



PPR / Pesticide Peer Review Unit

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Bat Risk Assessment

Held on 7-8 May 2019, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 15 May 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping

Philippe Berny

Danilo Russo

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Rachel Sharp

- **Others:**

Not Applicable



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 4-6 March 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 7th WG meeting were agreed by written procedure on 13 March 2019.

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Not applicable

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Integration of feedback received from PPR panel on the draft document

The feedback and recommendations received from the PPR panel were discussed and integrated in the updated document. The comments provided by the panel were answered.

6.2. Update and agreement on dermal exposure calculation

The dermal exposure calculations were updated with agreed parameters.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6.3. Writing of abstract

The experts agreed on a final text for the abstract

6.4. Glossary

Suggestions for terms which should be listed the glossary were collected.

7. Any Other Business

Not applicable

8. Next meeting(s)

Not applicable



PPR / Pesticide Peer Review Unit

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Bat Risk Assessment

Held on 4-6 March 2019, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 13 March 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping

Philippe Berny

Danilo Russo

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 13 February 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 6th WG meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18 February 2019.

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Not applicable

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Integration of feedback received on the draft document

The feedback received on the draft exposure calculations were discussed and integrated in updated chapters.

6.2. Presentation and discussion of latest contributions on toxicity comparison and bioaccumulation

The latest contribution on toxicological comparisons and bioaccumulation issues specific for bats were discussed and amendments of the text were agreed.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6.3. Predicted environmental concentrations (PEC) in air.

Refined PEC in air concentrations would be necessary for more precise dermal and inhalation exposure estimates. This will be highlighted in the document as a recommendation for future developments.

6.4. Agreement on the recommendations and conclusions and finalisation of chapters

The experts agreed on the content of the conclusions and recommendations chapter. Good progress was made in finalisation of the different chapters.

7. Any Other Business

Not applicable

8. Next meeting(s)

07-08. 05. 2019, EFSA Parma, 1.5 d (Tu 14:00 – We 18:00)

PPR / Peer Review Unit

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Bat Risk Assessment

Held on 13 February 2019, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 18 February 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping

Philippe Berny

Danilo Russo

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 13-15 January 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 5th WG meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25 January 2019.

5. Hearing Expert(s)

Not applicable

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Feedback from the panel

The feedback from the PPR panel on the results of the exposure calculation and toxicological comparison with birds and terrestrial mammals was presented to the WG.

6.2. How to address the points raised by the panel

The points raised by the panel will be covered by the different chapters.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6.3. Update on the exposure calculations and comparison with birds and terrestrial mammals

Updated exposure calculations were presented to the WG. The results and conclusion on the comparison with terrestrial mammals and birds were agreed. Decisions were taken on which parts should remain in the main text of the statement and which parts should be moved to appendices.

6.4. Developing conclusions and suggestions for future knowledge gathering

It was agreed that conclusions and recommendations should be drafted for each chapter as input in the overall conclusions and recommendations chapter of the statement.

7. Any Other Business

Not applicable

8. Next meeting(s)

04-06. 03. 2019, EFSA Parma, 2 d (Mo 14:00 – We 13:00)

07-08. 05. 2019, EFSA Parma, 1.5 d (Tu 14:00 – We 18:00)

PPR / Pesticide Unit

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Bat Risk Assessment

Held on 15-17 January 2019, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 25 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping

Philippe Berny

Danilo Russo

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Joanne van Dijk, Lucie Ctverackova

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after adding two agenda points on inhalation exposure calculations and a recently published document on neonicotinoids and bats.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 12 December 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 4th WG meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18 December 2018.

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Not applicable

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Discussion on residues data in flying insects

The different factors affecting residues measured in flying insects were analysed. It was agreed that different choices can be made for selecting residues studies in order to achieve residues values which are representative for the insects eaten by bats and which

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

also cover the range of different factors which influence residues in flying insects.

6.2. Discussion on inhalation exposure calculations

First inhalation exposure calculations were presented. The experts agreed on the principle of the calculation.

