

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Parma, 6-7 November 2014

(agreed on 20 January 2015)

Participants

- Working Group Experts:
 - Robert Smith, Ryszard Laskowski, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowsky, Chris Topping, Paulo Sousa, Barbara Manachini, Aaldrik Tiktak, Michael Klein, Ton van der Linden, Frank de Jong
- EFSA:
 - Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 22 October 2014.

The minutes were agreed on 06/11/2014 and published on the EFSA website 19/02/2015.

5. Discussion points

Preparation of the Scientific opinion addressing the state of science on risk assessment for non target arthropods ([EFSA-Q-2011-00975](#)) and of the Scientific Opinion addressing the state of the science on in-soil risk assessment ([EFSA-Q-2011-00978](#)).

The comments of the panel on the draft opinion were discussed and answered. It was agreed to make amendments in the different chapters in line with the recommendations of the panel.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Parma, 21 October 2014

(agreed on 22 October 2014)

Participants

- Working Group Experts:
 - Robert Smith, Ryszard Laskowski, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowsky, Chris Topping, Paulo Sousa, Barbara Manachini
- **EFSA:**
 - Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Aaldrik Tiktak, **Michael Klein, Ton van der Linden and Frank de Jong**

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 16-18 September 2014.

The minutes were agreed on 21/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on the 10/11/2014.

5. Discussion points

Preparation of the Scientific opinion addressing the state of science on risk assessment for non target arthropods ([EFSA-Q-2011-00975](#)) and of the Scientific Opinion addressing the state of the science on in-soil risk assessment ([EFSA-Q-2011-00978](#)).

The comments of the panel on the draft opinion were discussed. It was agreed to make amendments in the different chapters in line with the recommendations of the panel. The tasks were distributed among the authors of the chapters.

6. Miscellaneous

7. The next WG

Non-target Arthropods + In soil organisms Risk Assessment will be in Parma on 6-7 November.

PESTICIDES UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Parma, 16-18 September 2014

(Agreed on 21 October 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Robert Smith, Aldrik Tiktak (17+18 June), Ryszard Laskowski, , Frank de Jong (16+17 June), Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowsky, Chris Topping
- **EFSA:**
 - Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paulo Sousa, Barbara Manachini

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes and addition of a new discussion point on the final structure of the document.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 16-18 June 2014

The minutes were agreed on 16/09/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 13 October 2014.

5. Discussion points

A new structure of the document was agreed. The chapter on risk assessment will be deleted and integrated in chapter 5 on the general framework for risk assessment of NTAs. It will include a proposal for a risk assessment scheme, reference tier, calibration of different risk assessment tiers.

Agreement was reached on the content of the chapters on reference tier and calibration of the lower tiers.

The exposure chapter and the new effects chapter were discussed and amended according to the suggestions of the WG.

Tasks and timelines were agreed in order to finalise the draft opinion for distribution to the panel for a first reading.

6. Miscellaneous

The next WG Non-target Arthropods + In soil organisms Risk Assessment will be a teleconference on 21 October.

PESTICIDES UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Held on 16-18 June 2014, Vienna

(Agreed on 16 September)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

- Robert Smith, Aldrik Tiktak (17+18 June), Ryszard Laskowski, , Frank de Jong (16+17 June), Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowsky, Chris Topping, Barbara Manachini.

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paulo Sousa, Ton van der Linden and Michael Klein.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 22-23 May 2014.

The minutes were agreed on 16 June 2014 and published on the EFSA website.

5. Discussion of new contributions

The aim of this meeting was to discuss new contributions to the draft opinion and to identify tasks for the next meeting.

Some changes were proposed in the effect chapter of the opinion

A draft scheme for the risk assessment was agreed as well as the principles of a tiered approach specific for the non-target arthropod assessment. A suggestion for a reference tier was developed.

The potential use of different models to develop specific protection goal options based on the ecosystem service pest control was discussed.

Text which describes the main exposure routes was agreed and made available to develop further the exposure chapter.

