

**SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON
PLANT HEALTH**
110th Plenary meeting



24 February 2023

09:00-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 03 March 2023

Location: EFSA - Parma - Webconference

Attendees:

- PLH Panel Members:

Claude BRAGARD (Chair), Paula BAPTISTA, Elisavet CHATZIVASSILIOU, Francesco DI SERIO, Paolo GONTHIER, Josep JAQUES, Annemarie JUSTESEN, Alan MACLEOD, Panagiotis MILONAS, Juan NAVAS-CORTES, Roel POTTING, Emilio STEFANI, Hans-Hermann THULKE, Antonio VICENT CIVERA, Wopke VAN DER WERF, Jonathan YUEN, Lucia ZAPPALÀ

- Hearing Experts¹: Klara NICOVA, Maria Chiara ROSACE,

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

EC: Leonard SHUMBE, Wolfgang REINERT, Filippa DI MARIA (SANTE)

- EFSA PLANTS Unit:

Matteo CROTTA, Ewelina CZWIENCZEK, Spyridoula DIMITROPOULOU, Ciro GARDI, Alex GOBBI, Agata KACZMAREK, Paraskevi KARIAMPA, Virag KERTESZ, Julia LOPEZ MERCADAL, Andrea MAIORANO, Marco PAUTASSO, Eugenio ROSSI, Giuseppe STANCANELLI, Franz STREISSL, Emanuela TACCI

- Others:

MESE Unit: Olaf MOSBACH-SCHULZ

EFSA Procurement

- Oresteia SFYRA (Greece)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Christer MAGNUSSON, Stephen PARNELL and Philippe REIGNAULT

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Report on written procedures

Nothing to report

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft Scientific opinion on probability of introduction of *Thaumatotibia leucotreta* (false codling moth) with cut roses. ([EFSA-Q-2021-00033](#))

Following a request from the European Commission, the EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a risk assessment for *Thaumatotibia leucotreta* (false codling moth, FCM) in cut roses. The key components of the model (climate suitability, waste management, quantitative modelling approach for the cut roses entry pathway and results) were presented. For the climate suitability it was shown how the Working Group implemented a Physiologically Based Demographic Model (PBDM model) to see where in the EU the pest could develop into stable populations, considering what is known on the temperature-dependent biological parameters of the pest, and how actual observations were used for validation of the PBDM model. It was reminded that the predictions of the PBDM model were applied to EU over a 10-years simulation time frame to identify the most suitable area of EU and it was shown how, when compared to other models, the PBDM results were in overall agreement. For the waste management component, it was first reminded why the inclusion of the waste management was important in general and for this particular scientific opinion, and then proceeded with presenting the different methods for waste management considered in the model, together with the key sources of uncertainty (e.g. on private composting; and on the time from the initial disposal of cut roses in an household until the waste treatment). The quantitative model was presented, first reminding how the results of the climate suitability were used to identify the regions climatically suitable in EU to be considered in the model, then proceeding by explaining the key components of the pathway model including: the cut roses distribution model which describes how the imported infested roses are distributed to the NUTS2 regions in the European area with suitable climate; the developmental model which describes the proportion of *T. leucotreta* adults that will emerge depending on the number of days after import into the EU; the waste model which describes the proportion of *T. leucotreta* adults that will survive and escape prior to different types of waste treatments. It was presented how the results of the overall quantitative model were reported both in terms of (median) number of annual escapes per NUTS2 region and of standardised average values of adults escaping within a 1km radius in residential area considering a time span of 10 days, pointing how not necessarily the most climatically suitable areas are also those posing the higher risk of entry; this is due to other parameters playing a role (e.g. human population density, cut flowers trade and consumption higher in some area). It was also clarified that natural mortality has been included in the pathway model and a sensitivity analysis identifying the main sources of uncertainty has been included.

The main revisions of the draft opinion introduced to address the Panel comments were presented. For the Background and Terms of Reference, few edits and typos corrections were made but no changes in the phrasing because these should be reported as received from the requestor. Regarding interception data, it was reminded that it is a transition period for EUROPHIT and TRACES and this generates difficulties in retrieving accurate interception data, therefore this draft

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



opinion only include available data. It was asked whether the Commission have data on the proportion of inspected consignments/interceptions made related to the reduced checks and whether these were used in the opinion. It was replied that these data, when considered during the Expert Knowledge Elicitations, are reported in Appendix A.

It was also explained in more details: how the transfer to a suitable host has been addressed; how the natural mortality was included in the pathway model and the related assumptions made due to lack of data; the meaning of the second entry output used to estimate transfer; the new section on the sensitivity analysis; how Appendix B was considerably shortened; the inclusion of the definitions of the climate suitability classes and the figure on the NUTS2 regions considered in the cut roses pathway model

It was explained how the transfer was modelled by the output of average number of escaped adults per NUTS2 region within a 1km radius in a residential area considering a timespan of 10 days, under the assumption of no spatial nor temporal clustering of cut roses consumption.

