



Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare

Minutes of the 133rd Plenary meeting

Held on 23-24 June 2021

EFSA, Parma, WEBMEETING¹

(Agreed on 8 July 2021)²

Participants

■ Panel Members:

ALVAREZ Julio, BICOUT Dominique, CALISTRI Paolo, CANALI Elisabetta, DREWE Julian, GARIN-BASTUJI Bruno, GONZALES ROJAS Jose Luis, GORTAZAR SCHMIDT Christian, HERSKIN Mette, MICHEL Virginie, MIRANDA Miguel Angel, NIELSEN Søren Saxmose (Chair), PADALINO Barbara, PASQUALI Paolo, ROBERTS Helen, SIHVONEN Liisa, SPOOLDER Hans, STAHL Karl, VELARDE Antonio, VILTROP Arvo, WINCKLER Christoph

- **European Commission:** KUSTER Laszlo (Topics 5.5 and 6.1), LOGAR Barbara (Topics 5.1,5.2,5.3,6.2 and 6.3); MASSOT-BERNA Cristina (Topics 5.1,5.2,5.3,6.1,6.2 and 6.3), VORNHAGEN Kirsten (Topics 7.1); CAMARA Ewa (Topic 6.4), FUESSEL Alf-Eckbert (Topic 6.4), Denis SIMONIN (Topics 6.5, 6.6 and 7.2) Rebecca HOLMES (Topics 7.1 and 7.2), Lucie CARROUEE (Topics 7.1,7.2 and 9.2)

■ EFSA:

ALPHA UNIT: Antoniou Sotiria-Eleni, Ashe Sean, Aznar Inma, Baldinelli Francesca, Broglia Alessandro, Candiani Denise, Capelli Martina, Carfagnini Roberta, Chinchio Eleonora, Dhollander Sofie, Fabris Chiara, Gervelmeyer Andrea, Križ Nik (HoU), Lima Eliana, Lombardo Ludovico, Oswaldi Verena, Rapagna Cristina, Van der Stede Yves, Veggeland Maria, Zancanaro Gabriele

AMU UNIT: MOSBACH-SCHULZ Olaf

- **Hearing experts³:** not applicable

- **Observers:** not applicable

¹ All meetings were rescheduled to web meetings due to Covid-19

² Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the meeting participants. Apologies were received from Mette Herskin (24 June) and Helen Roberts (24 June 2021).

2. Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

The chair announced that between last Plenary meeting (5&6 May 2021) and the current one there were two Scientific opinions adopted via written procedure:

- Adoption on 19 May 2021: Art. 29 - Scientific opinion for listing and categorisation of transmissible animal diseases caused by bacteria resistant to antimicrobials in the framework of the animal health law – Cats & Dogs
- Adoption on 11 June 2021: Art. 29 - Scientific opinion for listing and categorisation of transmissible animal diseases caused by bacteria resistant to antimicrobials in the framework of the animal health law – Horses

3. Declarations of Interest Scientific Panel Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting had been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 132nd Plenary meeting held on 5-6 May 2021, WEB

The minutes of the 132nd Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 26 May 2021.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

5.1. Art. 29 –Scientific opinion on African Swine Fever: GAP – Wild Boar (EFSA-Q-2020-00431)

The panel discussed thoroughly the proposals made by the working group to address the comments provided by Panel members. The final wording was agreed and the document was adopted. The Panel adopted unanimously the Scientific Opinion. The Opinion will be prepared for publication assuring that the agreed changes are implemented throughout the document

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5.2. Art. 29 – Disease control measures category A diseases AHL – Peste de Petits Ruminants (EFSA-Q-2020-00798)

The panel discussed thoroughly the proposals made by the working group to address the comments provided by Panel members. The final wording was agreed and the document was adopted. The Panel adopted unanimously the Scientific Opinion. The opinion will be prepared for publication assuring that the agreed changes are implemented throughout the document

