SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

166th Plenary meeting 21-22-23 March 2023

09:00-18:00 / 09:00-18:00 / 09:00-13:00

MINUTES – agreed on 13 April 2023

Location: European Food Safety Authority (Parma, Italy)

Participants:

- **Panel Members:**

  Giovanna Azimonti, Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Henrik Christensen, Birgit Dusemund, Mojca Durjava, Maryline Kouba, Marta López-Alonso, Secundino López Puente, Francesca Marcon, Baltasar Mayo, Alena Pechová, Mariana Petkova, Fernando Ramos, Roberto Edoardo Villa and Ruud Woutersen

- **Hearing Experts:**

  Not applicable.

- **European Commission:**

  Not applicable.

- **EFSA:**

  FEEDCO Unit: Natalia Alija Novo, Angelica Amaduzzi, Arianna Angelini, Montserrat Anguita, Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Rosella Brozzi, Yvette Dirven, Joana Firmino, Stefani Fruk, Yolanda García Cazorla, Mary Bridget Gilsenan, Orsolya Holczknecht, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Alberto Navarro Villa, Jordi Ortuño, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Anita Radovnikovic, Joana Revez, Barbara Rossi, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.

- **Others:**

  Not applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Yolanda Sanz.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without modifications.

3. Declarations of Interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

1 Policy on Independence

2 Competing Interest Management

4. Report on written procedures since the 165th FEEDAP Plenary meeting

The minutes of the 165th FEEDAP Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 20 February 2023.[3]

The Panel adopted on the 165th FEEDAP Plenary meeting an opinion on Pan-zoot (pancreatin of porcine pancreas glands) for dogs (EFSA-Q-2021-00464). However, prior to its publication, it was identified a mistake in the conclusions regarding the safety of the product. Therefore, the Panel decided to withdraw the adoption of the opinion. The document was modified and the Panel unanimously adopted the opinion on the 27th of February by written procedure.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Anise tincture (EFSA-Q-2010-01286, EFSA-Q-2022-00565)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of anise tincture as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion had been discussed in previous meetings and the Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.2. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Anise oil and anise tincture (EFSA-Q-2010-01286, EFSA-Q-2023-00180)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of anise oil and anise tincture as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.3. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 - Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories: Pine white oil (EFSA-Q-2010-01516, EFSA-Q-2023-00033)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of pine white oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion had been discussed in previous meetings and the Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.4. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 - Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories: Juniper berry oil and Juniper tincture (EFSA-Q-2010-01516, EFSA-Q-2023-00181)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of juniper berry oil and juniper tincture as a sensory additive for all animal species.

[3] https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2023-02/feedap_220131-0202_m_1.pdf

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.5. Potassium ferrocyanide (Potassium Hexacyanoferrate Trihydrate) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00529)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of potassium ferrocyanide (potassium hexacyanoferrate trihydrate) as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.6. Potassium hexacyanoferrat (II) (potassium ferrocyanide) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00679)

This question refers to the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of potassium hexacyanoferrat (II) (potassium ferrocyanide) as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.7. Natriumhexacyanoferrat (II)-ferrocyannatrium (sodium ferrocyanide) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00680)

This question refers to the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of natriumhexacyanoferrat (II)-ferrocyannatrium (sodium ferrocyanide) as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.8. Coxiril® (diclazuril) for chickens reared for laying and pheasants (EFSA-Q-2020-00343)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the safety for the environment of Coxiril® (diclazuril) as a coccidiostat for chickens reared for laying and pheasants.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the safety for the environment of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.9. Hostazym C (endo-1,4-beta-glucanase (E.C.3.2.1.4)) for chickens for fattening, minor poultry species for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species reared for breeding, minor poultry species reared for laying, ornamental birds, piglets (weaned) (EFSA-Q-2021-00157)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Hostazym C (endo-1,4-beta-glucanase (E.C.3.2.1.4)) as a zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening, minor poultry species for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species reared for breeding, minor poultry species reared for laying, ornamental birds, piglets (weaned).

