



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS AND ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 14 Jan 2022

(Agreed on 18 Jan 2022)¹

Participants

- WG Members: Andrea Carvelli, Romain Paillot
- Hearing expert: Stephane Pronost, Ann Cullinane, Soeren Nielsen
- EFSA BIOHAW unit: Alessandro Broglia, Lisa Kohnle

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion points

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

The draft report has been discussed, the main points discussed are as follows:

- The title has been changed and approved
- Any strain of EHV-1 can give respiratory/neurological/abortion disease: to skip mention of virus strain as factors, and to include housing
- Figures from FEI have been revised, reference to be updated (Ann)
- Differences between outbreak magnitude and consequent geographical spread was discussed; importance of early diagnosis to prevent the latter;
- Diagnostic test Se and Sp: values of Sp reported by Perkins et al., 2008 is too low >> virus neutralisation is not gold standard anymore, thus the determination of specificity is out of date, need of new reference/values, or skip to mention.
- Phylogeny to be used for epidemiological investigations
- Discussion about what should health certificates contain: decision to include 21 days no cases on the premise, absence of clinical signs, vaccination status
- To encourage use of vaccination but explain limitations for preventing neurological disease
- Discussion about role of semen: no evidence that semen is epidemiologically relevant.

5. Timeline and action points

What	Who	By when
Draft report discussed at AHAW Plenary on 19 Jan		19 Jan
Circulate draft report for last check	Alessandro	21 Jan
Replies from WG	All	31 Jan
Only in case major issues will pop up: a further meeting can be scheduled	All	tbc



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

In the Annual Declaration of Interest filled by Dr. Romain Paillot the following interests have been declared: he worked for Zoetis until September 2020, and tendered occasional consultancy to Zoetis from January 2020 to November 2020, which was in accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted according to Article 21 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.

Pursuant to Article 21(6) of the above-mentioned Decision, the concerned expert was allowed to take part in the discussion and drafting phase of the EFSA Scientific Opinion regarding EHV-1, and has not been allowed to be, or act as, a chairman, a vice-chairman or rapporteur of the Working Group.

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 16 November 2021

(Agreed on 19 Nov 2021)¹

Participants

- WG Members: Andrea Carvelli, Romain Paillot
- Hearing expert: Stephane Pronost, Ann Cullinane, Soeren Nielsen
- EFSA ALPHA unit: Alessandro Broglia, Lisa Kohnle

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion points

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

The further work on EHV-1 has been explained by EFSA staff. An additional report should be produced by March 2022 to cover the point 1, 2, 3 below.

Most information is already contained in the [Factsheet \(FS\)](#): the relevant aspects will be extracted and additional information and references will be added to better explain.

Concerning the 3 major point, the following has been discussed:

1. the potential of EHV-1, notably its neurotropic variant, to affect equine animals in the Union

- to be referred mainly to the section on morbidity of the FS (the disease already largely present in EU) and to the box about Valencia outbreak;
- The fatality in Valencia outbreak did not differ hugely from other outbreaks observed in Europe (number of cases are now available in the abstract by Stephane, information to be added by Romain in section about "case-morbidity rate" and box about Valencia outbreak – lines 546-570, see comment in draft FS). The outbreak was not caused by the so called neuropathic strains.
- Neurological forms depend on virus, host characteristics, management/environment. Neurological forms without the mutation have been also observed, there is still a lot of uncertainty around the development of the neurological form.
- References to be considered: paper on Emerging Disease by Stephane and new manuscript to be submitted by Stephane.

2. the performance of the available diagnostic methods for the detection of EHV-1, including its neurotropic single point mutations:

- The information about this aspect is mainly contained in the FS in section d.1
- For **detection of clinical cases**: to reinforce the info in FS, sample matrix and test of choice is naso-pharyngeal , nasal swab, and PCR , respectively.
 - nasal swabs vs. naso-pharyngeal swabs: no controlled trials available -> more details on the length etc. of swab sticks could be provided. If inconclusive, seroconversion may help. The use of paired blood samples was discussed.
 - Important point is about detection of infectious animals vs. ones with clinical signs. There may be infectious animals that have not clinical signs. Furthermore, some infectious animals can be PCR pos. due to residual viral particles – thus, they are not shedding infectious virus). There are also animals that are intermittently positive. So PCR on naso-pharyngeal swab is performed with the aim of detecting shedders.
 - Lab confirmation is required with clinical suspicions due to differential diagnoses such as WNV and other respiratory/neurological pathogens,
- For **detection of latent infection** there is no test, important to clearly state this.
- For **detection of single point mutation**: some labs use the point mutation as diagnostic tool, e.g. in US, but this should not be the first step for virus detection, since some strains has not that point mutation and an initial step including viral detection is required. Still this diagnostic tool for point mutation may be helpful for epidemiological purposes

