/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00840	Natural mixture of illite-illite/smectite mixed layer as a technological additive	29/06/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00881	Propionic acid (1k280)	17/07/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00042	Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8.) and endo-1,4-beta-glucanase (EC 3.2.1.4.) (Natugrain TS/TS L)	04/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00043	Alpha-amylase (E.C. 3.2.1.1) produced by *Bacillus licheniformis* DSM 34315	16/08/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00048	L-Tryptophan as new feed additive	12/07/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00049	L-Threonine, as feed additive	31/07/2023

EFSA-Q number	Subject	Valid on
EFSA-Q-2023-00162	*Pediococcus pentosaceus* DSM 23689	14/07/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00163	*Pediococcus pentosaceus* DSM 23688	31/08/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00164	*Pediococcus pentosaceus* DSM 14021	31/08/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00202	L-Tyrosine (3c401)	18/07/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00203	Fumonisin esterase EC 3.1.1.87	03/08/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00250	*Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 34271	09/08/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00251	Preparation of endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase (EC 3.2.1.6) produced by *Trichoderma reesei* (CBS 126896)	24/08/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00253	Endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase EC 3.2.1.6 / Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase EC 3.2.1.8 (4a1604i) Rovabio Excel	04/07/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00255	*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* NCYC R618 (Benesacc)	15/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00298	*Lactobacillus plantarum* 14D/CSL - CECT 4528 (Lactosil) - 1k20746 - silage additive	25/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00363	*Limosilactobacillus fermentum* NCIMB 30169 as feed additive	19/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00391	Vermiculite	19/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00392	*Lentilactobacillus buchneri* BioCC 228 DSM 32651	07/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00453	Chromium-DL-methionine (Availa® Cr 1000)	12/09/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00486	*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* CNCM I-1079 in Canidae	18/09/2023

These applications were assigned to the respective working groups, where relevant.

6.3. New questions under Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 since the previous meeting

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2023-00166	KemTRACE chromium (chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species

These questions were assigned to the respective working groups, where relevant.

7. Feedback from Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission/EURL

7.1. Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels

The Chair of the Panel provided a short update on the last plenary of the Scientific Committee, held on 20-21 September 2023.

7.2. EFSA

Not discussed.

7.3. European Commission/EURL

Not discussed.

8. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

The Panel was informed on the outcome of the public consultation on the draft updated Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the users, which was open from 21/07/2023 until 15/09/2023. The comments received will be considered in the revised version of the guidance document that will be sent to a future plenary for adoption.

9. Any other business

a) In March 2023, the FEEDAP Panel adopted an opinion on the safety and efficacy of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 11520 as a feed additive for horses, dogs, cats and pet rabbits (EFSA-Q-2021-00687). Regarding the safety conclusion for the consumer the Panel only considered horses as food producing animals and did not conclude on the safety for the consumer for rabbits since the application considered pet rabbits only. European Commission clarified that rabbits should be considered as food producing animals in accordance with Article 1, paragraph 1, of Commission Regulation (EC) 429/2008, and requested to have a conclusion on the safety for consumers of rabbits. The Panel concluded in that opinion that *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 11520 qualified for the Qualified Presumption of Safety (QPS) approach, therefore, the additive is considered safe for the consumers of rabbits fed with the additive.

b) The next plenary (14-16 November) will include a session open to observers.