5.3. Art. 29 - Disease control measures category A diseases AHL – Classical Swine Fever (EFSA-Q-2020-00797)

The panel discussed thoroughly the proposals made by the working group to address the comments provided by Panel members. The final wording was agreed and the document was adopted. The Panel adopted unanimously the Scientific Opinion. The opinion will be prepared for publication assuring that the agreed changes are implemented throughout the document

5.4. Art. 29 - Scientific opinion for listing and categorisation of transmissible animal diseases caused by bacteria resistant to antimicrobials in the framework of the animal health law – Pigs

The panel discussed thoroughly the proposals made by the working group to address the comments provided by Panel members. The final wording was agreed and the document was adopted. The Panel adopted unanimously the Scientific Opinion. The opinion will be prepared for publication assuring that the agreed changes are implemented throughout the document.

5.5. Art. 29 – endorsement of SO on AMR in feed residues (joint with BIOHAZ, endorsement of sections about “Main use” of drugs, Table 3, Table 5)

AHAW Panel endorsed the section on main use of the AMR in feed residues opinion, which will be adopted by the BIOHAZ Panel.

5.6. Art.31 - endorsement of Report EU Surveillance on Avian Influenza 2020 data - (EFSA-Q-2021-00340)

AHAW Panel endorsed the EU surveillance report on Avian Influenza summarising the data of 2020.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion (pre-adoption)

6.1. Art. 29 – Scientific opinion for listing and categorisation of transmissible animal diseases caused by bacteria resistant to antimicrobials in the framework of the animal health law – Poultry

The draft opinion, already at an advanced stage, was thoroughly discussed. It was proposed and



suggested to split the figures according to the type of poultry (broilers, laying hens, mixed-unknown). The opinion is tabled for written adoption in July 2021.

6.2. Art. 29 – Disease control measures category A diseases AHL – Sheep and Goat Pox (EFSA-Q-2020-00799)

The draft opinion, already at an advanced stage, was thoroughly discussed. It was proposed and suggested to map curves and parameters. The discussion brought useful input for the working group. During the summer deep reviewers (tbc) will revise the draft. The opinion is tabled for adoption at the next Plenary meeting in September 2021.

6.3. Art. 29 – Disease control measures category A diseases AHL – Newcastle Disease (EFSA-Q-2020-00800)

A number of issues related to methodology and parameterisation of the NCD model were previously shared with the Panel members and were thoroughly discussed. Deep reviewers for this scientific opinion were appointed: Soren Saxmose Nielsen and José Gonzales. The opinion will be shared once more with the Panel Members over the next coming summer months and is tabled for adoption at the next Plenary meeting in September 2021.

6.4. Art. 29 – Equine Herpes Virus 1 (EHV-1) – Factsheet (EFSA-Q-2021-00183)

The draft factsheet, already at an advanced stage, was thoroughly discussed. It was proposed and suggested to test a new methodology proposed by Dominique Bicout that allows the expression of the certainty (Probabilities) for the judgements made by the experts for each assessment question. The method will be piloted using the example of paratuberculosis. The opinion is tabled for adoption at the next Plenary meeting in September.

6.5. Art. 29- Scientific Opinion on slaughter of small ruminants (EFSA-Q-2018-00721)

The draft opinion, already at an advanced stage, was thoroughly discussed. It was proposed that a consistent terminology is applied throughout the slaughter opinions and the new opinions on Farm to Fork, especially that on transport that addresses similar topics and issues (e.g. use the word "lorry" instead of "truck" and use it consistently).

6.6. Update on methodology to apply for EKE in F2F mandates

The methodology to address the specific scenarios, for which EC requested EFSA to define quantitative (or qualitative) thresholds, was tested with a first exercise on space allowance for calves. The EC feedback and the task force proposal of F2F WG was discussed.

7. New Mandates

7.1. Art. 29 - Request for a scientific opinion concerning the protection of farmed ducks, geese and quail related to the keeping in farming systems

Kirsten Vornhagen presented the new mandate on the protection of farmed ducks, geese and quail related to the keeping in farming systems.



