

21 Octobre 2024

14:00-16:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 8 November 2024

Location: EFSA - Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÄHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
EC: Francesca CALVETTI
- EFSA:
Lina MUR (chair)
Stefania TAMPACH

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting held on 9 October 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 24 October 2024.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Conclusions and recommendations ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

The Working Group carefully reviewed all the highlights, conclusions and recommendations of the report, doing some minor changes in the phraseology to make them clearer and concise.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 6 December 2024, via web conference.

9 October 2024

13:30-15:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 24 October 2024

Location: EFSA - Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Julio ALVAREZ
Anette BOKLUND
Miguel Angel MIRANDA CHUECA
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
EC: Francesca CALVETTI
- EFSA:
Lina MUR (chair)
Stefania TAMPACH

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting held on 10 September 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 27 September 2024.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Formulation of uncertainty regarding vectors ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

To assess the possible role of vectors (*Ornithodoros erraticus* and other mechanical vectors) in the epidemiology of ASF in the currently affected areas in the EU considering all sources of uncertainty, a semi-formal Expert Knowledge Elicitation was carried out according to EFSA protocol. The Working Group (WG) experts were asked to answer four specific questions prior to the meeting considering the evidence present in the report.

During the WG meeting, individual judgments were then discussed with the help of a facilitator not involved in the judgements, and a consensus judgment was agreed for each question. The results of the judgement, including the rationale behind the assessment were included in the result section of the report, and used to phrase the conclusions associated with this mandate element.

b. Major comments pending

The WG reviewed and commented the few major points pending of each section of the report. Individual experts were asked to work on specific sections of the report in order to improve the clarity and content of some of some of the arguments.

c. Conclusions and recommendations

Finally, the WG went through all the highlights, conclusions and recommendations of the report, discussion and rephrasing them when needed.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 21 October 2024, via web conference.

10 September 2024

09:00-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 27 September 2024

Location: EFSA - Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
EC: Francesca CALVETTI
- EFSA:
Eleonora CATTANEO
Lina MUR (chair)
Stefania TAMPACH

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting held on 27 August 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 09 September 2024.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Review of risk and protective factors report. ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

The Working Group (WG) reviewed and commented each section of the report produced in accordance with the TOR2 of African Swine Fever (ASF) mandate that request the assessment of risk factors involved in the occurrence, persistence and spread of ASF in domestic pigs and wild boar populations.

Immunocontraception for controlling wild boar population: results for this section were divided in experimental studies on fertility control and modelling studies on the effectiveness of this method for population control. Highlights of this section were reviewed and defined. Additional work on the gaps for the potential implementation of this method needs to be done in the report (e.g. missing works on the applicability of oral vaccination for wild boars, research on the efficacy of long-term infertility and the impact and safety of field use of this vaccines). Based on the discussion, WG agreed on the conclusions and recommendations of immunocontraception.

Barriers for controlling wild boar movements: results will be split for systematic literature review (SLR), questionnaire, and recent experiences in areas where fencing has been used for ASF control. The WG reviewed the structure and content of the material and methods section and additional references recently published were discussed. For the questionnaire, the WG agreed on using all results and not only those referring specifically to ASF control.

WG also pointed out the importance of the timing of fences implementation as one of the reasons for their effectiveness or not. An ongoing study in South Korea on this aspect will be published and can be used as reference. WG reviewed and defined highlights for this section. Difficulties in maintaining fences, mainly for electric fences was pointed out as crucial point. Based on the discussions, conclusion and recommendation sections were defined.

Role of vectors in ASF epidemiology in Europe: Suggestion to make the map from VectorNet clearer were provided (e.g. only 2 colors to distinguish presence from absence, context explanation, and map projection). The table containing studies investigating the role of arthropods other than *Ornithodoros* will be split according to the division provided in the results section (i.e. detection of ASF, experimental transmission of ASFV and field studies).

Highlights were defined and agreed. Specific circumstances under which mechanical vectors play a role should be pointed out (e.g. the effect of temperature on vectors). The WG agreed on dividing the conclusions in mechanical vectors and *Ornithodoros*.

Risk and protective factors for ASF in wild boar and domestic pigs: WG reviewed both sections and main comments previously reported were discussed and potential issues related with the models interpretation were solved. Additional insights will be provided on some aspects linked to the case control study to explain some results for one of the variables.

b. Next steps

EFSA will work on each section and WG experts will review them before the report is sent to deep reviewers. After deep review the abstract and summary will be produced.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 09 October 2024, via web conference.

27 August 2024

15:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 09 September 2024

Location: EFSA - Webconference

Attendees:

○ Working Group Members:

Tomasz PODGORSKI

Karl STÅHL

Timothée VERGNE

Anette BOKLUND

○ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

EC: Simona FORCELLA

EC: Francesca CALVETTI

○ EFSA:

Lina MUR (chair)

Stefania TAMPACH

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants, with no absences recorded.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting held on 04 July 2024, in EFSA's premises (Parma, Italy)

The [minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 16 July 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Structure of the report: the general structure of the report was reviewed and the WG agreed on keeping the interpretation of Terms of References at the beginning of each section and the

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



structure of the report including results, discussion and highlights for each of the sections. WG agreed to use the term persistence and not maintenance in the report.

a. Update on the risk factors report ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

Systematic Literature review (SLR) the latest updates on the SLR on risk factors in domestic pigs and wild boars included in the report were presented to the WG. this section will be completed by the coming week and an email will be sent to the WG for review. There are no major changes compared to the previous SLR.

Case-control study: Some questions related to the methodology were discussed as well as some comments made in the table of results. EFSA will work on this, and members of the WG can review this section when the final changes are done.

Wild boar model for occurrence and persistence: The two models have been summarised in the report. The WG will work on interpretation, limitations and conclusions.

Wild boar immunocontraception: Section is ready to be reviewed by the WG members. Mainly focus on discussion section and highlights.

Mitigation measures against ASF: This section will be shortened. Afterwards the WG will review the section after receiving a notification via email.

Role of vectors on ASF in Europe: Existing data on the presence of *Ornithodoros spp.* was discussed. An updated map was requested from VectorNet. Discussions around the role of *Ornithodoros spp.* and other arthropods in the spread and transmission of ASF took place. Furthermore, the structure of the mechanical vectors section was discussed and the presentation of the SLR in a table format were suggested.

b. Update on the spread model ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

Timothée Vergne presented to the working group the updates on the spread model for ASF he is working on. The aim of the model is to evaluate the impact of wild boar density on ASF spread during the epidemic in Northern Italy using data from January 2022 to September 2023. The methodology and results were explained in detail. This section can be reviewed from the WG.

c. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 10 September via web conference.

04 July 2024

10:30-12:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 16 July 2024

Location: EFSA, Parma

Attendees:

- Hearing Experts¹:
Jan Arend STEGEMAN
- EFSA:
Eleonora CATTANEO
Jose CORTINAS ABRAHANTES
Sofie DHOLLANDER
Lina MUR (chair)
Stefania TAMPACH

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting held on 12 June 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 28 June 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Biosecurity: case control study results ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

Eleonora Cattaneo, Sofie Dhollander and José Cortinas Abrahantes from EFSA presented the results of the analysis for the case control study. Two different databases have been created in order to deal with uncertainty reported for some of the variables included in the analysis. Discussion has been raised about the best method to be used for imputing missing values. Further analysis will

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



be performed on two additional databases: one considering only complete variables, one imputing missing values using a random forest model.

The results of the conditional logistic regression model have been shown and interaction between variables have been discussed and will be analysed in order to explain counterintuitive results.

