



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

MINUTES OF THE 18TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON BONSAI DEROGATIONS

Held on 25 -26 March 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 26 March 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Roel Potting (chair)
 - Anna Maria Vettraino participated via web-conference
 - Christer Magnusson
 - Andrea Battisti participated via web-conference
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable
- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska
- Others:
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 13-14 February 2019 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation⁵

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.). The working group addressed the comments received from the PLH Panel and finalised the draft opinion for the possible adoption during the March PLH Panel plenary meeting.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁶

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will be organised after the expected additional information on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation will be provided by the Chinese Authority to EFSA.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/plant-health/wqJapanBlackPineBonsai.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁶ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

MINUTES OF THE 17TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON BONSAI DEROGATIONS

WEB -conference, 4 and 6 March 2019

(Agreed on 6 March 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Roel Potting (chair) has participated via WEB-conference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via WEB-conference
Christer Magnusson has participated via WEB-conference
Andrea Battisti has participated via WEB-conference
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska
AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz
- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 4 and 6 March 2019 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation⁵

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.). The Working Group reviewed and finalised the draft opinion and all pest sheets and agreed on the version for sending to the PLH Panel plenary meeting in March 2019.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁶

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group web-meeting will take place on 25-26 March 2019.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/plant-health/wqJapanBlackPineBonsai.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁶ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

MINUTES OF THE 16TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON BONSAI DEROGATIONS

Held on 13 -14 February 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 14 February 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Roel Potting (chair)
 - Anna Maria Vettraino
 - Christer Magnusson
 - Andrea Battisti
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable
- EFSA:
 - ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz, Eugen Christoph
- Others:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 13-14 February 2019 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation⁵

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.). The working group performed a semiformal expert knowledge elicitation of the pest freedom of the commodity for the relevant pests and agreed on the next steps.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁶

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group web-meeting will take place on 4 and 6 March 2019.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/plant-health/wqJapanBlackPineBonsai.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁶ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 6, 20, 21 and 22 February 2019, via web-conference
(Agreed on 22 February 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference
Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference
Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska
AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz, Eugen Christoph

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 6, 20, 21 and 22 February 2019 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 22 February 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.). The Working Group reviewed all pest sheets and amended them according to the results and justification for the assessment of pest freedom of the commodity and started drafting the opinion.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will take place on 13 and 14 February 2019 in Parma.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 9, 11 and 25 January 2019, via web-conference
(Agreed on 25 January 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference
Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference
Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska
AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 9, 11 and 25 January 2019 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 25 January 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.), specifically the information received in December 2018, and drafted part of the opinion focusing on the assessment of selected pests and pathogens (update of pest sheets).

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will take place on 13 and 14 February 2019 in Parma.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 13 and 14 December 2018, via web-conference
(Agreed on 14 December 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference

Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference on 14 December 2018

Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference on 13 December 2018

Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 13 and 14 December 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 14 December 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.) and drafted part of the opinion focusing on the assessment of selected pests and pathogens.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will be a web-meeting on 9, 11 and 25 January 2018.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 26 and 28 November 2018, via web-conference
(Agreed on 28 November 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference
Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference
Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Ciro Gardi, Svetla Kozelska
AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 26 and 28 November 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 28 November 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.) and drafted part of the opinion focusing on the assessment of selected pests and pathogens. An expert knowledge elicitation was performed for assessment of selected pests.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will be a web-meeting on 13 and 14 December 2018.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 14 November 2018, via web-conference
(Agreed on 14 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participant.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 14 November 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 14 November 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.) and drafted part of the opinion focusing on the assessment of fungi pathogens.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will be a web-meeting on 26 and 28 November 2018.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 7 – 9 November 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 9 January 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair)

Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via WEB-conference

Christer Magnusson

Andrea Battisti has participated on 9 November 2018

- EFSA**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

Pesticide Unit: Renata Leuschner has participated on 9 November 2018

- Hearing experts**

Yuichi Yamaoka has participated on 9 November 2018

Yasutada Kanegae has participated on 9 November 2018

Yohei Haneishi has participated on 9 November 2018

Yukino Yamakami has participated on 9 November 2018

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 7-9 November 2018 were agreed on 9 January 2019.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L). The Working Group discussed the outcome of the review and analysis of the dossier and started drafting the opinion. On 9 November 2018 as from 0.9.00 till 12.30 following hearing experts from Japan: Yuichi Yamaoka (Tsukuba University, professor); Yasutada Kanegae (Kagawa prefecture Plant protection office, Chief researcher); Yohei Haneishi (Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry & Fisheries (MAFF), Plant Protection Division, Deputy director) and Yukino Yamakami (Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry & Fisheries (MAFF), Plant Protection Division, Subsection chief) participated to the meeting. The hearing experts have answered before the hearing in writing the questions that had been sent to them by the Working Group. The additional information provided in this written document is considered as a part of the dossier. During the hearing the hearing experts gave oral clarification on the written answers and answered further oral questions from the WG members. Following this meeting, the hearing experts received the draft summary of the hearing and the opportunity was given to correct or complement the information. The summary from the hearing

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

is provided in the Annex to these minutes. After the hearing, the WG discussed the outcome of the hearing and how to proceed with the opinion. The next steps were agreed.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will be a web-meeting on 14 November 2018.

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Annex to the Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Summary of the hearing with experts from Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry & Fisheries (MAFF) of the Government of Japan

Roel Potting (Chair of the WG on Bonsai derogations) welcomed all the participants to the hearing. A tour de table followed with each meeting participant introducing themselves.

The Chair explained that a summary of the hearing would be produced which would be shared with all participants for agreement and published on the EFSA website as attachment to the minutes of the 10th WG Bonsai derogation meeting held on 7 – 9 November 2018.

The draft agenda of the hearing was adopted. The participants agreed to focus on the following technical agenda points:

1. Presentation of the EFSA mandate and working procedures
2. Presentation of the technical dossier provided by MAFF to EFSA
3. Reply to EFSA questions submitted by 16 October 2018
4. Additional questions and clarification

1. Presentation of the EFSA mandate and working procedures

The chair of the Working group presented to the participants:

- the composition of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations,
- the Terms of Reference as provided by the European Commission (EC),
- the methodology of the assessment (referring to the EFSA Technical report on "Information required for dossiers to support demands for import of high risk plants, plant products and other objects as foreseen in Article 42 of Regulation (EU) 2016/2031" (EFSA, 2018),
- the guidance for commodity risk assessment providing an overview about the risk assessment process starting with a list of pests potentially associated with the commodity and obtaining a list of pests of regulatory significance for which the risk mitigation measures needs to be evaluated,
- the process of adoption and publishing of this opinion.

2. Presentation of the technical dossier provided by MAFF to EFSA

The hearing experts presented some aspects of the technical dossier provided by MAFF to EFSA focusing on:

- History and structure of *Pinus* bonsai plants production in Japan

The tradition of bonsai production is about 200 years old. The Kagawa prefecture is with ca 80% of the bonsai production the main area where the *Pinus* bonsai are produced in Japan. The *Pinus thunbergii* is the prevalent species for *Pinus* bonsai (ca 60% and being the symbol of Kagawa prefecture) followed by *P. parviflora* (ca 40%).

- Request for derogation

In March 2016 Japan asked the EU for a temporary derogation from the import ban of *Pinus* plants, as specified in Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.) to the EU under the same conditions as for the *P. parviflora* bonsai plants. The hearing experts expressed their willingness to consider possible additional mitigation measures to meet the EU requirements with regards to the potential export of *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai plants to the EU.

