

Inaugural meeting of **EFSA's Stakeholder Forum** 30-31 May 2017

Table of contents

DAY 1	4
Morning plenary session.....	4
Afternoon workshops	4
Workshop 1: Quality data for risk assessment: What EFSA does with it and the role of stakeholders.	5
Workshop 2: Usability of EFSA's outputs and clear communications: How EFSA presents and explains its science.....	6
Workshop 3: Transparency and open data in risk assessment.....	6
DAY 2	7
Plenary session	7
Appendix A.....	9
Appendix B.....	12

Introduction

Stakeholders have been contributing to the work of the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) since the Authority was established in 2002. Now, as part of its five-year strategy, EFSA is committed to prioritising public and stakeholder involvement in the process of risk assessment. The Stakeholder Forum is one of the permanent engagement mechanisms that enable all registered stakeholders to provide recommendations for EFSA, in particular regarding strategic planning and activity implementation, the development of horizontal policies and processes, and the review of how the various engagement platforms function.

EFSA hosted the first meeting of its Stakeholder Forum on 30-31 May 2017 in Parma as part of its new approach to furthering public and stakeholder involvement in the process of risk assessment. Well-attended first meeting of the Forum kick-started a series of new initiatives to enable EFSA to interact with a larger range of stakeholders, and continue to develop how it engages with them on its work.

The meeting was attended by over 50 of the approximately 100 registered stakeholders representing seven different categories: consumer organisations, NGOs, the food industry, farmer organisations, practitioners, distributors and academics. The occasion was a good opportunity for face-to-face discussions with stakeholders, questions and answers, and constructive debates on EFSA's work. The event programme was developed with input from the participants ahead of the meeting.

After a plenary session on the first day, the participants attended three parallel interactive workshops where they discussed specific aspects of EFSA's work in more depth - transparency, quality of data and clear communication. The recommendations from these interactive workshop sessions will feed into EFSA's strategic reflections and future activities. The feedback will also serve as input for discussions at the Stakeholder Bureau, which will meet for the first time in September 2017.

Draft proposals for the framework for EFSA's interactions with stakeholders were circulated ahead of the Forum meeting, with the final document agreed on the basis of input from participants at the Forum as well as comments from all registered stakeholders. The final version will be published on EFSA's website.

A graphic artist was also on site throughout the Forum meeting sketching his impressions and capturing key elements of the discussions in a series of unique drawings, which were displayed at the back of the main Forum meeting room.

DAY 1

Morning plenary session

EFSA's Executive-Director Bernhard Url and the Chair of EFSA's Management Board Jaana Husu-Kalio opened the plenary session on the first day with welcome speeches outlining the new opportunities for interaction with stakeholders, from permanent mechanisms such as the Forum to more ad hoc targeted meetings for specific issues. Both also underlined the evolving nature of the new approach that would continue to be developed with the input of stakeholders and regularly reviewed.

Mr. Url also underlined EFSA's commitment and efforts to improve the transparency of scientific data, including the use of new data-sharing tools and technologies, while respecting intellectual property rights. To this end, he called for deep engagement with stakeholders in meeting this goal.

The key-note speech for the morning session was made by Dr. Pia-Johanna Schweizer from the Institute for Advanced Sustainability Studies in Potsdam, who discussed the theory of risk, principles for the governance of risk and concepts regarding the role of stakeholders in participative processes.

Other presentations included an overview by Barbara Gallani, EFSA's Head of Communications and External Relations Department, of the draft framework for interaction between the Stakeholder Forum and EFSA. She stressed in particular the goal of gathering a wide range of views as early as possible in the risk assessment process and of receiving stakeholder input into EFSA's work plans and priorities.

Florian Cimarusti, Secretary-General of the NGO SAFE Food Advocacy Europe, presented recommendations from her organisation's annual conference, designed to serve as input into EFSA's future work. These included for example clearer communication and stricter independence rules. The recommendations came from a workshop using an innovative 'Design Thinking Method', which was identified as potentially useful as a model for EFSA's future interactions with stakeholders.

The plenary session also gave opportunities for stakeholders to take the floor for comments, to seek clarifications or pose questions on EFSA's work in the presence of EFSA's Executive Director. The interventions from stakeholders in these question and answer sessions focussed on best practices for management of possible conflicts of interest, how to guarantee that stakeholder engagement is an integral part of EFSA's work, and how best to communicate on uncertainty.

Afternoon workshops

Stakeholders split into three parallel interactive workshops for the afternoon session, designed to provide specific feedback and recommendations on particular aspects of EFSA's work. The chosen topics were based on input from an online survey of stakeholder views. These sessions gave stakeholders the opportunity, in a more informal setting, to express their views and debate key aspects of EFSA's work in greater detail.