Specific part on vector surveillance is planned to be published as a separate short communication.

b. Systematic literature review of risk factors for ASF ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

Sofie Dhollander and Stefania Tampach gave an update on the Systematic Literature Review to identify the new risk or protective factors associated with the occurrence of ASF. The search was performed on literature from January 2021 to February 2024 and resulted in 220 papers screened using Distiller. After conducting two screening steps (abstract and full text screening), database extraction was performed for a total of 45 publication.

Risk factors have been categorised in three classes, from broader to more specific and comparison with the previous classification has been performed in order to ensure harmonisation among categories and specific risk factors.

Final results of the systematic literature review will be finalised during summer and will be used as introduction of the risk factors report.

12 June 2024

09:30-12:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 28 June 2024

Location: EFSA - Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Giovanna MASSEI
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
Sofie DHOLLANDER
Eleonora CATTANEO
Lina MUR (chair)
Stefania TAMPACH

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants and apologised Anette Boklund for her absence.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declarations of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting held on 15 May 2024, in via web-conference

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



The [minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 04 June 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Wild boar immunocontraception ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

Giovanna Massei took part as hearing expert in the discussions about wild boar immunocontraception as method for controlling wild boar populations. She discussed her previous experiences on the area, the research projects she is currently involved on and presented some of her previous results. For example, she presented a mechanical method developed to distribute baits targeting specifically wild boars that has been experimentally tested in UK.

The potential limitations, advantages and needed progress were discussed in the meeting. For example, about the acceptability of fertility control on wildlife by public opinion, as well as the definition of target population and the needs for implementing oral distribution of vaccines to wild boars in Europe.

b. Update on the spread model ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

Timothée Vergne presented to the working group an update on the spread model for ASF he is working on, focusing on the definition of the different modelling parameters and states of the model, as well as the different scenarios proposed.

Discussion on the definition of summer and winter season has been raised, and WG agreed to explore the average and maximum temperatures in the study area to better include differences of infection's duration in the cells.

WG also discussed processes that can lead to the movement of wild boar in certain periods of the year, specifically around September, and that can cause re-susceptibility of a cell in the model.

c. Update on the risk factors report ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

Case-control study: Eleonora Cattaneo from EFSA presented an update of the analysis performed on the case control study. Correlation analysis and influence of significant variables disaggregated will be performed to better explore the results.

Update on the report structure: WG agreed on the general structure of the report and on keeping a separate section for mitigation measures. A supporting material file will be produced to include the methodology of all the elements together.

Systematic Literature review: Stefania Tampach gave an update on the Systematic Literature Review to identify the new factors associated with the occurrence of ASF. The search was performed on literature from 2021 to 2024 and resulted in 220 papers screened using Distiller. After the first screening processes, database extraction was performed for a total of 90 publication.

Risk factors has been categorized in three classes and comparison with the previous classification will be performed. Results of the systematic literature review will be used as introduction of the risk factors report.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 27 August via web conference.



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

NO CONFLICT: With regard to this meeting, Dr Timothée VERGNE declared the following interest: contract with EFSA for the development of a mechanistic model to quantify the influence of wild boar density on African swine fever spread and maintenance in wild boar population. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

15 May 2024

09:30-12:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 04 June 2024

Location: EFSA – Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
Eleonora CATTANEO
José CORTINHAS ABRAHANTES
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,² EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declarations of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 19 April 2024, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 08 May 2024.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Review of the ASF annual epidemiological report. ([EFSA-Q-2022-00380](#))

The Working Group (WG) reviewed the process and content of the annual epidemiological report produced in accordance with the TOR1 of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF). The WG discussed the changes and improvements to be implemented in future reports.

Suggestions were provided by the WG about various aspects of the report, including the harmonization of some calculations for the impact of the disease (e.g., considering only affected NUTS3), the modification of some figures in order to enhance their interpretation (e.g., spread by quarter map), the definition of some terms (e.g., enhanced passive surveillance), and the simplification of the surveillance questionnaires. Overall, the WG agreed on the necessity to keep the report concise and informative, avoiding the repetition of information.

b. Risk factors. ([EFSA-Q-2022-00381](#))

The TOR2 of the ASF mandate requests the assessment of risk factors involved in the occurrence, persistence and spread of ASF in domestic pigs and wild boar populations. The first proposal of the scientific report's template was shown to the WG, together with an update on the first results of risk factors analysis obtained up until now. Main topics discussed are listed below:

Report structure: each section of the report should be concise and, when possible, refer to the external report published for the detailed methodology. WG agreed on including in the risk factors' report the "highlights" sections as for the annual epidemiological report. WG suggested to add a new section on the report for countermeasures including those elements that are not risk factors (e.g., fences). WG agreed on splitting the report in a way that each expert will take care of one specific section.

Spread model update: Timothée Vergne presented an update of the spread model for ASF virus and the first results obtained. Some discussions took place regarding the terms used in the ordinary differential equations, specifically about the detection rate and the recovery rate. The WG discussed about the influence of the season on ASF persistence and how this can impact the recovery rate of a cell in the spread model presented.

Wild boar abundance and barriers report: the WG reviewed and discussed the main conclusions and results of the risk factors model including wild boar density produced by ENETWILD. In addition, the WG discussed the work done on the effectiveness of the barriers and how those results would be integrated and discussed in the risk factor report.

c. Next steps

EFSA will provide a proposal of the changes for the future epidemiological reports and surveillance questionnaire. EFSA will explore also internally the possibility on modifying the structure of the scientific report for risk factors.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 12 June 2024, via web conference.



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

NO CONFLICT: With regard to this meeting, Dr Karl Ståhl and Dr Anette Boklund declared the following interest: involvement in the advisory board of the ASFaVIP (ASF attenuated live vaccines in pigs), which intends to provide ASF oral vaccines for wild boar in the European market , and is funded by Horizon Europe. In addition, Dr Tomasz Podgorski declared his participation as partner in the EFSA funded "ENETWILD: Wildlife and One Health: wildlife ecology, health surveillance and interaction with livestock, human population and the environment". In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the experts concerned.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

19 April 2024

16:00-18:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 08 May 2024

Location: EFSA - Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Eleonora CATTANEO
Lina MUR (chair)
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 03 April 2024, in via web-conference

The [minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 17 April 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion ([EFSA-Q-2022-00380](#))

The objective of the meeting was to do a final review of the annual epidemiological report (TOR1) of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF), addressing the last pending comments. Final checks were done on the graphs and terminology, and particular focus was provided to the conclusions and recommendations. Main topics are listed below.

a. Report general review and harmonization.

The Working Group (WG) addressed the final pending comments received from deep reviewers, EC and representatives of the ASF Subgroup Network. The WG also checked text changes provided by the English editor.

In order to harmonize the report, the WG discussed about few terms for which changes or more clarifications were requested and decided which term are the more appropriate to be used.

All graphs were checked to highlight potential discrepancies and visualization errors.

b. Summary and abstract

The WG checked abstract and summary sections to reduce them and make them clearer for the reader. The WG agreed on removing some sentences from the summary that were not considered relevant.

The WG also agreed on adding more information in Table 1 about the number of outbreaks in domestic pigs and wild boar for each country.

Discussions were raised about the spread by quarter analysis, highlighting the need to better define calculations on the average number of newly affected NUTS3 in one trimester and the number of NUTS3 affected since the first ASF introduction. The WG agreed on comparing the number of NUTS3 affected per trimester in 20223 compared with 2022.

