

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> Web-meeting of the Working Group on Insecticides (Art. 4.7)

**Held on 10<sup>th</sup> October 2016**  
**(Agreed on 10<sup>th</sup> October, 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- Working Group Members:**

Udo Heimbach

Jean-Claude Gregoire

- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Mark Williams

- EFSA:**

**ALPHA Unit:**

Ciro Gardi

Ioannis Koufakis

**Pesticide Unit:**

Claudia Heppner

- Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

Apologies were received from Josep Anton Jaques Miret and Joel Gonzalez-Cabrera.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

### **4.1 Discussion on the required data to perform the assessment and further actions of the WG**

Scientific Topic for discussion: Consideration of evidence that the application of an active substance (insecticide) is necessary to control a serious danger to plant health which cannot be contained by other available means including non-chemical methods (EFSA-Q-2016-00378).

The members of the WG were introduced to the EFSA way of working and the administrative rules concerning EFSA experts.

The experts, Udo Heimbach and Jean-Claude Gregoire, shortly presented themselves.

Then, Mark Williams as a representative of the EC presented the mandate to the WG members. In addition, the WG discussed about the scope of the technical report, the methodology, supporting information and data needed. Finally, the work-plan was set up and tasks were allocated among the WG members.

Discussion on the scientific output and workplan

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

- Scope of the scientific report
- Discussion on the methodologies
- Supporting information and data
- Review of available literature
- Workplan (allocation of tasks in progress)

## **5. Next meeting(s)**

The date of the next meeting will be decided later, but most probably on 3-4 or 15-16 of November 2016.

## **6. Minutes approval**

The minutes of this meeting were orally approved by participants at the end of the meeting<sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/plhinsecticideswg.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Web-meeting of the Working Group on Insecticides (Art. 4.7)

**Held on 10<sup>th</sup> November 2016**  
**(Agreed on 10<sup>th</sup> November, 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- Working Group Members:**

Udo Heimbach

Jean-Claude Gregoire

Josep Anton Jaques Miret

Joel Gonzales Cabrera

Andrea Lucchi

- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

- Not applicable**

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

Ioannis Koufakis

Pesticide Unit:

Claudia Heppner

- Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

### **4.1 Discussion on the required data to perform the assessment and further actions of the WG**

The experts, Josep Anton Jaques Miret, Joel Gonzales Cabrera and Andrea Lucchi, shortly presented themselves.

Update on the status of the draft report revision (including feedback on the flow-chart).

Critical points for further discussion in the WG meeting were identified. Discussion on the possibility/opportunity to include e.g. acaricides, etc. in the protocol took place and it was decided to request some clarification on these issues to the EC.

Updates from WG members on assigned tasks were given.

Discussion on the scientific output and work plan:

- Discussion on the methodologies
- Workplan (allocation of tasks in progress)

## **5. Next meeting(s)**

The next meeting will be on 15-16 of November 2016.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## 6. Minutes approval

The minutes of this meeting were orally approved by participants at the end of the meeting<sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/plhinsecticideswg.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Insecticides (Art. 4.7)

**Held on 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> November 2016**  
**(Agreed on 16<sup>th</sup> November, 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- Working Group Members:**

Udo Heimbach

Jean-Claude Gregoire

Josep Anton Jaques Miret

Joel Gonzalez Cabrera

Andrea Lucchi

- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

- Not applicable**

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

Ioannis Koufakis

Pesticide Unit:

Claudia Heppner

- Others:**

Not Applicable

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absent at the 1st day of the WG received from Jean-Claude Gregoire.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change. The following bullet point was added for discussion in the agenda:

- Differences between the herbicide and insecticide protocol.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### 4.1 Discussion on the methodology, progress of the report and further actions of the WG

Initially, the experts presented themselves at the round table. Then, discussion on critical points and the differences of this protocol from the herbicide protocol took place among the WG members. Moreover, it was discussed and agreed that the protocol should cover insecticides and acaricides. EC supported this decision.

Furthermore, it was decided that plant resistance it is taken into account as an alternative method as it is stated in the IPM directive.

The WG requested and received clarifications on the interpretation on the ToR by the EC.

The spreadsheet for data collection to be used by applicants/MSs was discussed and drafted by the WG.

The WG went through each section of the draft protocol (including the flow-chart).

