

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

Held on 31 August 2015, web (Italy)

(Agreed on 21 October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
- Thierry Candresse
- Trond Rafoss
- Xavier Foissac
- Domenico Bosco
- Gudrun Strauss

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Elisavet Chatzivassiliou.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-

Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 31 August 2015 were agreed on the 21 October 2015.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271)for the EU territory

Structure and composition of the Working Group has been agreed, the Terms of reference and the scope of the expected outputs has been discussed. The participants agreed on a work plan and meetings calendar.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 30 September 2015 (web).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

Held on 30 September 2015, web (Italy)

(Agreed on 21 October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
- Thierry Candresse
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Xavier Foissac
- Domenico Bosco
- Gudrun Strauss

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo/Gritta Schrader

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Trond Rafoss.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 30 September 2015 were agreed on the 21 October 2015.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The Working group discussed in detail the Terms of reference, the new template and agreed on the methodology. The new methodology (for pest risk assessment and evaluation of risk reduction options) proposed by the PLH Panel should be used when developing the opinion with the aim to test and verify the new approach.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Amsterdam on 21 October 2015.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 21 October 2015, web (Amsterdam, Schiphol)
(Agreed on 16 December 2015)**

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
- Thierry Candresse
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Domenico Bosco
- Xavier Foissac

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Gudrun Strauss and Trond Rafoss

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 21 October 2015 were agreed on the 16 December 2015.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The Working group discussed in detail the new template and the methodology. It has been agreed that conditional risk assessment will be carried out with main focus on spread, impact and risk reduction options.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 19-20 November 2015.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 19-20 November 2015, Parma, EFSA
(Agreed on 13 January 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
 - Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
 - Trond Rafoss
 - Domenico Bosco
 - Xavier Foissac
 - Gudrun Strauss
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-

Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 19-20 November 2015 were agreed on the 13 January 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271)for the EU territory

The Working group further discussed the new template and the methodology. The objectives and the key questions on modelling were also discussed. The WG stressed that there is a need for further support in the area of calculations and fine-tuning of the new approach for pest risk assessment used by the WG when developing the opinions.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be a web-meeting on 16 December 2015.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 16 December 2015, web-meeting
(Agreed on 15 February 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
- Thierry Candresse
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Trond Rafoss
- Xavier Foissac
- Domenico Bosco
- Gudrun Strauss

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 16 of December 2015 were agreed on the 15 February 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

An update on the progress of the Methodology Working Group was given. The participants discussed how to assess spread and impact and what are the minimum requirements for their estimation. The Working Group also identified the further data needs for the quantitative approach.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be a web-meeting on 11 January 2016.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 11 January 2016, web-meeting
(Agreed on 15 February 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 11 of January 2016 were agreed on the 15 February 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The participants further discussed the new methodology the assessment of spread and impact and the minimum requirements for their estimation.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be a web-meeting on 13 January 2016.

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 13 January 2016, web-meeting
(Agreed on 15 February 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
 - Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
 - Xavier Foissac
 - Domenico Bosco
 - Gudrun Strauss
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Trond Rafoss.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 13 of January 2016 were agreed on the 15 February 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The spread and impact sections were discussed in detail. The data needed for further development of the opinion was clarified. The WG stressed that further guidance by the WG Methods for risk assessment and for the risk reduction option part is needed.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be in Parma, on the 25-26 of January 2016.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 25-26 January 2016, Parma, EFSA
(Agreed on 15 February 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
 - Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
 - Roel Potting (only 26 of January)
 - Trond Rafoss
 - Domenico Bosco (via web)
 - Xavier Foissac
 - Gudrun Strauss
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz (only 25 of January am)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 25-26 of January 2016 were agreed on the 15 February 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The Working group further discussed the calculation approach the estimation and justification of the basic values. The discussion on Establishment and Spread sections was continued. With the support of the new expert the WG discussed and identified the list of possible measures that can be taken and the most important risk reduction options.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be via web on the 15 of February 2016.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 15, 16 and 26 February 2016, Web
(Agreed on 17 March 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
 - Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
 - Trond Rafoss
 - Domenico Bosco
 - Xavier Foissac
 - Gudrun Strauss
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Roel Potting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 15, 16 and 26 of February 2016 were agreed on the 17 March 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The Working group further discussed the calculation approach the estimation and justification of the basic values. The discussion on Establishment and Spread sections was continued. Key factors affecting the impact were explored and additional modifications in the template were proposed to the Methodology Group.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Bordeaux on the 2-4 of March 2016.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