Suggestions on how to improve the report according to the data available will be take into consideration to make it more consistent with the ongoing epidemiological situation.

c. Conclusions and recommendations

After an attentive reading of the conclusions and recommendations the WG discussed about the points that are not clear and should be rephrased, those that could be deleted and eventually, additional points to include. WG agreed on these sections changes.

d. Next steps

EFSA will implement changes discussed during the meeting and will send back the report to experts for the final revision before sending it for approval.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 15 May 2024, via web conference.



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

NO CONFLICT: With regard to this meeting, Dr Timothée VERGNE declared the following interest: contract with EFSA for the development of a mechanistic model to quantify the influence of wild boar density on African swine fever spread and maintenance in wild boar population. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

03 April 2024

09:30-12:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 17 April 2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
Eleonora CATTANEO
Sonagnon Martin GOUDJIHOUNDE
Lina MUR
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Stefania TAMPACH
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. **Agreement of the minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 28-29 February 2024, in Parma**

The [minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 14 March 2024.

V. **Scientific topic(s) for discussion ([EFSA-Q-2022-00380](#))**

The objective of the meeting was to discuss about the draft of the annual epidemiological report (TOR1) of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF), address comments received from deep reviewers and define Conclusions and Recommendations sections of the report. Main topics are listed below.

a. Report review

During the meeting the Working Group (WG) was given an update on the latest data submitted and changed by some countries and discussed about the possibility to contact them to ask for some clarification, if needed.

WG agreed on the criteria for including some non-EU countries in the report and the explanation to be provided in the report.

WG agreed on changing the order of Assessment section, by reporting as first sub-section the spatial dynamics of the disease, followed by the temporal dynamics and the surveillance, keeping the division between domestic pigs first and wild boar. The order of the sections was decided according to the possible relevance of each one of them for the audience.

The WG discussed also about various maps and graphs and decided which one should be kept and which one of them should be changed or implemented.

b. Conclusions and recommendations

During the meeting the WG focused also on the Conclusions and Recommendations sections.

They agreed on keep the conclusions concise, since detailed information are reported in the different highlights of the report.

WG discussed about the description of outbreaks seasonality in wild boar, mainly on their less evident pattern with respect to domestic pigs.

WG agreed on the main points to be included and described in the conclusions and recommendations sections.

c. Next steps

EFSA will send to the WG a new draft version of the report, with comments discussed during the meeting implemented. The draft version with WG comments will be sent to deep reviewers and Network members for the final review by the 8th of April.

The report, with deep reviewers and Network members' comments implemented will be sent to WG before the next meeting.

VI. **Next meeting**

The next meeting will be held on 19 April 2024, in Parma or via web conference.

Location: EFSA - Parma (Meeting Room 03/M01)

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
Eleonora CATTANEO
José CORTINHAS ABRAHANTES
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declarations of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 31 January 2024, in via web-conference

The [minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 20 February 2024.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The objective of the meeting was to review the first draft of the annual epidemiological report (TOR1) of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF) produced using Kaleidoscope application. During the meeting, the Working Group (WG) was also given an update on the ASF spread model by Timothée Vergne.

a. Epidemiological report review

The Working Group (WG) agreed on the work planning to review the annual epidemiological report for ASF. During the present meeting all experts reviewed the whole document providing comments and suggestion and discussed about the most relevant data to better describe the 2023 epidemiological situation of ASF in Europe.

To harmonize the report, the WG agreed on terminology to be used in the document referred to African Swine Fever, EU and non-EU countries.

The WG discussed about the countries' responses to the surveillance questionnaire. They agreed on having more insight on active surveillance activities performed by countries also comparing answers from previous year. They also discussed about the usefulness of having more information within the report about the size of farms in which outbreaks were detected through enhanced passive surveillance, to assess the efficacy of this method to early detect ASF.

The WG agreed on adding a separate section in the report to describe translocation events (Italy and Sweden will be included) and countries responses analysis about WGS.

The WG discussed about the visualization of the "spread by quarter" maps to make the maps easier to read and to allow deeper data analysis.

About the section on wild boar, WG discussed about the possibility to visualize in the surveillance effort map, the proportion of positive samples over the total samples. Kaleidoscope implementation is required. The WG also agreed on including in the "found dead" category of wild boar sampled population, wild boar with clinical signs.

WG also discussed on the possibility to implement in the impact section of the report the percentage of establishments and pigs located in restricted areas.

Due to the peculiar situation in Sweden, the WG agreed on adding a specific section on the impact caused by the disease in wild boar in the country.

The WG discussed on the hunting bags graphs highlighting the appearing synchronization between some countries. They provided some suggestions to better examine this aspect.

b. Spread model update

Timothée Vergne presented to the WG an update of the spread model for ASF. This model simulates the spread of ASF in wild boar in a specific area, considering the wild boar density data (from ENETWILD model) as input. The model parametrization was presented to the WG.

c. Next steps

The draft report with comments from the present meeting implemented will be shared with experts on 05 March. Starting from this date experts will focus specifically on reviewing the report sections assigned to them. The report with experts' comments will be sent to the countries before the network meeting that will be held online on 18 March.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 03 April 2024, via web conference.



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, Dr Karl STÅHL declared the following interest: research grant with the Swedish Research Council for Environment, Agricultural Sciences and Spatial Planning on ASF, and participation in an ad-hoc group in WOAAH on drivers of disease emergence. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Location: EFSA - Parma (Meeting Room 01/B04)/Webconference

Attendees:

○ Working Group Members:

Anette BOKLUND

Tomasz PODGORSKI

Karl STÅHL

Timothée VERGNE

○ Hearing Experts¹:

Ezio FERROGLIO

Smith GRAHAM

Joaquin VICENTE BANOS

Estelle MEROC

○ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

EC: Simona FORCELLA

○ EFSA:

Eleonora CATTANEO

José CORTINHAS ABRAHANTES

Sonagnon Martin GOUDJIHOUNDE

Lina MUR (chair)

Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 19 January 2024, in via web-conference

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



The [minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by oral procedure during this Working Group meeting that was held via web-conference on 31 January 2024.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Systematic Literature Review on Immunocontraception methods for controlling wild boar populations

Estelle Meroc presented to the WG the results of the systematic literature review (SLR) on scientific evidence of immunocontraception as wild boar population control method.

The WG, that have previously reviewed a first version of the report, discussed on pending topics, among which: the adverse effect of the immunocontraceptive vaccination, the potential oral administration of the vaccines, and the subsequent impact of non-specific baits on other species. The practical aspects and cost-related issues of the implementation, and the possible reproductive adaptation of the non-treated population will be included in the report discussion.

A second version of the report with corrections and clarifications will be shared with the WG that will review it to provide final feedback and comments.

b. Progress from ENETWILD on wild boar work (wild boar density models and barriers for controlling wild boar)

The WG was given an update from ENETWILD on the wild boar density models developed and delivered to EFSA. Two different methodologies were used for modelling the wild boar density and both were calibrated using data from camera traps from the European Observatory of Wildlife. The differences between both models were presented and discussed during the meeting.

The WG discuss the potential better fit of the models in southern Europe due to the greater presence of camera traps in those areas. In addition, the WG suggested to explore the spatial variations of across the years of the hunting yields data.

