



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 11th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

Web, 19 September 2022

(Agreed on 23 September 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Rob Davies. John Threlfall joined for 1h post-meeting. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and provides regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Neieuwenhuyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports⁴ (European Parliament-EP- Mandate)

During this meeting, open comments in the opinion were closed, the changes on the Data gaps and research needs (Section 3.4) and answers to Tor3 were revised, and the summary and the abstracts were discussed. The draft scientific opinion will be presented for adoption at the BIOHAZ Plenary meeting of 28-29 September. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

5. Next meetings

No further meetings were planned.

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 10th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

Web, 14 September 2022

(Agreed on 15 September 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

John Threlfall

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Rob Davies and Ernesto Liébana. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and provides regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Nieuwenhunyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports⁴ (European Parliament-EP- Mandate)

During this meeting, the main discussions focused on the agreement of the Data gaps and research needs identified (Section 3.4), and on the subjective probability ranges included in the final conclusions for the uncertainties associated to the mitigations options (ToR2). Additionally, comments received from BIOHAZ Panel Members acting as reviewers were also discussed. Tasks were allocated. The draft scientific opinion will be presented for adoption at the BIOHAZ Plenary meeting of 28-29 September. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting of the WG will take place via Web on 19 September (WG11).

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 9th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

Parma, 23-24 August 2022

(Agreed on 30 August 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Luisa Peixe
 - Friederike Hilbert
 - Barbara Padalino
 - Hector Argüello
 - Wietske Dohmen
 - Chiara Magistrali
 - Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen
 - John Threlfall
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Not Applicable
- European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not applicable (see apologies)
- EFSA:
 - BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Kateryna Chuzhakina, Pietro Stella (23, 24 partially)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Rob Davies, Ernesto Liébana, Sean Ashe, Raquel García Fierro. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and provides regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Neieuwenhuyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports⁴ (European Parliament-EP- Mandate)

Contributions provided by the WG members to the different sections of the draft scientific opinion were presented. During this meeting, the main discussions focused on closing open points in risk factors (ToR1) and mitigation sections (and ToR2), the revision of the impact of the uncertainties in the conclusions of the mitigation section, and the update of the draft data gaps included in the data gaps and research needs section. The research needs will be accordingly adjusted for the next meeting. Other open comments along the opinion were also addressed. Tasks were allocated. The draft scientific opinion will be presented for adoption at the BIOHAZ Plenary meeting of 28-29 September. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

5. Next meetings

The next meetings of the WG will take place online on 14 and 19 of September (WG10, WG11).

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 8th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

Parma, 4 July 2022

(Agreed on 12 July 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra, , Ernesto Liébana (partially), Sean Ashe (partially), Raquel García Fierro (partially), Kateryna Chuzhakina (partially)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Rob Davies and Pietro Stella. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and provides regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Nieuwenhunyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports⁴ (European Parliament-EP- Mandate)

Contributions provided by the WG members to the different sections of the draft scientific opinion were presented. During this meeting, the main discussions focused on addressing the comments received by the BIOHAL Panel experts, the summarizing tables included in the risk factors and mitigation sections (developed to address ToR1 and ToR2), and the inclusion of the impact of the uncertainties in the conclusions. The different sections, specially data gaps and research needs will be further developed and discussed at the next meeting. Tasks were allocated. The draft scientific opinion will be presented for through reading at the BIOHAZ Plenary meeting of 13-14 July. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting of the WG will take place physically in Parma on 23-24 August (WG9).

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>



Further meetings are planned for the following dates: WG10: 19 September.