- Bonsai production and the phytosanitary situation in nurseries

The *Pinus* bonsai production is based on using either seedlings (produced from seed collected in natural forests) or cuttings as the starting point. The *Pinus* bonsai may stay in the nursery 3 to 30 years. The pests of main concern are:

- Pests feeding on leaves: symptoms are clear and insecticides effective,
- Pests feeding in trunk: can be prevented by sanitation and treatment,
- Pine wood nematode (PWN): *P. thunbergii* is highly sensitive to the PWN, but can be prevented from the commodity by treatment of the vector (*Monochamus alternatus*) and during the inspections before export by detecting the feeding marks of the beetle and symptoms of PWN.
- Pests of soil: use of sterile growing media, the steam soil disinfection is widely used and the soil from the root surrounding is removed and root portion is disinfested by MEP when the plants are potted.
- Fungi diseases: can be in general managed. In case of *Cronartium orientale* and *Coleosporium phelodendri* the alternate hosts need to be taken into consideration,

- Difficulty in preparing the dossier on *P. thunbergii*, especially the request to give an overview of all pests associated with *Pinus thunbergii* in Japan. It was noted that there is a difference between the environment in the bonsai nursery and in the natural forest.
- Situation regarding *Cronartium orientale* and *Coleosporium phellodendri* in Japan

The pine needle rust (caused by *Coleosporium phellodendri*) and pine gall rust (caused by *Cronartium orientale*) are both present in Kagawa prefecture; *Coleosporium phellodendri* being a common pathogen in Japan. In the Kagawa prefecture in the last three years there were more than 50 000 *P. thunbergii* bonsai inspected in each year and no signs of infection by the above two pathogens were found. The pine needle and pine gall rusts are controlled by chemical treatment with four effective pesticides (Mancozeb being the most effective). Furthermore the bonsai for export are inspected 6 times per year for a period for two years and the diseased trees would be found during these inspections.

3. Reply to EFSA questions submitted by 16 October 2018

The hearing experts provided following oral clarification on the written answers to the questions that had been sent to them by the Working Group beforehand:

- A map of registered bonsai nurseries in Japan

The provided map of registered bonsai nurseries in Japan shows that the most important regions for the *P. thunbergii* bonsai production Kagawa, Saitama and Chiba. The *P. thunbergii* nurseries are tend to be located in south of Japan due to the climatic requirements of *P. thunbergii*, whereas the nurseries with *Pinus parviflora* are more likely to be located in middle of Japan as *P. parviflora* is acclimatized to higher altitudes. The numbers indicated to the map reflect the number of the nurseries in the specific region (to obtain the total number of the nurseries in Japan the numbers for all regions has to be summed-up). In Kagawa prefecture some nurseries are located in the vicinity of a forest.

The new plants entering a registered (export) bonsai nursery may in some cases originate from other producers. MAFF does not inspect the new entering plants (i.e. does not check, if the new entering plants are pest free when entering the nursery), but inspect the bonsai plants 6 times per year in the exporting nursery checking the treatment for soil applied to the bonsai tree upon potting. In Japan there are many non-registered producers from which the registered nursery may buy the plants.

- Surveillance system in place for the detection or confirmation of absence of specific pests

There are three main systems how MAFF obtains information on pest presence/absence:

- (1) on-site inspection and test for exported bonsai,
- (2) pest occurrence forecasting system and area wide surveillance,
- (3) forest damage information.

Only the first system (on-site inspection and test for exported bonsai) is relevant for bonsai as requested by EU (from April to September one inspection per month is performed).

Pest specific surveys for the forest depend on the prefecture, some prefecture survey some pests. In Japan some pests are under official control and surveillance, e.g. potato nematodes or some kinds of fruit flies.

- Treatment against *Monochamus alternatus* and *Bursaphelenchus xylophilus*

The treatment applied to control *Monochamus alternatus* is effective through the whole occurrence period of *M. alternatus* by spraying the insecticide (fenitrothion or acetamiprid) in late May, mid-June and mid-July. The pesticide kills the insect but not immediately and maturation feeding may be possible enabling transfer of the nematode. In Japan combined measures (such as detection of symptoms during daily management, six inspection per year and removal of damaged plants, observation of symptoms for two years) are used to decrease the possibility of infection. So far there are no reports of symptoms that could be associated to PWN and no reports of marks of maturation feeding in the nurseries.