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.10. Stenorol® (halofuginone hydrobromide) for chickens for fattening and turkeys (EFSA-Q-2021-00321)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the safety and efficacy of Stenorol® (halofuginone hydrobromide) as a coccidiostat for chickens for fattening and turkeys.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the safety and efficacy of the additive for chickens for fattening and turkeys for fattening/reared for breeding. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.11. BioCell® (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* DBVPG 48 SF) for horses, pigs and ruminants (EFSA-Q-2021-00343)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of BioCell® (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* DBVPG 48 SF) as a zootechnical additive for horses, pigs and ruminants.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.12. BIOSTRONG® 510 (preparation of essential oils of thyme and star anise, and quillaja bark powder) for all avian species (EFSA-Q-2021-00344)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of BIOSTRONG® 510 (preparation of essential oils of thyme and star anise, and quillaja bark powder) as a zootechnical additive for all avian species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.13. CanBiocin k-9 Heritage Probiotic Blend for dogs (EFSA-Q-2021-00383)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of k-9 Heritage Probiotic Blend as a zootechnical additive for dogs.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel endorsed the draft and will be considered for written adoption after the outcome of the public consultation is addressed.

5.14. Nor-Grape alpha (dry grape extract) for all avian species (EFSA-Q-2021-00467)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Nor-Grape alpha (dry grape extract) as a zootechnical additive for all avian species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.15. L-Valine produced by *Corynebacterium glutamicum* CGMCC 18932 for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2021-00566)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of L-valine produced by *Corynebacterium glutamicum* CGMCC 18932 as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel endorsed the draft and will be considered for written adoption after the outcome of the public consultation is addressed.

5.16. Vitamin B12/cyanocobalamin produced by *Ensifer adhaerens* CGMCC 19596 for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2021-00571)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of vitamin B12/cyanocobalamin produced by *Ensifer adhaerens* CGMCC 19596 as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.17. *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 11520 (preparation of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 11520) for horses, cats, dogs and pet rabbits (EFSA-Q-2021-00687)

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 11520 (preparation of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 11520) as a technological additive for horses, cats, dogs and pet rabbits.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation, safety and efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.18. Lignosulphonate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00195)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the safety of lignosulphonate as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.19. AQ02 (*Lactobacillus plantarum* CECT 8350 and *Lactobacillus reuteri* CECT 8700) for suckling piglets (EFSA-Q-2022-00353)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the efficacy of AQ02 (*Lactobacillus plantarum* CECT 8350 and *Lactobacillus reuteri* CECT 8700) as a zootechnical additive for suckling piglets.

The draft opinion was originally adopted in the 165th Plenary meeting of the FEEDAP Panel. However, after adoption, a mistake was identified regarding the study on the efficacy that was submitted by the applicant. Therefore, the Panel decided to withdraw the adoption and discussed the application with the newly submitted information. The Panel decided that further discussion is needed in the working group on animal nutrition.

5.20. L-Isoleucine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80185 for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00399)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the presence of recombinant DNA in L-isoleucine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80185 as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.21. IMP (disodium 5-inosinate) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium stationis* KCCM 80235 (EFSA-Q-2022-00400)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the safety of IMP (disodium 5-inosinate) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium stationis* KCCM 80235 as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation and safety of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.22. APSA PHYTAFEED® 20,000 GR/L (6-phytase) for pigs for fattening (EFSA-Q-2022-00507)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the efficacy of APSA PHYTAFEED® 20,000 GR/L (6-phytase) as a zootechnical additive for pigs for fattening.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the efficacy of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

5.23. Lactic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2022-00625)

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the presence of viable cells in the lactic acid which is to be used as a technological additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed focusing on the characterisation of the additive. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6. New mandates

6.1. New applications under Regulation (EC) 1831/2003 since the previous meeting

The Commission has forwarded to EFSA the following new applications of feed additives seeking authorisation under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 since the last Plenary meeting. These applications were presented to the Panel:

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2023-00042	Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8.) and endo-1,4-beta-glucanase (EC 3.2.1.4.) (Natugrain TS/TS L) for pigs for fattening and all pigs
EFSA-Q-2023-00043	RONOZYME ®HiStarch (CT) RONOZYME ®HiStarch (L) Alpha-amylase (E.C. 3.2.1.1) produced by *Bacillus licheniformis* DSM 34315 for all growing poultry species
EFSA-Q-2023-00048	L-tryptophan for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00049	L-threonine for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00110	L-selenomethionine (3b815) for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00162	*Pediococcus pentosaceus* DSM 23689 for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00163	*Pediococcus pentosaceus* DSM 23688 for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00164	*Pediococcus pentosaceus* DSM 14021 for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00180	Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Anise oil and anise tincture
EFSA-Q-2023-00181	Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 - Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories: Juniper berry oil and Juniper tincture
EFSA-Q-2023-00202	L-Tyrosine 3c401 for all animal species