The number of meetings, dates and type (online vs. on site/hybrid) could be altered depending on the needs and the Covid situation.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 7th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

Parma, 7 June 2022

(Agreed on 20 June 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Rob Davies

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra, , Ernesto Liébana (partially), Raquel García Fierro (partially),
Kateryna Chuzhakina (partially)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Pietro Stella and Sean Ashe (EFSA staff). EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and provides regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Neieuwenhunyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports⁴ (European Parliament-EP- Mandate)

Contributions provided by the WG members to the different sections of the draft scientific opinion were presented. During this meeting, the main discussions focused on the summarizing tables included in the risk factors and mitigation sections (developed to address ToR1 and ToR2), the data gaps and research needs (ToR3), and the conclusions for those 3 sections. The different sections will be further developed and discussed at the next meeting. Tasks were allocated. The draft scientific opinion will be presented for first reading at the BIOHAZ Plenary meeting of 15-16 June. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting of the WG will take place via Web-conference on 4 July.

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>



Further meetings are planned for the following dates: WG8: 4 July; WG9: 24 August; WG10: 19 September.

The number of meetings, dates and type (online vs. on site/hybrid) could be altered depending on the needs and the Covid situation.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 6th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

Parma, 10 May 2022

(Agreed on 13 May 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Rob Davies

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella, Sean Ashe (partially), Ernesto Liébana (partially)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and will provide regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Neieuwenhuyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Additional information

EFSA staff in charge of the parallel EC Mandate on Transport and Animal Welfare (EFSA AHAW Panel), updated the WG on the progress of the draft scientific opinions that are being developed to address the mandate (deadline end June 2022).

4.2. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports⁴ (European Parliament-EP- Mandate)

The Chair of the WG informed the experts about the discussions hold at the 157 BIOHAZ Panel meeting hold on 3-4 May. Contributions provided by the WG members to the different sections of the draft scientific opinion were presented. During this meeting, the main discussions focused on the sections on risk factors (ToR2) and mitigations (ToR3). The different sections will be further developed and discussed at the next meeting. Tasks were allocated. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>



5. Next meetings

The next meeting of the WG will take place via Web-conference on 7 June.

Further meetings are planned for the following dates: WG8: 4 July; WG9: 24 August; WG10: 19 September.

The number of meetings, dates and type (online vs. on site/hybrid) could be altered depending on the needs and the Covid situation.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 5th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

WEB-conference, 08 April 2022

(Agreed on 13 April 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Rob Davies

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Sean Ashe (partially) and Pietro Stella (partially)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and will provide regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Neieuwenhuyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Additional information

EFSA staff in charge of the parallel EC Mandate on Transport and Animal Welfare (EFSA AHAW Panel), updated the WG on the progress of the draft scientific opinions that are being developed to address the mandate (deadline end June 2022).

4.2. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports⁴ (European Parliament-EP- Mandate)

The WG was informed that the draft protocol⁵ was approved by the BIOHAZ Panel at their Plenary hold on 16-17 March. Contributions provided by the WG members to the different sections of the draft scientific opinion were presented. During this meeting, the main discussions focused on the sections on risk factors (term of reference 2, ToR2) and mitigations (ToR3) which had been restructured (in order to avoid duplications, they will not be presented by animal species but grouped). The new structures were agreed. The different sections will be further developed and discussed at the next meeting. Tasks were allocated. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>

⁵ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2020.EN-1843>



5. Next meetings

The next meeting of the WG will take place physically on 10 May in Parma (in case of need, it will be a hybrid meeting).

Further meetings are planned for the following dates: WG7: 7 June; WG8: 4 July; WG9: 24 August; WG10: 19 September.

The number of meetings, dates and type (online vs. on site/hybrid) could be altered depending on the needs and the Covid situation.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

WEB-conference, 08 March 2022

(Agreed on 16 March 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Rob Davies

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Sean Ashe (partially), Raquel García Fierro (partially), Ernesto Liébana (partially) and Pietro Stella

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and will provide regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Neieuwenhunyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Additional information

EFSA staff in charge of the parallel EC Mandate on Transport and Animal Welfare (EFSA AHAW Panel), updated the WG on the progress of the draft scientific opinions that are being developed to address the mandate.