Held on 2, 3 and 4 of March 2016, INRA Bordeaux, France
(Agreed on 17 March 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
 - Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
 - Roel Potting
 - Trond Rafoss
 - Domenico Bosco
 - Xavier Foissac
 - Gudrun Strauss
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 2,3 and 4 of March 2016 were agreed on the 17 March 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The changes in the methodology and terminology as well as the new modifications in the template have been debated. The approach of Entry and Establishment section was slightly revised. The discussion on spread impact and risk reduction options was continued. The first estimates on spread rate for Grapevine Flavescence dorée phytoplasma and its vector *Scaphoideus titanus* were calculated and presented. The Working group further discussed the calculation approach the estimation and justification of the basic values. Additional dates were identified and added to the working plan.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma on the 17-18 of March of 2016.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 17-18 of March 2016, EFSA, Parma
(Agreed on 20 of April 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
 - Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
 - Roel Potting
 - Trond Rafoss
 - Domenico Bosco
 - Xavier Foissac
 - Gudrun Strauss
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo
 - AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 17-18 of March 2016 were agreed on the 20 April 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The Working group further discussed the calculation approach the estimation and justification of the basic values. Issues concerning justification, variability and uncertainty were raised. Different scenarios were defined in the assessment. The discussion on entry, establishment, spread and impact sections was continued. A session with the Methodology group and the two other working groups was held to harmonise the approach. The three pilot projects agreed that the recent procedure is quite time-consuming and the opinions are running late. The deadline for adoption has been officially extended until September 2016.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 31 of March of 2016 (web).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 12nd meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 31 of March 2016, web
(Agreed on 20 April 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Trond Rafoss
 - Domenico Bosco
 - Gudrun Strauss
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Gabor Hollo

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 31 of March 2016 were agreed on the 20 April 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The meeting focused on establishment and spread. The Working Group discussed the new maps added to the text, revised the NUTS regions and agreed on the first spread estimates based on the most updated database. Nevertheless further refinement and argument with the other experts will still be needed.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 20-22 of April of 2016 (Parma, EFSA).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 20-22 of April 2016, Parma
(Agreed on 26 May 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
 - Trond Rafoss (via web)
 - Elisavet Chatzivassiliou (20-21 April)
 - Roel Potting
 - Xavier Foissac
 - Domenico Bosco (via web)
- **EFSA:**
 - Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit), Olaf Mosbach Schulz (AMU Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Gudrun Strauss

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 20-22 of April 2016 were agreed on the 26 May 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The work on spread, impact and risk reduction options was continued. The estimation of the basic values was agreed whilst the justification behind and the source of uncertainties were drafted along. The spread model and the approach of risk reduction options evaluation were further developed. Additional dates were identified and added to the working plan.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 2 of May of 2016 (web).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 2 and 4 of May 2016, web
(Agreed on 26 May 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
- Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
- Thierry Candresse
- Trond Rafoss
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Roel Potting
- Gudrun Straus
- Domenico Bosco

- **EFSA:**
- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Xavier Foissac

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 2 and 4 of May 2016 were agreed on the 26 May 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The Working Group discussed the new maps, the spread estimates and the updated NUTS regions. The evaluation of risk reduction options was continued and the spread and impact sections were generally revised.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 26-27 of May of 2016 (Brussels).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 26 and 27 of May 2016, web
(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Jean Claude Gregoire (chair)
 - Thierry Candresse
 - Trond Rafoss
 - Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
 - Roel Potting
 - Xavier Foissac
 - Domenico Bosco
- **EFSA:**
 - Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)
 - Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Gudrun Straus

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 26 and 27 of May 2016 were accepted by the WG on the 22nd of September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

Among the list of possible scenarios previously listed three were identified. The spread models and estimates were further discussed. The Working Group went through the whole list of RROs and their effectiveness and feasibility was assessed. Summary of the discussion regarding the Flavescence Doree Phytoplasma at the PLH Plenary was given.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 17 and 23 of June of 2016 (web).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 17 and 23 of June 2016, web
(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
- Jean Claude Gregoire (17 and 23 of June)
- Thierry Candresse (23 of June)
- Trond Rafoss (17 and 23 of June)
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou (17 and 23 of June)
- Roel Potting (17 of June)
- Xavier Foissac (17 and 23 of June)
- Domenico Bosco (17 of June)

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 17 and 23 of June were accepted by the WG on the 22 of September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The meeting primarily focused on risk reduction options. The experts assessed the efficacy of a phytosanitary measure and described the current implementation. Limiting factors in the RRO's currently applied were also defined. An update on spread estimation was given. Further tasks were discussed and distributed. Additional meeting dates were added.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 27 and 28 of June of 2016 (Parma).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 27 and 28 of June 2016, Parma
(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
- Jean Claude Gregoire (28 of June pm)
- Trond Rafoss
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Roel Potting
- Xavier Foissac
- Domenico Bosco

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)
- Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (AMU Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Thierry Candresse and Gudrun Strauss