- Refs to be provided by Stephane/Ann to highlight these aspects

3. possible methods and feasible risk mitigation measures to ensure safe international and EU trade in equine animals and their germinal products, including movement restrictions.

- The information about this aspect is contained in the FS in section d. The measures to apply at horse events are listed in section d 4.1
- Trade is here meant as any movement of horses.
- The measures for safe trade in order of importance include:
- Biosecurity (this is the most important measure for safe movement):
 - health certificate 48 h before movement
 - isolation if clinical signs are detected
 - disinfection premises, transport
 - quarantine at arrival in the new herd
 - segregation of visiting horse from resident horse populations, especially pregnant mares
- Pre-movement testing: this may be useful in some circumstances, e.g. in case of suspicion in the area, in case of alert in the country or region:
 - PCR by naso-pharyngeal/nasal swabs would be the test of choice
 - The alert would be based on indications of health authorities or equestrian/sport/race/breeders organisations, which may ask for pre movement- test;
 - EHV infection is not notifiable in all MSs but no movements should be allowed during outbreaks, and for 21 days after.
- Vaccination: could be compulsory for competition horses, but there is no evidence that vaccine can protect against neurological forms, this is still controversial. So vaccination only does not guarantee safe movement.
- mitigation measure to ensure safe trade for different categories of horses:
 - Competition horses: daily fever monitoring during events can be important for early detection and then followed by lab test on those with fever for confirmation. Well ventilated premises are also important. Need of available lab to process samples quickly, with recognised methods. Need of isolation facilities, best would be off site facilities.
 - Different geographical level of competitions: international events can be more at risk due to horses coming from different countries and back, than national or regional events, although more resources may be available at international events for disease prevention and control.
 - Industry is cooperative in controlling the disease, since can jeopardise the sector
 - Public sales, gatherings, fairs: this should be handled the same as competition events , vaccination recommended for pregnant mares.

- Breeding horses: vaccination recommended in mares, and isolation of foaling mares during outbreaks.
- Meat horses: outbreak standstill is important, import can be followed by fattening periods for weeks or months, they are not slaughtered immediately, so can be treated as live animals.
- about role and trade of germinal product, e.g. semen: there is no clear info available on that, one reference is listed in the FS.

5. Timeline and action points

What	Who	By when
Provide references related to point 1-3 as mentioned above	Stephane, Ann, Romain	30 Nov
To add information about morbidity as indicated in the FS in the side comments	Romain	6 Dec
Preparing draft report with extracted information	Alessandro	20 December
Revision of the draft report (a further meeting can be scheduled in January/February)	All	10 January 2022



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

In the Annual Declaration of Interest filled by Dr. Romain Paillot the following interests have been declared: he k Ug`Ya d`cmYX`Vm @56vC until September 2020, and tendered occasional consultancy to Zoetis from January 2020 to November 2020, which VcbgHh HY`U` 7cbZ]MfcZ -bHfYghf7c-L`k Jh H`Y a UbXUH` cZH`Y`9: G5 K cf_]b[; fci d`in hand" -b accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted according to Article 21 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.

Pursuant to Article 21(6) of the above-mentioned Decision, the concerned expert was allowed to take part in the discussion and drafting phase of the EFSA Scientific Opinion regarding EHV-1, and has not been allowed to be, or act as, a chairman, a vice-chairman or rapporteur of the Working Group.

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 27 August 2021

(Agreed on 27 August 2021)¹

Participants

- Hearing expert: Stephane Pronost

- EFSA ALPHA unit:
 - Alessandro Broglia

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4.1. Discussion on the draft factsheet

The comments given by the expert on the factsheet were discussed, specifically those about the impact of the disease on animal health and economy and how much the disease would deserve to be controlled.