- What is the efficacy of the chemical treatments in use against *Xiphinema americanum sensu lato*?

Tables from tests of the survival of *Xiphinema* spp. during treatment with MEP were provided as the efficacy test data. From this data it is indicated that MEP has a strong efficacy for *Xiphinema* spp. But the effect of the treatment declined with time after the treatment. The level of efficacy of the test will be stated by MAFF. Additional data will be provided by MAFF.

The hearing experts stressed that bonsai trees for export have little possibility to have *Xiphinema* spp. because soil for bonsai potting is disinfected and in addition, MEP treatment is applied upon potting and before export.

- Symptoms and discard of plants in the nursery

Symptoms (colour changing to yellow) have been found in the nurseries; the affected plants were removed, but the cause of the symptoms was not examined (i.e. no proof can be provided that these symptoms are not caused by nematodes).

The number of discarded plants of *P.thunbergii* in the nurseries registered for export to Turkey in the last three years is shown below. It is to expect that the same producers/nurseries would also export to the EU.

Year	Total number of inspected plants	Number of plants declined from registration by producer	Number of dead plants
2016	1256	83	1
2017	1143	138	0
2018	774	111	0

The reason for the declination of the plants is not specifically known, it can be presence of symptoms or selling the plants to the domestic market. MAFF has the list of registered bonsai and the information how many registered plants are declined from the list by producers or dead. The main reason of declining is selling into the domestic market. When discarding the plants (with wilt symptoms) there is no compulsory testing or analysis for nematode presence. The analysis can be performed when requested by the producer/nursery itself.

- Symptoms and pest absence

In case of general symptoms in the nursery there is no compulsory check/analysis of the reason of the symptoms therefore EFSA pointed out that this is different to state that the pests are not present in the nursery. As there is no analysis performed the absence of EU-regulated pests is not directly confirmed. The hearing experts stressed that although the reason of the symptoms is not known all damaged plants are removed.

- MAFF reply to notifications from the EU

In 2008 there were several notifications from EU due the nematodes presence therefore checks for nematodes are now performed. In the last years there are only few notifications, specifically one notification in 2016, i.e. one notification from the EU in last five years on *Pinus* plants. In case of a notification MAFF analyses the reason by investigating with the exporter. All notifications are recorded in MAFF database.

- Forest in the vicinity of a nursery

The forests in the vicinity of the nurseries are very small and control measures are not applied there. The control measures are applied and financed by MAFF in big forests having high risk of pest damage.

- Types and performance of inspections

There are two types of inspections performed to Bonsai plants:

- On-site inspection: taking place 6 times a year in the registered nursery and mainly visual inspections conducted with magnifying

glass used to detect also small insects. To find hidden insects, inspectors apply the beating method. In addition, a part of plant or pest is taken to laboratory and inspected in case the symptoms can not be identified in nursery.

- Export inspections: comprising visual inspection of the stem and twigs, sampling of twigs for symptoms, laboratory test for *Giberella circinata*. From one lot 4 to 10 samples are taken depending on the lot size. One lot is composed by plants from the same nursery, the same year and the same species. The number of plants in a lot depends on the nursery and can vary from few plants to few hundred plants. Each lot is checked, all plants in the lot are checked and some of them are sampled for laboratory test for *G. circinata*.

4. Additional questions and clarification

4.1 **Oral reply and clarification to further oral questions from the WG members provided by the hearing experts**

The hearing experts gave oral reply and clarification to the following further oral questions from the WG members:

- Question: More information on Pinus species used for rootstock.

Reply: *P. thunbergii* is not grafted because *P. thunbergii* has tough roots.

- Question: Procedure of measures/treatment for new plants entering an export nursery

Reply: The future export of *P. thunbergii* bonsai from Japan to the EU is expected to be mainly from Kagawa prefecture. In the Kagawa prefecture the nurseries produce their plants by themselves, i.e. the nurseries produce its own seedlings from seed collected in natural forest in Kagawa prefecture. In case of other regions different from Kagawa prefecture MAFF is ready to consider additional mitigation measures for new plants entering the nurseries if requested by the EU.