6. Miscellaneous

The next WG Non-target Arthropods + In-soil organisms Risk Assessment will be in Parma on 16–18 September 2014.

PESTICIDES UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Held on 22-23 May 2014, Parma

Agreed on 16 June 2014

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

- Robert Smith, Aldrik Tiktak, Ryszard Laskowski, Ton van der Linden, Michael Klein, Frank de Jong, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowsky, Chris Topping, Barbara Manachini.

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl, Laura Villamar Bouza.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paulo Sousa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 27-28 March 2014

The minutes were agreed on 22/05/2014 and published on the EFSA website.

5. Discussion of new contributions

The aim of this meeting was to discuss and identify issues which need to be worked on so that they can be discussed in the next meeting of the working group.

Some changes were proposed in the effect chapter of the opinion as well as the exposure chapter.

New simulations have been proposed to illustrate exposure routes for different life stages of arthropods and to develop an example how to link exposure and effects.

The main pending point for the next meeting is related to further development of the specific protection goal options.

6. Miscellaneous

The next WG Non-target Arthropods + In soil organisms Risk Assessment will be in Vienna on 16– 18 June 2014.

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Held on 27-28 March 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 22 May 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

- Robert Smith, Aldrik Tiktak, Ryszard Laskowski, Ton van der Linden, Michael Klein, Frank de Jong (absent), Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowski, Chris Topping, Barbara Manachini.

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl, Laura Villamar Bouza (only 27 March).

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Frank de Jong.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 6-8 January 2014

The minutes were agreed on 27/03/2014 and published on the EFSA website.

5. Discussion of new contributions

The working group has been informed about the need to define the **SPGs** (Specific Protection Goals) in detail and to develop different options for risk managers to choose.

New simulations of the beetle population model have been presented and discussed. It was concluded that it was demonstrated that in-field impacts can produce off-field effects and that wide field margins and a diverse landscape can buffer in-field effects.

Alignment with the ongoing working group of the scientific committee on recovery is important as well as harmonization of the terminology used.

New contributions on the ecosystem service pest control and on food web support were discussed and agreed. Once more it was pointed out that it is difficult to make a quantitative link between population level effects and effects on ecosystem service because of a lack of data.

The definition of a reference tier was discussed. Possible reference tier options are field studies or models which include data from field studies.

An update of the exposure chapter was presented and the group agreed on a way forward to calculate exposure in the off-field.

6. Miscellaneous

The next WG Non-target Arthropods+In soil organisms Risk Assessment will be in Parma on 22 – 23 May 2014.

PESTICIDES UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Held on 6-8 January 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 27 march 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Robert Smith (6-7 January), Aaldrik Tiktak, Ryszard Laskowski, Ton van der Linden, Michael Klein, Frank de Jong, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowski, Chris Topping.
- **EFSA:**
 - Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl, Laura Villamar.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paulo Sousa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 17 December 2013

The minutes were agreed on 6 January 2014 and published on the EFSA website on 14 January 2014.

5. Discussion of new contributions

A model simulation has been carried on by a member of the working group. The results were presented and discussed in the meeting.

Gaps in the current assessment were identified. It was decided to investigate with the model the effects of field margin width and buffer strips.

Related to the draft opinion, some chapters have been discussed during the meeting and the structure of the document was amended. Tasks for the next meeting were distributed among the experts.

6. Miscellaneous

The group agreed on new dates of meetings.

PESTICIDES UNIT

Parma, 20 December 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 5th webconference of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Parma, 17 December 2013

EFSA / Pesticides

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Robert Smith, Aldrik Tiktak, Ryszard Laskowski, Ton van der Linden, Michael Klein, Frank de Jong, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowski, Chris Topping
- **EFSA:**
 - Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl, Laura Villamar.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paulo Sousa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 19/20 11 2013.

The minutes were agreed on 08 01 2014 and published on the EFSA website 10 01 2014.

5. Discussion of new contributions

Some chapter has been discussed during the conference. Consequently, some tasks came to light to develop the work for the next meetings.

