



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURING (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 4TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE RE-EVALUATION OF PHOSPHATES AS FOOD ADDITIVES

Held on 18th March 2019, web conference

(Agreed on 18th March 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members: Peter Aggett, Adamasco Cupisti, Cristina Fortes, Gunter Kuhnle, Inger Therese Lillegaard, Peter Moldeus, Michael Scotter and Ursula Gundert-Remy (Chair)
- EFSA FIP Unit: Alessandra Giarola, Alexandra Tard
- European Commission as observer: Guillermo Cardon

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4. Feedback from Scientific Committee

Alessandra Giarola gave a feedback on the discussion about phosphates held at the Scientific Committee Panel meeting on November 2018 and more recently on February 2019.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1 Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

Phosphoric acid (E 338), Monosodium phosphate (E 339(i)), Disodium phosphate (E 339 (ii)), Trisodium phosphate (E 339 (iii)), Monopotassium phosphate (E 340 (i)), Dipotassium phosphate (E 340 (ii)), Tripotassium phosphate (E 340 (iii)), Calcium dihydrogen phosphate (E 341 (i)), Calcium hydrogen phosphate (E 341 (ii)), Tricalcium phosphate (E 341 (iii)), Monomagnesium phosphate (E 343 (i)), Dimagnesium phosphate (E 343 (ii)), Disodium diphosphate (E 450 (i)), Trisodium diphosphate (E 450 (ii)), tetrasodium diphosphate (E 450 (iii)), Tetrapotassium diphosphate (E 450 (v)), Dicalcium diphosphate (E 450 (vi)), Calcium dihydrogen diphosphate (E 450 (vii)), Magnesium dihydrogen diphosphate (E 450 (ix)), Pentasodium triphosphate (E 451 (i)), Pentapotassium triphosphate (E 451 (ii)), Sodium polyphosphate (E 452 (i)), Potassium polyphosphate (E452 (ii)), Sodium Calcium polyphosphate (E 452 (iii)), Calcium polyphosphate (E 452 (iv)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00532](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00533](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00534](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00535](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00536](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00537](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00538](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00539](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00540](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00541](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00542](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00543](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00618](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00619](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00620](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00621](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00622](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00623](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00624](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00625](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00626](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00628](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00629](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00630](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00597](#))

The opinion has been finalised and will be presented at the forthcoming FAF Panel meeting.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of phosphates as food additives held on 18th March 2019 were agreed.

Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

Minutes of the 3rd Meeting of the Working Group on the re-evaluation of Phosphates

Held on 14th -15th November 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 15th November 2018)

Participants

■ **Working Group Members:**

- Peter Aggett, Adamasco Cupisti, Cristina Fortes, Gunter Kuhnle, Inger Therese Lillegaard, Michael Scotter and Ursula Gundert-Remy

- Apologies from Peter Moldeus

■ **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not present

■ **EFSA**

FIP Unit: Eleonora Alquati, Dimitrios Chrysafidis, Alessandra Giarola, Alexandra Tard

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Adoption of the notes of the previous meeting

The notes were adopted without changes.

4. Feedback from FAF Panel, EFSA and European Commission

The Chair gave a feedback on the discussion phosphates draft opinion at the FAF Panel meeting in October.

5. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

6. Scientific contributions by the members of WG submitted for consideration

Phosphoric acid (E 338), Monosodium phosphate (E 339(i)), Disodium phosphate (E 339 (ii)), Trisodium phosphate (E 339 (iii)), Monopotassium phosphate (E 340 (i)), Dipotassium phosphate (E 340 (ii)), Tripotassium phosphate (E 340 (iii)), Calcium dihydrogen phosphate (E 341 (i)), Calcium hydrogen phosphate (E 341 (ii)), Tricalcium phosphate (E 341 (iii)), Monomagnesium phosphate (E 343 (i)), Dimagnesium phosphate (E 343 (ii)), Disodium diphosphate (E 450 (i)), Trisodium diphosphate (E 450 (ii)), tetrasodium diphosphate (E 450 (iii)), Tetrapotassium diphosphate (E 450 (v)), Dicalcium diphosphate (E 450 (vi)), Calcium dihydrogen diphosphate (E 450 (vii)), Magnesium dihydrogen diphosphate (E 450 (ix)), Pentasodium triphosphate (E 451 (i)), Pentapotassium triphosphate (E 451 (ii)), Sodium polyphosphate (E 452 (i)), Potassium polyphosphate (E452 (ii)), Sodium Calcium polyphosphate (E 452 (iii)), Calcium polyphosphate (E 452 (iv)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00532](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00533](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00534](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00535](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00536](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00537](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00538](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00539](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00540](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00541](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00542](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00543](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00618](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00619](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00620](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00621](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00622](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00623](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-00624](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf); [EFSA-Q-2011-](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf)

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

[00625](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00626](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00627](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00628](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00629](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00630](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00597](#))

The whole body of the opinion has been reviewed in preparation of the next FAF Plenary meeting.

7. Any Other Business

- 7.1. Minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting on Phosphates held on 14th -15th November 2018 were agreed.
- 7.2. Tasks were agreed in preparation for the next Panel meeting.

Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

Minutes of the 2nd Meeting of the Working Group on the re-evaluation of Phosphates

Held on 15th -17th October 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 17th October 2018)

Participants

■ **Working Group Members:**

- Peter Aggett, Adamasco Cupisti, Cristina Fortes, Gunter Kuhnle, Inger Therese Lillegaard, Peter Moldeus, Michael Scotter and Ursula Gundert-Remy

- Apologies from Gunter Kuhnle on Day 1

■ **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not present

■ **EFSA**

FIP Unit: Dimitrios Chrysafidis, Alessandra Giarola, Alexandra Tard

Nutrition Unit: Agnes de Sesmaisons-Lecarre

SCER Unit: Jean-Lou Dorne

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Adoption of the notes of the previous meeting

4. Feedback from FAF Panel, EFSA and European Commission

The Chair gave a feedback on the discussion on phosphates draft opinion at the FAF Panel meeting in September.