There is no specific protocol for re-potting and inspection of plants at the moment they enter the export nursery. The new plants will be part of the regular inspection and treatment (including re-potting) regime in the nursery.

- Question: EFSA has identified 19 relevant species for the commodity, please provide:

Records of findings in nurseries

Pest-specific surveillance in surrounding environment

Reply: Pest-specific surveillance in surrounding environment of the registered bonsai nurseries for the 19 relevant species associated with *P. thunbergii* and selected by the Working Group (16 EU quarantine pests and three pests not quarantine for the EU) is not performed. For the three species which are not regulated in the EU (*Crisicoccus pini*, *Sirex nitobei*, *Urocerus japonicus*) there are no records for the last three years in the inspected nurseries.

4.2 Reply to the questions of MAFF by the WG chair and WG members

The WG chair and WG members replied to the following questions of MAFF:

- Question: Has it determined that EFSA Journal on Japanese *P. thunbergii* Bonsai will be published in the end of this examination planning to finish in this year? Or, is there any possibility to postpone publishing EFSA Journal and require more information in the end of this examination?

Reply: The WG chair when explaining the process of adoption and publishing of the future opinion provided the time schedule of the next plenary meetings of the EFSA Scientific Panel on Plant Health (PLH Panel) (November 2018, January 2019, March 2019, May 2019). Before the opinion can be published it needs to be adopted by the PLH Panel. Therefore the Working Group has to finalise the draft opinion and present to the PLH Panel for discussion and potential adoption. In case the PLH Panel has substantial comments to the draft opinion the WG has to amend the draft opinion and present during the following plenary meeting for discussion and potential adoption. This process is expected to be finished in first/second quartile of the next year.

- Question: As for *Xiphinema americanum* sensu lato, EFSA published the EFSA Journal which categorized *X. americanum* sensu lato in to 4 groups. Will the EU require preventing measures against group II ~IV?

Reply: To reply to this question is out of EFSA remit. The risk managers of the EU will decide what specific measures will be specified.

5. References:

European Food Safety Authority (EFSA), Dehnen-Schmutz K, Jaques Miret JA, Jeger M, Potting R, Corini A, Gabbi S, Kozelska S, Munoz Guajardo I, Stanganelli G and Gardi C, 2018. Information required for dossiers to support demands for import of high risk plants, plant products and other objects as foreseen in Article 42 of Regulation (EU) 2016/2031. EFSA supporting publication 2018:EN-1492, 22 pp. doi:10.2903/sp.efsa.2018.1492

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 29 October 2018, via web-conference
(Agreed on 29 October 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference
Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference
Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 29 October 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 29 October 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L). The Working Group continued to review the information on the mitigation measures. The next steps were agreed.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will take place on 7 – 9 November 2018 in Parma.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 16-17 October 2018, via web-conference
(Agreed on 17 October 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference
Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference
Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Ewelina Czwiencek
PRAS Unit: Renata Leuschner

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 16-17 October 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 17 October 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group continued reviewing and analysing the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.). The Working Group (i) revised and agreed on the content of tables listing the EU regulated and EU non-regulated pests and on the list of pests that may need phytosanitary mitigation measures; (ii) started to review the information on the mitigation measures. The next steps were agreed.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will take place on 29 October 2018.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 19-20 September 2018, via web-conference
(Agreed on 20 September 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference
Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference
Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska
PRAS Unit: Renata Leuschner

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 19-20 September 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 20 September 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

The Working Group started to review and analyse the dossier submitted to EFSA by the Japanese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L). The Working Group provided first draft of tables listing the EU regulated and EU non-regulated pests with the aim to identify pests that may need phytosanitary mitigation measures. The Working Group meeting plan was confirmed and next steps agreed.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group web-meeting will take place on 16-17 October 2018.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 4 June 2018, via web-conference
(Agreed on 4 June 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting (chair) has participated via teleconference
Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference
Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference
Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska
PRAS Unit: Renata Leuschner

