



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

4th Working Group meeting on HIGH EXPANSION FOAM FOR STUNNING AND KILLING



28 November 2023

08:30-14:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 01 December 2023

Location: EFSA – Parma/Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Present physically:

VIRGINIE MICHEL

JESSICA MARTIN

ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI

Present online:

MOHAN RAJ

- Hearing Experts¹:

Under Framework Partnership Agreement No GP/EFSA/ALPHA/2021/10 and according to Specific Agreement No 1-2022

Present physically:

ANTONI DALMAU

ALEXANDRA CONTRERAS

Present online:

SANTIAGO RUCINQUE

ARANZAZU VARVARO

- European Commission representative:

Not Applicable

- EFSA:

AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU

MARIKA VITALI

YVES VAN DER STEDE

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Denis Simonin (EC).

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 04 September 2023, via web-conference

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 08 September 2023.

V. Overall integration from all studies submitted

a. Demonstration of equivalence with existing methods

The Working Group (WG) discussed and reviewed the text that had been prepared by the Tasking Grant (TG) group about the overall integration from all studies submitted by the applicant and specifically the text about the quantitative and qualitative approaches for the demonstration of equivalence with the existing stunning and killing methods. It was decided that the tables with the identified and relevant hazards will be finalised in a future targeted meeting.

b. Overall discussions & conclusions

The WG checked the text of the TG group about the overall discussion and conclusions on the overall integration from all studies submitted and in particular on the results regarding welfare impact, the external validity and on the discussion on equivalence with existing methods.

VI. Revision of previous sections

The WG identified the changes made to the previous sections after the second submission of the applicant's reply to the additional request for information and reviewed very few parts. It was decided that these sections will be finalised in the next meeting.

VII. Tasks and deadlines

Specific tasks were delegated to each of the WG group member, i.e. to refine some parts of the text prepared by the TG group, based on the comments until 14 December 2023.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



VIII. Any Other Business

Not applicable

IX. Next meeting

The next 2-hour WG meeting will be held on 21 December 2023 via web conference.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

3rd Working Group meeting on HIGH EXPANSION FOAM FOR STUNNING AND KILLING



04 September 2023

12:30-18:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 08 September 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
VIRGINIE MICHEL
JESSICA MARTIN
MOHAN RAJ
ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI
- Hearing Experts¹:
ARANZAZU VARVARO
- European Commission representative:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU
MARIKA VITALI
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Antoni Dalmau, Alexandra Contreras and Rucinue Santiago.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 13 July 2023, via web-conference

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18 July 2023.

V. Comments of the previous meeting

The Working Group (WG) discussed and resolved some comments on two sub-sections of the previous meeting. The structure of each section was also revised with a view to improving clarity.

VI. Description of the individual studies submitted

a. Introduction

The WG discussed and reviewed the text that had been prepared by the Tasking Grant (TG) group about the description of the individual studies that were submitted by the applicant and specifically the text about the introduction, the background and rationale and the objective of each study.

b. Materials and methods

The WG discussed about the methods used and the measurement of the outcomes of each study and reviewed the text of the TG group.

c. Reporting the results

The WG discussed and reviewed the text of the TG group on reporting the results and specifically on reporting outcomes and estimations of each study and reporting uncertainty both for pigs and poultry.

d. Discussions & conclusions

1. For poultry

The WG checked the text of the TG group about the conclusions on the description of the individual studies submitted and in particular on reporting interpretation of the results for poultry. Overall, the WG concluded that the section will be finalised after the applicant has submitted additional information, in order to complete the assessment.

2. For pigs

The WG reviewed the text of the TG group about the conclusions on the description of the individual studies submitted and in particular on reporting interpretation of the results for pigs. Overall, the WG concluded that the section will be finalised after the applicant has submitted additional information, in order to complete the assessment.

VII. Tasks and deadlines

Specific tasks were delegated to each of the WG group members, i.e. to refine some parts of the text prepared by the TG group, based on the comments until 02 October 2023.



VIII. Any Other Business

As soon as EFSA receives the reply from the applicant on the second request for additional information, EFSA will send it to the TG group and to the WG, in order to proceed to the next steps of assessment of the method.

IX. Next meeting

The next WG meeting will be held on 28 November 2023 physically in Parma.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

2nd Working Group meeting on HIGH EXPANSION FOAM FOR STUNNING AND KILLING



13 July 2023

12:30-18:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 18 July 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
VIRGINIE MICHEL
JESSICA MARTIN
MOHAN RAJ
ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI
- Hearing Experts¹:
ANTONI DALMAU
ALEXANDRA CONTRERAS
SANTIAGO RUCINQUE
ARANZAZU VARVARO
- European Commission representative:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU
MARIKA VITALI
YVES VAN DER STEDE
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 25 January 2023, via web-conference

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 13 February 2023.

V. Definition of the steps till the adoption of the SO

A definition of the steps and the way of working until the adoption of the Scientific Opinion (SO) was made by the EFSA staff.