4.2. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports⁴ (European Parliament-EP- Mandate)

With regards to the EP Mandate, the WG agreed on the latest version of the draft protocol⁵, updated to comply with the requests of the BIOHAZ Panel reviewers. This draft protocol version will be presented for approval to the next BIOHAZ Plenary (16-17 March). Contributions provided by the WG members to the different sections of the draft scientific opinion, considering the three main food-producing animal species broilers, pigs and cattle, were discussed. During this meeting, the main discussions focused on the section on risk factors (term of reference 2) and its reorganization. Contributions received for the mitigation options section and introduction were also discussed. The

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>

⁵ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2020.EN-1843>



different sections will be further developed and discussed at the next meeting. Tasks were allocated. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting of the WG will take place on 8 April (web meeting)

Further meetings are planned for the following dates: WG6: 10 May (physical in Parma); WG7: 7 June; WG8: 4 July; WG9: 24 August; WG10: 19 September.

The number of meetings and dates could be altered depending on the needs. If the Covid situation allows, the celebration of additional meetings physically in Parma will be evaluated.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS AND ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

WEB-conference, 01 February 2022

(Agreed on 4 February 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Rob Davies

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOAHAW Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella (partially).

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Ernesto Liébana and Sean Ash (EFSA). EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and will provide regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Neieuwenhunyze (EP administrative staff) act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) follows the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports the food chain⁴

The Chair informed the WG on the main discussion points raised by the BIOHAZ Panel at their Plenary hold on 26 January on the draft protocol. Accordingly, the WG revised the interpretation of the ToRs, clarifying the bacteria included as a focus of the opinion, and agreed on the changes proposed on the assessment questions and sub-assessment questions to be addressed in line with the "EFSA Technical Report Draft framework for protocol development for EFSA's scientific assessments"⁵. Contributions provided by the WG members to the different sections of the draft scientific opinion, considering the three main food-producing animal species broilers, pigs and cattle, were discussed and will be further developed. Main discussions focused on the introduction section on animal transport and antimicrobial resistance, and the reorganization of risk factors section. Contributions for the mitigation options section will be further developed and will be discussed at the next meeting. Tasks were allocated. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>

⁵ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2020.EN-1843>



5. Next meetings

The next meeting of the WG will take place on 8 March.

Further meetings are planned for the following dates: WG5: 8 April; WG6: 10 May; WG7: 7 June; WG8: 4 July; WG9: 24 August; WG10: 19 September.

The number of meetings and dates could be altered depending on the needs. If the Covid situation allows, the celebration of any of those meetings physically in Parma will be evaluated.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

WEB-conference, 20 December 2021

(Agreed on 21 December 2021)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe
Rob Davies
Friederike Hilbert
Barbara Padalino
Hector Argüello
Wietske Dohmen
Chiara Magistrali
Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pilar García-Vello (trainee at the ED Office), Frank Boelaert (Agenda point 3)

ALPHA Unit: Sean Ashe

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and will provide regularly updates to the ENVI Committee on the development of the scientific opinion. Natalia Papasteriadou and Ellen Van Neieuwenhunyze (EP administrative staff) will act as EP contact points but no active EP participation at the WG is expected unless required. The European Commission (EC) will follow the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Presentations on supplementary information

Information included in the published European Union One Health 2020 Zoonoses Report (EFSA and ECDC, 2021 (<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/6971>) and on other possible zoonoses data sources available at EFSA that could be useful to the WG was presented by Frank Boelaert (EFSA scientific officer in charge).

An update on relevant information for the WG collected by the WG on Animal transport and Welfare (e.g. animal transport statistics, welfare consequences considered to address the parallel EC Mandate allocated to the AHAW Panel) was presented by Sean Ash (EFSA scientific officer in charge).

Discussions followed both presentations.