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 4 June 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 4 June 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

The Working group (WG) focused on (i) review of dossier submitted to the Commission by the Chinese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese white pine bonsai (*Pinus parviflora* L.) and (ii) identification of information gaps and formulation of questions to Chinese Authority. The participants agreed also on the next steps.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will be agreed after receiving the additional information requested from Chinese and Japanese Authorities.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 14 May 2018, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 14 May 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting

Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference

Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference

Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 14 May 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 14 May 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

The Working group (WG) focused on (i) review of dossier submitted to the Commission by the Chinese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese white pine bonsai (*Pinus parviflora* L) and (ii) identification of information gaps and potential type of questions to Chinese Authority. The participants agreed also on the next steps.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will take place on 4 June 2018 via web-conference.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Bonsai derogations

Held on 18 April 2018 via web-conference

(Agreed on 18 April 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting has participated via teleconference

Anna Maria Vettraino has participated via teleconference

Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Andrea Battisti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 18 April 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 18 April 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion on the scientific opinion on *Pinus thunbergii* bonsai derogation³

For this mandate the clock has been stopped until the expected additional information will be provided to EFSA.

5.2. Discussion on the scientific opinion *Pinus parviflora* bonsai derogation⁴

The Working group (WG) focused first on discussion on and interpretation of the Terms of Reference and the first review of dossier submitted to the Commission by the Chinese Authority in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of Japanese white pine bonsai (*Pinus parviflora* L). In the second part of the meeting the approach and methodology were discussed and agreed. The participants agreed also on the next steps.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will take place on 14 May 2018 in Parma.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00277>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Japan black pine (*Pinus thunbergii*) bonsai derogation

Held on 13-15 February 2018 Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 15 February 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting

Anna Maria Vettraino

Andrea Battisti has participated via teleconference

Christer Magnusson has participated via teleconference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

PRAS Unit: Renata Leuschner

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 13-15 February 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 15 February 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Japan black pine (*Pinus thunbergii*) bonsai derogation³

The Working group first discussed and agreed the approach to be used when preparing the output taking into account the feedback received during January PLH Panel plenary meeting. The main part of the meeting was focused on a detailed review of dossier (specifically fungi organisms) submitted to the Commission by the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF) of the Government of Japan in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.). Based on this detailed review the WG (i) reconsidered and formulated detailed questions to the Japanese Authority, (ii) agreed on division of tasks and (iii) agreed on next steps.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will take place on 18 April 2018 as a web-conference.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Japan black pine (*Pinus thunbergii*) bonsai derogation

Held on 24 January 2018 by web-conference

(Agreed on 24 January 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The EFSA staff welcomed the participant.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 24 January 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 24 January 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Japan black pine (*Pinus thunbergii*) bonsai derogation³

The Working group (WG) focused on (i) the review of dossier submitted to the Commission by the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF) of the Government of Japan in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L.), (ii) formulating questions to the Japanese Authorities and (iii) division of tasks. The next steps were agreed.

6. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting will take place on 13-15 February 2018 in Parma.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Japan black pine (*Pinus thunbergii*) bonsai derogation

Held on 10-11 January 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 11 January 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:**

Roel Potting

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Maria Mirazchiyska (DG SANTE) participated via web-conference

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Svetla Kozelska

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The EFSA staff welcomed the participant.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of this Working Group meeting held on 10-11 January 2018 were agreed by the end of the meeting on 11 January 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Japan black pine (*Pinus thunbergii*) bonsai derogation³

The Working group (WG) focused first on discussion on and interpretation of the Terms of Reference and the first review of dossier submitted to the Commission by the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF) of the Government of Japan in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for export of black pine bonsai (*Pinus thunbergii* L). The proposed interpretation of the Terms of Reference were discussed and agreed with a requestor (European Commission) representative. In the second part of the meeting the approach and methodology were discussed and proposed.

6. Any Other Business

Agreement on working group meeting plan, next steps and division of task were proposed.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next WG group meeting is planned for 24 January 2018 as a web-meeting.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00715>