VI. Eligibility criteria of EFSA's guidelines (ToR 1)

a. Description of the method including potential sources of pain, distress and suffering

The Working Group (WG) discussed about the description of the stunning method, including potential sources of pain, distress and suffering, and reviewed the text that had already been prepared by the Tasking Group (TG) group on this. They agreed that some important information is still missing from the updated dossier submitted by the applicant.

b. Key parameters of the effective use of the method for poultry and pigs

The WG discussed about the key parameters of the effective use of the method both for poultry and pigs and in particular reviewed the text of the TG group and agreed on the information that is still missing from the updated dossier.

c. Scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness for this method

The WG discussed and reviewed the text of the TG group already prepared regarding the scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness for this method.

d. Potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence

1. For poultry

The WG checked the text of the TG group about the potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence for poultry. Overall, they considered that additional information is still needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this method. Therefore, another request for additional information will be sent to the applicant and agreed on the format of the document to be sent.

2. For pigs

The WG reviewed the text of the TG group about the potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence for pigs and overall, they considered that additional information is still needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this method. Therefore, another

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



request for additional information will be sent to the applicant and agreed on the format of the document to be sent.

VII. Tasks and deadlines

EFSA will clear the document, prepared by the TG group, from the comments made by the WG before and during the meeting and will refine the text regarding the descriptive part submitted by the applicant until the end of July. Specific tasks were also delegated to the WG group members, i.e.: to refine the text prepared by the TG group regarding the assessment on the scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness for this method as well as on the potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence for poultry and pigs, based on the comments until 21 August 2023, and to draft the specific questions in order to request additional information from the applicant. This questionnaire will be sent by EFSA to the WG for their final approval until 19 July 2023.

VIII. Any Other Business

The Chair of the WG proposed to discuss if EEG data of this method is necessary to prove equivalence with the actual gas methods. EFSA staff provided the relative information of EFSA Guidance that is:

- The extent of disruption caused by a stunning method and the induction of unconsciousness and insensibility are best demonstrated by recording electrical activity of the brain using EEGs (EFSA, 2004).
- To assess the onset of unconsciousness and death and the magnitude of pain, distress and suffering, ABMs should be used. These measures can be (i) neurological (e.g. EEG records), (ii) physiological (e.g. heart rate variability), (iii) behavioural (e.g. escape attempts) or (iv) physical reflexes (e.g. tonic-clonic seizures).

Therefore, the WG agreed that EEG data is best to be provided but it is not mandatory.

IX. Next meeting

The next WG meeting will be held on 04 September 2023 via web conference.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

1ST Working Group meeting on HIGH EXPANSION FOAM FOR STUNNING AND KILLING



25 January 2023

14:00-18:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 13 February 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
VIRGINIE MICHEL
MOHAN RAJ
ALEXEI VYSSOTSKI
JESSICA MARTIN
- Hearing Experts¹:
SANTIAGO RUCINQUE
ALEXANDRA CONTRERAS
VARVARO ARANZAZU
- European Commission representative:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
AIKATERINI MANAKIDOU
MARIKA VITALI
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Denis Simonin (EC).

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Tour de table & Working group composition

An introduction of the participants and of the Working Group (WG) composition was made and the roles of all participants were specified by the EFSA staff.

V. Overview and Terms of Reference of the mandate

The EFSA staff presented the objective and the Terms of Reference of the mandate EFSA-Q-2022-00344.

VI. Overview of EFSA's guidance 2018

The EFSA staff presented the key points of EFSA's guidance 2018⁴ for new or modified stunning methods. The WG agreed to use this guidance for the assessment of the method.

VII. Check for completeness of the application submitted

a. Introduction

The WG discussed about the objectives of the check for completeness of the document that had already been prepared by the Tasking Grant (TG) group regarding the application submitted.

b. General points to be addressed

The WG discussed about the general points that are addressed in the aforesaid document and in particular reviewed and agreed on the main points that the application is missing.

c. Specific points to be addressed - Description of the stunning method

The WG checked the completeness of the description of the new stunning method as presented in the technical document submitted by the applicant and in relation to the prepared document of the TG group. In particular, they reviewed and agreed on the information missing regarding: the name of the method, the description of the method itself, the key parameters of the effective use of the method, the scientific basis of induction and maintenance of unconsciousness for this method and the potential causes of system failure and chances of occurrence. Simultaneously, some questions were formed about the document that would be sent to the applicant for providing them additional information.

d. Description of the individual studies submitted

The WG checked the completeness of the individual studies submitted for stunning and killing poultry and pigs and reviewed and agreed on the missing information from the applicant as described in the previously mentioned prepared document, while at the same time a few questions were formed for the applicant.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.5343>



e. Overall integration of findings from all studies and additional information to request

The WG discussed about the completeness of the overall integration of findings from all studies as presented in the aforementioned document and reviewed and agreed on the missing information of the new submitted method both for poultry and pigs regarding: the demonstration of equivalence with existing methods, the overall conclusions, the results regarding the welfare impact and the external validity. Simultaneously, a few questions were formed for the applicant. They concluded on the overall completeness of the application submitted and on the revision of the whole document prepared by the TG group. The WG considered that additional information is needed from the applicant in order to proceed with the scientific assessment of this method. Therefore, a request for additional information will be sent to the applicant and agreed on the format of the document to be sent.

VIII. Tasks and deadlines

EFSA will clear the document, prepared by the TG group, from the comments made by the WG before and during the meeting, regarding the check for completeness of the method submitted. EFSA will also prepare a separate document with specific questions in order to request additional information from the applicant. Both of the documents will be sent to the WG in the beginning of February 2023 for their final approval.

IX. Any Other Business

When EFSA receives a reply from the applicant, a plan for the next WG meetings will be communicated.