The WG was also given an update on SLR on the use of barriers for controlling wild boar populations for which ENETWILD will start to analyse the results. The questionnaire on field application of the barriers and the link to attend to the workshop organized by ENETWILD with the stakeholders will be shared with the WG. In parallel, EFSA will compile information from those countries with greater experience on the use of fences to include it in the report.

c. Protocol on TOR2

The WG discussed on specific elements of the protocol of TOR2 report of African Swine Fever (ASF) mandate for the assessment of risk factors involved in ASF epidemiology. The WG agreed on the definitions of spread, occurrence and persistence and include those in the interpretation of the mandate elements.

The WG also discussed the structure of the assessment questions and sub-questions and agreed on the conceptual model to be included in the protocol. Also, for the report's structure, it was decided to follow the same structure as the Scientific Opinion.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 28-29 February 2024, in person in EFSA headquarters in Parma.

Location: EFSA - Parma (Meeting Room 02/B02)/Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
Eleonora CATTANEO
José CORTINHAS ABRAHANTES
Sonagnon Martin GOUDJIHOUNDE
Lina MUR (chair)

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 11 December 2023, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 20 December 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The objective of the meeting was to provide an update to the working group (WG) on the annual epidemiological report (TOR1) of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF), and review the

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



progress done on TOR2 for the assessment of risk factors involved in the occurrence, persistence and spread of ASF in domestic pigs and wild boar populations.

Main topics discussed are listed below.

a. TOR 1 'Annual Epidemiological report'

The WG was given an update on the data submitted until the meeting by the affected countries. The WG was also informed about the finalisation of the development of Kaleidoscope application, its improvements and functionalities were showed.

Based on ASF outbreak events as extracted from ADIS database (accessed the 12th December 2023) the WG identified the translocation events that should be described in the annual epidemiological report (namely, Sweden and events in Italy in new affected regions).

A partial version of the annual epidemiological report will be created with Kaleidoscope using 2023 ADIS data and will be provided to WG experts soon. For the preliminary version of the final report, the process of data submission and validation needs to finish and will be shared on 20th February in the morning.

The WG discussed on the ASF surveillance questionnaires that will be sent to countries. The WG will use of the same terminology provided in ASF guidelines and will make the questions harmonized. The WG agreed on the changes and the pre-filled questionnaires will be sent to countries.

b. TOR2 and assessment of risk factors

The WG was given an update on the risk factors analysis, as requested in the TOR2 of the mandate on African Swine Fever. The WG was asked to provide feedbacks and comments on the report on immunocontraception that will be presented in detail during the next meeting.

About the assessment of *Ornithodoros* as a risk factor involved in ASF epidemiology, the WG was suggested to use records from GBIF platform in addition to Vectornet database to have more complete and detailed information that can be used.

The WG was also given an update on the case-control study. A preliminary adaptation of the R code used last year have been done but further adjustments are required.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 31 January 2024, via web conference.

Location: EFSA - Parma (Meeting Room 00/M04)/Webconference

Attendees:

○ Working Group Members:

Anette BOKLUND

Tomasz PODGORSKI

Karl STÅHL

Timothee VERGNE

○ EFSA:

Eleonora CATTANEO

Sonagnon Martin GOUDJIHOUNDE

Lina MUR (chair)

Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Simona Forcella.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 16 November 2023, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 05 December 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The objectives of the meeting were to discuss some pending topics for the annual epidemiological report (TOR1) of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF), and the use of mathematical models to study the risk factors involved in ASF (TOR2). The WG was also given an update on the case-

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



control study conducted on commercial pig farms. Clarification about next activities and report timeline were provided. More details are listed below.

a. TOR 1: Protocol and surveillance questionnaire

The WG agreed on applying the protocol published last year (EFSA, 2023) for the following annual epidemiological report of ASF.

The WG was updated on the latest progress on the Kaleidoscope application. A first draft report will be produced by EFSA, sent to WG members and reviewed during the meeting that will be held in February. The WG also discussed on the possibility to add a recommendation section in the 2023 epidemiological report.

The WG discussed on the ASF surveillance questionnaire that will be sent to affected countries in January. In agreement with previous meetings, the questionnaire will be prefilled with answers provided by countries from the previous year and sent to EU and to non-EU countries affected by ASF, reporting outbreaks to ADIS.

b. Mechanistic mathematical models for the study of ASF spread

In previous meetings it was decided to use mechanistic mathematical models to evaluate the risk factors, including wild boar density, on spread of ASF in wild boar populations. For that purpose, Tomasz Podgorski and Timothée Vergne presented two existing models that could be used in this assessment. The WG discussed on the possible use and adaptation of these two models to properly answer mandate questions. The

c. Case control study

The WG was given an update by Eleonora Cattaneo on the case-control study conducted in commercial pig farms. Data available for three different countries included in the study were presented and next steps required were provided. The WG discussed on the next steps to include the case-control study in the TOR2.

d. Next steps

The WG was also provided an overview of report timeline and next steps and deadlines for both TORs of the mandate. The planning with meeting dates scheduled and deadlines will be sent to WG members.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 19 January 2024 via web conference.

16 November 2023

14:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 05 December 2023

Location: EFSA - Parma (Meeting Room 04/B14)/Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÄHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Ezio FERROGLIO
José Antonio BLANCO AGUIAR
Joaquin VICENTE BANOS
- EFSA:
Alessandro BROGLIA
José CORTINHAS ABRAHANTES
Eleonora CATTANEO
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

III. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 26 October 2023, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 14 November 2023.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The objective of the meeting was to define the work concerning the third element of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF) that requires the assessment of risk factors including wild boar density, on occurrence, spread and persistence of ASF in wild boar populations. The Working Group (WG) was also asked to review the fourth element of the mandate concerning the effectiveness of barrier methods on controlling wild boar movements.

Mani topics discussed are listed below.

a. Define the methods and study settings to be used in the third element of ASF mandate

The WG discussed on the specific modelling approaches to use for each sub-question related with the wild boar density, namely the risk factors, involved in ASF occurrence, persistence and spread in wild boar.

The WG agreed on the use of statistical models for the study of factors involved in the occurrence and persistence; and a mechanistic mathematical spread model for the study of spread and persistence.

The WG agreed on using the highest spatial resolution available for all models implemented, concretely square shaped 2*2km cells.

According to data availability for each country, the WG agreed on the use of data from those that have the most useful and complete data. The WG identified three countries suitable for the aim of the study. The WG also agreed on the use of the same list of risk factors to include in all models.

b. Review the methods for addressing the fourth element of ASF mandate on barriers for controlling wild boar populations

The ENETWILD hearing experts presented their proposal for the collection of scientific evidence and definition of existing scenarios for the use of fences.

They presented the methodology applied for the Systematic Literature Review conducted and the definitive strings to use in order to update scientific information on the use of barriers to control wild boar movements.

They will complement the information present in the scientific literature with 'field data' by the use of specific questionnaires to collect data from different stakeholders in affected countries for artificial barriers utilization and their experience. ENETWILD group suggested the use of a social scientist to develop the questionnaire and the organization of workshops to include stakeholders opinion by the use of delphi method.

The WG discussed on additional elements to take into consideration about the impact of artificial barriers and to add in the report produced by ENETWILD group.

Next steps

ENETWILD will study the ASF data and define the time window and spatial areas for the models, and start preparing the data at the required spatial resolution. In the meantime, the WG will continue working on the protocol, and finalising to define the way forward for the other mandate elements.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 11 December 2023, via web conference.