6.3. Discussion on chapter on general biology

It was agreed that the main text of the chapter should be included in an appendix and that a shortened summary which is focused on the main issues related to the risk from pesticides will be included in the main body of the text.

6.4. Discussion on draft statement, missing sections, tasks

No missing sections were identified. Some of the tasks were re-allocated in the working group.

6.5. Discussion on recent publication on bats and neonicotinoids

The experts discussed the content of the publication on neonicotinoid insecticides and bats. It was noted that the publication considered direct and indirect effects on bats. Reference will be made to it in the statement and a careful checking will be conducted if there is new information which is relevant for the development of the bat statement.

6.6. Discussion on the presentation in the PPR plenary

It was agreed that the experts will send slides to the ones presenting the progress made with the development of the statement since the last PPR plenary.

7. Any Other Business

Not applicable

8. Next meeting(s)

13. 02. 2019, TC, 4h (We 9:00-13:00)

04-06. 03. 2019, EFSA Parma, 2 d (Mo 14:00 – We 13:00)

07-08. 05. 2019, EFSA Parma, 1.5 d (Tu 14:00 – We 18:00)

PPR / Pesticide Unit

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Bat Risk Assessment

Held on 12 December 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 18 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping, Philippe Berny and Danilo Russo

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Joanne van Dijk, Lucie Ctverackova

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after adding an agenda point on bat risk assessment in banana plantations.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 10 September 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 3rd WG meeting were agreed by written procedure on 27 November 2018.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Discussion on oral exposure calculations

First results from the comparison of oral exposure estimates for bats and birds and mammals were presented. Points for discussion were the energy requirements of bats and the different sources of information for the energy requirements. The focus of the comparison with the shortcut values for birds and mammals and the residues for flying insects to be used in the oral exposure calculations. A need for further analysis of the database was identified by the working group experts.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

5.2. Discussion on dermal exposure calculations

A first draft of the section on dermal exposure calculations was presented and agreed by the working group. The experts identified the need for expertise on air concentrations during spraying.

5.3. Discussion on literature review Appendix.

It was agreed that the appendix should focus on the methodology of the literature review. There is no need to provide a summary of the results as the information retrieved is the basis for the different chapters in the statement and hence would lead to duplication of text.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Uses in bananas

The WG received a message from the general peer-review meeting that uses in bananas should be considered in the revision of the birds and mammals Guidance and in the statement on bats. The experts were of the opinion that insect-eating bats would be covered by the methodology proposed in the statement and considering an orchard scenario. Fruit-eating bats would need to be addressed separately. As a first step it was agreed to collect further data on fruit-eating bats.

7. Next meetings

- 15-17 January 2019
- 13 February 2019
- 04-06 March 2019
- 07-08 May 2019

PPR / Pesticide Unit

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Bat Risk Assessment

Held on 20-22 November 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 27 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping, Philippe Berny and Danilo Russo

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Stefania Barmaz, Rachel Sharp, Joanke van Dijk, Lucie Ctverackova

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after adding an agenda point on a presentation regarding risk assessment for bats on biocides.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 15-16 October 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 2nd WG meeting were agreed by written procedure on 22 October 2018.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Presentation on bat risk assessment for biocides

Two MSs provided some information on tools for the risk assessment for bats related to biocides (wood preservatives) available at national level only. The risk assessment schemes provided were not considered applicable to pesticides because of difference in applications and potential exposure routes for bats.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

5.2. Update of chapter on general biology of bats

The updated version of the chapter was presented. The content was agreed by the working group experts.

5.3. Oral exposure calculations.

Publications providing key information on daily energy expenditure of bats were discussed. It was agreed that the oral exposure estimation should follow the same principles as in the Birds and Mammals GD with bat specific parameters for energy expenditure and food composition. The life stages of bats with the highest energy requirements were during late lactation. The lactation period is in spring and early summer and therefore coincides with the time of when most pesticides are applied. The most relevant oral exposure scenario is therefore a lactating female bat. Concerns were also raised regarding pups which might receive a higher dose via the milk.