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2023-00203	Fumonisin esterase EC 3.1.1.87 for all animal species

6.2. Valid applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 since the previous meeting

Applications considered valid for the start of the assessment:

EFSA-Q number	Subject	Valid on
EFSA-Q-2022-00326	Huvezym neXo (multi-enzyme product with endo 1,4 betaxylanase, endo 1,4 beta glucanase and xyloglucan-specific-endo-beta-1,4-glucanase activities) for sows, pigs for fattening and minor pigs species for fattening or reproduction	17/02/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00478	Patent Blue V for all non-food producing species	06/03/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00524	*Lentilactobacillus buchneri* DSM 19455(previously *Lactobacillus kefiri* DSM 19455) for all animal species	31/01/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00531	Bonvital (*Enterococcus faecium* DSM 7134) for chickens for rearing and minor avians	07/02/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00547	Nonanoic acid for all avian species, all porcine species	10/03/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00553	Lactiferm® (*Enterococcus faecium* NCIMB 11181) for piglets (weaned), calves for fattening and calves for rearing	08/02/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00624	Iron (II) - betaine complex for all animal species	08/02/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00793	BIOMIN® BBSH® 797 (microorganism strain DSM 11798) for pigs and all avian species	06/02/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00812	Orthophosphoric acid for all animal species	13/02/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00817	Econase XT (Beta-1,4-xylanase) for pigs for fattening, laying hens and minor poultry species	03/03/2023
EFSA-Q-2022-00820	Provita LE (*Enterococcus faecium* DSM 7134 and *Lacticaseibacillus rhamnosus* DSM 7133) for calves	27/02/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00180	Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories: Anise oil and anise tincture	09/03/2023
EFSA-Q-2023-00181	Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 - Gymnosperms (Coniferales,	09/03/2023

EFSA-Q number	Subject	Valid on
	Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories: Juniper berry oil and Juniper tincture	

These applications were assigned to the respective working groups, where relevant.

6.3. New questions under Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 since the previous meeting

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2022-00587	Biosprint® (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* MUCL 39885) for cats and dog
EFSA-Q-2022-00625	Lactic acid for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00030	41 flavouring compounds to provide a Herbal flavour for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2023-00044	*Lactobacillus farciminis* CNCM MA67/4R (now CNCM I-3740) for chickens for fattening, laying hens and turkeys for fattening
EFSA-Q-2023-00077	BA-KING® (*Bacillus amyloliquefaciens* TOA5001 (NITE BP-01844)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and all minor avian species (including also sporting, ornamental and exotic birds)
EFSA-Q-2023-00089	Availa-Cr (chromium chelate of DL-methionine) for dairy cows

These questions were assigned to the respective working groups, where relevant.

7. Feedback from Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission/EURL

7.1. Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels

Not discussed.

7.2. EFSA

Not discussed.

7.3. European Commission/EURL

The European Union Reference Laboratory (EURL) has recently finished an addendum of the EURL evaluation report for rosemary extract linked to FAD-2020-0084 (EFSA-Q-2020-00728); the addendum referred to the determination of carnosic acid as an active substance of rosemary extract in compound feed. The EURL recommended for official control the single-laboratory validated and verified method proposed for the quantification of carnosic acid in compound feed. The Panel acknowledged this information.

8. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

8.1. Animal dietary exposure

In some opinions of the CONTAM Panel, dietary exposure to contaminants present in feeds of animals, both food-producing and non food-producing, needs to be estimated. For this scope, in 2012 the CONTAM Panel has developed an approach to estimate the exposure which is based on i) default values for feed intake and body weight of animals, taken from the literature or from the FEEDAP Panel Guidance documents and ii) example diets, composed of different feed materials, which could be modified depending on the specific feed that could be the target of a defined contaminant(s). The approach requires alignment with the current dietary recommendations/practices. The FEEDAP Panel has the expertise in the area and could lead the exercise in collaboration with the CONTAM Panel.

9. Any other business

Not discussed.