4.2. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports the food chain⁴

The WG further discussed and agreed on the interpretation of the ToRs and continued with the protocol development following the "EFSA Technical Report Draft framework for protocol development for

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>

EFSA's scientific assessments"⁵. Accordingly, the assessment questions, and when applicable, sub-assessment questions that will be answered, as well as the Methodology that will be used (mainly literature searches, data from public reports/data bases if suitable, and expert knowledge) were agreed. Further literature searches performed by EFSA Secretariat were presented and the way to maintain the literature repository was discussed. Contributions provided by the WG members to the different sections of the draft scientific opinion (general information on animal transport, possible sources of antimicrobial resistance bacteria and genes, possible risk factors and mitigation options) considering the three main food-producing animal species broilers, pigs and cattle, had been revised by the experts and will be further developed. Tasks were allocated. The deadline for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel is 30 September 2022.

5. Next meetings

The third meeting (WG3) of the *ad hoc* WG is planned for 1 February 2021 (Web-meeting).

Further Web meetings are planned for the following dates: WG4: 8 March; WG5: 6 April; WG6: 10 May; WG7: 7 June; WG8: 4 July; WG9: 24 August; WG10: 19 September.

The number of meetings and dates could be altered depending on the needs. If the Covid situation allows, the celebration of any of those meetings physically in Parma will be evaluated.

⁵<https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2020.EN-1843>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 1st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TRANSMISSION OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) DURING ANIMAL TRANSPORTS

(AMR Animal Transport)

WEB-conference, 17 November 2021

(Agreed on 24 November 2021)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Luisa Peixe

Rob Davies

Friederike Hilbert

Barbara Padalino

Hector Argüello

Wietske Dohmen

Chiara Magistrali

Bernd-Alois Tenhaguen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission, European Parliament and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable yet (see apologies)

■ EFSA:

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella, Ernesto Liébana, Pilar García-Vello (trainee at the ED Office)

ALPHA Unit: Sean Ashe

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. EFSA is in liaison with the European Parliament and will provide regularly updates on the development of the scientific opinion. The European Commission (EC) will follow the development of the Scientific Opinion as an observer and will participate at the meetings when required by EFSA.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups (WG) members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Introduction to the EFSA Process, WG membership, administrative issues and the digital collaboration platform

EFSA introduced the process for delivering scientific opinions, the role of the WG members and provided information on administrative issues for the experts.

EFSA also introduced the digital collaborative platform which will be used for communication, co-authoring documents, and sharing relevant literature and supporting materials.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Transmission of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) during animal transports the food chain⁴

The Mandate was received from the European Parliament and was allocated to the EFSA BIOHAZ Panel. The work will be done in close collaboration with the EFSA AHAW Panel which is currently working on a parallel EC Mandate concerning the protection of terrestrial animals during transport (focus on welfare). The BIOHAZ scientific opinion shall be adopted by 30 September 2020. The development of the opinion will be closely followed by the European Commission as an observer.

During the meeting, the background and Terms of Reference (ToR) of the Mandate were presented. The chair of the WG and EFSA secretariat in charge of the Mandate (BIOCONTAM Unit) provided additional background information. EFSA Secretariat from the ALPHA Unit presented the parallel AHAW

² https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2021-00435>

Mandate and discussions followed this presentation. The need to develop a protocol and perform uncertainty assessment according to the “EFSA Technical Report Draft framework” for protocol development for EFSA’s scientific assessments⁵ and “EFSA Scientific Committee’s Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments”⁶, respectively, was indicated. The WG initiated the discussion on the interpretation of the ToRs, which were clarified by the WG chair and EFSA staff and will continue with this discussion to agree on a common understanding in the next meeting. The preliminary table of contents was presented, and the structure and main sections were agreed. EFSA Secretariat presented the steps needed to produce the draft protocol for the current assessment and provided an example to be further developed by the WG. Literature searches already performed by EFSA Secretariat and structure of the literature repository were presented. WG experts were appointed to further develop each of the sections of the draft opinion, section leaders were identified, and tasks were allocated.

Alternatives for the dates of the 2022 WG meetings were shared with the WG and feedback from the experts will be provided to EFSA Secretariat after the meeting.

6. Next meetings

The second meeting of the *ad hoc* WG is 20 December (Web-meeting). The dates for the planned 2022 meetings will be agreed in the next weeks.

⁵<https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2020.EN-1843>

⁶ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.5123>