SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

4th Working Group meeting on DIATHERMIC SYNCOPE FOR STUNNING CATTLE

27 September 2024
10:00-18:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 01 October 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
ANTONIO VELARDE CALVO

MOHAN RAJ

ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
Under Framework Partnership Agreement No GP/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/10 and according to Specific Agreement No 2-2023

ANTONI DALMAU

ALEXANDRA CONTRERAS

- European Commission representative:
ESTER ALAEZ PONS (SANTE)

- EFSA:
AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU

YVES VAN DER STEDE

- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence2 and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management3, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 26 July 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 31 July 2024.

V. Revision of assessment phase 1

The Working Group (WG) discussed and resolved some comments from assessment phase 1.

VI. Assessment phase 2

a. Assessment of equivalence of the method with existing stunning methods

The experts assessed and judged the new stunning method with the comparable approved existing stunning methods by expert opinion, through a ranking hazards exercise and in relation to the parameters of prevalence, duration and severity, using the scoring system of Likert scale. The comparative stunning methods were identified from the Council Regulation (EC) No 1099/2009, while the list of hazards for each method was formed by the Tasking Grant group (TG), the WG and the EFSA AHAW Panel. The prevalence and duration were defined and agreed collectively during the WG meeting, whereas the severity of the hazards for each method was ranked independently by each expert.

b. Results of the qualitative exercise on equivalence

After the first results were provided, the experts discussed to find a consensus on the conclusions. Finally, the five highest selected hazards from each expert were kept for further comparative analysis.

VII. Tasks and deadlines

Specific tasks were delegated to each member of the WG, as well as to the TG to be prepared in October 2024.

VIII. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

IX. Next meeting

The next WG meeting will be held on 04 November 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE
3rd Working Group meeting on DIATHERMIC SYNCOPE FOR STUNNING CATTLE

26 July 2024
09:00-17:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 31 July 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
ANTONIO VELARDE CALVO

MOHAN RAJ

ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
Under Framework Partnership Agreement No GP/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/10 and according to Specific Agreement No 2-2023

ANTONI DALMAU

ALEXANDRA CONTRERAS

- European Commission representative:
SUSANNE DITTMANN RASMUSSEN (SANTE)

- EFSA:
AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU

AITANA LOPEZ

- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Ester Alaez Pons (EC). New EFSA SNE Aitana Lopez presented herself.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence2 and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management3, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by

[1] As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 20 February 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 23 February 2024.

V. Assessment phase 1

The Working Group (WG) assessed the preparatory work of the Tasking Grant (TG) group, after receiving the second additional information from the applicant.

a. Description of the method including potential sources of pain, distress and suffering after recieving the second additional information.

The WG analysed the preparatory work of the TG group about the description of the new stunning method, including the potential sources of pain, distress, and suffering. Specifically, they also reviewed the texts about the stunning apparatus, cleaning and maintenance, the technical description of the waveguide position and application of energy, the additional commercial considerations, and the assessment of Animal Welfare (AW) when Diathermic Syncope (DTS) is used.

b. Key parameters and scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness, after receiving the second additional information.

The WG examined the preparatory work of the TG group about the key parameters for the effective use of the method and the scientific basis related to the induction and maintenance of unconsciousness of this method. Specifically, they reviewed the list of the related specifications as per Annex I of Regulation (EC) 1099/2009, the electromagnetics effects and the theory of thermal unconsciousness.

c. Methods used and reporting outcomes, estimations and interpretation of the results for each individual study submitted.

For each individual study submitted, the WG reviewed the preparatory work of the TG about the methods employed, the outcomes and estimations, and the interpretations of the results.

d. Quantitative approaches for the overall integration of findings.

The WG reviewed the preparatory work on the quantitative approaches for the demonstration of equivalence with the existing approved stunning methods.

VI. Tasks and deadlines

WG members were asked to further review the TG work and re-examine the information provided by the applicant in greater detail. Throughout the meeting, specific tasks were delegated to each of the WG group members, as well as to the TG to be prepared by September 5th.

VII. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

VIII. Next meeting

The next WG meeting will be held on 27 September 2024 via web conference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

2nd Working Group meeting on DIATHERMIC SYNCOPE FOR STUNNING CATTLE

20 February 2024
12:30-18:30
MINUTES - Agreed on 23 February 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
ANTONIO VELARDE CALVO

MOHAN RAJ

ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
Not Applicable

- European Commission representative:
ESTER ALAEZ PONS

- EFSA:
AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU

YVES VAN DER STEDE

- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 12 June 2023, via web-conference

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 16 January 2023.

V. Definition of the steps till the adoption of the SO

A definition of the steps and the way of working until the adoption of the Scientific Opinion (SO) was made by the EFSA staff.

