



# Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare

## Minutes of the 140<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting

**Held on 4-5 May 2022**

**EFSA, Parma, WEB MEETING<sup>1</sup>**

**(Agreed on 20/05/2022)**

### Participants

#### ■ Panel Members:

ALVAREZ Julio, BICOUT Dominique, CALISTRI Paolo, CANALI Elisabetta, DREWE Julian, GARIN-BASTUJI Bruno, GONZALES ROJAS Jose Luis, GORTAZAR SCHMIDT Christian, HERSKIN Mette, MICHEL Virginie, MIRANDA Miguel Angel, NIELSEN Søren Saxmose (Chair), PADALINO Barbara, PASQUALI Paolo, ROBERTS Helen, VELARDE Antonio, VILTROP Arvo

#### ■ European Commission:

CHALUS Thierry, HOLMES Rebecca, KLEMM Moritz, RALCHEV Stanislav, ZAFEIROPOULOU Kornilia

#### ■ EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: ANTONIOU Sotiria-Eleni, ASHE Sean, AZNAR Inma, BALDINELLI Francesca, BROGLIA Alessandro, CANDIANI Denise, DHOLLANDER Sofie, FABRIS Chiara, GEFFROY Mariana, GERVELMEYER Andrea, KOHNLE Lisa, LIEBANA-CRIADO Ernesto (HoU), LIMA Eliana, MUR Lina, ROJO GIMENO Cristina, OSWALDI Verena, VAN DER STEDE Yves, VITALI Marika, ZANCANARO Gabriele

#### ■ Hearing experts<sup>2</sup>: not applicable

#### ■ Observers: list enclosed as Annex 1

<sup>1</sup> All meetings were rescheduled to web meetings due to Covid-19

<sup>2</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the meeting participants. Apologies were received from Christoph Winckler and from Paolo Calistri on Day 2 (5/05/2022).

## 2. Presentation of the Guidelines for Observers

Rules and guidelines to follow the meeting were presented to observers.

## 3. Adoption of the agenda and Declarations of Interest

The agenda was adopted without changes.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting had been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 139<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting held on 16-17 March 2022, WEB

The minutes of the 139<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure and published on 1 April 2022.

## 5. Scientific outputs submitted for possible adoption and endorsement

### 5.1. Art 29. AHAW Panel guidance for Good Practice in Conducting Scientific Assessments in Animal Health using Modelling ([EFSA-Q-2020-00177](#))

The Panel discussed the comments made during the review of the draft guidance document and agreed on modifications of the text. The document was unanimously adopted.

## 6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

### 6.1. Art 29. Disease control measures category A diseases AHL | Assessment of prohibitions and risk mitigations for Cat. A diseases ([EFSA-Q-2022-00024](#))

The Panel discussed the comments made during the review of the draft Scientific Opinion and agreed on modifications of the text. For assessments that diverge from the current prohibitions in the Delegated Regulation or from the respective OIE codes, it was agreed to add the references on which the experts based their assessments to the document. The scientific opinion will be tabled for potential adoption at the plenary meeting of 29-30 June 2022.

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



## **6.2. Art 31. Scientific Report on Rabies ([EFSA-Q-2022-00159](#))**

The Scientific Report on rabies was presented to the Panel, and unresolved comments left by Panel experts were discussed. This report will be further reviewed by the three Panel members that took the role of external reviewers as well as by the WG members. After all comments are resolved the report will be presented for approval by EFSA and published with a deadline at the end of May.

## **6.3. Methodology for the development of welfare mandates in the context of Farm-to-Fork strategy & public consultation ([EFSA-Q-2021-00672](#))**

The Panel discussed the Scientific Opinion and the comments received during the review of the draft Opinion, including the comments and answers provided during the public consultation (14 Feb 2022 – 31 March 2022). The Panel agreed with the modifications proposed in the abstract, in Table 2 (Welfare Consequences), and in the conclusions. In the conclusions a paragraph was added allowing an update of the list of welfare consequences for future mandates as well as the inclusion of positive welfare consequences. The Scientific Opinion is planned for adoption in June 2022.

## **6.4. Art. 29. Scientific opinion concerning the protection of animals during transport in containers ([EFSA-Q-2020-00480](#))**

The Panel revised and discussed two separate documents on: i. Fitness for transport and ii. Restriction of movement.

For fitness for transport: the structure of the document was considered appropriate; the section on domestic birds needs a more detailed description of gait scores and related thresholds for considering the animal unfit for transport; for rabbits, the stage of gestation needs to be better justified.

For restriction of movement: the rabbit section needs to be better aligned with findings from the EFSA Opinion on rabbits of 2018 with view to floor surface and height of the cages. Also, the first attempt on uncertainty assessment was acknowledged, namely uncertainty is to be restricted to few key, mainly quantitative, conclusions and it was agreed to include a general conclusion stating that if no uncertainty level is reported around certain conclusions it's because there is no uncertainty (i.e. certainty 100%).

The overall Scientific Opinion is planned for adoption in June 2022.