Location: EFSA - Parma (Meeting Room 02/B17)/Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Ezio FERROGLIO
José Antonio BLANCO AGUIAR
Joaquin VICENTE BANOS
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
Alessandro BROGLIA
José CORTINHAS ABRAHANTES
Eleonora CATTANEO
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 25 September 2023, in via web-conference

The [minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 12 October 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Planning of TOR2 methodology and data availability on wild boar density

The objective of the meeting was to plan TOR2 methodology of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF) that requires the assessment of risk factors involved in the occurrence, persistence and spread of ASF in domestic pig and wild boar populations. The Working Group (WG) focused on the third element of the mandate that request to assess the risk factors including wild boar density, on occurrence, spread and persistence of ASF in wild boar populations.

Main topics discussed are listed below.

Data availability on wild boar density

The WG was given an update by ENETWILD members on the data available for wild boar density. Joaquin Vicente presented data on hunting statistics used as a proxy of wild boar density, wild boar movements data and data on connectivity and scavengers. All this, been factors to be considered in the models to be developed.

The WG agreed on the use of statistical models as methodology to answer mandate questions and assess risk factors involved on ASF epidemiology (occurrence, spread and persistence) in wild boar in Europe. WG agreed on the use of the same risk factors in all the three models (occurrence, spread and persistence).

Terms definition

The WG agreed on questions formulation for the third element of the mandate and pointed out three terms to be defined in order to describe which parameters have to be used in the statistical models.

Occurrence: WG discussed on the definition of occurrence and the necessity to define a space resolution and a time window.

The WG agreed on the approach to be used in occurrence by modelling the number of positive samples given the number of tests performed through a Poisson model and a logistic model to check its consistency. They also pointed out the difficulties associated with the re-infection in certain areas (previously infected cells that become infected after a period on non-infection) and the bias associated with different sampling efforts (eg. sampling increase in positive cells after positivity is found).

Spread: WG discussed on several options to define this term and approaches to model it. The concrete definition is pending for future meetings.

Persistence: WG discussed the definition of ASF persistence and the potential identification of a threshold for it, and specific scenarios where the disease persisted despite low wild boar density.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 16 November 2023, via web conference.

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Experts:
Anette BOKLUND,
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÄHL
Timothée VERGNE
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
José CORTINHAS ABRAHANTES
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 4 July 2023, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 20 July 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



a. Planning of TOR2 and protocol development

The objective of the meeting was to plan the TOR2 of the mandate on African swine fever (ASF) that requires the assessment of risk factors involved in the occurrence, persistence and spread of ASF in domestic pig and wild boar populations. The working group was given an update on the work carried out by EFSA in the period from July to September.

Main topics are listed below.

Annual Epidemiological report:

Lina Mur from EFSA informed the WG that five additional countries will be included in the EPI report for the next year and that an informative session for ASF data providers and validators will be organized on 4 October.

The WG agreed that the questionnaires sent the previous year to the affected countries provided useful information on surveillance activities and decided that the questionnaires will be sent again for the next report. For countries which had already provided information, a prefilled questionnaire with answers from the previous year will be sent and countries will be asked for confirmation/amendments. The questionnaire will be also sent to non-EU countries.

Discussion on boxplots for secondary outbreaks in wild boars: it was agreed to follow a descriptive approach for this section of the report instead of providing a more statistical insight.

TOR2

Vectors: Lina Mur updated the WG on the assessment of the presence/absence of *O.erraticus* and presented the results of the survey sent to Vectornet members to collect information on surveillance activities for *Ornithodoros* ticks. Replies were received from 24 countries and missing countries will be contacted. Six countries reported they performed entomological surveillance activities for *Ornithodoros spp.*, while only two countries reported serological surveillance. The majority of countries reported that they did not perform any surveillance activities, mostly due to the lack of resources to implement vector surveillance or because of the historical knowledge about the absence of the ticks in the country.

The systematic literature review on the role of mechanical vectors on ASF epidemiology will start in January.

Fences: the results from the survey sent to members of the Animal Health and Welfare Network to collect information on barriers for controlling wild boar in ASF context were presented. Additional efforts will be done to collect more information on the countries missing.

The WG agreed on using summary tables with information on fences to give an overview of the different situations between countries, then for some countries a deeper evaluation will be done. Germany was suggested as a scenario considering their wide experience on building fences (more than 3000km were built). Results and tables summarizing the survey responses will be shared with the countries involved to be validated.

Wild boar density: Enetwild will present their plan and data availability during the meeting that will be held on 26 October.

The literature review on immunocontraception will be carried out by external experts from may 2024.

Protocol for the ToR2 will be shared with the WG members before the next WG meeting.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 26 October 2023, via web conference.

4 July 2023

14.00-17.00

MINUTES - Agreed on 20 July 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Experts:
Anette BOKLUND,
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona Forcella
- EFSA:
Lina MUR (chair)
José CORTINHAS ABRAHANTES
Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. The Declaration of Interests submitted by Timothée Vergne on 26.06.23, currently under assessment, does not present any changes compared to the Declaration of Interests currently valid. No other Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 9 June 2023, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 21 June 2023.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Planning of TOR2

The objective of the meeting was to plan the second Term of Reference of the African swine fever (ASF) mandate that requests the assessment of risk factors involved in the occurrence, persistence and spread of ASF in wild boar and domestic pig populations. The content of TOR2 and main topics discussed are listed below.

Systematic literature review: EFSA will update the systematic review on risk factors performed in previous assessments.

Vectors: to study this factor, a systematic review of mechanical vectors will be performed. Moreover, a questionnaire to collect data on *Ornithodoros erraticus* surveillance activities carried out in EU countries will be sent to Vectornet members. The working group (WG) experts reviewed and commented the draft of the questionnaire providing important insights to improve the survey.

Wild boar density: Enetwild consortium provide support for the assessment of the wild boar density. The objective is the production of high accuracy modelled wild boar density estimations for different scenarios and the spatial analysis of the risk factors involved in these scenarios.

Effectiveness of fences: The literature review performed by EFSA in 2018 on this area will be updated. In addition, Enetwild will identify and define the different scenarios existing for the use of fences.

The WG discussed the possibility to study the immunocontraception in wild boars and its role in wild boar density reduction through a systematic literature review.

b. Review of Epidemiological report – improvements and changes

The latest improvements of the Kaleidoscope application were showed. By the end of the year the application will be ready for the production of reports.

In the meantime, EFSA staff is organising meetings with countries representatives to ensure the on time submission of data for the report.

Finally, WG experts agreed that the questionnaires sent to countries provided important information about surveillance activities to be included in the report and decided that the questionnaire will be sent again to collect data for the next report.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 25 September 2023 via web conference.

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Experts:
Anette BOKLUND,
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona Forcella
- EFSA:
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 16 May 2023, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 2 June 2023.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Planning of TOR2 of African Swine Fever mandate

The objective of the meeting was the initial planning of the TOR2 of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF) that requests the assessment of risk factors involved in the occurrence, persistence and spread of ASF in domestic pigs and wild boar populations.

The Working Group (WG) discussed how to address this request, considering the current epidemiology of the disease, the previous work of EFSA on ASF and the availability of time and resources. First, a systematic literature review will be performed to update the results of the previous assessments, emphasising any new or controversial result. Secondly, three factors will be studied in detail:

Vectors: An extensive literature review of *O. erraticus* distribution will be performed, including grey literature and ongoing research projects. Additional information on the surveillance activities carried out by the Member States on *O. erraticus* and other vectors potentially involved on ASF epidemiology will be collected via questionnaire.

Wild boar: The WG agreed that a spatial model using geographical units which considers the characteristics of the population would be the best option to study the influence of the factors for the occurrence, incidence, speed of spread and the persistence of ASF. The wild boar density will be investigated together with other relevant factors (e.g.: connectivity index, wild boar movement data, scavenger) in selected scenarios. The wild boar density estimations will be based on hunting data calibrated with camera trap data.

