

## Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources added to Food (ANS)

### Minutes of the 9<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation of food colours

Held on 28-30 September 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 30 September 2015)

#### Participants

##### ■ Working Group Members:

- Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, David Gott, Claude Lambré, Jean-Charles Leblanc, Agneta Oskarsson (Vice chair), Jeanne Stadler, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Ruud Woutersen (Chair)
- Pierre Galtier has participated in agenda points 5.1 and 5.2.
- Paul Tobback has participated in agenda points 5.6 and 5.7.
- Jean-Charles Leblanc has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.1 and 5.2.

##### ■ EFSA:

- FIP Unit: Federica Lodi, Ana Rincon, Alexandra Tard and Stavroula Tasiopoulou

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Jean-Charles Leblanc has not participated in agenda point 5.4.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>2</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

#### **4. Action points from the 8<sup>th</sup> Working Group Colours meeting held on 30 June - 2 July 2015**

The action points were checked.

#### **5. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **5.1. Iron oxides and hydroxides (E 172) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00347](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.2. Beetroot red (E 162) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00350](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.3. Paprika extract, capsanthin, capsorubin (E 160c) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00353](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.4. Silver (E 174) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00346](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.5. Gold (E 175) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00345](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.6. Annatto, bixin, norbixin (E 160b) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00362](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.7. Titanium dioxide (E 171) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00348](#))**

The Rapporteur briefly summarised the new information received by the interested parties. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions and the additional data, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

## **6. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

None.

## **7. Any Other Business**

The items to be discussed at the forthcoming meeting were agreed.

## **8. Agreement of the minutes of the 9<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 28-30 September 2015**

The minutes of the 9<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 28-30 September 2015 were agreed<sup>3</sup>.

## **9. Next meetings:**

- 9-11 November 2015

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/assets/answgcolours.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources added to Food (ANS)

### Minutes of the 8<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation of food colours

Held on 30 June-2 July 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 2 July 2015)

#### Participants

##### ■ Working Group Members:

- Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, Pierre Galtier, David Gott, Claude Lambré, Jean-Charles Leblanc, Agneta Oskarsson (Vice chair), Jeanne Stadler, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Ruud Woutersen (Chair)
- Fernando Aguilar has participated via teleconference, in agenda point 5.3.

##### ■ EFSA:

- FIP Unit: Federica Lodi, Ana Rincon, Stavroula Tasiopoulou

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Jean-Charles Leblanc, David Gott and Ruud Woutersen did not participate in agenda point 5.1.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>2</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

#### 4. Action points from the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group Colours meeting held on 27-29 April 2015

The action points were checked.

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **5. Scientific topics for discussion**

### **5.1. Iron oxides and hydroxides (E 172) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00347](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

### **5.2. Silver (E 174) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00346](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

### **5.3. Cochineal, carminic acid, carmines (E120) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00360](#))**

The latest modifications made in the draft document were presented and discussed. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

### **5.4. Gold (E 175) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00345](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

## **6. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

None.

## **7. Any Other Business**

The items to be discussed at the forthcoming meetings were agreed.

## **8. Agreement of the minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> Working Group meetings on the re-evaluation of food colours**

The minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 26 May 2015 and 30 June-2 July 2015, respectively, were agreed<sup>3</sup>.

## **9. Next meetings:**

- 28-30 September 2015

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fipwgs/documents/answqcolours.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources added to Food (ANS)

### Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation of food colours

Held on 26<sup>th</sup> May 2015 (Web-conference)

(Agreed on 2 July 2015)

#### Participants

##### ■ Working Group Members:

- Fernando Aguilar, Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, Claude Lambré, Jean-Charles Leblanc, Jeanne Stadler, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Ruud Woutersen (Chair)

##### ■ EFSA:

- FIP Unit: Federica Lodi, Ana Maria Rincon, Alexandra Tard, Stavroula Tasiopoulou

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### 4. Action points from 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group Colours meeting held on 27-29 April 2015

The action points were checked.

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **5. Scientific topics for discussion**

### **5.1. Copper complexes of chlorophylls and chlorophyllins (E 141(i,ii)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00356](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00372](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in the Plenary meeting (9-11 June).

## **6. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

None.

## **7. Any Other Business**

None.