- Workshop 1** Quality data for risk assessment: What EFSA does with it and the role of stakeholders.
- Workshop 2** Usability of EFSA's outputs and clear communications: How EFSA presents and explains its science.
- Workshop 3** Transparency and open data in risk assessment.

Each workshop lasted for four hours. They began with presentations by EFSA staff on key elements of their work related to the workshop topic, with several opportunities for questions and answers. The floor was then given to participants from different stakeholder categories to give short presentations of their views on the particular workshop topic.

Based on the presentations and the discussions, stakeholders from each workshop were divided into small groups and invited to discuss and identify areas where they thought EFSA could improve its work and where they considered it already performs well. These discussions were facilitated by a moderator from EFSA's staff as well as a volunteer rapporteur from the group of stakeholders. The outcomes of the discussions were summarised into three main points to be presented at the plenary session the following day.

The allocation of stakeholders to the different workshops was based on participant's preferences expressed via a survey in advance of the event, and done in a way to ensure a balanced representation among the different stakeholder groups at each session. Badges were used to indicate to which group a participant belonged.

The outcomes of each workshop presented to the plenary were the following:

Workshop 1: Quality data for risk assessment: What EFSA does with it and the role of stakeholders.

Areas for EFSA to improve:

- More collaboration with registered stakeholders in calls for data.
- To take advantage of existing networks/channels of communication to reach their members.
- More proactive work with stakeholder representatives to enable their constituents/members to provide data within deadlines.
- Provide guidance to data providers e.g. defining/adopting data standards.
- Explore how to better communicate with applicants when requesting missing data.

Areas where EFSA does well:

- Early stakeholder involvement.
- Comprehensive food consumption database.
- Data standardisation which is key for interoperability, reuse and scrutiny of data.
- Initiatives such as the Prometheus Project and 'Weight of Evidence' guidance which allow consideration of a wider spectrum of data, with their relative weight.

Workshop 2: Usability of EFSA's outputs and clear communications: How EFSA presents and explains its science

Areas for EFSA to improve:

- Stronger advocacy for science to engender trust in stakeholders.
- Define target audiences and develop appropriate tiered communications.
- Headline accuracy and align with content, including contextualisation of risk.

Areas where EFSA does well:

- Dialogue with stakeholders.
- New visual tools to improve communications.
- Commitment to cooperation.
- Quality of science.
- New Comms Lab project.

Workshop 3: Transparency and open data in risk assessment

Areas for EFSA to improve:

- Improve transparency of the risk assessment process (e.g. minutes, data and process).
- Increase consultation earlier and at different stages of the process.
- Improve clarity and accessibility of the website.

Areas where EFSA does well:

- Proactive approach and continuous improvement.
- Ability to listen and readiness to be challenged.
- Opening better channels for feedback.

DAY 2

Plenary session

After a warm welcome to the second day of the Forum from EFSA's Executive-Director, the stakeholder rapporteurs from each workshop were invited to present the main feedback from their discussions the previous day. These presentations were followed by a discussion on elements of the recommendations with Mr. Url.

The discussions touched on issues surrounding the balance that can be struck between protecting intellectual property rights and the transparency of data, the concept of independent research and related funding, as well as ensuring the reproducibility of data. Mr. Url emphasised EFSA's commitment to ensuring open data, which he said could only be fully achieved with the support of applicants. The European Medicines Agency's (EMA) clinical trials database was identified as a possible model for future developments in this area.

The keynote speech was given by François Hoüyez, Director of Treatment Information and Access for EURORDIS, a non-governmental patient-driven alliance of patient organisations representing 755 rare disease patient organisations in 67 countries. Mr. Hoüyez presented EURORDIS' work and its success in engaging as a stakeholder with EMA.

As one of the pioneers for patient advocacy since the early 1990s, Mr. Hoüyez gave a detailed and well-received account of how early engagement with EMA developed. The model for interaction between EMA and patient/consumer organisations as well as a methodology for measuring the impact of civil society engagement was awarded the European Ombudsman Award for Good Administration for 2016.

Discussions following the presentation touched on whether involvement of consumers and patients in EMA's processes could help deepen understanding of its work. The topic of risk-benefit assessments was also brought up, with questions raised as to whether EFSA could carry out these types of assessments in the future.

In the final session, James Ramsay, Head of External Relations Unit (a.i) at EFSA, presented the draft framework for interaction between EFSA and the Stakeholder Bureau. Mr. Ramsay outlined the main functions of the Bureau – to be chaired by EFSA's Executive Director – which will provide high-level input into EFSA's work regarding societal concerns surrounding health, the environment, food production and other issues in EFSA's remit.