## **6.5. Art. 29. Scientific opinion concerning the protection of animals during transport (Sheep and goats [EFSA-Q-2021-00433](#))**

The draft Opinion was presented describing the assessment structure and the transport practices that are addressed in the Opinion. The threshold for microclimatic conditions (temperature and humidity), space allowance (horizontal and vertical) and maximum journey times were emphasised in the opinion. General comments from the Panel were dealt with. The approach and conclusions to Fitness for transport were presented and discussed. The Opinion contains a list of conditions that signify a lack of fitness for transport. The threshold for late pregnancy was discussed with suggestions made as how to reach a recommendation, possibly using EFSA 2017. Reference has been made in various fora (guidelines emanating from stakeholder projects and governmental sources) that the last 10% of gestation should be used as the limit however further work needs to be done before a final conclusion can be reached.

The approach and conclusions relating to thermal recommendations were presented (identifying the upper threshold of the thermal comfort zone and the upper critical temperature).



The approach and conclusions for space allowance was presented using k-values from the Petherick equation recommended for sheep during transport. This was arrived at based on the functional needs related to space during transport (space to balance, rest, etc.) More work to assess the vertical space requirement is needed by the working group. Hunger/thirst and intake of feed/water: the working group has used behaviour (e.g. intake upon arrival – motivation and no access) and physiological proxies to assess hunger and thirst. Control Post: welfare consequences to be mitigated in the control post and preventive measures to feature in the overall recommendations. Further work on the resting periods is still outstanding.

#### **6.6. Art. 29. Scientific opinion concerning the protection of animals during transport (Cattle [EFSA-Q-2020-00481](#))**

The draft Opinion was presented, the structure and approach being the same as the sheep opinion. The comments received from the Panel members were addressed. The UCT for adult cattle and unweaned calves was given. A maximum journey time was recommended. Conclusions on minimum rest periods, pregnancy thresholds and vertical height is still outstanding. This opinion is to be adopted in June 2022.

#### **6.7. Art. 29. Scientific opinion concerning the protection of animals during transport (Pigs [EFSA-Q-2021-00434](#))**

The draft opinion was presented, the structure and approach again being the same as the sheep opinion. The comments received from the panel members were addressed. The UCT for various categories of pigs is identified. A maximum journey time is recommended along with a space allowance again give using the k value. Conclusions on minimum rest periods, pregnancy thresholds and vertical height still outstanding. This opinion is to be adopted in June 2022.

### **7. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission**

#### **7.1 Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission-Activities from other Panels**

A short feedback was provided by the Chair about the discussions during the last Scientific Committee meeting, where the 2022 AHAW work programme was presented.

### **8. Other topics for information and/or discussion**

N/A

### **9. Any other business**

Panel members were informed about two new mandates expected by the Animal Health team. One mandate will be a continuation of the activities currently carried out in relation to African Swine Fever. The second mandate expected is on Avian Influenza and the use of vaccination.



## 10. Q&A session for Observers

Only one question was received, concerning the expected date of publication of EFSA's opinions on pig welfare and welfare during transport which is foreseen by 30th June 2022: publication by approximately the 9<sup>th</sup> of August 2022 (28 working days after adoption according to EFSA's SOP). In addition, the Panel was informed about an experiment on the evaluation of animal welfare of cattle during sea transport by one of the observers working SEPAB, in partnership with the French national research institute (INRAE).

## Annex 1 – List of Observers via web-conference

Surname	Name	Country	Affiliation
Battaglia	Gabriele	Italy	Private sector
Bonerba	Elisabetta	Italy	University/public research institute
Bouscatel	Lucie	France	Private sector
Brusamonti	Linda	Italy	University/public research institute
Casella Colombeau	Livio	France	University/public research institute
Christiansen	Stine B.	Denmark	University/public research institute
Dahl-Pedersen	Kirstin	Denmark	University/public research institute
Daramola	Ebenezer	Nigeria	Private sector
De Santis	Marta	Italy	University/public research institute
Etoe	Florence	France	National authority
Fontanesi	Luca	Italy	University/public research institute
Galjot	Arnej	Slovenia	National authority
Grimstad	Julie	Norway	National authority
Inacio	Patrícia	Portugal	University/public research institute
Karamperi	Viktoria	Greece	Other
Karatzia	Maria	Greece	University/public research institute
Knežević	Dražen	Croatia	EFSA Panel/WG/Network
Kocina	Iveta	Latvia	University/public research institute
Liu	Yangfan	Denmark	University/public research institute
Mandel Briefer	Roi	Denmark	University/public research institute
Marcelino	Cátia	Portugal	University/public research institute
Mellegaard	Hilde	Norway	National authority
Messeri	Gianni	Italy	University/public research institute
Messeri	Alessandro	Italy	University/public research institute
Mijić	Pero	Croatia	University/public research institute
Mohamed	Khaled	Egypt	University/public research institute
Morelli	Daniela	Italy	University/public research institute



Nganyi	Laban	Kenya	University/public research institute
Nincakova	Simona	Czech Republic	EFSA Panel/WG/Network
Otten	Nina	Denmark	University/public research institute
Perez-Burgos	Andrea	Spain	University/public research institute
Popova	Maya	Bulgaria	University/public research institute
Rota Nodari	Sara	Italy	EFSA Panel/WG/Network
Sarubbi	Fiorella	Italy	University/public research institute
Scata'	Maria Carmela	Italy	University/public research institute
Trevisi	Erminio	Italy	University/public research institute
Varvella Vicente	Mauricio	Spain	Private sector
Venold	Fredrik	Norway	National authority
Von Eugen	Kaya	Netherlands	NGO