The parameters of the model run have been presented by the responsible working group member.

The harmonization with the NTTP group has been identified.

6. Miscellaneous

PESTICIDES UNIT

Parma, 20 November 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Parma, 19-20 November 2013

EFSA / Pesticides

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

- Robert Smith, Aaldrik Tiktak, Ryszard Laskowski, Ton van der Linden (only 19 Nov.), Michael Klein (only on 19 Nov.), Frank de Jong, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowski, Chris Topping, Paulo Sousa

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Peter Craig.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 24/25 10 2013

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 20 12 2013 and published on the EFSA website 10 01 2014.

5. Discussion of new contributions

6. Miscellaneous

The rapporteurs for different chapters of the opinion were identified.

PESTICIDES UNIT

Parma, 28 October 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Berlin, 24-25 October 2013

EFSA / Pesticides

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

- Robert Smith, Aldrik Tiktak, Ryszard Laskowski, Ton van der Linden, Michael Klein (only on 25 Oct.), Frank de Jong, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowski, Peter Craig, Chris Topping

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paulo Sousa

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 17/20 09 2013

The minutes were agreed on 20 12 2013 and published on the EFSA website 10 01 2014.

5. Discussion of new contributions

A summary of ESCORT III was presented. Different new contributions were discussed and a way forward in order to identify the main exposure routes was developed. It was also discussed on how modelling could help in order to derive proposals on the width of buffer strips.

6. Miscellaneous

The rapporteurs for different chapters of the opinion were identified.

PESTICIDES UNIT

Parma, 24 September 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Parma, 17-20 September 2013

EFSA / Pesticides

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

- Robert Smith, Aldrik Tiktak, Ryszard Laskowski, Ton van der Linden, Michael Klein, Paulo Sousa, Frank de Jong, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowski, Peter Craig, Barbara Manachini, Ingvar Sundh, Chris Topping (19-20. September),

- **Hearing Experts:**

- Carsten Brühl (17-18. September), Josep Anton Jacas Miret (19-20. September)

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 18/19 06 2013

The minutes were agreed on 20 12 2013 and published on the EFSA website 10 01 2013.

5. Presentation hearing experts and discussion of new contributions

A presentation on the size of off-field habitats in Germany was given. Research was presented on representativeness of non-target arthropods test species and indirect effects. The current field study design was discussed and whether recovery observed in small plot experiments can be extrapolated to other situations. A first draft of calibration of HQ values was presented and discussed. A population model for carabid beetles and spiders suggests that long-term population effects may not be covered by current field studies. Different possibilities of using these models were explored.

Issues which are of importance for the development of the opinion were identified. Next steps in the development of the opinion were agreed.

A preliminary structure of the opinion was developed.

6. Miscellaneous

Future meeting dates were agreed for 2014.

PESTICIDES UNIT

Parma, 09 July 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Non-Target Arthropod and In-soil Risk Assessment

Parma, 18/19 June 2013

EFSA / Pesticides

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

- Robert Smith, Aldrik Tiktak, Ryszard Laskowski, Ton van der Linden, Michael Klein, Paulo Sousa, Frank de Jong, Silvia Pieper, Klaus Swarowski, Peter Craig (18.6.)

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with slight changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the Previous Working Group meetings.

Not applicable.

5. Presentation of available documents (spatial boundaries, specific protection goals)

The concepts on how to define spatial boundaries and how to integrate them in the risk assessment scheme were presented and agreed. The specific protection goal options and the methodology on how to derive them was presented.

6. Discussion of tasks and future workplan

Different tasks were identified and it was agreed among the experts who will take on which tasks.

7. Specific protection goal options

The working group started to work on different options for specific protection goals. Responsibilities and deadlines for contributions were agreed.

8. Miscellaneous

Future meeting dates were agreed.

9. Next meeting

The WG will meet in Parma in September, 17-18 (1 day) and 19-20 (1 day).