Agnes de Sesmaisons-Lecarre from Nutritional Unit attended in the afternoon of the second day and provided a feedback on the opinion.

Jean-Lou Dorne from SCER Unit attended in the morning of the third day and provided a feedback on the opinion.

5. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

6. Scientific contributions by the members of WG submitted for consideration

Phosphoric acid (E 338), Monosodium phosphate (E 339(i)), Disodium phosphate (E 339 (ii)), Trisodium phosphate (E 339 (iii)), Monopotassium phosphate (E 340 (i)), Dipotassium phosphate (E 340 (ii)), Tripotassium phosphate (E 340 (iii)), Calcium dihydrogen phosphate (E 341 (i)), Calcium hydrogen phosphate (E 341 (ii)), Tricalcium phosphate (E 341 (iii)), Monomagnesium phosphate (E 343 (i)), Dimagnesium phosphate (E 343 (ii)), Disodium diphosphate (E 450 (i)), Trisodium diphosphate (E 450 (ii)), tetrasodium diphosphate (E 450 (iii)), Tetrapotassium diphosphate (E 450 (v)), Dicalcium diphosphate (E 450 (vi)), Calcium dihydrogen diphosphate (E 450 (vii)), Magnesium dihydrogen diphosphate (E 450 (ix)), Pentasodium triphosphate (E 451 (i)), Pentapotassium triphosphate (E 451 (ii)), Sodium polyphosphate (E 452 (i)), Potassium polyphosphate (E452 (ii)), Sodium Calcium polyphosphate (E 452 (iii)), Calcium

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

polyphosphate (E 452 (iv)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00532](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00533](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00534](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00535](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00536](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00537](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00538](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00539](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00540](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00541](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00542](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00543](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00618](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00619](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00620](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00621](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00622](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00623](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00624](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00625](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00626](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00627](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00628](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00629](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00630](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00597](#))

The whole body of the opinion has been reviewed in preparation of the next FAF Plenary meeting. The tasks for the following WG were agreed.

7. Any Other Business

- 7.1. Minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting on Phosphates held on 15th -17th October 2018 were agreed.
- 7.2. Tasks to be discussed at the next meeting were agreed.
- 7.3. Future meeting 2018: 13th-15th November was confirmed.

Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

Minutes of the 1st Meeting of the Working Group on the re-evaluation of Phosphates

Held on 28th -29th August 2018 Tele/Web conference

(Agreed on 29th August 2018)

Participants

■ **Working Group Members:**

- Peter Aggett, Cristina Fortes, Gunter Kuhnle, Inger Therese Lillegaard, Peter Moldeus, Michael Scotter and Ursula Gundert-Remy

- Adamasco Cupisti attended agenda items 8 and 9 on Day 2

■ **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not present

■ **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Alessandra Giarola, Alexandra Tard

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Adoption of the notes of the previous meeting

4. Feedback from FAF Panel, EFSA and European Commission

At the Inaugural Plenary meeting of the FAF panel a general introductory presentation on the opinion on Phosphates was given by Ursula Gundert-Remy which has been re-appointed as Chair of the WG. A feedback on the presentation given at the plenary meeting has been given to the WG.

5. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

6. Feedback from Public Consultation

The WG reviewed the answers received in response to the public consultation "Questions for health professionals in the fields of nephrology, mineral metabolism, cardiovascular and nutrition medicine on phosphates food additives re-evaluation".

7. Update on exposure assessment

Exposure data provided by Alexandra Tard were reviewed and commented by the WG.

8. Scientific contributions by the members of WG submitted for consideration

7.1 Phosphoric acid (E 338), Monosodium phosphate (E 339(i)), Disodium phosphate (E 339 (ii)), Trisodium phosphate (E 339 (iii)),

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Monopotassium phosphate (E 340 (i)), Dipotassium phosphate (E 340 (ii)), Tripotassium phosphate (E 340 (iii)), Calcium dihydrogen phosphate (E 341 (i)), Calcium hydrogen phosphate (E 341 (ii)), Tricalcium phosphate (E 341 (iii)), Monomagnesium phosphate (E 343 (i)), Dimagnesium phosphate (E 343 (ii)), Disodium diphosphate (E 450 (i)), Trisodium diphosphate (E 450 (ii)), tetrasodium diphosphate (E 450 (iii)), Tetrapotassium diphosphate (E 450 (v)), Dicalcium diphosphate (E 450 (vi)), Calcium dihydrogen diphosphate (E 450 (vii)), Magnesium dihydrogen diphosphate (E 450 (ix)), Pentasodium triphosphate (E 451 (i)), Pentapotassium triphosphate (E 451 (ii)), Sodium polyphosphate (E 452 (i)), Potassium polyphosphate (E 452 (ii)), Sodium Calcium polyphosphate (E 452 (iii)), Calcium polyphosphate (E 452 (iv)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00532](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00533](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00534](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00535](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00536](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00537](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00538](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00539](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00540](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00541](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00542](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00543](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00618](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00619](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00620](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00621](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00622](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00623](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00624](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00625](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00626](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00627](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00628](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00629](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00630](#))

The whole body of the opinion has been reviewed in preparation of the next FAF Plenary meeting. The tasks for the following WG were agreed.

9. Any Other Business

- 9.1. Minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting on Phosphates held on 28th-29th August 2018 were agreed.
- 9.2. Tasks to be discussed at the next meeting were agreed.
- 9.3. Future meeting 2018: 15th(AM)-17th (AM) October in Parma was confirmed.