From the presentation of the results, it was the opinion of the Panel that while the Working Group have provided a very comprehensive quantitative model, the interpretation of the numerical outputs, particularly in relation to the model uncertainties, is challenging. The Panel appreciated and endorsed the methodology, but it was agreed that the Working Group would do some further work to make the interpretation/practical meaning of the numerical outputs clearer before adoption. The representative from EC SANTE also agreed that such details would provide additional support to risk managers in the decision making process. As a follow up to the discussion, the Panel will be asked to provide a second round of comments on the updated draft and then the draft opinion will be finalized for possible adoption by the Panel.

5.2. Draft Scientific opinion on the pest categorisation of *Eotetranychus sexmaculatus*. ([EFSA-Q-2021-00765](#))

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Eotetranychus sexmaculatus* (Acari: Tetranychidae), the six-spotted spider mite, for the EU. The mite is native to North America and has spread to Asia and Oceania. It is not known to occur in the EU. The species is not listed in Annex II of Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/2072. *E. sexmaculatus* feeds on more than 50 hosts in 20 botanical families and can be a serious pest of important crops in the EU such as citrus (*Citrus* spp.), avocado (*Persea americana*), grapevine (*Vitis* spp.) and ornamentals such as *Ficus* spp. and *Rosa* spp. In California and New Zealand, the mite can breed continuously on evergreen hosts such as avocados and citrus, growing slowly during the winter and faster during the summer. Dry weather conditions hamper its development. Plants for planting, fruit, cut branches, and cut flowers provide potential pathways for entry into the EU. Some host plants for planting are prohibited from entering the EU while others require a phytosanitary certificate, as do cut branches and cut flowers. In the warmer parts of southern EU Member States, climatic conditions and host plant availability are conducive for establishment and spread. The introduction of *E. sexmaculatus* is expected to have an economic impact in the EU through the reduction in yield, quality and commercial value of citrus and avocado production. Additional damage on other host plants, including ornamentals, under EU environmental conditions and cropping practices cannot be ruled out. Phytosanitary measures are available to reduce the likelihood of entry and spread. *E. sexmaculatus* satisfies with no key uncertainties the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess for it to be regarded as a potential Union quarantine pest.

The opinion was adopted on 24 February 2023.

5.3. Draft Scientific opinion on the pest categorisation of *Paracoccus marginatus*. ([EFSA-Q-2021-00767](#))

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Paracoccus marginatus* (Hemiptera: Sternorrhyncha: Pseudococcidae), the papaya scale, for the EU. It is native to Central America and since the 1990s it has spread rapidly in mainly tropical areas of the Caribbean, islands



in the Indian and Pacific Oceans, Africa, and southern Asia. Large populations were detected in northern Israel in 2016. It has not been reported within the EU. It is not listed in Annex II of Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/2072. It reproduces sexually and there are up to 11 generations per year in India. The estimated minimum, optimum, and maximum temperature thresholds for the adult females are 13.9, 28.4 and 32.1°C, respectively. First instar nymphs may move to neighbouring plants by crawling, or be passively dispersed by wind, or hitchhiking on clothing, equipment, or animals. It is highly polyphagous, feeding on plants in 172 genera and 54 families. It is an important pest of custard apple (*Annona* spp.), papaya (*Carica papaya*) and *Hibiscus* spp. It also feeds on a wide range of plants cultivated in the EU such as eggplant (*Solanum melongena*), avocado (*Persea americana*), citrus (*Citrus* spp.), cotton (*Gossypium hirsutum*), grapevine (*Vitis vinifera*), guava (*Psidium guajava*), mango (*Mangifera indica*), passionfruit (*Passiflora edulis*), pomegranate (*Punica granatum*), pepper (*Capsicum annuum*) and tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum*). Plants for planting, fruits, vegetables, and cut flowers are the main potential pathways for entry of *P. marginatus* into the EU. Climatic conditions in the warmest areas of Cyprus, Greece, Italy, and Spain, where host plants occur, would likely allow this species to successfully establish and spread. Reductions in yield and quality of some cultivated hosts including *Annona* spp., *Hibiscus* spp., and papaya is anticipated if establishment occurs. Phytosanitary measures are available to reduce the likelihood of entry and spread. *P. marginatus* meets the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess for this species to be regarded as a potential Union quarantine pest.

The opinion was adopted on 24 February 2023.

VI. Any Other Business

The Panel was reminded about the open Call for Expressions of Interest for Membership of the Scientific Panels and the Scientific Committee of EFSA 2023, with deadline 3rd April 2023.

The next PLH Panel meeting will be held on 29 and 30 March 2023, onsite meeting at EFSA in Parma (Italy).