In addition, to investigate the spread and persistence of the disease, it was proposed to use a dynamic transmission model at local scale (e.g. investigating the situation in northern Italy with the data of Piemonte). Additional discussions are required to define the details of this potential approach.

Effectiveness of fences: evidence on the effectiveness of fences for controlling wild boar movement will be collected and use to characterise the different scenarios based on the type of fence, the orography, the epidemiological situation, etc.

b. Review of Epi report and planning

The WG discussed about the future changes and improvements for the next epidemiological report (e.g.: different structure of the report sections and avoid duplications). In addition, the main improvements of the Kaleidoscope application were showed including the implementation of evolution of restricted areas graphs, and the insertion of the trend of the previous year in monthly seasonality plots.

Lina Mur informed the WG that the ASF data collection for year 2023 will be open in October and the workshop with data providers will be held in October. Individual meetings with countries data providers will be held to help the countries with the data submission. The WG reviewed and agreed the latest updates for the guidelines on data collection.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 4 July 2023, via web conference.

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Experts:
Anette BOKLUND,
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 19 April 2023, in via web-conference

The minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 2 May 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Initial planning of TOR2 of African Swine Fever mandate

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



Lina Mur from EFSA presented to the Working group the TOR2 of the mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF) that requests the assessment of risk factors involved in the occurrence, persistence and spread of ASF in domestic pigs and wild boar populations. The report addressing the TOR2 will be produced every two years, starting in September/October 2024.

After discussing the different topics to be addressed, the WG proposed the following general structure of the report:

- Update of the systematic literature review on ASF risk factors
- Identification and analysis of following factors:
 - o Update on the information on presence of tick *O. erraticus* in the EU. In case of presence, role/competence in the ASF epidemiology
 - o Analysis of risk factors related with wild boar involved on ASF epidemiology
 - o Effectiveness of fences for controlling wild boar populations

b. Brainstorming wild boar risk factor

The relevance of wild boar density on ASF epidemiology was discussed, and, importantly, how to obtain reliable estimations of wild boar density. The biases and limitations associated with the traditional density indicators (eg. hunting bags) were discussed and the incorporation of other measures such as camera trap data was suggested to complement and recalibrate the abundance model based on hunting bags data.

Enetwild consortium was identified as the relevant partner for the support and assessment on wild boar. The hunting data collected in the last years will be leveraged as well as the abundance models previously developed by the project.

c. Review of Epi report – improvements and changes

Due to the long discussions hold on how to study the role of wild boar, no time was left to review the epidemiological report and identify challenges and potential improvements. This topic will be addressed in the next meeting the 9th June.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 9 June 2023, via web conference.

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Experts:
Anette BOKLUND,
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Simona FORCELLA

- EFSA:
José CORTINAS ABRAHANTE
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 28 March 2023, via web-conference

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 14 April 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



a. Review of the draft scientific report on Epidemiological analysis of African swine fever in the European Union during 2022 (EFSA-Q-2022-00369)

The objective of the meeting was the review of the draft of the scientific report of TOR 1 on African Swine Fever (ASF) before its submission for the approval. The WG examined each section of the draft and provided additional suggestions to improve the text, as well as the layout of the tables and maps. All changes were duly noted in order to make corrections in the report.

The most relevant topics and agreement are listed below.

The WG agreed on:

- expressing the animal loss and farm incidence as a percentage.
- keeping the order of the countries based on their geographical position from north to south.
- the use of the word 'establishment' to identify premises in which domestic pigs are kept.
- adding a map with ASF outbreak in domestic by farm size to improve the clarity of the maps on impact of the disease.

Different options for the plots for the visualisation of the monthly seasonality in wild boars were presented to the WG experts. WG agreed on improving the visualization of the graphs of monthly seasonality using a thicker line to highlight the monthly seasonality for year 2022.

b. Next activities

All the suggested changes and correction will be addressed by EFSA, and the final version of the report will be sent to the HoD on Monday 24 April 2023 for the approval.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 16 May 2023 via web conference.

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

○ Working Group Experts:

Anette BOKLUND,
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE

○ Hearing Experts¹:

Marisa ARIAS
Camina GALLARDO
Georgina HELYES
Carmen ISCARO
Katarína JUHÁSOVÁ
Daniela KORYTAROVA
Petr KUCÍNSKÝ
Marius MASIULIS
Alexandra MITEVA
Ioana NEGHIRLA
Raquel NIETO
Edvins OLSEVSKIS
Christoph STAUBACH
Arvo VILTROP
Grzegorz WOZNIAKOWSKI

○ European Commission:

Simona FORCELLA

○ EFSA:

Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 7-8 March 2023, in Parma

The [minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 27 March 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Review of surveillance section of scientific report draft.

The objective of the meeting was the review of the draft of the scientific report of TOR 1 on African Swine Fever (ASF) by addressing the comments and observations received from the countries representatives. Each section of the scientific report was examined and changes were duly noted in order to make corrections in the report. The most relevant topics and agreement are listed below.

Clarification about the terminology used for the host species (pigs and wild boar) in the report were provided, as the use of the terms from the Regulation 429/2016 is not compulsory.

Some of the countries were asked to clarify the surveillance activities described in the report and to check the way of detection of outbreaks occurred in domestic pigs in 2022. Additional information was provided on the type of farms in which enhanced passive surveillance is performed.

The surveillance and testing of wild boar samples was discussed, with special interventions from EURL colleagues on the use of the correct sample matrix for each type of test. Countries were invited to review the guidance on diagnosis produced by the EURL https://asf-referencelab.info/asf/images/GUIDELINES_DIAGNOSIS/Link_2_workflow_MA.pdf

b. Multi gene-approach for genotyping ASF isolates

Camina Gallardo from EU Reference Laboratory (EURL) presented the multi-gene approach sequencing method for differentiation of ASFv isolates. The analysis of multiple ASFv genome regions permitted to classify 382 European ASFV genotypes II isolates into 24 distinct groups. This approach and the addition of new markers allowed to group the isolates from the new introductions of Italy to provide hypothesis on the origin of those viruses.

c. Whole genome sequencing of ASF isolates from Germany

Christoph Staubach presented the work of the Friedrich Loeffler Institute (FLI) on genome sequencing of ASFv isolates in Germany. Christoph Staubach provided an overview of the different ASFv isolates from the different regions of Germany summarising the different lineages found and the future plans of FLI lab.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



d. Review of spatio-temporal dynamics section of scientific report

Lina Mur showed the maps of the report related with the epidemiological situation of the disease and explained the procedure followed to analyse the evolution of the ASF restricted areas. The countries representatives agreed on using the terminology restricted area in that section of the report.

Temporal graphs of wild boar will be redone for the countries concerned as soon as the corrected data is submitted. The temporal graph of wild boar cases will be modified removing the differentiation between countries reporting.

e. Review impact section

The section of the report about the impact of the disease in domestic pigs and wild boar was reviewed by the working group. The incidence by size of farm was discussed and agreed that differences should be considered with caution. Additional tests can be done increasing the threshold of the farm size.

Finally, the working group discussed about the potential factors involved in the re-growth of the wild boar population in the Baltics.

f. Next activities

The WG experts and EFSA will review the draft of the report based on the discussions during the meeting by the 4th of April. From 5th to 17th April the draft will be reviewed by the countries representatives. On April 19th there will be the last WG meeting with the experts in order to finalize the scientific report.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 19th April 2023 via web conference.