Tasks were allocated among WG members to be concluded before the next meeting.

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **5. Next meeting(s)**

The next meeting will be on 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2016.

## **6. Minutes approval**

The minutes of this meeting were orally approved by participants at the end of the meeting<sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/plhinsecticideswg.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Insecticides (Art. 4.7)

**Held on 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2016**  
**(Agreed on 2<sup>nd</sup> December, 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- Working Group Members:**

Udo Heimbach

Jean-Claude Gregoire

Josep Anton Jaques Miret

Joel Gonzales Cabrera

Andrea Lucchi

- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

- Not applicable**

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

Ioannis Koufakis

Pesticide Unit:

Zoltan Erdos

- Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### 4.1 Discussion on the methodology, progress of the report and further actions of the WG

Initially, updates from WG members were received.

Then, the WG discussed and agreed on the methodology for the evaluation and classification of the insecticide and pest risk of resistance:

- methodology for the evaluation of insecticides risk of resistance;
- methodology for the evaluation of pest risk of resistance;
- model/methodology for the evaluation of the combined risk and reclassification;

Moreover, the alternative methods to insecticides were drafted.

Finally, tasks were allocated among WG members to be concluded until the next meeting.

## 5. Next meeting(s)

The date of the next meeting will be decided later.

## 6. Minutes approval

The minutes of this meeting were orally approved by participants at the end of the meeting<sup>4</sup>.

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/plhinsecticideswg.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Insecticides (Art. 4.7)

**Held on 11<sup>th</sup> January 2017  
(Agreed on 11<sup>th</sup> January, 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- Working Group Members:**

Udo Heimbach

Jean-Claude Gregoire

Josep Anton Jaques Miret

Joel Gonzalez Cabrera

- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**
- Not applicable**

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

Ioannis Koufakis

Pesticide Unit:

Zoltan Erdos

- Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Andrea Lucchi sent his apologies for absence.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without change.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

### **4.1 Discussion on the comments by the reviewers, corrections in the report and further actions of the WG**

The WG discussed on the comments received by the reviewers of the protocol. Adjustments in the content of the report (e.g. methodology) were agreed and performed by the WG.

Finally, tasks were allocated among WG members to be concluded until the next meeting.

## **5. Next meeting(s)**

The next meeting will be decided later.

## **6. Minutes approval**

The minutes of this meeting were orally approved by participants at the end of the meeting<sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/plhinsecticideswg.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Insecticides (Art. 4.7)

**Held on 28<sup>th</sup> February 2017  
(Agreed on 28<sup>th</sup> February, 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- Working Group Members:**

Andrea Lucchi

Josep Anton Jaques Miret

Joel Gonzalez Cabrera

Udo Heimbach

- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

**Not applicable**

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

Ioannis Koufakis

Pesticide Unit:

Zoltan Erdos

- Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Jean-Claude Gregoire.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without change.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

### **4.1 Discussion on the comments by the reviewers, corrections in the report and further actions of the WG**

The WG reviewed, discussed and answered the comments received by Member States regarding the draft insecticides protocol. The WG initiated the correction of the agreed amendments in the report.

Tasks were allocated among WG members to be concluded until the next meeting.

## **5. Next meeting(s)**

The next meeting will be on 13<sup>th</sup> of March 2017.

## **6. Minutes approval**

The minutes of this meeting were orally approved by participants at the end of the meeting<sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/plhinsecticideswg.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Insecticides (Art. 4.7)

**Held on 13<sup>th</sup> March 2017  
(Agreed on 13<sup>th</sup> March, 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- Working Group Members:**

Andrea Lucchi  
Joel Gonzalez Cabrera  
Udo Heimbach  
Jean-Claude Gregoire

- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**  
**Not applicable**

- EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:  
Ciro Gardi  
Ioannis Koufakis  
Pesticide Unit:  
Zoltan Erdos

- Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Josep Anton Jaques Miret.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without change.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

### **4.1 Discussion on the comments by the reviewers, corrections in the report.**

The WG finalised the answers to the comments received by Member States regarding the draft insecticides protocol. Additionally, the WG made the agreed changes and corrections in the protocol.

## **5. Next meeting(s)**

Additional meeting is not foreseen.

## **6. Minutes approval**

The minutes of this meeting were orally approved by participants at the end of the meeting<sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/plhinsecticideswg.pdf>