

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

## 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting on DIATHERMIC SYNCOPE FOR STUNNING CATTLE



20 February 2024

12:30-18:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 23 February 2024

**Location:** Webconference

**Attendees:**

- Working Group Members:  
ANTONIO VELARDE CALVO  
  
MOHAN RAJ  
  
ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI
  
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
  
- European Commission representative:  
ESTER ALAEZ PONS
  
- EFSA:  
AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU  
  
YVES VAN DER STEDE
  
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



#### **IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 12 June 2023, via web-conference**

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 16 January 2023.

#### **V. Definition of the steps till the adoption of the SO**

A definition of the steps and the way of working until the adoption of the Scientific Opinion (SO) was made by the EFSA staff.

#### **VI. Eligibility criteria of EFSA's guidelines (ToR 1)**

##### **a. Description of the method including potential sources of pain, distress and suffering**

The Working Group (WG) discussed about the description of the stunning method, including potential sources of pain, distress and suffering, and reviewed the text that had already been prepared by the Tasking Grant (TG) group, after the submission of additional information by the applicant. They agreed that some important information is still missing from the updated dossier submitted by the applicant.

##### **b. Key parameters of the effective use of the method for poultry and pigs**

The WG discussed about the key parameters of the effective use of the method for cattle and in particular reviewed the text of the TG group and agreed on the information that is still missing from the updated dossier.

##### **c. Scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness for this method**

The WG discussed and reviewed the text of the TG group already prepared regarding the scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness for this method and agreed on the missing information.

##### **d. Potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence**

The WG assessed the text of the TG group about the potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence for cattle. Overall, they considered that additional information is still needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this method. Therefore, another request for additional information will be sent to the applicant and agreed on the format of the document to be sent.

#### **VII. Tasks and deadlines**

Based on the comments made by the WG before and during the meeting, regarding the check of data for risk assessment and in relation to the description of the stunning method, EFSA will prepare a separate document with specific questions in order to request additional information from the applicant for second time. This document will be sent to the WG until 04 March 2024 for their final approval.

---



## **VIII. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

## **IX. Next meeting**

When EFSA receives a reply from the applicant, a plan and reorganisation of the next WG meetings will be communicated.

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

## 1<sup>ST</sup> Working Group meeting on DIATHERMIC SYNCOPE FOR STUNNING CATTLE



12 June 2023

08:00-14:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 16 June 2023

**Location:** Webconference

**Attendees:**

- Working Group Members:  
ANTONIO VELARDE CALVO  
  
MOHAN RAJ  
  
ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI
  
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
ANTONI DALMAU  
  
SANTIAGO RUCINQUE  
  
ARANZAZU VARVARO
  
- European Commission representative:  
Not Applicable
  
- EFSA:  
AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU
  
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Denis Simonin (EC).

### II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **IV. Tour de table & Working group composition**

An introduction of the participants and of the Working Group (WG) composition was made and the roles of all participants were specified by the EFSA staff.

#### **V. Overview and Terms of Reference of the mandate**

The EFSA staff presented the objective and the Terms of Reference of the mandate EFSA-Q-2023-00085.

#### **VI. Overview of EFSA's guidance 2018**

The EFSA staff presented the key points of EFSA's guidance 2018<sup>4</sup> for new or modified stunning methods. The WG agreed to use this guidance for the assessment of the method.

#### **VII. Check for completeness of the application submitted**

##### **a. Introduction**

The WG discussed about the objectives of the check for completeness of the document that had already been prepared by the Tasking Grant (TG) group regarding the application submitted.

##### **b. General points to be addressed**

The WG discussed about the general points that are addressed in the aforesaid document and in particular reviewed and agreed on the main points that the application is missing. Simultaneously, some questions were formed about the document that will be sent to the applicant for providing them additional information.

##### **c. Specific points to be addressed - Description of the stunning method**

The WG checked the completeness of the description of the new stunning method as presented in the technical document submitted by the applicant and in relation to the prepared document of the TG group. In particular, they reviewed and agreed on the information missing regarding: the description of the method, the key parameters of the effective use of the method, the potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence. At the same time some questions were formed for the applicant.

##### **d. Description of the individual study submitted – STEP 5**

The WG checked the completeness of the individual study submitted for anaesthetised cattle and reviewed and agreed on the missing information from the applicant as described in the previously mentioned prepared document regarding: the material and method, reporting the results and conflicts of interest.

##### **e. Description of the individual studies submitted - STEPS 7, 9, 11**

The WG checked the completeness of the pilot and validation studies submitted on conscious cattle, as well as of the commercial scale validation, as presented in the technical document submitted by the applicant and in relation to the prepared document of the TG group. In particular, they reviewed and agreed on the information missing regarding: the material and methods (for each

---

<sup>4</sup> <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.5343>



single study), reporting the results, discussion and conclusions, conflicts of interest. At the same time some questions were formed for the applicant.

**f. Overall integration of findings from all studies and additional information to request**

The WG discussed about the completeness of the overall integration of findings from all studies as presented in the aforementioned document and reviewed and agreed on the missing information of the new submitted method regarding the overall conclusions. Simultaneously, a few questions were formed for the applicant. They concluded on the overall completeness of the application submitted and on the revision of the whole document prepared by the TG group. The WG considered that additional information is needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this method. Therefore, a request for additional information will be sent to the applicant and agreed on the format of the document to be sent.

## **VIII. Tasks and deadlines**

Based on the comments made by the WG before and during the meeting, regarding the check for completeness of the method submitted, EFSA will prepare a separate document with specific questions in order to request additional information from the applicant. This document will be sent to the WG until 21 June 2023 for their final approval.

## **IX. Any Other Business**

When EFSA receives a reply from the applicant, a plan for the next WG meetings will be communicated.

---