Location: EFSA - Parma

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission:
EC: Simona FORCELLA
- EFSA:
Jose CORTINAS ABRAHANTE
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Alessia RUSINA'

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 15 February 2023, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 3 March 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Review of the draft scientific report on Epidemiological analysis of African swine fever in the European Union during 2022 ([EFSA-Q-2022-00369](#))

The WG discussed the scientific report by examining each section of the draft report in detail to identify the parts that required further discussion. Some general decisions were taken for the report: i) to include 'highlights' for each section of the report; ii) to order the countries based on their geographical position from north to south, clearly differentiating EU from non-EU countries and, to check the definitions used (also in tables) to be consistent with the previous report.

The **spatial section** was reviewed by the Working Group, looking at the maps layout in detail and discussing the main conclusions from them. Additional analysis were agreed to be done in the trimester evolution section.

After analysing all the graphs for the time profiles of positive rates of wild boar, it was decided to focus only on the passive surveillance graphs in the report, as active surveillance graphs were all but one plain (all 0s).

Regarding the section on **surveillance activities**, the WG agreed on asking further clarifications to the countries about the active surveillance activities performed, as well as about the systematic carcasses search.

The **impact section of the report** was reviewed considering the importance of differentiating between farm size for domestic pigs for the control and impact measures. For wild boar, additional analysis were suggested such as plotting the affected areas against the annual numbers of wild boar harvested.

b. Next activities

The WG agreed on sharing the draft report with countries and deep reviewers on 20th March 2023, to receive their comments by March 24th. Comments and suggestions from countries will be addressed in the next meeting on the 28th March with the countries representatives.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 28 March 2023, via web conference.

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Hearing Experts¹:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STÅHL
Timothée VERGNE

- EFSA:
Lina MUR (chair)
Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 11 January 2023, via web-conference

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25 January 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Review of data submitted

Alexandra Papanikolaou from EFSA updated the working group about the data submission progress, emphasizing the challenges faced by some countries. The detailed situation on data submission and validation was discussed (i.e., countries that have sent data, data already validated and submission delays). Finally, potential improvements for future data collections were discussed.

b. Review of questionnaires responses

Results of the compilation of the questionnaires submitted by the ASF affected countries were presented by Alessia Rusinà from EFSA and discussed by the group.

c. Review of the draft report

The draft of the scientific report was reviewed in detail, paying special attention to the graphs and maps developed by the online application (Kaleidoscope). The working group agreed on the use of a harmonised colour palette in all the visual components of the report. Additional suggestions on legend titles, and other details to improve the visualization of the figures were provided. All the suggested changes agreed where noted in order to make corrections in the application and the report.

d. Next activities

Clarification about the timeline for the report were given. The sections of the reports based on ADIS data will be drafted by 28th of February by the experts. The rest of the sections based on surveillance and pig population data will be drafted and reviewed during the next WG meeting in Parma.

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 7-8 March 2023, in Parma.

11 January 2023

09:30-12:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 25 January 2023

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Hearing Experts¹:

Anette BOKLUND

Tomasz PODGORSKI

Karl STÅHL

Timothee VERGNE

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

EC: Simona FORCELLA

- EFSA:

José CORTIÑAS ABRAHANTES

Lina MUR (chair)

Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU

Alessia RUSINÀ

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 30 November 2022, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting](#) were agreed by written procedure on 13 December 2022.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Report planning and Kaleidoscope application feedback

The objective of the meeting was to plan the work for the following months of the scientific and technical report of the TOR 1 on African Swine Fever (ASF). The detailed planning was reviewed, emphasizing the next meetings, periods for report reviewing and experts responsibilities.

Afterwards, the online application kaleidoscope was reviewed in detail using demo data (as the final data is not available yet), collecting the feedback from the experts on every component. Numerous suggestions were provided by the experts to improve the visualization of the data and readability of the outcomes. All the changes were duly noted and will be implemented in the application.

b. Data submission status

Alexandra Papanikolaou from EFSA informed the experts about the data submission process and current status. On 9 November 2022 an informative session for countries was held, and the deadline for data submission is set on the 31st of January 2023. The situation on data submission (i.e. countries that have sent already the data or started the process) was discussed and corrective actions were agreed in order to remind and support the remaining countries on data submission.

c. Next Activities

Clarification about the timeline for the report were given. Lina Mur informed the WG experts that the data extraction from ADIS will be performed on 16-17 January 2023. Then preliminary maps and graphs will be produced. Experts will be informed when maps and graphs will be plotted in the draft report to be discussed.

Draft scientific report on Epidemiological analysis of African swine fever in the European Union during 2022 ([EFSA-Q-2022-00369](#))

VI. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 15 February 2023, via web conference.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

AFRICAN SWINE FEVER

Held on VIDEO -conference, 30 November 2022

(Agreed on 13 December 2022)¹

Participants

- Hearing Experts²:
 - Anette BOKLUND
 - Tomasz PODGORSKI
 - Karl STÅHL
 - Timothée VERGNE
- EFSA:
 - BIOHAW : Lina MUR (chair), Alessia RUSINÀ
 - MESE: José CORTIÑAS ABRAHANTES

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received from WG experts.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 11 November 2022, VIDEO-conference.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21 November 2022⁵.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁶

5.1. Report methodology and protocol finalisation

The objective of the meeting was the finalization of the protocol for the TOR 1 of the scientific and technical assistance on African Swine Fever (ASF) by addressing the different sections of the protocol and comments emerged from previous meetings. The most relevant topics and agreements are listed below.

Specifically, experts discussed the best approach to summarise the surveillance activities and their performance, emphasising the importance of differentiating between mandatory and optional surveillance strategies.

The WG agreed on using restricted areas (defined by Regulation EC 605/2021) as an estimation of the surface affected by ASF, to be included as well in the impact assessment.

All WG experts agreed on using outbreaks data instead of samples data to describe seasonality in domestic pig.

After reviewing the different proposals for visually representing the impact of the disease, experts agreed on adding maps of disease prevalence per NUTS 3 for pig population but to only use temporal graphs for the evolution of hunting bags for the wild boar populations.

5.2. Next Activities

The protocol will be shared after the meeting for final revision by WG before sending it to reviewers. Clarification about next activities and report timeline were provided.

6. Any Other Business

Lina Mur informed experts they will need to register for the 4EU platform to be able to access the kaleidoscope online application and that she is now discussing about what kind of data she could provide them to test the tool.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2022-09/africanswinefeverepi7.pdf>

⁶ EFSA-Q-2022-00551 <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health>

7. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meeting is scheduled for January. A doodle will be distributed to check the availability of the experts.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AFRICAN SWINE FEVER

Held on TELE - conference, 11 November 2022

(Agreed on 21 November 2022)¹

Participants

■ Working Group experts:²

Annette BOKLUND

Tomasz PODGORSKI

Karl STÅHL

Timothée VERGNE

■ Hearing Experts³:

Georgina HELYES

Carmen ISCARO

Vanja KONDRATENKO

Daniela KORYTAROVA

Marius MASIULIS

Aleksandra MITEVA

Ioana NEGHIRLA

Edvins OLSEVSKIS

Saša OSTOJIĆ

Christoph STAUBACH

Arvo VILTROP

Grzegorz WOŹNIAKOWSKI

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

■ EFSA:

BIOHAW: Kateryna Chuzhakina, Lina Mur (Chair), Alessia Rusinà, Gabriele Zancanaro

iDATA: Alexandra Papanikolaou

MESE: José Cortiñas Abrahantes

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 13 September 2022, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 22 September 2022⁶.