The Bureau will act as a guardian EFSA's stakeholder engagement, particularly on issues such as balanced representation, and monitor the actions EFSA takes as a result of the Stakeholder Forum. The finalised framework for interaction will be submitted to the Bureau at its first meeting for agreement.

Mr. Ramsay also unveiled the results of the selection process for members of the Stakeholder Bureau for the different stakeholder categories:

- Consumers - BEUC, Ilaria Passarani,
- NGOs and Advocacy Groups - Pesticide Action Network Europe, Martin Dermine,
- Farmers and Primary Producers - COPA-COGECA, Pekka Pesonen,
- Business and Food Industry - European Crop Protection Association–ECPA, Euros Jones,
- Distributors and HORECA - Euro Commerce, Els Bedert,
- Practitioners - European Federation of the Associations of Dietitians–EFAD, Ayla Gulden Pekcan,
- Academia - Society of Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry Europe–SETAC, José Julio Ortega Calvo.

EFSA's Executive Director closed the first meeting of the Stakeholder Forum with some final remarks, warmly thanking participants, speakers, moderators and EFSA staff. He praised the first Forum as providing a good model for highly interactive and constructive discussions with stakeholders. Mr. Url also stressed the evolving process of the mechanisms in place for interaction, which would be continually updated in the light of ongoing feedback and discussion with stakeholders.

Appendix A

List of attendees

Participants

Surname	Name	Organisation
Adamaszwili	Kinga	European Dairy Association (EDA)
Agostini	Alessandro	Association of Veterinary Consultant (AVC)
Ahern	Patrick	European Federation of Associations of Health Product Manufacturers (EHPM)
Bedert	Els	EuroCommerce
Boeing	Heiner	European Nutrition Society (FENS)
Bouxin	Arnaud	European Feed Manufacturers Association (FEFAC)
Calvert	Emma	The European Consumer Organisation (BEUC)
Cantaloube	Alain	European Federation for Animal Health and Sanitary Security (FESASS)
Capodieci	Giuseppe Luca	EU Association of Specialty Feed Ingredients and Their Mixtures (FEFANA)
Cimmarusti	Floriana	Safe Food Advocacy Europe (SAFE)
Coppens	Patrick	Food Supplements Europe
Delmotte	Didier	European Federation for Animal Health and Sanitary Security (FESASS)
Demyttenaere	Jan	European Flavour Association (EFFA)
Derrien	Christophe	International Platform of Insects for Food & Feed (IPIFF)
Grant	Lewis	Veterinary Public Health Association (VPHA)
Haefeker	Walter	European Professional Beekeepers Association (EPBA)
Hajjar	Kalila	The EU Vegetable Oil And Protein Meal Industry (FEDIOL)
Hartwig	Markus	Energy Drinks Europe (EDE)
Heilig	Ulf	International Biocontrol Manufacturers Association (IBMA global)
Herve	Maryse	EU Specialty Food Ingredients
Horn	Michel	European Federation of Associations of Health Product Manufacturers (EHPM)
Jones	Euros	European Crop Protection Association (ECPA)
Kadi	Andreas	Energy Drinks Europe (EDE)
Karsten	Jens	Food Lawyers Network worldwide (FLN)
Kettlitz	Beate	Food Drink Europe
Kostolaniova	Petra	European Association for Bioindustries (EuropaBio)
Leibovitch Majster	Emilie	Primary Food Processors of the EU (PFP)
Luyckx	Karen	Feedback Global
Mccartney	Elinor	Association of Veterinary Consultants (AVC)
Ó Laoide	Seán	Federation of Veterinarians of Europe (FVE)
Ortega-Calvo	Jose-Julio	Society of Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry Europe (SETAC)
Patruno	Paolo	The Liaison Centre for the Meat Processing Industry in the European Union (CLITRAVI)

Surname	Name	Organisation
Pecere	Rosanna	International Probiotic Association – Europe (IPA Europe)
Pedernera	Cecilia	Animal Welfare Foundation
Perrudin	Maud	Association of the European Self-Medication Industry (AESGP)
Porta	Francesca	Eurogroup for animals
Prieto Arranz	Miguel Angel	European Chemical Industry Council (CEFIC)
Proscia	Francesco	Federation of Veterinarians of Europe (FVE)
Rosa'	Renato	European Manufacturers of Feed Minerals Association (EMFEMA)
Rotini	Gabriele	The European Association of Craft, Small and Medium-sized Enterprises (UEAMPME)
Rovida	Costanza	European Consensus-Platform on Alternatives (ECOPA)
Rusconi	Giorgio	Food Lawyers Network worldwide (FLN)
Schmidt	Silvia	European Community of Consumer Co-operatives (Euro Coop)
Setien	Elisa	European Association of Chemical Distributors (FECC)
Sprangers	Diederick	European Network of Scientists for Social and Environmental Responsibility (ENSSER)
Toft	Annette	COPA COGECA
Van Belzen	Nico	International Dairy Federation (IDF)
Van Der Gaag	Rutger Jan	The Standing Committee of European Doctors (CPME)
Vesco	Umbero	Bee Life European Beekeeping Coordination