5.4. Aggregated information from the literature review

Information retrieved in the literature review on food intake rates, daily energy expenditure, assimilation efficiency and (if available) the proportion of different insect sizes in the bat food and the time bats spend foraging in agricultural landscapes was summarized in one document. A short presentation was given on a Dutch report where pesticide residues in bat droppings and in dead bats were measured. The results confirm that bats are exposed to plant protection products.

5.5. How to address inhalation and dermal exposure

A methodology on how to calculate inhalation and dermal exposure was discussed and agreed by the working group. The parameters needed for the calculations were identified and need to be retrieved from literature on bat biology.

6. Next meetings

- 12 December 2018

- 15-17 January 2019
- 13 February 2019
- 04-06 March 2019
- 07-08 May 2019

PPR / Pesticide Unit

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Bat Risk Assessment

Held on 15-16 October 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 22 October 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping, Philippe Berny and Danilo Russo (teleconference)

- **Hearing Experts:**

Carsten Brühl

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Stefania Barmaz, Rachel Sharp, Lucie Ctverackova

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 10 September 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 1st WG meeting were agreed by written procedure on 14 September 2018.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Presentation on bat research and risk assessment

The results of a research project on bat occurrence and insect residues in orchards in Germany were presented. The study included also a risk assessment for bats based on the insect residue data collected in the study.

5.2. Discussion of chapter on general biology of bats

A first outline of the chapter on general biology of bats was presented.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

The quantitative approach of comparing different life history traits of mammals was considered useful and should be included in the final document.

5.3. Presentation of literature review and data extraction, agreement on which data should be further aggregated.

An overview was given on the information that was retrieved on population trends, life history traits, habitat use, feeding strategies, foraging activity and diet composition of some species.

It was recommended that information should be retrieved and summarised on food intake rates, daily energy expenditure, assimilation efficiency and (if available) the proportion of different insect sizes in the bat food and the time bats spend foraging in agricultural landscapes.

6. Next meetings

- 20-22 November 2018
- 12 December 2018
- 15-17 January 2019
- 13 February 2019
- 04-06 March 2019
- 07-08 May 2019

PPR / Pesticide Unit

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Bat Risk Assessment

**Held on 10-11 September 2018, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 14 September 2108)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping, Philippe Berny and Danilo Russo

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Stefania Barmaz, Rachel Sharp and Joanke van Dijk

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Presentation and clarification of mandate

The background, objectives and terms of references were presented. Some of the points in the terms of references were further clarified. All experts were of the opinion that it is possible to address the terms of references in the statement. However, it was highlighted that the first point of the terms of references will be very challenging as only very little toxicological data exist for bats which can be used to explore whether the available endpoints for other vertebrates might be useful to predict the toxicity of pesticides to bats.

4.2. Presentation of literature review and data extraction

The ongoing literature review was presented. An overview was given on the search strings and the results of the searches.

¹ [EFSA's policy on independence](#)

² [Decision on competing interest management](#)

The data retrieved on toxicological information on bats was also shown to the experts.

4.3. Feedback and recommendations for the literature review and data extraction

The search results were discussed and recommendations were given to add some searches for obtaining further information. The data on life history traits, diet, feeding patterns and energy requirements are essential to address all points in the terms of references. A similar format for data extraction should be followed as for the data on toxicological information.

4.4. Structure of the document and sharing of writing tasks

The main chapters of the document were agreed on the basis of the terms of references. An additional chapter was required on the biology and ecology of bats in view of risk estimates for oral, dermal and inhalation exposure of bats and their vulnerability to toxic effects of pesticides

5. Future meeting dates, teleconferences and physical meetings

Future meeting dates were agreed by all experts:

- 15-16 October 2018
- 20-22 November 2018
- 12 December 2018
- 15-17 January 2019
- 13 February 2019
- 04-06 March 2019
- 07-08 May 2019