

26-28 September 2023

09:00-18:00 / 09:00-18:00 / 09:00-13:00

MINUTES (Agreed on 05 October 2023)

Location: NH Hotel, Parma

Attendees:

- FAF Panel Members:

Laurence Castle, Gisela Degen, María José Frutos Fernández, Peter Fürst, Rainer Gürtler, Melania Manco, Wim Mennes, Peter Moldeus, Sabina Passamonti, Dina (Ine) Waalkens-Berendsen and Matthew Wright, Maged Younes

- EFSA:

Food Ingredients and Packaging (FIP) Unit: Stefania Barmaz, Valeriu Curtui, Maria Carfi, Consuelo Civitella, Gabriele Gagliardi, Christina Kyrkou, Federica Lodi, Carla Martino, Agnieszka Mech, Salvatore Samuele Multari, Vasantha Palaniappan, Laura Ruggeri, Camilla Smeraldi, Alexandra Tard, Panagiota Zakidou.

- European Commission: Stylianos Koulouris

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Fowler on 28th September 2023.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 38th FAF Panel meeting held on 5 July 2023, via web-conference

The minutes of the [38th FAF Panel meeting](#) were agreed on 25th July 2023.

5. Report on written procedures since 38th Plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last Plenary meeting.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

6.1. Scientific opinion on the renewal of the authorisation of proFagus Smoke R714 (SF-001) as a smoke flavouring primary product ([EFSA-Q-2022-00423](#))

The FAF Panel discussed all parts of the draft opinion. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to the incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting and editorial changes.

6.2. Scientific opinion on the renewal of the authorization of Zesti Smoke Code 10 (SF-002) as a smoke flavouring primary product . ([EFSA-Q-2022-00415](#))

The FAF Panel discussed all parts of the draft opinion. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to the incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting and editorial changes.

6.3. Scientific opinion on the renewal of the authorisation of Smoke Concentrate 809045 (SF-003) as a smoke flavouring primary product ([EFSA-Q-2022-00420](#))

The FAF Panel discussed all parts of the draft opinion. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to the incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting and editorial changes.

6.4. Scientific opinion on the renewal of the authorisation of Scansmoke SEF7525 (SF-004) as a smoke flavouring primary product ([EFSA-Q-2022-00421](#))

The FAF Panel discussed all parts of the draft opinion. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to the incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting and editorial changes.

6.5. Scientific opinion on the renewal of the authorisation of SmokEz C-10. (SF-005) ([EFSA-Q-2022-00416](#))

The FAF Panel discussed all parts of the draft opinion. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to the incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting and editorial changes.

6.6. Scientific opinion on the renewal of the authorisation of SmokEz Enviro-23 (SF-006) ([EFSA-Q-2022-00417](#))

The FAF Panel discussed all parts of the draft opinion. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to the incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting and editorial changes.

6.7. Scientific opinion on the renewal of the authorisation of proFagus Smoke R709 (SF-008)([EFSA-Q-2022-422](#))

The FAF Panel discussed all parts of the draft opinion. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to the incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting and editorial changes.

6.8. Scientific opinion on the renewal of the authorisation of Fumokomp Conc (SF-009) as a smoke flavouring primary product ([EFSA-Q-2022-00414](#))

The FAF Panel discussed all parts of the draft opinion. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to the incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting and editorial changes.

7. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Panel(s), EFSA, European Commission

7.1. Scientific Committee/Panel(s) including their Working Groups

The Panel Chair provided feedback from the last plenary of the EFSA Scientific Committee held on 20-21 September 2023.



Of particular relevance for the work of the Panel were the progress made on the guidance on protocol development (which was adopted on 20 September 2023), on the draft guidance on read across and on the ongoing work on biomarkers of effect.

The next meeting of the EFSA Scientific Committee is planned for 21-23 November 2023.

7.2. FAF Panel Working Groups /Task Forces

The Chairs of the Working Groups of the FAF Panel were consulted with respect to the status of the ongoing assessments with a view to identify possible agenda items for the coming Panel plenary meetings.

A tentative plan for the plenary meetings planned for the remaining months of 2023 was agreed.