The opinion from the expert on what type of control should be done on EHV-1 was discussed, testing should be focused on risk base approach on horses travelling to other countries and then back (equine competitions).



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 20 August 2021

(Agreed on 20 August 2021)¹

Participants

- Hearing expert: Stephane Pronost

- EFSA ALPHA unit:
 - Alessandro Broglia

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4.1. Comments on the factsheet

The comments done by the expert on the factsheet were discussed, in particular those about the impact of the disease on animal health and economy and how much the disease would deserve to be controlled .

The opinion of the expert about what kind of control should be done on EHV-1 was discussed, testing should be focused on risk base approach on horses that are moved to other countries and back (equine competitions).



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 14th July 2021

(Agreed on 14th July 2021)¹

Participants

- Hearing expert: Ann Cullinane

- EFSA ALPHA unit:
 - Alessandro Broglia

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4.1. Comments on the factsheet

The comments done by the expert on the factsheet were discussed, in particular those about the impact of the disease on animal health and economy and how much the disease would deserve to be controlled .



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 4th June 2021

(Agreed on 4th June 2021)¹

Participants

- WG member: Andrea Carvelli
- Hearing expert:² Romain Paillot

- EFSA ALPHA unit:
 - Alessandro Broglia

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Revision of the factsheet

The draft factsheet was revised focusing on quantification of measures of spread of the disease (morbidity and case fatality) and on the impact on health and economy.

5. Timeline and next steps

The agreed proposal is:

- Revision of the factsheet by reviewers and Panel by 20th June (revision on going visible in Teams)
- Addressing comments by reviewers by 30 June
- Second revision by 10 July
- Finalisation of the factsheet by 15 July



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 27 May 2021

(Agreed on 27 May 2021)¹

Participants

- WG member: Andrea Carvelli
- Hearing expert:²
 - Romain Paillot
- EFSA ALPHA unit:
 - Alessandro Broglia

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Revision of the factsheet

- Major comments: focus on EU situation and give quantitative/numerical indications
- For economic impact: to try to quantify losses by calculating number of lost horses/abortions due to the disease

5. Timeline and next steps

The agreed proposal is:

- First complete draft of the factsheet: 3rd June
- Revision of the factsheet by reviewers and Panel by 20th June (revision on going visible in Teams)
- Addressing comments by reviewers by 30th June
- Second revision by 10 July
- Finalisation of the factsheet by 15 July

6. Next meetings

Next meetings are scheduled on:

- Fri 4 June



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 14 May 2021

(Agreed on 14 May 2021)¹

Participants

- Hearing expert:²
 - Romain Paillot

- EFSA ALPHA unit:
 - Alessandro Broglia

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion on how to compile the factsheet

- Introduction: the mandate on EHV-1 and AHL work was explained by EFSA staff
- Explanation of the art. 7 criteria: the factsheet template was discussed, example of filling parameters was presented
- Collaboration between WG members: possible ways of collaborating between the WG members were discussed

5. Timeline and next steps

The agreed proposal is:

- First complete draft of the factsheet: 3rd June
- Revision of the factsheet by reviewers and Panel by 20th June (revision on going visible in Teams)
- Addressing comments by reviewers by 30th June
- Second revision by 10 July
- Finalisation of the factsheet by 15 July

6. Next meetings

Next meetings are scheduled on:

- Wed 26 May
- Fri 4 June



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON EHV-1

TELE-conference, 12 May 2021

(Agreed on 12 May 2021)¹

Participants

- Working Group Members:²
 - Andrea Carvelli

- EFSA ALPHA unit:
 - Alessandro Broglia

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Participants were welcome, no apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion on how to compile the factsheet

- Introduction: the mandate on EHV-1 and AHL work was explained by EFSA staff
- Explanation of the art. 7 criteria: the factsheet template was discussed, example of filling parameters was presented
- Collaboration between WG members: possible ways of collaborating between the WG members were discussed

5. Timeline and next steps

The agreed proposal is:

- First complete draft of the factsheet: 3rd June
- Revision of the factsheet by reviewers and Panel by 20th June (revision on going visible in Teams)
- Addressing comments by reviewers by 30th June
- Second revision by 10 July
- Finalisation of the factsheet by 15 July

6. Next meeting

Next meetings are scheduled on:

- Wed 26 May
- Fri 4 June