5. Hearing Experts

Hearing experts were invited to present the epidemiological evolution of ASF in their countries in 2022 and provide their views on the potential factors involved in ASF in their territories.

Ms Georgina Helyes presented for Hungary, Ms Carmen Iscaro presented for Italy, Mr Vanja Kondratenko presented for North Macedonia, Ms Daniela Korytarova presented for Slovakia, Mr Marius Masiulis presented for Lithuania, Ms Aleksandra Miteva presented for Bulgaria, Ms Ioana Neghirla presented for Romania, Mr Edvins Olsevskis presented for Latvia, Mr Saša Ostojić presented for Serbia, Mr Christoph Staubach presented for Germany, Mr Arvo Viltrop presented for Estonia and Mr Grzegorz Woźniakowski presented for Poland.

6. Scientific topics for discussion

6.1. Presentation of the Mandate and discussion on terms of reference⁷

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2022-09/africanswinefeverepi7.pdf>

⁷ EFSA-Q-2022-00551 <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health>

Lina Mur from EFSA presented the new mandate on African Swine Fever (ASF) and the terms of reference. In accordance with article 31 of Regulation (EC) 178/2002 EFSA is requested to produce nine scientific reports on ASF from April 2023 to June 2028.

Explanation about the main changes of the epidemiological report versus previous years were given, including the implementation of the transparency regulation, the separation of terms of reference in different scientific reports and different timing for those reports (annually and following a calendar basis for the epidemiological reports and bi-annually for the risk factor reports).

6.2. Report structure and protocol

The chair presented the proposed report structure and discussed the key elements of the draft Protocol to be adopted by the end of December.

The working group agreed on using the term "translocation" for the description of long distance jumps of the virus. Also, the working group agreed on the use of the term "outbreak" independently of the population involved, aligning with the EC terminology, but reminded the importance of including the number of cases in the calculations performed.

A video of a demo of Kaleidoscope online application was showed and discussed among the group. The chair explained the objectives of Kaleidoscope, which include allowing EFSA to produce the report but also providing a useful tool to visualise epidemiological data for anyone is interested.

6.3. Surveillance activities questionnaire results and highlights of African Swine Fever situation per country in the last year

Results of the compilation of the surveillance activities questionnaires, which 11 countries out of 12 have submitted to EFSA, were presented by the chair and discussed in the group. Further refinements of the questionnaire were agreed to be done, which would need a second round of consultation to the countries.

All country representatives were asked to briefly discuss the epidemiological evolution of ASF in their countries in the last year, emphasizing if the situation improved, declined or remained stable versus previous years. They also explained their view on the main hypotheses or factors involved on it, and if any translocation event of the virus occurred that would be of interest for the report.

6.4. Data submission

Alexandra Papanikolaou explained the type of data requested to the countries for 2022, i.e. pig population data and ASF laboratory test results, and the timeline for data submission and validation. She emphasised the importance of respecting the deadlines and involve the appropriate persons for the different roles (data providers and data validators).

7. Any Other Business

The coming activities for the working group are to finalise the protocol for its approval by the end of December.

The affected countries need to prepare the data for the submission by 31 January 2023 and be reactive for the validation of data submitted.

8. Next meetings

The next working group meeting is scheduled for the 30th November, and with the representatives of the affected countries in 28 March.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS AND ANIMAL AND HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

Biological Hazards & Animal Health and Welfare Unit (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 1ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AFRICAN SWINE FEVER -EPI 7

TELE- conference, 13 September 2022

(Agreed on 22 September 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Anette BOKLUND
Tomasz PODGORSKI
Karl STAHL
Timothée VERGNE
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Simona FORCELLA (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:
MESE Unit: José CORTIÑAS ABRAHANTES
iDATA: Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU
BIOHAW Unit: Lina MUR, Gabriele ZANCANARO

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The meeting concerned the Mandate received by the EC under article 31 of Regulation (EC) 178/2002 for scientific and technical assistance on African swine fever.

4.1. Presentation and discussion of the Mandate and the Terms of Reference

The Mandate and the Terms of Reference were presented to the WG. It was clarified that the Mandate was received by the EC in the context of article 31 of Regulation (EC) No. 178/2002. The outputs of this mandate will be nine Scientific Reports that will be produced from April 2023 until June 2028.

4.2. Interpretation of Terms of Reference

The Terms of Reference were discussed and it was agreed by the WG that two separate protocols will be developed considering that the two terms of reference provided by the requestor are going to be published in separate outputs, require different methodology and have different timelines.

The meeting, protocol and terms of reference discussed below referred exclusively to the first term of reference, for the development of annual descriptive epidemiological analysis of the spread and impact of ASF.

The data collection will cover the period from the last data collected in the previous epidemiological report until the 31 December and reports will be produced in calendar year basis. Exceptionally, the first year data will cover from September 2021 to December 2022, although the report will be focused on the calendar year 2022.

The countries included in the report will be those EU Member States and neighbouring countries affected by African swine fever in the period of analysis and sending data to EFSA through the Data Collection Framework following SIGMA standards. Previously affected countries that became free of the disease before that reporting period, will be excluded from the analysis.

The three mandate elements were discussed and specifications on how they will be addressed based on the WG interpretation of the mandate, were included in the protocol document.

4.3. Protocol

A first draft of the protocol for the TOR1 was shared with the WG before the meeting. Lina Mur presented the draft protocol, provided clarifications to the experts and asked their advice on certain points.

For the description of the surveillance activities in the affected countries, the WG agreed on including a first description of the surveillance activities carried out in the different countries, followed by a summary table with the numbers of samples analysed in the report period per type of surveillance (i.e. active and passive), animal species affected (domestic pigs and wild boar) and

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

diagnostic tests. A map and potential graphs will be developed to display the number of wild boar samples analysed in relation with the surface or wild boar abundance data.

The spatio-temporal dynamics will include a comprehensive assessment of the geographical spread and temporal patterns of the disease in the last reporting period. Maps will be used to visualise the spread of the disease, the surface of the areas affected by ASF will be analysed over time (and compared with the surface of the areas affected during the previous reported period) and a descriptive section will address the previously identified long-distance translocation events. The temporal dynamics will be assessed by epidemiological curves and seasonality plots by affected species. Network analysis will be used to estimate the speed of spread per country. Spatio-temporal clustering analyses will also be performed.

The impact of ASF in the affected countries will be assessed by summary tables and graphs including cumulative incidence and losses per country for the domestic pigs, and by analysing the evolution of wild boar abundance and hunting bag data for wild boar populations.

4.4. Structure of the report

A first draft of the report structure for the descriptive epidemiological analysis was shared with the WG before the meeting. Following the discussions during the meeting on the interpretation of the terms of reference and the protocol, the structure of the epidemiological assessment was rearranged to follow a more logical order and better understanding of the situation. First, a detailed description of the surveillance efforts done by affected countries for ASF detection will be performed to assess the disease monitoring. Secondly, the spatio-temporal dynamics of the disease will be analysed including spatial and temporal analysis and speed of infection assessment. Finally, the impact of the disease in the affected populations will be described, including the number of domestic pigs lost and the changes in the wild boar abundance data in affected countries.

5. Distribution of tasks

The protocol and report structure documents will be reviewed and modify based on the discussions during the meeting. The WG will review the next version of the documents and provide their inputs when required.

6. Next meeting(s)

The following meeting will be held on November 11 with the attendance of hearing experts from all ASF affected countries involved in the report. Another meeting will follow the 13th December with the working group members to finalise the protocol.