## **8. Agreement of the minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 26<sup>th</sup> May 2015**

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

## **9. Next meetings:**

- 30 June-2 July 2015
- 28-30 September 2015

## Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources added to Food (ANS)

### Minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation of food colours

Held on 27-29 April 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 29 April 2015)

#### Participants

##### ■ Working Group Members:

- Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, David Gott, Claude Lambré, Agneta Oskarsson (Vice chair), Jeanne Stadler, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Ruud Woutersen (Chair)
- Jean-Charles Leblanc has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.1, 5.2, 5.3, 5.5 and 5.7.
- Pierre Galtier has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.6 and 5.7

##### ■ EFSA:

- FIP Unit: Federica Lodi, Ana Rincon, Stavroula Tasiopoulou
- DATA Unit: Petra Gergelova

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received by Fernando Aguilar.

David Gott did not participate in agenda points 5.4 and 5.8.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>2</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



#### **4. Action points from 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group Colours meeting held on 2-4 March 2015**

The action points were checked.

#### **5. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **5.1. Cochineal, carminic acid, carmines (E120) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00360](#))**

The latest modifications made in the draft document were presented and discussed. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.2. Tocopherols (E 306-309) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00475](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00476](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00477](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00478](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.3. Beetroot red (E 162) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00350](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.4. Copper complexes of chlorophylls and chlorophyllins (E 141(i,ii)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00356](#)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00372](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.5. Paprika extract, capsanthin, capsorubin (E 160c) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00353](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.6. Iron oxides and hydroxides (E172) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00347](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.7. Gold (E 175) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00345](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.8. Silver (E 174) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00346](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these

revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

## **6. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

None.

## **7. Any Other Business**

The items to be discussed at the forthcoming meetings were agreed.

## **8. Agreement of the minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 27-29 April 2015**

The minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 27-29 April 2015 were agreed<sup>3</sup>.

## **9. Next meetings:**

- 26 May 2015 (tele-conference)
- 30 June-2 July 2015 (tbc)

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fipwgs/documents/answgcolours.pdf>

## Annex

### **Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting**

With regard to this meeting, Claude Lambré declared that he attended the 79<sup>th</sup> Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives meeting in 2014 where paprika extracts (E 160c) was discussed. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>5</sup>, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

## Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources added to Food (ANS)

### Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation of food colours

Held on 2-4 March 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 4 March 2015)

#### Participants

##### ■ Working Group Members:

- Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, David Gott, Claude Lambré, Jean-Charles Leblanc, Jeanne Stadler, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Ruud Woutersen (Chair)
- Fernando Aguilar has participated via teleconference, in agenda point 5.5.
- Pierre Galtier has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.3 and 5.4.

##### ■ EC:

- Jiri Sochor has participated via teleconference

##### ■ EFSA:

- FIP Unit: Federica Lodi, Ana Rincon, Alexandra Tard, Stavroula Tasiopoulou
- DATA Unit: Petra Gergelova

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received by Agneta Oskarsson (Vice chair).

David Gott did not participate in agenda points 5.1, 5.2, 5.3 and 5.4.

Jean-Charles Leblanc did not participate in agenda points 5.6 and 5.8.

Ine Waalkens-Berendsen did not participate in agenda points 5.6 and 5.8.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Action points from 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group Colours meeting held on 26-28 January 2015**

The action points were checked.

#### **5. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **5.1. Tocopherols (E 306-309) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00475](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00476](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00477](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00478](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.2. Chlorophylls (E 140i) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00357](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.3. Chlorophyllins (E 140ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00371](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

##### **5.4. Iron oxides and hydroxides (E172) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00347](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.5. Cochineal, carminic acid, carmines (E120) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00360](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.6. Gold (E 175) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00345](#))**

A preliminary discussion on the draft document took place. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

##### **5.7. Silver (E 174) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00346](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

#### **5.8. Annatto, bixin, norbixin (E 160b) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00362](#))**

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

#### **6. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

None.

#### **7. Any Other Business**

The items to be discussed at the forthcoming meetings were agreed.

#### **8. Agreement of the minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 2-4 March 2015**

The minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 2-4 March 2015 were agreed<sup>3</sup>.

#### **9. Next meetings:**

- 27-29 April 2015
- 1-2 July 2015

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fipwgs/documents/answgcolours.pdf>

28 January 2015

EFSA/FIP/577

**Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources Added to Food  
Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation of  
food colours**

**Held on 26-28 January 2015, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 28 January 2015)**

**Participants**

• **Working Group Members:**

- Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, David Gott, Claude Lambré, Jean-Charles Leblanc, Agneta Oskarsson (Vice chair), Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Ruud Woutersen (Chair)
- Paul Tobback has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.3, 5.4 and 5.5.

• **Hearing experts:**

- Ivan Stankovic has participated via teleconference in agenda points 5.3, 5.4 and 5.5.