VI. Eligibility criteria of EFSA's guidelines (ToR 1)

a. Description of the method including potential sources of pain, distress and suffering

The Working Group (WG) discussed about the description of the stunning method, including potential sources of pain, distress and suffering, and reviewed the text that had already been prepared by the Tasking Grant (TG) group, after the submission of additional information by the applicant. They agreed that some important information is still missing from the updated dossier submitted by the applicant.

b. Key parameters of the effective use of the method for poultry and pigs

The WG discussed about the key parameters of the effective use of the method for cattle and in particular reviewed the text of the TG group and agreed on the information that is still missing from the updated dossier.

c. Scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness for this method

The WG discussed and reviewed the text of the TG group already prepared regarding the scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness for this method and agreed on the missing information.

d. Potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence

The WG assessed the text of the TG group about the potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence for cattle. Overall, they considered that additional information is still needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this method. Therefore, another request for additional information will be sent to the applicant and agreed on the format of the document to be sent.

VII. Tasks and deadlines

Based on the comments made by the WG before and during the meeting, regarding the check of data for risk assessment and in relation to the description of the stunning method, EFSA will prepare a separate document with specific questions in order to request additional information from the applicant for second time. This document will be sent to the WG until 04 March 2024 for their final approval.

VIII. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

IX. Next meeting

When EFSA receives a reply from the applicant, a plan and reorganisation of the next WG meetings will be communicated.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

1ST Working Group meeting on DIATHERMIC SYNCOPE FOR STUNNING CATTLE

12 June 2023
08:00-14:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 16 June 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
  ANTONIO VELARDE CALVO

  MOHAN RAJ

  ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI

- Hearing Experts[1]:
  ANTONI DALMAU

  SANTIAGO RUCINQUE

  ARANZAZU VARVARO

- European Commission representative:
  Not Applicable

- EFSA:
  AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU

- Others:
  Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Denis Simonin (EC).

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[2] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[3], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening

[1] As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf
[3] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Tour de table & Working group composition

An introduction of the participants and of the Working Group (WG) composition was made and the roles of all participants were specified by the EFSA staff.

V. Overview and Terms of Reference of the mandate

The EFSA staff presented the objective and the Terms of Reference of the mandate EFSA-Q-2023-00085.

VI. Overview of EFSA's guidance 2018

The EFSA staff presented the key points of EFSA's guidance 2018[4] for new or modified stunning methods. The WG agreed to use this guidance for the assessment of the method.

VII. Check for completeness of the application submitted

a. Introduction

The WG discussed about the objectives of the check for completeness of the document that had already been prepared by the Tasking Grant (TG) group regarding the application submitted.

b. General points to be addressed

The WG discussed about the general points that are addressed in the aforesaid document and in particular reviewed and agreed on the main points that the application is missing. Simultaneously, some questions were formed about the document that will be sent to the applicant for providing them additional information.

c. Specific points to be addressed - Description of the stunning method

The WG checked the completeness of the description of the new stunning method as presented in the technical document submitted by the applicant and in relation to the prepared document of the TG group. In particular, they reviewed and agreed on the information missing regarding: the description of the method, the key parameters of the effective use of the method, the potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence. At the same time some questions were formed for the applicant.

d. Description of the individual study submitted – STEP 5

The WG checked the completeness of the individual study submitted for anaesthetised cattle and reviewed and agreed on the missing information from the applicant as described in the previously mentioned prepared document regarding: the material and method, reporting the results and conflicts of interest.

e. Description of the individual studies submitted - STEPS 7, 9, 11

The WG checked the completeness of the pilot and validation studies submitted on conscious cattle, as well as of the commercial scale validation, as presented in the technical document submitted by the applicant and in relation to the prepared document of the TG group. In particular, they reviewed and agreed on the information missing regarding: the material and methods (for each

[4] https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.5343

single study), reporting the results, discussion and conclusions, conflicts of interest. At the same time some questions were formed for the applicant.

f. Overall integration of findings from all studies and additional information to request

The WG discussed about the completeness of the overall integration of findings from all studies as presented in the aforementioned document and reviewed and agreed on the missing information of the new submitted method regarding the overall conclusions. Simultaneously, a few questions were formed for the applicant. They concluded on the overall completeness of the application submitted and on the revision of the whole document prepared by the TG group. The WG considered that additional information is needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this method. Therefore, a request for additional information will be sent to the applicant and agreed on the format of the document to be sent.

VIII. Tasks and deadlines

Based on the comments made by the WG before and during the meeting, regarding the check for completeness of the method submitted, EFSA will prepare a separate document with specific questions in order to request additional information from the applicant. This document will be sent to the WG until 21 June 2023 for their final approval.

IX. Any Other Business

When EFSA receives a reply from the applicant, a plan for the next WG meetings will be communicated.