The mandate is meant to focus on the impact of cage -systems, and it covers caged housing as well as systems alternative to cages. The TORs were presented and discussed with the panel members. The request is about animals kept for the production of meat (including foie gras) and eggs, and breeding animals.

EC also clarified what is outside the remit of the mandate (i.e the process of collecting feathers and downs, the process of force-feeding for fatty liver production, the transport and the killing of the animals). Panel members raised specific questions and requests for clarifications. EC provided all requested information; in particular Kirsten Vornhagen clarified that the need of the EC is to know more about alternatives to cages; therefore, the request refers to all animals addressed by the mandate, thus also those currently farmed in non-cage systems (e.g. ducks kept for meat production should be looked at also for the period when they are not force-fed and when kept in non-cage systems).

The deadline for this mandate is March 2023.

The chair requested the panel members to volunteer for being chair or member of the WG.

7.2. Art. 29 - Request for a scientific opinion concerning the protection of dairy cows

Denis Simonin presented the EC needs for the new mandate highlighting the need of defining welfare consequences and animal-based measures, hazards and routine collected data.

C. Winckler and panel members proposed to reword the dairy cattle husbandry system categories to align them with current practice and to define adult cattle if possible. Panel members and EFSA staff raised specific questions and requests for clarification; EC provided all requested information through a deep discussion.

EFSA will provide the feedback on the draft mandate to the EC.

The chair requested the panel members to volunteer for chair of the WG and/or member of the WG.

8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission-Activities from other Panels

Not applicable

9. Any other business

9.1. Election of Chair and vice chairs of AHAW panel

Election of the AHAW Panel Chair and two Vice-chairs were carried out according to the Decision of the EFSA Management Board concerning the establishment and operations of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and of their Working Groups (<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2021-02/expertselection.pdf>.)

Candidates were communicated before voting: Candidates were Soren Saxmose Nielsen (Chair), Virginie Michel (Vice-Chair) and Miguel Angel Miranda (Vice-Chair). All Panel Members present agreed to waive the secrecy of the voting after request by the panel coordinator. The voting was done by calling off 'yes' 'no'.



Soren Nielsen was unanimously elected as AHAW Panel Chair and Virginie Michel and Miguel Angel Miranda Chueca were unanimously elected as AHAW Panel Vice-chairs.

9.2. Review of Working group for AHAW panel

AHAW Panel Coordinator presented the current working groups.

The Panel confirmed the need for most of the currently existing Working Groups <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/scientific-committee-and-panels/ahaw> in order to assist the Panel in undertaking all necessary preparatory tasks in relation to draft scientific outputs falling under its remit, including the current composition and chairmanship.

- WG AMR-Animal Health Law
- WG Control measures Cat. A diseases-Animal Health Law
- WG Equine herpesvirus-1
- WG on African Swine Fever
- WG on Avian Influenza
- WG on SARS-Cov-2 monitoring mink
- WG Welfare at slaughter and killing
- WG Welfare FarmToFork
- WG Update on AHAW Guidance documents
- WG Early indicators on syndromic surveillance project

The Panel agreed to close the SWG on Lumpy skin disease.

9.3. Toll gates in RA process

AHAW Panel Coordinator introduced the tollgates to AHAW Panel members. The tollgates consist of formal quality checks of the documents (Scientific Opinions, Scientific Reports, etc.) produced within EFSA. Three tollgates/milestones are defined: protocol development, ongoing draft integration and ongoing draft finalisation. Tollgates have to be implemented within the new risk assessment process while implementing the new transparency regulation.

9.4. Wrap up and schedule of next Panel meetings in 2021

AHAW Panel Coordinator summarised achievements and next steps with Plenary meeting in September and later in the year.

9.5. Farewell

The Panel Chair wished a good summer break to all attendees and together with ALPHA HoU thanked Liisa Shivonen who resigned from the AHAW panel.