• **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Federica Lodi, Ana Rincon, Stavroula Tasiopoulou
- DATA Unit: Petra Gergelova

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Jean-Charles Leblanc did not participate in agenda point 5.7.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Action points from 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group Colours meeting held on 24-26 November 2014

The action points were checked.

### 5. Scientific topics for discussion

#### 5.1. Beetroot red (E 162) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00350](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

#### 5.2. Paprika extract, capsanthin, capsorubin (E 160c) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00353](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

#### 5.3. Chlorophylls (E 140i) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00357](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

#### 5.4. Chlorophyllins (E 140ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00371](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

#### 5.5. Copper complexes of Chlorophylls and Chlorophyllins (E 141i,ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00356](#)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00372](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

#### 5.6. Annatto, bixin, norbixin (E 160b) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00362](#))

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

**5.7. Tocopherols (E 306-309) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00475](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00476](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00477](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00478](#))**

The revised exposure section was briefly presented. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

**6. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

None.

**7. Any Other Business**

The items to be discussed at the forthcoming meetings were agreed.

**8. Agreement of the minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 26-28 January 2015**

The minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 26-28 January 2015 were agreed<sup>3</sup>.

**9. Next meetings:**

- 2-4 March 2015
- 4-6 May 2015

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fipwgs/documents/answgcoulours.pdf>

26 November 2014

EFSA/FIP/575

**Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources Added to Food  
Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation  
of food colours**

**Held on 24-26 November 2014, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 26 November 2014)**

**Participants**

• **Working Group Members:**

- Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, David Gott, Claude Lambre, Agneta Oskarsson (Vice chair), Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Ruud Woutersen (Chair)
- Fernando Aguilar has participated in agenda points 5.1 and 5.4
- Jean-Charles Leblanc has participated in agenda point 5.7
- Paul Tobback has participated via teleconference in agenda points 5.1, 5.3 and 5.4.

• **Hearing experts:**

- Ivan Stankovic has participated in agenda point 5.4.

• **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Federica Lodi, Ana Rincon and Alexandra Tard

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Action points from 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group Colours meeting held on 28-29 October 2014

The action points were checked.

### 5. Scientific outputs for discussion

#### 5.1 Cochineal, carminic acid, carmines (E120) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00360](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

#### 5.2 Paprika extract, capsanthin, capsorubin (E160c) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00353](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

#### 5.3 Titanium dioxide (E171) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00348](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

#### 5.4 Chlorophylls (E 140i) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00357](#))

A preliminary discussion took place on the information provided by the applicant on the chemistry of chlorophylls.

#### 5.5. Chlorophyllins (E 140ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00371](#))

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

#### 5.6. Copper complexes of Chlorophylls and Chlorophyllins (E 141i,ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00356](#)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00372](#))

This item was not discussed due to lack of time

#### 5.7 Tocopherols (E306-309) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00475](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00476](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00477](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00478](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **6. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

None

## **7. Any Other Business**

The items to be discussed at the forthcoming meetings were agreed.

## **8. Agreement of the minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 24-26 November 2014**

The minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 24-26 November 2014 were agreed<sup>3</sup>.

## **9. Next meetings:**

- 26-28 January 2015
- 2-4 March 2015

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fipwgs/documents/answgfoodcolours.pdf>

29 October 2014

EFSA/FIP/480

**Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources Added to Food  
Minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation  
of food colours**

**Held on 28-29 October 2014, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 29 October 2014)**

**Participants**

• **Working Group Members:**

- Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, Jean-Charles Leblanc, Agneta Oskarsson (Vice chair), Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Ruud Wourtesen (Chair)
- Paul Tobback has participated via teleconference in agenda point 6.3

• **European Commission:**

- Wim Debeuckelaere (DG SANCO)

• **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Claudia Heppner, Marco Lannuti, Federica Lodi and Alexandra Tard
- AMU Unit: Diane Lefebvre
- IT consultant: Elena Bonandi

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from David Gott.

Jean-Charles Leblanc has not participated in agenda point 6.1

Ine Waalkens-Berendsen has not participated in agenda points 6.1-6.3

Ruud Woutersen has not participated in agenda point 6.2

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Action points from 1<sup>st</sup> Working Group Colours meeting held on 30 Sep-1 Oct 2014

The action points were checked.

## 5. OpenText DMS

The new Documents Management System OpenText was shortly presented to the Working Group members.

## 6. Scientific outputs for discussion

### 6.1. Annatto, bixin, norbixin (E 160b) ([EFSA-Q-2008-395](#)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00362](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

### 6.2. Beetroot red (E 162) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00350](#))

A short summary of the data available for the exposure assessment was presented. Based on the comments provided by the participants a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

### 6.3. Titanium dioxide (E171) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00348](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

### 6.4. Tocopherols (E306-309) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00475](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00476](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00477](#)), ([EFSA-Q-2011-00478](#))

The Rapporteur introduced the draft document. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

### 6.5. Silver (E 174) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00346](#))

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **6.6. Gold (E 175) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00345](#))**

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming working group meeting.