Speakers/Moderators

Surname	Name	Organisation
Cappe	Stefano	Team Leader, Data Unit, EFSA
Castoldi	Anna Federica	Team Leader, Food Ingredients & Packaging Unit, EFSA
Davies	Sue	Strategic Policy Adviser at Which? UK Consumer Magazine
De Seze	Guilhem	Head of Department Scientific Evaluation of Regulated Products, EFSA
Fernandez Dumont	Antonio	Scientific Officer, GMO Unit, EFSA
Gallani	Barbara	Head of Communications and External Relations Department, EFSA
Gizzi	Gisele	Project Manager TERA Project, EFSA
Harrington	Rory	Head of Risk Communications Unit, EFSA
Healy	Arthur	Lead Editor, Risk Communications Unit, EFSA
Houÿez	François	Treatment Information and Access Director / Health Policy Advisor, EURORDIS
Husu-Kallio	Jaana	Chair of EFSA's Management Board
Lheureux	Karine	Head of Unit Applications Desk, EFSA
Ramsay	James	Head of Unit a.i., External Relation Unit, EFSA
Schoonjans	Reinhilde	Senior Scientific Officer, Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit, EFSA
Schweizer	Pia Johanna	Institute for Advanced Sustainability Studies – Potsdam
Smith	Anthony	Content Team Leader, Risk Communications Unit, EFSA
Url	Bernhard	Executive Director, EFSA

Organising Team

Surname	Name	Organisation
Cavalli	Erika	Institutional and Stakeholder Relations Assistant, External Relations, EFSA
Kumric	Goran	Stakeholder Engagement Officer, External Relations, EFSA
Simeoni	Elisa	Policy Officer, Institutional & Stakeholders Relations, External Relations, EFSA
Villamar	Victoria	Team Leader, Institutional & Stakeholders Relations, External Relations, EFSA

Appendix B

List of presentations

DAY 1

1. Welcome, Jaana Husu-Kallio
2. Science and society: Challenges and way forward, Dr Pia Johanna Schweizer
3. Framework for Interaction between Stakeholder Forum and EFSA, Barbara Gallani
4. Engagement between EFSA and its stakeholders – Sensing stakeholder expectations, Floriana Cimmarusti

Workshop 1 - Quality data for Risk Assessment - What EFSA does with it and the role of Stakeholders

1. Data Quality: Fit for purpose Data in EFSA Risk Assessment - Stefano Cappe
2. Data Quality: The role of Stakeholders, Anna Federica Castoldi and Antonio Fernandez Dumont
3. View on Quality in Scientific Assessment - Pitch by Paolo Patruno, CLITRAVI
4. View on Good Quality Data - Pitch by Costanza Rovida, ECOPA
5. View on Good Quality Data – Pitch by Jose Julio Ortega, SETAC

Workshop 2 - Usability of EFSA's outputs and Clear Communications - How EFSA presents and explains its science

1. Usability of EFSA's Outputs, Reinhilde Schoonjans and Arthur Healy
2. EFSA Clear Communication – Anthony Smith
3. View on Usability of EFSA Outputs - Pitch by Annette Toft, COPA-COGECA
4. View on EFSA Clear Communication - Pitch by Els Bedert, EUROCOMMERCE

Workshop 3 - Transparency and open data in Risk Assessment

1. EFSA Openness and Transparency, Gisele Gizzi
2. Open Data - Karine Lheureux
3. View on EFSA transparency - Pitch by Emma Calvert, BEUC
4. View on Transparency and Open Data - Pitch by Rutger Jan van der Gaag, CPME

DAY 2

1. Workshop 1, Report to plenary on outcomes of discussion
2. Workshop 2, Report to plenary on outcomes of discussion
3. Workshop 3, Report to plenary on outcomes of discussion
4. Public engagement: Best practices and food for thought, François Houyez
5. Framework for Interaction between Stakeholder Bureau and EFSA, James Ramsay
6. Closing remarks by the Chair and what comes next

All presentations are available on the [EFSA website](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/170530)¹.

¹ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/170530>