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-

Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held on 27 and 28 of June were accepted by the WG on the 22 of September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The initial condition for the spread (*with current measures in place*) and its justification were discussed. The overall assessment of the estimated number of spatial units occupied by the pest at the time horizon for scenario A0, A1 and A2 was finalized. The WG calculated the number of NUTS with grapevine. In the count the already occupied (*by the pest and vector*), non-occupied but suitable areas were also taken into consideration. The WG plans to finalise the opinion were discussed and presented on the PLH plenary meeting. It was agreed that that the first draft will be circulated to the PLH Panel by early September. Further tasks with the WG were discussed and distributed.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held between the 11-14 of July of 2016 (Parma).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

Held on 11, 12, 13 and 14 of July 2016, Parma

(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Jean Claude Grégoire (chair)
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Thierry Candresse
- Trond Rafoss (via web partly)
- Roel Potting (via web partly)
- Domenico Bosco (via web partly)

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)
- Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (AMU Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Xavier Foissac

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held from 11 to 14 of July were accepted by the WG on the 22 September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The objective of the meeting was to draft the opinion based on the available data. In order to effectively proceed all the ratings and the reasoning behind had to be finished. Some further information on production had to be gathered; in addition the calculation and the curves to be completed, also the spread model had to be re-estimated. Regarding the quantiles subsequent expert elicitation were performed.

In order to finalize the draft by early September the WG decided to add further web-meetings in August.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held between the 25 of July of 2016 (web).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 25 of July 2016, web
(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)**

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Thierry Candresse

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

No apologies received

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held from 25 of July were accepted by the WG on the 22 of September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The spread and impact sections were drafted mainly for scenario A0. Further shortcomings in the draft were identified. The latest draft was circulated to the WG.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 17 of August of 2016 (web).

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 17 of August 2016, web
(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)**

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

No apologies received

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held from 17 of August were accepted by the WG on the 22 of September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The meeting focused on risk reduction options (RRO's) part. The description of the individual RRO's and their limitations were drafted. It was concluded that additional work is needed in this section. The expertise of other WG members is necessary to rate the overall effectiveness, search for the weaknesses in the system and propose additional improvements. It is also essential to decide the strategy how present the RRO's in the final document.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 23 of August of 2016 (web).

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 21st meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 23 of August 2016, web
(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)**

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Jean Claude Grégoire (chair)
- Thierry Candresse
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Roel Potting

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA)
- Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (AMU)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held from 23 of August were accepted by the WG on the 22 of September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The contributions of the experts during the summer were incorporated into the latest draft. Comments and further recommendations were discussed with the participants. The conclusions on spread and impact sections were drafted moreover the overview of current phytosanitary measures and their limitations were discussed. Additional shortcomings were identified.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 30 of August of 2016 (web).

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 22nd meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 30 of August 2016, web
(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)**

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Roel Potting

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

No apologies received

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held from 30 of August were accepted by the WG on the 22 of September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The meeting focused on the risk reduction options (RRO's) section. A concept for a new version of the RRO annex was presented and discussed. The evaluation of the different scenarios was drafted and the summary excel table was updated. The main limitation in implementation and a rating of the level of limiting factors were added in scenario A0. The proposed strengthened measures were drafted. The description of the individual RRO's were also revised. Further data needs from the experts were identified.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held between the 1-2 of September of 2016 (Parma).

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 23rd meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 1-2 of September 2016, Parma
(Accepted on the 22nd of September 2016)**

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Jean Claude Gregoire
- Thierry Candresse
- Trond Rafoss
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Roel Potting
- Xavier Foissac
- Domenico Bosco

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)
- Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (AMU Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Gudrun Strauss

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held from 1-2 of September were accepted by the WG on the 22 of September 2016.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The draft risk assessment has been revised in detail by the WG members. The risk reduction options were finalized and the strategy how to present them was defined. The model specification for impact calculations was completed. The summary, the final conclusions and the abstract were also drafted.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 22 of September of 2016 (web).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 24rd meeting of the Working Group on *Flavescence dorée* risk assessment

**Held on 22 of September 2016, Web
(Written adoption on 15 of November)**

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Jean Claude Gregoire
- Thierry Candresse
- Trond Rafoss
- Elisavet Chatzivassiliou
- Roel Potting
- Xavier Foissac
- Domenico Bosco

EFSA:

- Gabor Hollo (ALPHA Unit)
- Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (AMU Unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Gudrun Strauss

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of this Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the meeting held from 22 of September were adopted by the WG in writing.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Discussion on the scientific opinions on the risk to plant health of Grapevine Flavescence dorée risk assessment (EFSA-Q-2015-00271) for the EU territory

The comments of the Plant Health Panel have been discussed and where appropriate the draft risk assessment has been modified accordingly.

6. Next meeting

No further meeting foreseen.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>