## **7. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

- **EFSA:** Some clarifications on the new implementing rules<sup>2</sup> on Declarations of Interests (DoI) took place.

## **8. Any Other Business**

The items to be discussed at the forthcoming meetings were agreed.

## **9. Agreement of the minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 28-29 October 2014**

The minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 28-29 October 2014 were agreed<sup>3</sup>.

## **10. Next meetings:**

- 24-26 November 2014
- 26-28 January 2015

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fipwgs/documents/answgfoodcolours.pdf>

1 October 2014

EFSA/FIP/456

**Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources Added to Food  
Minutes of the 1<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Working Group on the re-evaluation of food  
colours**

**Held on 30 September – 1 October 2014, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 1 October 2014)**

**Participants**

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Fernando Aguilar, Riccardo Crebelli, Alessandro di Domenico, Maria José Frutos, David Gott, Agneta Oskarsson (Vice chair), Ruud Woutersen (Chair).
- Claude Lambré has participated in agenda points 6.5-6.8<sup>1</sup>
- Jean-Charles Leblanc has participated in agenda points 1-6.4<sup>2</sup>
- Ine Waalkens- Berendsen has participated in agenda points 6.4-6.7
- Paul Tobback has participated in agenda point 6.4<sup>2</sup>
- Pierre Galtier has participated via teleconference.

• **European Commission:**

- None.

• **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Paolo Colombo, Federica Lodi

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

The Chair informed that with the aim to ensure continuity with the work already undertaken by the Working Groups previously established under the 2011-2014 ANS Panel mandate and with a view to meet the deadlines given for the re-evaluation of food additives allocated to this present Working Group, some experts already appointed as Rapporteurs for specific scientific opinions will participate at the meetings on ad hoc basis when the specific opinions are included in the agenda and for the duration of the work on a specific EFSA output.

---

<sup>1</sup> On 1 October

<sup>2</sup> On 30 September



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Introduction to EFSA, ANS Panel and WG mandate, responsibility and way of working

A general presentation on the role of EFSA and ANS Panel, the mandate of the present Working Group and its responsibility and way of working was given.

## 5. Working programme 2014-2015

The Working Group members were informed on the scientific opinions that were allocated to the working group for the following years in accordance with the mandate of the working group and the "re-evaluation of food additives: tentative work programme 2014-2015" published in April 2014.

## 6. Scientific outputs for discussion

### 6.1 Annatto, bixin, norbixin (E 160b) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00362](#))

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

### 6.2 Paprika extract, capsanthin, capsorubin (E 160c) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00353](#));

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

### 6.3 Beetroot red (E 162) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00350](#))

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

### 6.4 Titanium dioxide (E171) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00348](#))

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions, a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

### **6.5 Chlorophylls (E 140i) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00357](#))**

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

### **6.6 Chlorophyllins (E 140ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00371](#))**

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

### **6.7 Copper complexes of chlorophylls and chlorophyllins (E 141 i-ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00356](#)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00372](#))**

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

### **6.8 Iron oxides and hydroxides (E172) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00347](#))**

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

### **6.9 Cochineal, carminic acid, carmines (E120) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00360](#))**

The Rapporteur presented the current status of the draft opinion. Further clarifications and improvements based on the comments provided by the participants were noted. Subject to these revisions a new draft document will be scheduled for discussion in a forthcoming WG meeting.

## **7. Feedback from EFSA, ANS Panel and European Commission**

- **EFSA:** The Working Group members were informed the new template for the EFSA scientific opinion and statement has been published as an Appendix of the EFSA Scientific Committee Guidance on the structure and content of EFSA's scientific opinions and statements.<sup>5</sup>
- **ANS Panel:** The Working Group Chair briefly summarised the current status of the draft opinion on Tocopherols (E306-E309) that was presented at the EFSA 53 ANS Plenary meeting (16-18 September 2014).

## **8. Any Other Business**

The meeting dates for working group meetings in 2014 and 2015 were agreed by the Working Group.

## **9. Agreement of the minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting on the re-evaluation of food colours held on 30 September – 1 October 2014**

The minutes were agreed.

---

<sup>5</sup> EFSA Scientific Committee, 2014. Guidance on the structure and content of EFSA's scientific opinions and statement. EFSA Journal 2014;12(9):3808.