7.3. EFSA

The Head of the FIP Unit provided an update on the ongoing procedure for the renewal of the EFSA Scientific Panels.

7.4. European Commission

Nothing to report.

8. New mandates

8.1. New questions received since the 38th FAF Plenary

The following new mandates have been received since the 38th FAF Plenary meeting:

Food Sector	EFSA-Q-Number	Subject	Reception date
FA Ext use	2023-00505	Application for the extension of use of the food additive quillaia extract	19.07.2023
FA Change specs	2023-00546	Application for the modification of the food additive rebaudioside M from stevia leaves	09.08.2023
FA Ext use	2023-00594	Application for the extension of use of the food additive steviol glycosides	08.09.2023

The three new mandates are all related to applications submitted under Regulation (EC) No 1331/2008 (i.e. the Common Authorisation Procedure), and pending the validity of these applications, they will be assigned to the WG on Food Additives Applications for the preparation of the respective scientific outputs.

8.2. Valid/accepted questions since the 38th FAF Plenary:

The following two new mandates have been accepted by EFSA since the 38th FAF Plenary meeting, both relating to the follow-up of scientific opinions on the re-evaluation of food additives completed by the ANS/FAF Panel in the frame of Regulation (EU) No 257/2010:

- **Request for a scientific opinion from the European Food Safety Authority as regards the specifications of the food additives acetic acid esters of mono- and diglycerides of fatty acids (E 472a), lactic acid esters of mono- and diglycerides of fatty acids (E 472b), tartaric acid esters of mono- and diglycerides of fatty acids (E 472d), mono- and diacetyltartaric acid esters of mono- and diglycerides**



of fatty acids (E 472e) and mixed acetic and tartaric acid esters of mono- and diglycerides of fatty acids (E 472f) ([EFSA-Q-2023-00577](#))

This new mandate from the European Commission relates to the assessment of the data submitted by the interested business operators in response to the call issued by the European Commission in January 2021 to follow-up on the earlier FAF Panel opinion on the re-evaluation s Scientific Opinion on the re-evaluation of acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, tartaric acid, mono- and diacetyl tartaric acid, mixed acetic and tartaric acid esters of mono- and diglycerides of fatty acids (E 472a-f) as food additives. The mandate has been accepted by EFSA on 4th September 2023 with deadline 25 May 2024 (unless the need for requesting additional information to the from relevant interested parties is identified during the assessment).

The Panel was reminded that, in addition to the present request, EFSA had already received from the European Commission a request to address all the data gaps specified in the recommendations made in its scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of the related food additive citric acid esters of mono- and diglycerides of fatty acids (E 472c), and for which the scientific assessment is already ongoing ([EFSA-Q-2021-00674](#)) at the level of the WG on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age.

It is therefore anticipated that the two related scientific assessments will be handled jointly, possibly resulting in the delivery of a single opinion. Support from the WG Specifications of Food Additives may also be needed.

- **Request for a scientific opinion from the European Food Safety Authority as regards the safety of the food additive processed Eucheuma seaweed (E 407a) and its specifications ([EFSA-Q-2023-00576](#))**

This new mandate from the European Commission relates to the assessment of the data submitted by the interested business operators in response to the call issued by the European Commission in October 2018 to follow-up on the earlier ANS Panel scientific opinion on the re-evaluation Scientific Opinion on the re-evaluation of carrageenan (E 407) and processed Eucheuma seaweed (E 407a) as food additives. The mandate has been accepted by EFSA on 4th September 2023 with deadline 25 August 2024 (unless the need for requesting additional information to the from relevant interested parties is identified during the assessment).

The Panel was reminded that, in addition to the present request, EFSA had already received from the European Commission a request to address all the data gaps specified in the recommendations made in its scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of the related food additive carrageenan (E 407), and for which the scientific assessment is already ongoing ([EFSA-Q-2018-00270](#)) at the level of the WG on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age.

It is therefore anticipated that the two related scientific assessments will be handled jointly, possibly resulting in the delivery of a single opinion. Support from the WG Specifications of Food Additives may also be needed.

8.3. Withdrawn questions since the 38th FAF Plenary:

None.

9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion



Nothing to report.

10. Any other business

None.